Preparing for quality: Examining global, national and local institutional policies and the experience of EFL teaching practice in Central Java, Indonesia

Koesoemo Ratih

Bachelor of English Language Education
(Universitas Negeri Sebelas Maret, Surakarta, Indonesia)

Master of Humanities-Applied Linguistics
(Universitas Negeri Sebelas Maret, Surakarta, Indonesia)

Submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy
Faculty of Law, Education, Business and Arts
International Graduate Centre of Education, School of Education
Charles Darwin University
Darwin, Northern Territory, Australia

July 2017
Abstract

This qualitative study investigates pre-service English Foreign Language (EFL) teacher education in Surakarta, Indonesia. Current literature suggests that producing quality Indonesian EFL teachers is challenging. Transnational agencies and policies have documented Indonesia’s low quality education outcomes and have noted evidence of poor EFL teacher competence. Global, national and local institutional level texts include many messages about developing quality education and quality teachers. However, the experiences of pre-service EFL teachers during practice based components of their course are not always consistent with the messages mandated in policy texts. To address this disjunct between policy texts and practice this study examined data from over 20 policy texts across global, national and local institutional levels, 10 group interviews, 34 individual interviews and analysis of several electronic sources, such as blogs and newspapers.

Several key findings emerged as a result of a content analysis informed by critical ethnographic methods of inquiry.

- Neoliberal ideas through quality discourse have emerged in the global, national and local institutional texts and influenced the formation of quality EFL teachers
- The identified subjective and objective dimensions of quality education and quality teachers indicate both agreement and disagreement across policy texts that support and challenge quality education and specifically EFL quality teaching
- The differences between and among policies and practice indicate that two research sites still face challenges in achieving globally competitive education outcomes as mandated in global policies.

These findings reveal the influence of neoliberal ideas in education systems in general and specifically in English language teaching and the
implications for pre-service programs that prepare quality EFL teachers for a globalising world. The flows of ideas about quality are not mutually exclusive. They reinforce and also destabilise messages about the formation of quality teachers. The findings indicate four issues need to be addressed: First, pre-service EFL teacher programs need to generate greater awareness of the global dynamics shaping the formation of education systems and education practice; Second, quality teacher formation includes discussion of the role of subjective and objective dimensions in quality provision; Third, discussion of quality needs to understand the degree to which school infrastructure facilitates and hampers pedagogical implementation; and finally, further investigation is required about the effectiveness of time invested in the practicum.
Declaration

I hereby declare that the work herein, now submitted as a thesis for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy by research at the Charles Darwin University, is the result of my own investigations, and all references to ideas and work of other researchers have been specifically acknowledged.

I hereby certify that the work embodied in this thesis has not already been accepted in substance for any degree, and is not being currently submitted in candidature for any degree. I give consent to this copy of my thesis, when deposited in the University Library, being made available for loan and photocopying online via the University’s Open Access repository eSpace.

Signed:

Koesoemo Ratih

Date:

July 21 2017
Acknowledgements

Alhamdulillah, all praise and gratitude be to Allah Swt who always gives me power and blessings so that I can finish my study.

This dissertation would never have been completed without support from numerous professionals. My first and foremost gratitude goes to Professor Sue Shore, my principal supervisor for her great support, deep concern and contribution not only to this project but also to prepare me to be independent as a future academic professional. I have benefited from her sincere advice and discipline so that I can finally be confident to submit this project. My sincere thanks go to Dr Paul Black, my second supervisor, who greatly contributed to my English language writing. He has inspired and motivated me since the beginning of my study and made me want to study at Charles Darwin University (CDU). My special gratitude and appreciation goes to Professor Laurence Tamatea, my third supervisor, for his sincere guidance and professional help. He has offered me enormous assistance in understanding social theory, methodology and data analysis. He has made me strong when I felt I was weak during the journey towards my PhD.

The completion of my doctoral study has been made possible by the generosity and support from the General Directorate of Indonesian Higher Education (DIKTI) for providing a scholarship, Charles Darwin University for providing a scholarship through PIRTS (Prestigious International Research Tuition Scholarship), and Franseda English Language Awards. Great appreciation and gratitude go to Sun and Full Moon Universities for giving me the opportunity to conduct my research there and my thanks extends to all participants joining this project from those universities.

Throughout my doctoral study, I have been surrounded by many people with great generosity and academic excellence. My gratitude and appreciation go to Professor Lawrence Cram and Professor Peter Kell for their generous support during my study at CDU. I owe my deep respect and gratitude to Professor Dr Bambang Setiaji, who has given me
support, care and academic commitment since the beginning of my study. My gratitude extends to Dr Sofyan Anif, Dr Dai, Dr Sarjito, Professor Dr Wahyudin, Muhammad Musiam, Dr. Supriyono and Ida Nursanti for their great concern and assistance during my study. Special thanks to Professor Dr Joko Nurkamto for his generosity to share his intellectual possessions. Gratitude also goes to Professor Dr Harun Joko Prayitno for his support and concern for my study.

I am grateful to Dr Marilyn Kell for her generosity in sharing her knowledge and experience to improve my academic writing and to Dr Nici Barnes for sharing neoliberal ideas, proof reading and three months accommodation! Great appreciation also goes to Professor Brian Devlin for his generosity in sharing ideas and for trusting me to be a facilitator for Indonesian language learning practice. My great gratitude extends to Sally-Anne Hodgetts and International Office staff for their sincere assistance and concern during my study at CDU, including issues in extending my visa. My thanks also extend to Tracy, Lee Ann and Shanti Bandara of the Research Office for their great assistance in managing the visa extension and the tuition scholarship. I am also very grateful to Dr Sue Smith, Associate Professor Dr Greg Shaw, Dr Ania Lian, Dr Gretchen Geng, Dr Jon Mason, Marianne St Clair, and Rachel, Nina, Azadeh, Rupa, Marty and all the staff in the School of Education at CDU for their academic and emotional support during my study at CDU. My thanks also go to Craig Coley for sharing his knowledge, skills and assistance in thesis formatting. My great gratitude also extends to Sarah Prince for her thorough work and assistance in editing my thesis.

Great appreciation goes to Bpk and Ibu Andre Siregar, the Consul of Republic Indonesia in Darwin, and other staff for their support and concern to involve me in many Indonesian events during my stay in Darwin, including trusting me to be a judge in several competitions on Indonesian short films and to become a temporary facilitator for an Indonesian language learning class. My sincere thanks also extend to Ibu Umi and Bpk Yusuf for sharing accommodation and sincere assistance during the beginning of my stay in Darwin. Thanks also go to Asim for
trusting me to be an Iqra’ teacher in the Weekend Islamic School of Darwin.

Sincere thanks go to Ibu Mauly, Head of my English Department, for her emotional support and understanding during my long study. I also wish to thank all my colleagues for their emotional support: Professor Endang, Ibu Zuhriah, Ibu Dwi Haryanti, Ibu Laila, Bpk Maryadi, Bpk Thoyibi, Bpk Joko, Bpk Abdillah, Bpk Sigit, Ibu Rini, Ibu Heppi, Ibu Dewi, Bpk Agus, Bpk Titis, Ibu Qonita, Ibu Muammaroh, Ibu Fatimah, mbak Yeni, mbak Susi, mbak Sahara, mas Giri and mas Fitri – lecturers in the English Department of the Teacher Training Education Faculty.

Thank you to my close friends Anne-Marie Marias, Jenny Buckworth, Janice Crerar, and Daile Fuller for their emotional support and sharing since my embarking on the journey towards a PhD. Thousands thanks also go to Indonesian friends studying at CDU – Tuti, Kussudiyarsana, Deasy, Ratri, Meika, Rachmat, Arum, Hanandyo, Saefuddin, Razaq, Evy, Epik, Musa, Wachid, Hanum and Dina, for their togetherness and sincere kindness during my stay in Darwin.

Finally, I would like to dedicate this dissertation to my parents, my beloved husband, my two daughters and son-in-law, Pudjotriyono family members and Rita’s family for their continuous support and prayers. My parents would be delighted and proud if they were still alive and could witness my achievement of finishing the highest level of education because of their prayers and commitment to education. I owe my special gratitude and appreciation to Mr Sun, my husband, for his lifelong support and encouragement in allowing me to follow my dreams and for his sincere patience and understanding at being left unattended by his wife for over four years to study in Australia. My endless love goes to my children Sitkha, Faza and Thesa; thank you for your sincere understanding of not being fully attended to during Mum’s study.
# Table of Contents

ABSTRACT ...................................................................................................................................................... I

DECLARATION .............................................................................................................................................. III

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS ................................................................................................................................ V

TABLE OF CONTENTS ................................................................................................................................... VIII

LIST OF TABLES ........................................................................................................................................... XII

1. SETTING THE SCENE .......................................................................................................................... 3
   1.1 BACKGROUND TO THE STUDY ................................................................................................. 3
   1.2 GLOBALISING PRACTICES: THE ROLE OF ENGLISH AND EXPECTED EFL TEACHER COMPETENCE .................................................................................................................. 6
       1.2.1 The EFL teacher according to Indonesian law ........................................................................ 6
       1.2.2 The local context: Who are the prospective EFL teachers? .................................................. 8
   1.3 AIM AND PURPOSE OF THE STUDY ......................................................................................... 8
   1.4 SIGNIFICANCE OF THE RESEARCH ....................................................................................... 10
   1.5 LOCATING MY DISJUNCTURE IN EFL TEACHER EDUCATION .................................................. 13
   1.6 OUTLINE OF THE THESIS ....................................................................................................... 14

2. GLOBALISATION AND QUALITY: A SYNTHESIS OF DEBATES .......................................................... 19
   2.1 INTRODUCTION .......................................................................................................................... 19
   2.2 WHAT IS GLOBALISATION? ...................................................................................................... 20
       2.2.1 Globalisation in the Modern Era ........................................................................................... 23
       2.2.2 Colonialism, bureaucracy and ambivalence ......................................................................... 26
       2.2.3 Understanding globalisation in a postmodern era .............................................................. 29
       2.2.4 Appadurai’s ‘scapes’ – globalisation as flows .................................................................... 32
   2.3 GLOBALISATION AND ITS ARTICULATIONS WITH LANGUAGE TEACHING .............................. 35
       2.3.1 Globalisation and educational provision: Some challenges .................................................. 37
       2.3.2 Challenges for teachers ......................................................................................................... 39
       2.3.3 Engaging notions of quality .................................................................................................. 40
       2.3.4 Engaging notions of teacher quality .................................................................................... 42
       2.3.5 The quality teacher in the context of globalisation ............................................................... 47
   2.4 GLOBALISATION AND EFL AS A MEDIUM OF INSTRUCTION ...................................................... 49
   2.5 GLOBALISATION, NEOLIBERALISM AND TEACHER EDUCATION ............................................. 53
       2.5.1 Pre-service teacher education institutions in the globalisation era ...................................... 56
       2.5.2 Pre-service Teachers and ICT ............................................................................................. 61
   2.6 POLICY AGENDAS AS GLOBAL, NATIONAL AND LOCAL ARTIFACTS ........................................... 63
   2.7 CONCLUSION ............................................................................................................................... 66
3. METHODOLOGY .......................................................................................................................... 70

3.1 INTRODUCTION .......................................................................................................................... 70

3.2 RESEARCH PARADIGM .............................................................................................................. 71
  3.2.1 Reality .................................................................................................................................. 72
  3.2.2 Theory-data relationship ................................................................................................. 73
  3.2.3 Researcher-participant relationship ............................................................................. 74
  3.2.4 Researcher-Truth Relationship ..................................................................................... 74
  3.2.5 The paradigm used in the present study ................................................................. 75

3.3 RESEARCH ORIENTATION ....................................................................................................... 78

3.4 RESEARCH METHOD .................................................................................................................. 79
  3.4.1 Critical ethnography .............................................................................................. 80
  3.4.2 Research sites and participants .............................................................................. 83

3.5 DATA COLLECTION TECHNIQUES ............................................................................................. 86
  3.5.1 Group interviews .................................................................................................... 86
  3.5.2 Individual interviews .............................................................................................. 89
  3.5.3 Policy documents ................................................................................................... 90
  3.5.4 Electronic resources ............................................................................................... 98

3.6 DATA ANALYSIS ......................................................................................................................... 98
  3.6.1 Transcription matters ............................................................................................ 99
  3.6.2 Familiarisation and organisation ...........................................................................100
  3.6.3 NVivo use in data analysis ....................................................................................101
  3.6.4 Informed by discourse analysis ..............................................................................101
  3.6.5 Content analysis and data interpretation ..............................................................103

3.7 ETHICS .....................................................................................................................................106

3.8 CONCLUSION .......................................................................................................................... 107

4. ALIGNED MESSAGES ON QUALITY DISCOURSE ................................................................ 113

4.1 INTRODUCTION ..........................................................................................................................113

4.3 NEOLIBERAL IDEAS AND QUALITY EDUCATION: MACRO LEVEL CONSIDERATIONS ............... 117
  4.3.1 Quality education and learning crises ...................................................................... 121
  4.2.2 Quality, transparency and accountability .................................................................. 124
  4.2.3 Quality, global competition and global mobility/employability .............................. 129

4.3 NEOLIBERAL IDEAS AND QUALITY EDUCATION: EXEMPLARS FROM EFL TEACHER EDUCATION ........... 136
  4.3.1 Quality education and the notion of learner centeredness ....................................... 137
  4.3.2 English as a global language and a foreign language in Indonesia .......................... 140
  4.3.4 Standards ............................................................................................................. 147
  4.3.5 Quality teacher preparation .................................................................................. 152
  4.3.6 Role of finance in quality education ..................................................................... 156
## List of Tables

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Table 1</td>
<td>Group Interview Profile</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 2</td>
<td>Global, Regional, National and Institutional Texts</td>
<td>92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 3</td>
<td>Local Policy Documents: Title; Audience; Date; Purpose</td>
<td>94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 4</td>
<td>National Policy Documents: Title; Audience; Date; Purpose</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 5</td>
<td>Global Level Policy Documents – Title; Audience; Date; Purpose</td>
<td>97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 6</td>
<td>Issues in Transcriptions</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 7</td>
<td>Examples of English Lexical Terms Articulated in Indonesian Policy Texts</td>
<td>118</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 8</td>
<td>Distribution of Foreign Working Force in Indonesia According to Country</td>
<td>134</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Chapter 1
Setting the Scene
1. Setting the Scene

1.1 Background to the study
Governments around the world have focused their education policies on improving outcomes in education system since the 1990s (Lynch, Madden & Doe, 2015). In educational literature this is known as the rise of the knowledge-based economy (Kell, Shore & Singh, 2004; Lynch et al., 2015), in which knowledge becomes the principle commodity to generate economy. This is different from economies based on manufacturing industries, where the main commodities underpinning the economy are raw resources, such as rubber and mining products (Kell, 2004; Lynch et al., 2015). In this knowledge-based economy, the importance of English is inherent for intensifying knowledge gains to generate economy. As Graddol argues, “economic globalisation encouraged the spread of English” (2006, p. 9), and this resulted in situations where, for example, English language teaching and testing providers have become major industries in Australia (Exley, 2004).

Lynch et al. (2015) asserted that repeated referencing of performance in large scale assessments, such as the Program for International Student Assessment (PISA) (see for example OECD, 2013), creates a global competition in education performance that leads to a highly skilled workforce. Global organisations, national governments, and education institutions have focused their agendas on improving the quality of education systems. This concern with quality relates to development agendas across all aspects of life as there are still many issues that can be eliminated through quality education, such as poverty, disparate access to economic resources, and substantial differences in experiences of human dignity around the world (UNESCO, 2014), including in Indonesia (Kell, 2004). The enhancement of quality education is underpinned by a view that better quality systems will produce highly competitive human resources to meet the needs of the global market.
The Indonesian government has shown its concern to improve the quality of its education system. Jalal and colleagues contend that Indonesia “has acknowledged the importance of improving the quality of its education system in order to supply the country with highly competitive human resources” (2009, p. 5) because of the low performance in the outcomes of educational quality at all levels (Hasbullah, 2015; Jalal et al., 2009). According to global assessments, education in Indonesia has not shown satisfactory results (Jalal et al., 2009; Kell & Kell, 2014; Raihani, 2014). Based on the 2007 Trends in International Mathematics and Science Study (TIMSS) (Mullis et al., 2008), the performance of Indonesian education has been quite low (Raihani, 2014) and among several “Southeast Asian participating countries – Indonesia, Singapore and Thailand – Indonesia ranked lowest” (Raihani, 2014, p. 39). Current PISA 2015 results (OECD/Asian Development Bank, 2015) show that Indonesian students’ performance is approximately three years behind the OECD average and over half of fifteen year old Indonesian children do not master basic skills in reading or mathematics (OECD/Asian Development Bank, 2015). Therefore, it is not surprising that international agencies argue that “raising performance in Indonesian education is crucial to meeting the challenge of reaching a high income status” (OECD/Asian Development Bank, 2015, p. 19).

One of the key elements in quality education enhancement is the role of teachers (UNESCO, 2014). Across transnational literature it is generally argued that good teachers will close the gap between poor and good quality education because they can provide optimal learning outcomes for every learner in the classroom (Hattie, 2009; Lynch et al., 2015; UNESCO, 2014). Therefore, the formation of a quality teacher is a concern for any country across the globe as governments aim at enacting policies for excellence at all levels of education in the global market (Goodwin, 2010; Lynch et al., 2015). In 2006, Wilson and I’ Anson claimed that students benefit from high quality instruction and that the benefits are cumulative for students who have good teachers. They argued that improving teacher quality involves policies concerning
recruitment, early preparation, and retention (including attention to working conditions), as well as professional development.

In regard to early preparation, prospective EFL teachers must be prepared well, trained and educated optimally to anticipate future challenges in order to become assets in education systems which aim to deliver high quality education. An exemplar of the value placed upon quality teaching is to be found in one of the Education for All (EFA) monitoring reports, *Teaching and Learning: Achieving quality for all* (UNESCO, 2014) which requires a specific commitment to realising quality education and by extension the formation of quality teachers. The key to improving education quality as advised in the EFA agenda is to recruit the best teacher candidates because it is claimed that quality of education depends on the quality of the teachers. Based on empirical studies and systematic reviews on improving performance on educational outcomes, improving the quality of teachers will contribute to quality education (Hattie, 2009; Lynch et al., 2015).

In the interest of extending my understanding of the role of policies in the formation of quality EFL teachers (globally, nationally and institutionally), this study investigates the formation of quality EFL teachers through policy documents at each of these levels. I also draw on group and individual interviews with prospective teachers and on electronic resources – social media, blogs and newspapers. This chapter presents several points to contextualise this study. Firstly, I introduce the roles of English and expected EFL teacher competence—what an EFL teacher is like based on the law and the local context of Indonesian pre-service teachers. I present the aim and purpose of the study in relation to this context and note the significance of the study for the field of Indonesian EFL teacher education. I then offer a brief illustration of an event I experienced during my period as a teacher educator which illustrates some disjuncture I experienced during my time as a teacher educator. This disjuncture was influential in the design and multi-layered data collection and analysis adopted for this study. I close this first chapter by
presenting the outline of the remaining chapters and their contribution to
the overall issue of the formation of quality EFL teachers in Central Java.

1.2 Globalising practices: The role of English and expected EFL teacher
competence

English plays a crucial role in the globalisation era (Madya, 2002; Saukah, 2003; Sawir, 2005). It is the language of international business, politics and diplomacy (Held, McGrew, Goldblatt & Perraton, 1999; Johnson, 2009; Saukah, 2003). In this era of globalisation, in which communication with foreign countries is necessary, it would be unwise to ignore English language skills. A range of professions demand mastery of the English language – business, tourism, education, trade, various industries, the government sector (Nunan, 2003), and medical professions (Boyd, 1984). Moreover, the rise in use of English across diverse professions means English language mastery is demanded of English teachers in order to respond to professional contexts where they must prepare their students to work in service roles with language learners and business clients. This diverse demand for mastery of English in Indonesia continues to increase, in line with the development of globalisation of English, and results in demands by various professions and international communication networks. Thus, it is critical for Indonesians to master English if they want to gain access to international communication and development (Pasassung, 2003).

1.2.1 The EFL teacher according to Indonesian law

Globalising practices are also related to emerging messages articulated in national education policies about EFL teachers in Indonesia. Like teachers in other subject disciplines, EFL teachers’ work and roles are based on rules articulated in national policies, such as the Law of the National Education System (Republik Indonesia, 2003) and Teacher Law (Republik Indonesia, 2005b). Based on the Law of the Indonesian National Education System (Republik Indonesia, 2003), “Pendidik merupakan tenaga profesional yang bertugas merencanakan dan
melaksanakan proses pembelajaran, menilai hasil pembelajaran, melakukan pembimbingan dan pelatihan, serta melakukan penelitian dan pengabdian kepada masyarakat, terutama bagi pendidik pada perguruan tinggi” [educators constitute a professional workforce assigned to plan and carry out learning processes, assess learning outcomes, guide and train learners and do research and social service, especially for educators in higher education]” (Republik Indonesia, 2003, p. 15). According to this National Law, a teacher is:

obliged to create a meaningful, pleasant, creative, dynamic and dialogic education atmosphere; to have professional commitment to improve education quality; and to be a model and to maintain the good name of the institution, profession and status in accordance with the mandates. Minimal qualification, certification, and competences to actualize national education goals are also compulsory features in the Law (Republik Indonesia, 2003, p. 15).

Consistent with the Law, the Teacher Act also articulates the main tasks of a teacher, such as to “mendidik, mengajar, membimbing, mengarahkan, melatih, menilai, dan mengevaluasi peserta didik pada pendidikan anak usia dini jalur pendidikan formal, pendidikan dasar, dan pendidikan menengah” [educate, teach, guide, direct, train, assess, and evaluate learners at the levels of early childhood formal education, primary education, and secondary education]” (Republik Indonesia, 2005b, p. 2).

The former Law regulates the national education system in general while the Teacher Law specifically regulates teachers’ rights and responsibilities. It also articulates the academic qualifications, certification requirements, physical and mental health competences, and ability to actualise the competencies required by the national education system. Academic qualifications are obtained through graduate programs in higher education. Teacher competencies include: pedagogic competence, personal competence, social competence and professional competence, all obtained through professional education (Republik Indonesia, 2005a).
The principles embedded in national laws and acts are translated into practice at institutional levels, where prospective teachers are educated in the English departments of teacher training and education faculties. The curriculum at the department level is an important mechanism in translating the messages articulated in national policies into local practice (Leask, 2015; Raihani, 2014).

1.2.2 The local context: Who are the prospective EFL teachers?

In preliminary work to understand the context of this study, it was apparent that pre-service EFL teachers arrived at the departments of English education from various backgrounds (Koesoemo & Shore, 2015; O'Sullivan, 2008). While they were predominantly recent high school graduates with different career purposes, many wanted to be EFL teachers because they received strong advice from their family, and in the Javanese context, family continues to retain substantial power over a child's future career plans. Hence the formation of EFL teachers is complex. Globalising practices manifest in the roles English plays and have affected how English teachers need to be prepared for global employability. The expected EFL teacher competence changes as a result of national policy articulation in response to global agendas. Locally these issues are shaped by family and cultural expectations of career planning. These issues are important in shaping understandings of the formation of quality EFL teachers in Indonesia.

1.3 Aim and purpose of the study

This research aims to explore the formation of quality EFL teachers through emerging ideas of ‘quality’ evident in global, national and local institutional policy texts, interviews and electronic resources. Theoretically this study is informed by Appadurai’s theory of globalisation. In brief, Appadurai argued that the modern world is a system in interaction and the “central problem of today’s global interaction is the tension between cultural homogenisation and heterogenisation… and the new global cultural economy has to be seen as complex, overlapping, and
disjunctive order” (1996, p. 32). Appadurai’s notion of global cultural flows helps to explain the emerging ideas of quality across policy texts and practice and the role these ideas play in the formation of quality EFL teachers.

In practical terms, the key aim of this study is to explore the alignments and issues in the formation of quality EFL teachers across global, national and local institutional policy texts and EFL teaching practice in Surakarta, Central Java. This aim was achieved in three stages. Firstly, I explored emerging ideas on the notion of quality and quality education across global, national and local institutional policy texts as well as interview texts elicited from EFL pre-service teachers and taken from related electronic resources. Secondly, I explored the similarities and differences across global, national and local institutional policy texts identified subjectively and objectively in constituting EFL quality teachers. Thirdly, I focused on the implementation level by examining responses from pre-service teachers against dimensions related to the notion of quality EFL teachers contained in the educational policy texts. The overarching question guiding this study was as follows:

How are EFL pre-service teachers in Indonesia influenced by mandated messages in global, national and local institutional policy texts?

A series of sub-questions further developed this interest as follows:

1. How do the notion of quality and its effects emerge across global, national and local institutional policy texts, EFL pre-service teachers’ experiences and electronic resources?
2. How are subjective and objective features integral to constituting quality EFL teachers represented across global, national and local institutional policy texts?
3. How is the notion of the quality EFL teacher noted in educational policy texts responded to in practice by pre-service EFL teachers?
1.4 Significance of the research

The 2014 EFA global monitoring report *Teaching and learning: Achieving quality for all* mandates that quality education relies on the most appropriate training for teachers and prospective teachers. It is recommended that initial teacher education is required to prepare teachers to help students from various backgrounds and needs. Therefore, preparing prospective EFL teachers to anticipate future challenges must start at the very beginning stage of entering the teaching profession if long term quality teaching is the expected outcome for professional practice. Prospective EFL teachers must be prepared well and trained and educated optimally. They will be teachers who become important assets in education systems which aim to deliver high quality education. Following Shulman (1999), they need to be well equipped with a range of knowledge and skills, including content knowledge, general pedagogical knowledge, curriculum knowledge, pedagogical content knowledge, knowledge of learners and their characteristics, knowledge of educational contexts and knowledge of educational ends, purposes and values. In the case of Indonesian EFL pre-service teachers this includes their ability to respond to the many changes occurring in the EFL language teaching system in Indonesia as well as their English language capacity and global employability.

Furthermore, the influence of globalisation in spreading English language as a medium of instruction in non-native English speaking countries has stimulated the demand for mastering English proficiency for developing human capital in many countries (Dang, Nguyen & Le, 2013). This issue is applicable in the Indonesian context as well. English language becomes important in society at large and particularly in business, politics, education and media (Dardjowidjojo, 1998; Lauder, 2008; Muller, Herder, Adamson & Brown, 2011). However, the teaching of English in Indonesia, which has occurred since long before Indonesian independence (Lauder, 2008; Lie, 2007; Mistar, 2005; Sadtono, 1979), remains problematic due to many factors. For example, Dardjowidjojo (1998) claimed that the result of teaching English – in effect the
experience of learning English – is discouraging. He contended that the majority of Indonesians, including many highly educated language scholars, do not master English well enough to absorb scientific materials written in English and that their oral ability is not satisfactory. He predicts that this situation will become a major obstacle, since progress in science and technology is described in English. Furthermore, based on research conducted nationally, English is not fully used in English lessons in the classrooms (Hamied, 1997).

Besides that, EFL teaching in Indonesia is regarded as failing to achieve its intended assignment (Madya, 2002). Madya argues that “the failure of EFL teaching might to some extent have contributed to the low rank of Indonesian competitiveness and higher education” (2002, p. 2). Additionally, the context of teaching English in Indonesia is unique at least in terms of socio-cultural, geographical, and political contexts that result in diversities in educational access (Madya, 2007). She contends that Indonesia has over 700 local languages and more than 350 ethnic groups which characterise different cultures. Such a multicultural atmosphere may influence how EFL teaching is delivered. Drawing upon noted cultural studies scholar Clifford Geertz, Madya contends that “throughout South East Asia, Indonesia probably has the greatest diversity of culture, caused by differing histories of the people’s contact with and responses to the outside world” (2007, p. 198). This cultural diversity adds to the challenges and opportunities in learning EFL. Nevertheless, there remains a problem in remote areas concerning the limited access for information and education. Thus, even though advancements of information and communication technology have facilitated education information and development a great deal, there are still disparities in EFL teacher competence across the country.

In addition to the above points, the quality of graduating EFL teachers is also problematic. Low EFL teacher competence has been considered to contribute to a decline in teacher quality. Regarding quality teachers, many studies begin with the assumption that EFL teachers in Central Java are inadequate in their English capacity. Marcellino (2008), Lie
(2007) and Dardjowidjojo (1998) claim that EFL teachers lack English language competence. Many teachers, who are mostly graduates of teacher training education, are assumed not to meet the standard of mature English teachers (Marcellino, 2005). Some current problems identified for EFL teacher professionalism in Indonesia by Yuwono and Harbon (2010), Dardjowidjojo (2000) and more broadly by Warschauer (2002) strengthen the evidence base that poor EFL teacher competence contributes to professional insufficiency.

Even though governments have supported the enhancement of quality teachers, such as by enacting the Teacher Law and running teacher certification and teacher professional training, there remains professional insufficiency. The launch of the Teacher Certification Program in Indonesia in 2006 aimed to develop teacher quality, yet it has not been successful in significantly improving teachers’ competence across the country (Maulia, 2008). For example, a study by Anif (2012) shows that teachers who have been certified through portfolio do not necessarily demonstrate improved performance. Another study by Fahmi, Maulana, and Yusuf (2011) reveals that teacher certification has no impact on students' achievement; the certification program may have improved teachers’ living standard, but its formally stated goal to improve the quality of education (as evidenced by better student performance) may not have been achieved. For these reasons, the result of teacher certification has been noted recently as an issue for review in achieving the Education for All goals of quality (UNESCO, 2014). It is also important to view the notion of quality not only as an objective entity but also the subjective one.

Furthermore, teacher education institutions around the world are actively involved in the process of change, not simply passive recipients of institutional policy. Drawing on Cochran-Smith and Fries (2001), Arnon and Reichel (2007) maintain that change is triggered by the social, economic and political changes that challenge what ideal teachers should be and how they should be prepared. This implicitly means that
institutions and policies also play an important role in the formation of the EFL professional teacher.

Regarding the above issues, the notion of quality is an important issue to investigate in the formation of quality EFL teachers through global, national and local institutional policy texts as well as understanding how teachers experience that process of formation. Understanding the processes of formation of professional EFL teachers through these texts may offer some ideas about potential capacity in pre-service teacher training education institutions so that planning can address some of the current problems that have been identified for EFL teacher professionalism in Indonesia (Dardjowidjojo, 2000; Yuwono & Harbon, 2010) and more broadly (Warschauer, 2002). This may also offer some suggestions for improvements to professional practice. In addition, my own professional learning and the disjuncture I experienced served as a useful guide for this work.

1.5 Locating my disjuncture in EFL teacher education

In 2009 I was assigned to be an assessor for a teacher certification program and to supervise EFL teachers' teaching performance in a microteaching session. When it was time for me to observe their teaching practice, I was surprised, they looked upset and tense waiting for their turns even though I had undertaken a warming up session with them and asked them to stay calm. It became worse when their turns came. Many of them looked extremely nervous. Some could not perform as optimally as they had planned according to their lesson plans. At the end of the session, I asked the participants to reflect on their performance. At this time, I was surprised when many said that they were nervous; they had lost their concentration and forgot what they had prepared; they could not do as they expected; and they were not confident when they used English for the whole session because in real classes they did not use English fully.
What happened in carrying out the task in certification made me think and worry about the conditions for prospective teachers. I never stopped thinking, “If the in-service teachers were in such poor condition, what would happen with pre-service teachers?” Moreover, after I arrived in Australia, I found a lot of things different from those in my country in relation to the teacher preparation program. Two things caught my attention: first, the English language requirements for teachers as determined by a score of 8 in IELTS and second, the time allowance for practicum during pre-service education (teaching practice at schools from Years 1 to 4). This inspired me to conduct research on the practicum experience, as my original task was to prepare prospective EFL teachers.

While undertaking this study, I was aware that English is critical for global employability. Most job advertisements require applicants to have a good command of English. Therefore, English language skills are critical to master in the discourse of global employability. I became more worried about the prospects of prospective EFL teachers. Will they be able to win in the competitive job market? Does the institution really prepare them to meet the market demands? How could they become EFL teachers?

These concerns inspired me to explore an understanding of the quality EFL teacher construction by examining global, national and local institutional policies and prospective EFL teachers’ experiences during their study at the teacher training education institutions.

Thus, this study is expected to provide insights for a number of policy makers in global, national and local institutional levels in regard to promoting quality teachers, especially preparing pre-service EFL teachers in teacher education programs.

1.6 Outline of the thesis
This thesis is presented in seven chapters. Chapter 1 (this current chapter) sets the scene. It presents the background of the study, addressing the need for improving the quality of education. Then it introduces the globalising practices associated with changing
expectations about the role of English and EFL teacher competence in contemporary education policies and systems. Expressing the aim, purpose of the study, and its significance, was further contextualised by recounting an experience of disjuncture I had whilst working as an EFL teacher educator. This experience reinforces the complex links operating between the policies, theories, pedagogies and employment practices of the EFL field. This set of complex practices underpins the remaining chapters in this thesis and its argument that the formation of quality EFL teachers, whilst central to quality education, is also a matter of alignments and disjunctures not easily identified by teacher educators, university departments or even prospective EFL teachers in pre-service programs.

Chapter 2 provides a synthesis of the debates related to globalisation and quality. First various views of globalisation are presented and elaborated through perspectives manifesting in notions of modernity, colonisation and bureaucracy. Next globalisation is explored using Appadurai’s idea of ‘scapes’. The articulations with English language teaching are explored, as are the challenges presented for EFL teachers, and the implications of neoliberalism on instruction and teacher education. Chapter 2 ends with the presentation of the policy agendas and texts: global, national and local institutional artefacts of relevance to the study.

Chapter 3 presents a framework for generating data about such a complex issue as EFL teaching, EFL professional teachers and relevant global, national and institutional policy texts. At the beginning of Chapter 3 I describe the research paradigm that guided me in determining the research methodology. Then I describe the research orientation that led me to conduct this qualitative study. Following that is a description of critical ethnography as my research methodology and of case study sites and participants. Finally, I describe data collection techniques, including multi-layered data and approaches.

Chapter 4 presents the findings in relation to the presence and effects of ideas on the notion of quality emerging from global, national and local institutional policy texts, as informed by Appadurai’s notions of global
cultural flows. This chapter discusses quality education in relation to two matters, namely notions of quality and neoliberal ideas and effects on the development of quality EFL teacher education. The discussion of quality is linked to such neoliberal ideas as learning crises, transparency, accountability, competition, mobility and employability, which have been produced by the international policies and education community. This discussion also demonstrates that neoliberal ideas have influenced quality EFL teaching and the formation of quality EFL teachers in Indonesia through the latter's experience of teaching practice.

Chapter 5 illustrates the similarities and differences found in the policy texts constituting EFL quality teachers. Most of the similar features in constituting quality EFL teachers are reflected from the global agenda down to national and local institutional policies. The dominant features in constructing quality EFL teachers are identified subjectively and objectively.

Chapter 6 focuses on the pre-service EFL teachers and how they experience disjuncture, difference, ambivalence and tension. This chapter examines the evidence that quality EFL teacher construction is influenced by global, national and local policies in which values are disjunctive at the practice level.

I close with Chapter 7 by describing the implications of the study and presenting recommendations and conclusions. First I synthesise the key findings presented in each chapter, I describe the implications of the findings for several issues facing stakeholders engaged in EFL teacher education. Four particular issues are addressed: the extent to which stakeholders are aware of global flows shaping the formation of education systems and education practice; values-based influences in quality provision; the degree to which school infrastructure and resources facilitate the flow of pedagogical ideas; and the alignment of practicum investment with the global agenda.
Chapter 2
Globalisation and Quality:
A synthesis of debates
2. Globalisation and Quality: A synthesis of debates

2.1 Introduction

A range of literature argues that high quality education is required for global employability (Chang et al., 2014; Madya, 2002; OECD, 2013). The key to improving the quality of education is to recruit the best teacher candidates because it is assumed that quality of education depends on the quality of the teachers. However, “Indonesia has not yet formally adopted the strategies to attract more and better candidates to the teaching profession through the selection process from the top 20 per cent of graduating secondary school class” (Chang et al., 2014, p. 24). The Indonesian government has initiated strategies, such as incentives, and the prospect within the Teacher Law of being considered a ‘professional’ (Chang et al., 2014). However, these strategies have not ensured consistency between policies, practices and outcomes in EFL teacher preparation programs. Some issues on the inconsistency between policies and practice present many challenges for EFL pre-service teachers, lecturers and departments in universities and those responsible for the development of policies in ministries. This issue of inconsistency and how it might be better understood is central to the research problem addressed in this study.

As stated in Chapter 1, this study explores the formation of quality EFL teachers through the emerging ideas of quality evident across global, national and local institutional policy documents, EFL pre-service teachers’ experience and electronic resources. In the interest of understanding the research problem above, in this chapter I present some issues and ideas from literature relevant to this study. This chapter therefore begins the exploration of EFL teacher education by analysing the broader context in which EFL teacher training is taking place in Indonesia. This broader context includes the influence of a phenomenon called globalisation, and its impact on global employability. Several views on globalisation are presented, followed by discussion of Appadurai’s (1996) notion of global flows. Appadurai’s work is used here for its
explanatory ability to inform how quality EFL teachers are constituted by
global, national and local institutional policy documents and pre-service
teachers' experience in teaching practice and electronic resources.

Given that a discussion of globalisation involves positioning it within a
history of modernity, I have included discussion here of some distinct
characteristics that contrast modernity and postmodernity, followed by a
discussion on globalisation in relation to EFL teaching. This part includes
the discussion of challenges for educational provision and for teachers,
engaging the notion of quality and quality teachers in the context of
globalisation. This is followed by the section discussing globalisation and
EFL use as a medium of instruction.

A discussion of globalisation, neoliberalism and teacher education is also
relevant due to the policy focus in this study that links bureaucratic power
and the roles of government. Neoliberalism and teacher education are
relevant in this chapter in view of neoliberal values having influenced the
constitution of quality EFL teachers in pre-service teacher education
programs in the globalisation era.

Describing the issues in quality EFL teacher preparation and EFL
teaching generally in the global context and more specifically in the
Indonesian context, this discussion is also important in understanding
several universal features of EFL teacher preparation. This chapter then
ends with a description of the policy agenda which forms the overarching
context for this study and a preliminary introduction to the policy texts
which have such an influence on EFL teacher education at the global,
national and local institutional levels.

2.2 What is globalisation?
Globalisation has penetrated all people’s lives. It has been evidenced that
what people eat and drink, the clothes they wear, the attitudes they take
on, the practices and behaviours they imitate, technologies they adopt
and how they apply them in daily life and the ideas they are exposed to,
all reflect globalised processes.
‘Globalisation’ is on everybody’s lips; a fad word fast turning into a shibboleth, a magic incantation, a pass-key meant to unlock the gates to all present and future mysteries. For some, globalisation is what we are bound to do if we wish to be happy; for others ‘globalisation’ is the cause of our unhappiness. For everybody, though, ‘globalisation’ is an intractable fate of the world, an irreversible process; it is also a process which affects us all in the same measure and in the same way. We are all being ‘globalised’—and being ‘globalised’ means much the same to all who ‘globalised’ are (Bauman, 1998, p. 1).

As mentioned in the quote above, globalisation may mean making everything become universal. What happens in some parts of the world may also occur on the other side of the globe. For example, popular culture in the western world, such as pop music in English, saturates the planet’s airwaves, which means many people who are not English speakers can sing words from their favourite English songs (Harmer, 2007).

Observers have suggested there are three different views about globalisation, held by hyper globalisers, sceptics and transformationalists (Held et al., 1999; Martell, 2007). According to Held et al. (1999), hyper globalisers believe that globalisation is a new era in which people everywhere rely on the global market. Traditional nation states are assumed not to be appropriate anymore. This may promote de-nationalism—the breakdown of national identity. Countries may lose their power because they have to rely on the needs of a more influencing power (Martell, 2007), and because transnational companies and free trades dominate, new governance arrangements are established (Rianto, 2004).

In contrast, sceptics argue that globalisation is not a new or even recent event, but part of an older process which is currently intensifying. Sceptics are concerned with evidence of whether globalisation is accepted uniformly and responded to in the same way everywhere or not (Held et al., 1999; Martell, 2007). Sceptics argue that global power depends on national power to guarantee liberalism; however, trade and
investment flow only to rich countries (Rianto, 2004). Martell contended that “national identities have a history and a hold on the popular imagination that global identities cannot replace, evolving rather than being swept away” (2007, p. 174). In this view I included observers who argued that the world has actually been an accumulation of large scale interactions for many centuries (Appadurai, 1996). Winarno (2008) contended that economic globalisation in developing countries such as Indonesia is an imminent process, that the features of change noted above are not new and have been part of the history of world civilisation.

The third view is the transformational view, which holds that features of globalisation are changing. Transformationalists share “the concern of the sceptics about evidence but cannot help but see processes of globalisation before their eyes, moving ahead at unprecedented level at recent time” (Martell, 2007, p. 176). For example, economic interdependence has long occurred, but it has increased significantly in recent times and consequently the global economy take place (Martell, 2007). Furthermore, transformationalists argue that in the beginning of the new millennium, globalisation is the main power of social, economic and political changes that re-established modern society and world order (Held et al., 1999).

In addition to views about what globalisation is, there is also a vast body of literature on the history of the idea. Goran Thernborn described it as manifesting in six waves (as cited in Van Krieken et al., 2014). The first consists of the diffusion of world religions and the establishment of transcontinental civilizations (300-600). Second, European naval exploration and colonial conquest follow (1500-1600). Third was competition between the European powers (1700-1850). Fourth, the European empires become the centre of domination of the world (1850-1918). Fifth was World War II (1940-70). Sixth, finance and culture replace the political and military dynamic of the previous wave with the current era from 1980 to the present.
The views about globalisation vary. The actual definitions of globalisation draw out different features and influences and therefore also implications for understanding EFL teacher education.

The following sections explore the features of globalisation in relation to modernity and postmodernity with the aim of understanding how perspectives on globalisation and its consequences influence views and practices of EFL use, teacher education and policy development. This exploration helps us to rethink EFL teacher education in times of global, national and local changes in regard to English and English teachers as articulated in policy documents and local practice. Recurring features in this exploration are extension and interconnection/interdependency of society, compression and intensification of social life, and multidimensional social processes and cultural flows.

2.2.1 Globalisation in the Modern Era

The modern era, often referred to as modernity, refers to the multifaceted phenomena commencing in the 17th century (Mansson & Langmann, 2011; Van Krieken et al., 2014). It is a time associated with the process of “change from an agricultural to an industrial foundation... populations migrating from rural, village settings to towns and cities, as well as moving beyond” (Van Krieken et al., 2014, pp. 8-9). The above statement about globalisation characterises it as a phenomenon of extension and interconnection (Appadurai, 1996; Held et al., 1999; Olssen, Codd & O’Neill, 2004). Having an interactive feature, globalisation is described as the process in which the growing technological, economic, political and legal, social and cultural integration of people and communities around the world influence people’s daily lives (Olssen et al., 2004; Powell & Steel, 2011; Robertson, 1992; Van Krieken et al., 2014).

According to Held et al. (1999), globalisation implies increased stretching and interconnectedness. Global modes of interaction are identified by Held (1997) as economic competition and cooperation, ideological and cultural. This idea is similar to how Cohn (2012) views globalisation as involving interdependence. He defined globalisation as a process that
involves both the “broadening and deepening of interdependence among peoples and states” (Cohn, 2012, p. 6).

In relation to ‘interconnected and extending’ features, Olsen et al. (2004) explain further about the interrelation of the above economic, cultural and political matters in globalisation. Economic globalisation involves processes that enable the free flow of goods, services, investment, labour and information across national borders to maximize capital accumulation. Cultural globalisation involves the expansion of western (especially American and British) culture to all corners of the globe, promoting particular values that are supportive of consumerism and capital accumulation. Politically:

   policy is increasingly [produced] in response to [and to respond to] international developments and increasingly involves international agreements and collaboration, as can be seen in the rise to prominence and power of quasi-regional or supra national organisations such as World Trade Organisation (WTO), the North Atlantic Treaty Organisation (NATO), European Economic Community (EEC), World Bank (WB), International Monetary Fund (EMF) (Olssen et al., 2004, p. 7).

According to this definition, globalisation is a new space of interconnectedness and communication where global markets and products ‘free’ individuals so that the constraints of national borders and cultures fade (Olssen et al., 2004).

Giddens positions globalisation “within the context of late modernity” (as cited in Van Krieken et al., 2014, p. 35). Giddens (1990) argued that global risks emerged from four modern institutions, namely capitalism, industrialism, surveillance and violence. Here he understands institutions not as organisations or agencies but as institutional dimensions. Those four modern institutions produce global impacts, namely global poverty, ecological risk, refusal of democracy and war. Hence, he includes modernity in the discussion of globalisation.

Van Krieken et. al. (2014) asserted that modernity and globalisation have developed together and include several common features, such as
industrial, capitalist economic arrangements, the nation state as the main form of political system, and a belief in development and in the reduction of poverty, injustice, and inequality. They asserted an emphasis on:

individuals as bearers of rights and freedom and more on individual choice and preference. The development of bureaucracy and the growing intrusion of the state and other organisations grow into the daily lives of its citizens… all characteristics of modern society [are exported] through the dynamics of colonialism (Van Krieken et al., 2014, p. 9).

Economic power triggered by capitalism increases production and consumption globalisation. Transnational industries create transnational capital so that neoliberalism penetrates into our daily life, shapes nationality processes and dis-embeds social culture. The process of intensification of transnational spaces, problems, and events always flows in global to local logic and is called the process of globalisation. Rianto (2004) argued that globalisation has brought about the power of multinational corporations that direct many public policies in underdeveloped countries so that the gap between the poor and the rich widens and actually hinders democratization. According to Van Krieken et al. (2000), globalisation produces inequality and fragmentation at the level of individual experience and identity. For example, growing inequality is evidenced by the gap between the average income per capita levels of the poorest and the richest nations, which has increased during the recent era of globalisation (Joyce, 2008).

Modernity is often contrasted with postmodernity with regard to their controversial features. For example, they are usually contrasted in terms of progress, truth, and orientation toward problems, bureaucracy, and government’s role (Haralambos, Van Krieken, Smith & Holborn, 1996). Progress is viewed positively and optimistically by modernity, while postmodernity is pessimistic towards progress (Haralambos et al., 1996). In regard to truth, modernity acknowledges absolute truth and objective facts within human’s ability. Drawing on Demeterio (2003), Tiffany contends that in terms of bureaucracy, modernity is characterised by bureaucratic-centralised power, while postmodernity is characterised by
stratified-decentralised power in a chaotic society (Tiffany & Hiu, n.d.). Therefore, with regard to government involvement, government plays a minimal role in postmodernity; its intervention is significantly replaced by that from private sectors. On the other hand, in modernity government plays the central role for social improvement.

In the next section I examine the links between colonialism and bureaucracy. Van Krieken et al. argued that “an important concept to place alongside that of modernity is colonialism, which captures the ways in which European modernity has been associated with the spread of empire by the English, ... Dutch…”(Van Krieken et al., 2014, p. 9). Besides that, bureaucracy in Indonesia has been influenced by colonialism, and my project relates to policies, the production of which might be influenced by some features of colonialism. Therefore, colonialism and bureaucracy are important concepts to explore and connect in this chapter.

2.2.2 Colonialism, bureaucracy and ambivalence

Indonesia, officially ‘Republik Indonesia’, is a country in Southeast Asia. It is the largest island country, with over thirteen thousand islands. The Indonesian archipelago has been an important trade region since the 7th century, so local rulers have absorbed foreign cultural, religious and political models since early centuries. However, Indonesia secured its independence after World War II, in 1945. It has thus been free from colonisation for around 70 years. During the period from the 1600s to 1942, Indonesia was under Dutch colonial rule, and “quality of schooling was only provided to the minority Dutch, European families and a few Indonesian aristocrats” (Kell & Kell, 2014, p. 101). This means that they were set up to be educated in Dutch colonial bureaucracy. During 1942-1945, Indonesia was colonised by Japanese. During their occupation, the national system of schooling was also directed to support Japanese administration. Kell and Kell (2014) confirmed that during colonialism, Indonesians were only educated to work in colonial administration.
Aligned with the above statement, to serve the need of the colonials, Dutch was used as a medium of instruction during Dutch colonialism; however, during the Japanese colonialism, the language promoted was Indonesian or Malay. However, “the colonial legacy… left bureaucratic regimes committed to retaining rigid centralised curriculum and examination systems” (Kell & Kell, 2014, p. 104).

As stated previously, modernity has characterised ‘progress’ as a condition of certainty, optimism, and positivity. In the colonial era, modernity was a project of the colonisers. However, it is also a transition time that creates a condition in which colonised peoples often feel uncertain and pessimistic. This uncertainty manifests as a condition or experience described as ambivalence. Ambivalence has relevance to this study as it permeates all societies, but in this Chapter it provides background to understanding the pre-service teacher experience in times of personal and collective uncertainty (Bauman, 2000). In this study I draw on understandings of ambivalence associated with the personal and the societal. Ambivalence involves colonised and colonisers because, as Ashcroft, Griffiths and Tiffin explained, “the colonised subject is never simply and completely opposed to the coloniser” (2007, p. 10), and this often involves what Bhabha (1994) described as mimicry – a desire to be like the coloniser but also never to achieve sameness. Mimicry is an ability of someone to resemble or imitate other people, but according to Bhabha, mimicry also involves ambivalence. On the one hand it builds identity or similarity, but on the other it maintains differences.

With regard to the relation between mimicry and ambivalence, Bhabha (1984) argued that ambivalence would appear when the process of mimicry obtains uncertainty of determining identity:

The discourse of mimicry is constructed around ambivalence; in order to be effective, mimicry must continually produce its slippage, its excess, its difference. The authority of that mode of colonial discourse that I have called mimicry is therefore stricken by indeterminacy: mimicry emerges as the representation of a difference that is itself a process of disavowal. Mimicry is, thus, the sign of a double articulation; a complex strategy of
reform, regulation, and discipline, which ‘appropriates’ the Other as it visualises power (Bhabha, 1984, p. 126).

Therefore, the relation between colonised and colonisers is ambivalent and in on-going fluctuation because the colonised have local genius in their involvement and fights.

Drawing upon Bauman, ambivalence is defined as "the possibility of assigning a phenomenon (be it a thing or a person) to more than one category" (Mansson & Langmann, 2011, p. 16). Ambivalence is a controversial action or inconsistency of belief or emotion (Craig & Martinez, 2005; Fanon & Markmann, 2008) The term ‘ambivalence’ according to Fanon and Markmann (2008) relates to the personality of colonised and colonisers in which the colonised show desire to maintain national cultural identity and at the same time adopt the cultural identity of the colonisers. When a person experiences “contradictory or inconsistent evaluations, beliefs, or emotions, we can describe him or her as being ambivalent” (Craig & Martinez, 2005, p. 2).

Even though the concept of ambivalence has emerged in the disciplines of postcolonial and cultural studies, it can also be applied in the present study to explain the “superior and inferior” relations between mentor teachers, lecturers and pre-service teachers and the imbalance in positions within education systems. Ambivalence as a colonial discourse results from the process of hybridity triggered by the tensions between colonisers and colonised (Bhabha, 1994). Therefore, according to Bhabha, notions of ‘superiority and inferiority’ are ‘fixed’ through images. He also argues that fixity is required as a sign of racial, historical and cultural differences in colonial discourse that is dynamic, contradictory and identical. For example, to a certain extent there is an inclination to praise and desire, but at the same time, also to hate. To gain fixity, the colonised experience an uncertain situation and in during this process of fixity they try to construct their identity to follow the superior image (Bhabha, 1994).
In this study, there are many instances where EFL pre-service teachers might experience imbalances of power and authority and relationships of superiority and inferiority, such as with their parents, their mentor teachers (during teaching practicum at schools), and in wider society.

To summarise, Indonesia’s colonial history and the bureaucracies that formed in those times produce competing desires in people. Ambivalence involves controversial emotions to survive, and it is experienced by someone whose intended desire is defeated by a superior power. Some ideas about social or economic or industrial progress may cause people to experience ambivalence. These feelings of uncertainty are also signs of transition associated with what has been called the postmodern era.

2.2.3 Understanding globalisation in a postmodern era

Many proponents of postmodernity argue that “the aim of Enlightenment thinkers has been abandoned in the course of the 20th century” (Haralambos, Krieken, Smith & Holborn, 1996, p. 721). Haralambos et al (1996) characterised postmodernity as being less optimistic toward progress, with no one set of ideas to solve all problems, denotative language games being replaced by technical language games, research being directed towards producing knowledge as the market demands, and offering tolerance and creative difference. They see that solving the world’s problems is complex, so people do not believe that there are fixed ideas providing absolute truth. They characterise postmodernity as risk and uncertainty, consumption and individualisation.

Van Krieken et al. (2014) contended that the distinction between modernity and postmodernity signals the idea that technological development, especially the computer and internet, have resulted in social transformation. According to Van Krieken et al. (2014) there has been an increasing presence and consumption of mass media. “The role of consumption [of information and communication] is much more important in postmodernity than it was in modern society” (Van Krieken et al., 2014, p. 14). In the postmodern era globalisation is characterised by
compression and intensification, and multidimensional sets of social processes.

Appadurai (1996) also views globalisation as an interactive process. He argues that the modern world is an interactive system that must be viewed with all its complexities. He contends that new order and intensity have been involved in this modern world. Globalisation is assumed to have been in progress for some time, but has been accelerated and intensified by the transfer of technology. “The central problem of today's global interactions is the tension between cultural homogenisation and heterogenisation” (Appadurai, 1996, p. 32). Even though Appadurai views globalisation as an interactive process, he acknowledges the process of intensification of the current period of globalisation.

Globalisation has both compression and intensification features. The concept of globalisation is viewed as compression of the world (Giddens, 1999; Kushendrawati, 2006; Robertson, 1992) and the world is intensified as a whole so that global connection and understanding of that connection increases (Robertson, 1992). Giddens is one among the chief transformationalists who views globalisation as starting from radical change in the quality of space and time. There is a compression of space and time so that different spaces and times do not matter in social interaction. The radical change produces the world in compression, local identity strength, and more benefits to developed countries, so that the gap between the rich and the poor countries widens (Giddens, 1999; Kushendrawati, 2006). This is so because the western nations and more generally the industrial countries have far more influence over world affairs than the poorer states (Giddens, 1999). The more powerful states might expand their labour for specialisation into regional states for skills and production of raw material so that interdependence arises (Tejada, 2007).

Globalisation is also featured by a multidimensional set of social processes (Giddens, 1999; Newell, 2012). According to Giddens (1999), globalisation is not merely an economic phenomenon, but also has
political, cultural and technological dimensions. Giddens sees globalisation as a catalyst for development that brings a number of changes that shape modern societies with influence over four dimensions: namely the world capitalist economy; nation state systems; the world military order; and industrial development (Geogantzas, Katsamakas & Solowiej, 2010). Therefore, Giddens (1999) confirms that globalisation affects societies, firms and the personal lives of people.

Drawing upon Steger (2003), Vylder argues for a multidisciplinary definition of globalisation as follows:

Globalisation refers to a multidimensional set of social processes that create, multiply, stretch, and intensify worldwide social interdependencies and exchanges while at the same time fostering in people a growing awareness of deepening connections between the local and the distant (2008, p. 64).

Vylder (2008) explained that on the monetary level, from July 1944 new international organisations laid the foundations for a more stable world economy, such as the IMF and the World Bank. He further asserted that international organisations and international aid played an essential part in strategies influenced by developmentalism – the notion that Third World countries will foster strong and productive economies through economic policies that promote particular forms of economic activity (Reinert, 2010). This means that neoliberal ideology has empowered many dimensions, including education. Implicitly, educational institutions face a large number of challenges. Neoliberalism forces education institutions to obey the market logic: they are required to build quality in education processes and policies that adjusts to market demands. The authority of knowledge which used to be controlled by educational institutions is fading or becoming liquid because everyone can gain knowledge through the internet and rely less on teacher knowledge. Information technology (IT) becomes an important matter in the classroom. IT-based classroom management becomes a must. What does this mean for EFL teachers?
2.2.4 Appadurai’s ‘scapes’ – globalisation as flows

Among the influential proponents of globalisation is Arjun Appadurai. He diverges from some of the above writers, arguing that globalisation does not bring homogenisation of culture. Globalisation does not produce a single universalising global space, but spaces that are disjunct. He names these spaces as cultural flows. Appadurai saw globalisation as a fluid and dynamic phenomenon tied to worldwide migrations (both voluntary and involuntary) and the dissemination of images and texts via electronic media (Durham & Kellner, 2006).

According to Appadurai (1996), the new global cultural economy is complex, overlapping, and disjunctive. Its political, social and economic order cannot any longer be understood in terms of the ‘centre-periphery’ models that explained previous colonial power relations. Furthermore, “the complexity of the current global economy has to do with certain fundamental disjuncture between economy, culture, and politics” (Appadurai, 1996, p. 33). Appadurai classified the cultural flows as five different ‘scapes’, namely ethno-scapes, media-scapes, techno-scapes, finance-scapes and ideo-scapes (Appadurai, 1996). He assured that the five scapes emerge but are not causally ordered (Heyman & Campbell, 2009). They emerge in and through growing disjunctures.

People, machinery, money, images, and ideas now follow increasingly non isomorphic paths; of course, at all periods in human history, there have been some disjuncture in the flows of these things, but the sheer speed, scale, and volume of each of these flows are now so great that the disjuncture have become central to the politics of global culture (Appadurai, 1996, p. 37).

Appadurai extended his argument for disjuncture to explain the ‘non-isomorphism’ of the five global flows. The disjunctures are critical as they manifest through the concept of deterritorialisation. Deterritorialisation is “one of the central forces of the modern world [where] it brings labouring populations into the lower class sectors and spaces of relatively wealthy societies” (Appadurai, 1996, p. 37). This deterritorialisation plays an important role since it is simultaneously a process in the actual world and
a conceptual break and makes the normal functioning of nation-states problematic and contingent, since their prime challengers are transnational ethnic movements (Heyman & Campbell, 2009).

The idea of ‘disjuncture’ above is adopted to explain the emerging ideas among the flows that in this study are present in the global, national and institutional policy texts and the experience of teaching practice reflected by EFL pre-service teachers.

If globalisation is viewed as cultural flows, it reveals movement of culture. Implicitly, it means that globalisation is not something new. It seems to be in accordance with the sceptic view that globalisation is an imminent process having occurred for many centuries. The five ‘scapes’ provide a way of understanding and rendering more visible these flows over time.

*Ethno-scape* refers to the view of people who undergo the changing world, for example tourists, immigrants, refugees, exiles, quest workers and other moving groups. These individuals are important features of the world and turn out to have influence within and between nations. *Techno-scapes* refer to the global forms of technology, for example, the use of particular software that can be used by people around the world. This techno-scape intensifies the compression of space and time, as Giddens articulated. *Ideo-scapes* refer to images that deal with state ideologies, politics, and movements which counter ideologies that capture state power or a piece of it. The elements of *ideo-scapes* cover the enlightenment worldview consisting of chains of ideas, terms and images, including freedom, welfare, rights, sovereignty, representation and democracy. *Finance-scapes* refer to the movement of global capital that flows rapidly: currency markets, national stock exchanges and commodity speculations. *Media-scapes* refer both to the distribution of the electronic capabilities to produce and disseminate information (newspapers, magazines, television stations, and film-production studios), which are now available to a growing number of private and public interests throughout the world, and to the images of the world created by these media. These Images involve many complicated inflections, depending on
their mode (documentary or entertainment), their hardware (electronic or pre-electronic), their audiences (local, national, or transnational), and the interests of those who own and control them.

Appadurai believed these scapes are the materials of modernity, ‘building blocks’ of the ‘imagined worlds’ that local groups make and remake in distinctive ways for themselves. Marginson and Sawir contend that “Global flows offer the familiar promises of modernity: the prestige and wealth awaiting those who have adroitly positioned themselves under the top of the wave” (2005, p. 282).

Cultural homogenisation and heterogenisation are continually at play and in tension with each other, and globalisation is not a single process but multiple processes in different sectors or domains of practice (Appadurai, 1996; Marginson & Sawir, 2005).

In this study the five ‘scapes’ – ethno-scape, finance-scape, ideo-scape, techno-scape and media-scape – assist in investigating the flow of cultural material across boundaries. Those five scapes help to illustrate how globalisation is articulated in both the experience of teaching practice of EFL pre-service teachers and the policies that set up their experiences. Since globalisation is defined as the interconnection of nations in the world, Appadurai’s global flows – scapes – become the primary tools in examining globalisation in local contexts, and so are a useful lens for examining globalisation’s various points of contact across ‘the local’ and ‘the national’ – namely international schools, the curriculum and students – because his model facilitates an understanding of the variety of flows that inform the global movement of ideas (Tamatea, Hardy & Ninnes, 2008).

An extensive exploration of globalisation literature (Giddens, 1999; Held, 1997) provides strong arguments for the benefits of globalisation. However, my study specifically relates to understanding the flows from the global to the local context. Appadurai’s notion of cultural flows may be successful in analysing the dynamic complexity of the globalisation process and are therefore appropriate to this study in examining the
formation of quality EFL teachers through global, national and local institutional texts.

2.3 Globalisation and its articulations with language teaching

One of the effects of globalisation is that economies often operate through the English language. This has created a demand for mastering English proficiency in order to promote the development of national human capital in many countries (Dang, Nguyen & Le, 2013), including through teacher preparation in Indonesia. The improvement of education quality, including English mastery, is believed to be ensured by the quality of teachers (Madya, 2009). Madya asserted that “up to now a lot of teachers in Indonesia can be said to be under-qualified” (2009, p. 5). The results of a study by Dang et al. (2013) indicated that global elements affect pre-service teachers’ teaching practices in local and national dimensions (such as access to computers and LCD projectors); pre-service teachers in Vietnam predominantly used English in the class; they employed authentic audio and video English materials sourced from the internet, not printed materials; they employed instructional artefacts from international testing systems such as: Test of English for a Foreign Language (TOEFL) and International English Language Testing System (IELTS); they referred to English spoken by native speakers, and prominent use of English by pre-service teachers was rooted in social and community pressure, internationalisation of education and the availability of teaching resources. The above study has similarities with the Indonesian context to some extent. For example, a study in Indonesia by Sugiyarto, Blake and Sinclair (2003) shows that globalisation brings positive effects on tourism growth so that welfare improves. This tourism growth requires an upgraded level of English skills which in turn demands an upgrade in the English proficiency of pre-service EFL teachers. In relation to the context of this study, pre-service EFL teachers are expected to use the English language during their practicum in microteaching held on campus, even though it is not predominantly used outside the classroom. How pre-service EFL teachers respond to
technology in this study in Indonesia is also similar to the study by Dang et al. in Vietnam (2013), as the pre-service EFL teachers in Indonesia also downloaded authentic material from the internet. This reflects how globalisation affects English language teaching in terms of teaching resources. However, in the Indonesian context, English language teaching resources at schools and EFL pre-service teachers’ competencies still need to be developed to meet the national education standard and the changing demand of the global era (Madya, 2009).

What is more, Lamb (2004) investigated the effects of globalisation and global forces on the integrative motivation of Indonesian children when they begin formal English in an urban junior high school. Through his mixed qualitative and quantitative study, the results show that parental views are a common reason to introduce English to primary schools even though English is not yet part of the official primary school curriculum. Parents value English as being extremely important in the lives of their children, and give positive responses regarding western countries in terms of having a high standard of living and advanced technology. Understanding English at an early stage for Indonesian young people is important to make them aware of worldwide culture and information.

However, there is a debate among scholars on language use in the classroom. A study by Hall and Cook (2012) supports first language use in language teaching and learning. Even though they argue the importance of bilingual language teaching in a globalised multilingual world, one of their main research findings shows that “teachers normally agree that English should be the main language used in the classroom, [and] most do not try to exclude completely the learners’ own language, but allow its use only at certain parts of the lesson” (Hall & Cook, 2012, p. 26). Moreover, many curricula, syllabus, institutions, material designers, EFL teachers, parents and students remain in favour of monolingual target language use in teaching English.

An Iranian study by Mehrpour and Vojdani (2012) showed the effects of globalisation issues on motivation for learning EFL. This quantitative study was conducted by distributing questionnaires and analysing the
data using Statistical Package for the Social Sciences (SPSS). The results show that Iranian EFL learners are instrumentally motivated to learn English under the influence of technological, sociological and scientific factors. This finding is similar to the Indonesian context in that globalisation through technological factors motivated learners to improve their English skills.

2.3.1 Globalisation and educational provision: Some challenges

The consequences/effects of globalisation – mobility, employability and competition – generate high expectations of quality education and high standards. The study by Lamb (2004) mentioned earlier reveals high expectations among people in Indonesia to master English language for better standards of living and advanced technology. This means that high quality standards and education in Indonesia need to be facilitated if Indonesia is to respond adequately to the consequences of globalisation.

English has been used as a genuine lingua franca for decades and is now commonly used for international communication (Harmer, 2007). Therefore, a high demand for English proficiency as a result of globalisation in all areas, including employability, becomes a challenge for education, especially EFL teacher education. EFL teacher education institutions are required to upgrade standards to meet global standards if they want to produce competitive graduates.

For example, the employment of international testing systems such as TOEFL and IELTS reveals that international quality standards have been used to assess English language proficiency. Global employability and mobility require applicants to pass such international standardised tests. Many Indonesians pass with satisfactory results of IELTS or TOEFL so that they can study or work in English speaking countries successfully. However, there are some challenges for the rest including for English language teachers. By employing TOEFL-equivalent tests in Indonesia, a study by Lengkanawati (2011) found that the English proficiency of the majority of Indonesian English language teachers was not yet at a presumably sufficient level. This fact showed that international
standardised testing is a great challenge for English teachers. There are several constrains that cause this incompetence. Lie (2007) suggested four constraints that led to EFL teacher incompetence in the Indonesian context, namely: 1) the large number of students and their diversity in terms of motivation, intellectual capability, cultural background and access to educational resources, 2) the limited budget that led to the lack of educational resources, 3) the nature of the EFL learning environment, and 4) the politics of policy and curriculum. In relation to EFL learning environment, Lie contended that:

Indonesia does not provide adequate exposure to English for the majority of the learners. This perhaps used to be a universal constraint among other countries where English is used as a foreign language (2007, p. 8).

Furthermore, Madya (2009) pointed out that what has been desired to the development of the intended competences has not been supported conductively during the process of educating EFL teachers. It is counterproductive that English teachers, who should in fact be role models for students learning English, still face such problems with English proficiency. Therefore, it is a necessity for English teachers and pre-service EFL teachers to upgrade teacher competence and particularly EFL teacher competence in this global context. EFL teachers and EFL teacher education programs in Indonesia are thus challenged by the effects of globalisation which requires them to enhance their English language competence. However Indonesian teachers should not be pessimistic about this challenge, because the reformation era in Indonesia has given insights to Indonesians, as stated by Ali: “Era reformasi telah membangkitkan kembali masyarakat tentang keberhasilan pembangunan nasional untuk menuju bangsa Indonesia yang mandiri dan bersaing tinggi” [The reformation era has generated people’s expectation of national development toward becoming an autonomous and competitive nation] (2009, p. 1). However, regarding educational reform, a study by Raihani (2014) identified four challenges to educational reforms in Indonesia: structural dichotomy of the educational system; corruption throughout most of the bureaucracy; teacher
absenteeism; and the diversity of Indonesian education across the archipelago. These challenges that Raihani identified assisted me in focusing on five particular challenges that globalisation presented in this study (discussed in detail in the following section), regarding the formation of quality EFL teachers, especially as it relates to the diversity of Indonesian education.

2.3.2 Challenges for teachers

Zhao (2010) identified five challenges of globalisation to education, namely: global competitiveness; international testing and the globalisation of educational standards and practices; migration and the changing student population; global competence; and global citizenship. He argued convincingly that these challenges are also challenges for individual teachers. Further, he believed that in the current era of globalisation, teachers are expected to prepare students to be successful not only locally but also globally. Therefore, he asserted that to meet the challenges, teachers have to understand the implications of globalisation, and be able to work effectively with students from various cultures and languages to deliver a globally oriented curriculum.

Zhao (2010) advised that teachers are required to teach effectively in this globalisation era, and he raised five concerns in regard to the challenges. First, in preparing globally competitive citizens, teachers need to have a comprehensive understanding of globalisation and its effects, education practices and systems in other countries, and global economic integration and interdependence. Second, to work with international testing and globalisation of educational practices, teachers are to be mindful of the nature of international testing, developing the ability to compare and analyse different educational policies and practices and having open minds towards different practices while reflecting on their own. Third, in regard to cultivating global competence, teachers must also demonstrate their own competence. Zhao drawing upon the Longview Foundation (2008) defined a globally competent teacher as having the following characteristics:
knowledge of international dimensions of their subject matter and a range of global issues, pedagogical skills to teach their students to analyse primary sources around the world, appreciate multiple points of view and recognize stereotyping, and a commitment to assisting students to become responsible citizens both the world and of their own communities (Zhao, 2010, p. 427).

The fourth concern is coping with a diverse student population; teachers need to be responsive. Zhao cited Garcia et al. (2010) pointing out that among the characteristics of responsive teachers are such things as: being knowledgeable about what students bring to school; being able and skilful at interacting with students with limited English proficiency; and understanding the impact of their students’ home and community cultures. Finally the fifth concern focuses on developing global citizenship. For cultivating global citizenship, teachers are required to have global perspectives, model cultural sensitivity, model global citizenship and engage students in educational activities aimed at developing global citizenship (Zhao, 2010).

2.3.3 Engaging notions of quality

“Quality is not a neutral word [and] is a socially constructed concept, with very particular meanings...produced through the discourse of quality” (Dahlberg, Moss & Pence, 1999, p. 87). This idea of quality, according to Dahlberg et al. (1999), is best understood when linked with economic and political life — a movement that began in the business world and in connection with private goods and services. They explicated that the concept of quality is predominantly about providing a definition and establishing and applying criteria that results in reliable evidence-based decisions:

The process of specification of criteria, and their systematic and methodical application, is intended to enable us to know whether or not something be it a manufactured or service product achieves the standard. Central to the construction of quality is the assumption that there is an entity or essence of quality, which is a knowable, objective and certain
truth waiting 'out there' to be discovered and described (Dahlberg et al., 1999, p. 93).

From what Dahlberg et al. conceptualise above, quality is viewed as something objective. It requires certain criteria that emphasise standard and universal values that can be measured.

However, other literature supports the idea of quality as something subjective. For example, the National Board of Education (1999) in Finland views quality as a dynamic concept because the working environment is always changing and influences customers’ expectations and therefore it considers that:

A quality [is] a relative one, not absolute. Quality can be defined by taking different dimensions into consideration simultaneously, and here the viewpoint is primarily that of the customer, not that of the service provider. Instead of the output, the emphasis lies on the process of service provision itself (National Board of Education, 1999, p. 13).

The above quote from the framework for evaluating educational outcomes in Finland shows that there is also a subjective approach to defining quality. Rather than focusing on output, the framework emphasises the process of establishing the space in which subjective notions of quality exist. This subjective and process view sits in contrast to historical approaches of objectively quantified notions of quality which, according to Graue, Delaney and Karch, have “focused on three aspects of practice with specific attention to teacher quality: inputs, outputs, and process” (2013, p. 3).

Raihani (2014, pp. 45-47) identified three indicators of quality of education to compare general schools and Islamic Elementary schools (Madrasah) in Indonesia, namely: teacher qualification and status, student-teacher ratio and completion rate. These indicators represent objective characteristics of quality which refer to measurable entities. As such they are important measures to incorporate in developing better understandings of the formation of quality EFL teachers. However, it is not sufficient to rely on the notion of quality objectively. The notion of
quality as mentioned in Chapter 2 is not a neutral word and it is not absolute. Therefore, to understand the notion of quality comprehensively the subjective approach to defining quality needs to be considered to sit together with the objective one.

2.3.4 Engaging notions of teacher quality

Preparing quality teachers has become a global concern as all nations attempt to be excellent at all levels of educational provision. Transnational organisations such as UNESCO, the OECD and the World Bank have been central in producing influential discourses about quality to improve educational performance. However, teacher quality is variously defined and often in contradictory ways (Goodwin, 2010). For example, Marsh (2010) emphasised the complexity of being a quality teacher, and therefore quality teacher formation needs careful attention. Hanushek, Rivkin, Rothstein and Podgursky (2004) studied teacher quality in relation to salary, qualification and incentives, as they are determinant factors for improving quality. Darling-Hammond (2005) asserted that good teaching requires acquisition of specialised content knowledge and learning in professional communities and through clinical experiences; those are obtained formally. Meanwhile, Richardson (1996) as cited by Goodwin (2010) asserted that real teaching behaviour is often shaped by positive and negative impressions that reveal the personal knowledge of teaching (such as impressions of who teachers are), rather than by a pre-service program.

According to Goodwin (2010), characteristics of 21st century life might impact teachers. He characterised six phenomena that influenced teachers’ work. The first is the high mobility of people on a global scale, such as how people move across the world for various economic or political reasons. The second phenomenon is the risk of global mobility, such as of transnational employment, which requires highly skilled workers. The third aspect relates to global mobility that is fuelled by war and natural disaster. The fourth is the new economy that generates rapid income growth, which results in wider disparities between the rich and the
poor. The fifth relates to new economies that demand competitive resources. Finally the sixth phenomenon involves technological advances that lead to interdependence on an international level (Goodwin, 2010).

Goodwin (2010) suggested five knowledge domains to prepare teachers in order to achieve quality education. The first domain is personal knowledge/autobiography and philosophy of teaching. The second is contextual knowledge/understanding of children, schools and society. The third aspect is pedagogical knowledge/content of theories, methods of teaching and curriculum development. The fourth dimension is sociological knowledge/diversity of cultural relevance and social justice. The final dimension is social knowledge/cooperative of democratic group processes and conflict resolution (Goodwin, 2010).

However, Goodwin (2010) also identified some barriers to changing the practice of teacher preparation. The obstacles to change include the structure and context of teacher education, how teacher education considers teaching and learning, and the dilemmas facing teacher educators (Goodwin, 2010). The structure and context of teacher education becomes an issue because institutions are usually structured as a collective enterprise involving several different groups, such as school partners, teachers and subject matter experts (lecturers). They may not hold the same views on preparing quality teachers (Goodwin, 2010). Furthermore, Goodwin asserted that learning to teach is multifaceted, particularly in context; it is historically grounded and informed by socio-political realities, and consequently quality teaching often looks different in different settings. Therefore, he recommended embracing the likelihood of multiple routes to quality teaching.

The number of qualified English teachers is still problematic in Vietnam as well as other Asian countries (Dang et al., 2013; Kirkpatrick, 2011). Indonesia is among the Asian countries having similar conditions that include a lack of quality among qualified EFL teachers. Many teachers lack competence in using English as the medium of instruction in the classroom, and “yet teachers are the key agents involved in the teaching
and learning process” (Dang et al., 2013, p. 53). Thus, Dang et al. suggested that “curricular changes need to be supported by appropriate socialisation and quality English teacher education including, as part of a larger set of strategies and programmes, the building of English as a medium of instruction to enhance teaching proficiency” (p. 53).

According to Hollins (2011), the essential knowledge, skills, and understandings for quality teaching includes: 1) knowledge of human growth and development and individual and group differences so as to facilitate learning, 2) deep understanding of pedagogical knowledge focusing on the innovative learning process and assessment which adapt to the current theories of learning innovation, 3) deep comprehension of disciplinary knowledge related to the diversity of learners’ cultural, linguistic and experiential backgrounds, 4) understanding pedagogy and philosophical stances, 5) an understanding of how to manage the demands of standards-based curriculum with learners’ progress, and 6) the ability to maintain a strong professional identity and engage in professional growth. In relation to pedagogical content knowledge (PCK), it is important to understand the concept of PCK. The idea of pedagogical content knowledge was originally initiated by Shulman in his presidential address in 1985 (Segall, 2004; Jing-Jing, 2014). Pedagogical content knowledge is the integration or the synthesis of teachers’ pedagogical knowledge and their subject matter knowledge (Shulman, 1986). According to Shulman content knowledge refers “to the amount and organization of knowledge per se in the mind of the teacher” (1986, p. 9). In dealing with the content knowledge, according to Shulman (1986), teachers must be able to both define the accepted truths in a domain and explain the reasons why it is worth knowing the subject matter and relate it to other disciplines. Shulman further explains that pedagogical knowledge:

\[
\text{goes beyond knowledge of subject matter per se to the dimension of subject matter knowledge for teaching... the particular form of content knowledge that embodies the aspects of content most germane to its teachability. Within the category of pedagogical content knowledge}
\]
Include, for the most regularly taught topics in one's subject area, the most useful forms of representation of those ideas, the most powerful analogies, illustrations, examples, explanations, and demonstrations - in a word, the ways of representing and formulating the subject that make it comprehensible to others. [It] also includes an understanding of what makes the learning of specific concepts easy or difficult: the conceptions and preconceptions that students of different ages and backgrounds bring with them to the learning (1986, p. 9).

Based on the above quote, PCK involves several components including knowledge of students’ understanding of the topics: students’ preconception, misconception, learning interest and learning difficulty.

Pedagogical content knowledge has been developed in many ways and a number of studies on PCK have been conducted related to various school subjects and usefulness. Cochran, King and DeRuiter (1991) developed PCK as:

an integrated understanding that is synthesized from teacher knowledge of pedagogy, subject matter content, student characteristics, and the environmental context of learning. In other words, PCK is using the understandings of subject matter concepts, learning processes, and strategies for teaching the specific content of a discipline in a way that enables students to construct their own knowledge effectively in a given context (1991, p. 10-11).

Cochran et al. developed Shulman’s notion of PCK with more emphasis on the environmental context of learning and the teacher’s knowledge of students. Jing-Jing (2014) conducted a critical review of pedagogical content knowledge components. His study indicated the development of the concept of PCK. Many studies indicate that pedagogical content knowledge is a particular concept which is much more than just subject matter knowledge itself and it develops over time as a result of teaching experience (Cochran, 1997). According to Cochran (1997) the uniqueness of the teaching process requires teachers to transform their subject matter knowledge for the purpose of teaching. This transformation happens because the teachers make a critical reflection on teaching and
interpret the subject matter; they find numerous ways to represent the information, such as making analogies, giving examples, showing problems, and conducting classroom activities to adjust the material to students' developmental levels and abilities, gender, prior knowledge, and misconceptions (Cochran, 1997). Cochran, DeRuiter and King (1993) revised Shulman's original model of PCK to be more consistent with a constructivist perspective on teaching and learning. This included an integration of four major components: 1) subject matter knowledge, 2) pedagogical knowledge, 3) teachers' knowledge of students' abilities and learning strategies, ages and developmental levels, attitudes, motivations, prior knowledge of the concepts to be taught, and 4) teacher knowledge that contributes to pedagogical content knowledge is teachers' understanding of the social, political, cultural and physical environments in which students are asked to learn (Cochran et al., 1993). The fourth component differs from Shulman’s, where Cochran et al. add a focus on the physical environment where learners learn. Teachers need to understand the socio, political, cultural, and physical environments in which learners are to learn, as teachers’ transformation of subject knowledge occurs in context. Another concept of PCK was developed by Grossman (Jing-Jing, 2014). Grossman's construct of PCK components include 'conception of teaching purposes', knowledge of students, curricular knowledge, and knowledge of instructional strategies and representations for teaching particular topics (Jing-Jing, 2014, p. 413). Compared to Shulman’s concept, knowledge of conception of teaching purposes is added in Grossman. Other clarifications of PCK that extended Shulman’s concept as identified by Jing-Jing (2014) include Magnusson, Krajcik, and Borko’s (1999) concept of orientation to teaching and knowledge of assessment, Tamir’s (1988) concept of knowledge of evaluation, and Marks’ (1990) study on media for instruction which is not included in Grossman’s 1990 study, nor other studies.

In my study, PCK is relevant to the issue of how preparing pre-service teachers and the major concerns they have about their pedagogical content knowledge. Grossman’s study (1989) indicated that the concern
on PCK is “present even in new teachers who possess the substantial subject matter knowledge in a specific subject matter area, in this case, in English” (Cochran et al., 1991, p. 8). However, the above literature on PCK does not sufficiently address the context of this study which is also concerned with information and technology (IT), the effects of globalisation on pedagogy, and the content of pedagogy.

2.3.5 The quality teacher in the context of globalisation

In contemporary times, teacher education programs constitute the notion of a quality teacher that may be different from the concept as it was in the past. Here I take this issue up through the notion of the ideal teacher (Arnon & Reichel, 2007). For example, Hopkins and Stern identified key characteristics of high quality teachers as having “commitment, love of children, mastery of subject didactics and multiple models of teaching, the ability to collaborate with other teachers, and a capacity for reflection” (1996, p. 501). Arnon and Reichel (2007) studied the general image and principles of an ideal teacher as perceived by student teachers and beginning teachers. From their study, the identified characteristics of ideal teachers cover personality dimensions, such as being empathetic and attentive to their pupils and professional knowledge, their knowledge of what is being taught and their ability to use a variety of teaching methods. Student teachers who have not yet 'really' taught value the personality components over knowledge, while beginning teachers evaluate both components as being of similar importance.

Of relevance to this study is the research on good language teachers, which reveals that one of the characteristics of good foreign language teachers is the maximum use and talk in the target foreign language (Bailey, 2001). In Bailey’s 2001 study, some characteristics of outstanding teachers' lessons involved more use and talk in the target language by the teachers and students, more use of praise and joking, personalised questions and non-verbal information giving. Bailey’s study supports most literature suggesting several tasks which the good language teacher should do in practice such as: providing clear language
items to be taught; providing meaningful use of language in communication activities generally used by native speakers; using the students’ native language minimally; engaging the students; and providing the students with cultural insights into the foreign country.

A study by Erbay, Erdem and Sağlamel (2014) suggests several characteristics of good language teachers. They include: finely-tuned classroom authority, energy, tolerance, creativity, a sound knowledge of language, ongoing professional development, and enhancement of student autonomy, good communication skills, and teaching experience. Sanderson’s (1983) study demonstrated that good language teachers use the target language predominantly and are careful of the pronunciation, intonation and stress (Ng & Cordia, 2003). They engage in intensive oral exploitation of material, promote understanding by non-verbal clues, relate the target foreign language to the target culture, and explain tasks clearly (Ng & Cordia, 2003). They also provide a variety of material, show flexibility with regard to objectives, and build upon pupil error. Finally, good language teachers provide a variety of language activities involving the whole group, are skilled in handling equipment, and promote use of the foreign language by pupils (Ng & Cordia, 2003).

Das and El-Sabban (1996) examined the characteristics of the ideal teacher in a classroom setting from the perspective of students and faculty in the United Arab Emirates. They employed a questionnaire referring to three types of characteristics of an ideal teacher, namely professional, educational and personal qualities. The results of the study reveal differences between students and faculty: students value personal qualities as being the most important, while faculty members view teaching qualities as more important.

According to Jhakar (2011), the ideal teacher has several characteristics, namely: knowing fully the content of the subject, a pleasant tone of expression, a good sense of humour, the highest degree of integrity, being concise and clear in both oral and written expression, patience, self-confidence, a source of great pleasure, a good self-concept, being
open, being an excellent role model, having good personal hygiene, and being disciplined, cooperative, friendly and obedient to the head of the institution. These characteristics reflect the three types of qualities summarised above by Das & El-Sabban (1996), namely professional, teaching and personal qualities.

Deriving from the above ideas, a quality EFL teacher in this global context may have the following characteristics: good personal and social qualities, solid professional qualities, mastery of pedagogical content knowledge, and global understanding.

2.4 Globalisation and EFL as a medium of instruction

Global flows may change the context of how English as a foreign language is taught and learned. “The availability of English as a global language is accelerating globalisation, [and at the same time] the globalisation is accelerating the use of English” (Graddol, 2006, p. 22). Global mobility of people, technology, media, finance and ideas have demanded awareness of the new context for teaching English. In response to an increasingly complex society and rapidly changing technology-based economy, schools are being asked to educate the most diverse student body to higher academic standards than ever before (Darling-Hammond, 1998, 2005), including the teaching of English. Therefore, it is challenging for EFL teachers to accomplish their work under global circumstances.

Particularly in Indonesia, the teaching of English is especially challenging. The teaching of English in Indonesia began sometime before Indonesian independence. Drawing on Huda (1999), Mistar (2005) contended that English was regarded as important after Indonesian independence to serve Indonesians for international communication, and drawing on Sadtono (1997), Mistar (2005) argued that since independence, the teaching-learning process of English language in schools has not been effective.
Chronologically Mistar (2005) classified the teaching of English in Indonesia into three stages, namely pre-independence, early independence (1945-1950), and the development period (1950 onwards). English was first taught to Indonesians in the early 1900s, when Indonesia was still under the Dutch colony (Lauder, 2008; Lie, 2007; Mistar, 2005; Sadtono, 1979). Sadtono according to Mistar (2005) contended that during the Dutch colonial period, the teaching of English was assumed to be successful due to small classes that resulted in effective teaching. At that time the schools were attended by only very few Indonesian children who belonged to the privileged class and by Dutch children (Kell & Kell, 2014; Lauder, 2008).

However, the success of teaching English did not last long at that time. When the Japanese armies threw out the Dutch in early 1942, the teaching of Dutch and English was forbidden in Indonesia (Mistar, 2005, p. 72). Even so, during that time instruction in foreign languages still occurred, although in secret (Groeneboer, 1998; Mistar, 2005).

The teaching of English gained its importance again in 1945 along with the proclamation of Indonesian independence. According to Mistar (2005), drawing on Thomas (1968), English was chosen to be the first foreign language in Indonesia because Dutch was the language of the colonialists and Indonesian leaders at the time were not ready to adopt the language of their enemy. In addition, Dutch did not have the international status that English did (Lauder, 2008). English was regarded as important after Indonesian independence to serve Indonesians for international communication (Mistar, 2005). However, during that period the teaching-learning process in schools was not effective because of domestic political troubles (Mistar, 2005).

The necessity of teaching English was raised again in 1949 when urgent action was taken by the Ministry of Education to establish English language teaching supervisors through setting up the Inspectorate of English Language Instruction. During this time the demand for teaching English increased and resulted in a shortage of qualified English teachers.
and inadequate availability of English instructional material; therefore the government made some efforts and ran some projects to improve the quality of teaching (Mistar, 2005). For example, from the early 1950s, the Indonesian government through the US Ford Foundation introduced the audio-lingual approach, which led to an audio-lingual based curriculum with a language laboratory as the main support and the development of audio-lingual textbooks (Sahiruddin, 2013).

Gradually English has come to play a role in broader areas and the teaching of English is more in demand than ever before. For example, in the development period the demand reached tertiary education, with the primary objective being to provide the students with the ability to read English textbooks in their fields (Suharmanto, 2003). This became important in society at large particularly in business, politics, education and media (Lauder, 2008; Muller, Herder, Adamson & Brown, 2011). Becoming a compulsory subject at school also exemplifies how English came to play an important role in education. During this development period, the role of English was strengthened by the Presidential Decree No. 28/1990, which allowed English to be taught earlier than before, from the fourth grade and to continue through until senior high school (Dardjowidjojo, 1998).

However, Dardjowidjojo (1998) claimed that the outcomes of teaching English were discouraging. He contended that the majority of Indonesians, including many highly educated language scholars, did not master English well enough to absorb scientific materials written in English and that their oral ability was worse. He predicted that this situation would become a major obstacle, since progress in science and technology is recorded in English. He argued therefore that “it is understandable if a national leader feels compelled to allow English as a language of instruction” (Dardjowidjojo, 1998, p. 45).

Based on research conducted nationally, English is not fully used in English lessons in Indonesian classrooms. For example, Hamied (1997) found that 75.5% of teachers use English and Indonesian (bilingually)
during their teaching. But some studies also demonstrate “that many teachers of English are poor users of the language...Thus, it is very hard to expect them to facilitate the transfer of learning in their English classrooms” (Lie, 2007, p. 5).

Lauder (2008) contended that English has two functions in Indonesia, namely as a means of international communication in practically all areas and a medium through which scientific knowledge and new technologies can be assessed and implemented with the intention of achieving competitive success in the global marketplace. He further states that the two functions are officially recognised, sanctioned and written into policy.

The Decree of the Minister of Education No. 26/2006 on Content Standards (Republik Indonesia, 2006) states that English teaching begins at the junior high school level. This policy ensures the function of teaching English as a foreign language in Indonesia is embedded in schooling. The endorsement of this policy is also intended to meet the demand created by global markets and subsequent aims to improve Indonesia’s global competitiveness.

The global economy has driven the demand for English mastery by society. Spring (2008) contended that, among other things instruction in English, as the language of commerce, contributes to the global homogeneity of the national curriculum. Similarly, when it is applied as a language of instruction, as in an English Department in the Indonesian context, the adoption of English may facilitate economic development in Indonesia. Moreover, the challenges of English language teaching in Indonesia are greater in these global circumstances because educational performance in Indonesia is still problematic if it is seen from the government policies in the educational sector that have not exhibited a strong system and strategy to face globalisation (Chang et al., 2014; Kell, 2004; Madya, 2002; Raihani, 2014).
2.5 Globalisation, neoliberalism and teacher education

This discussion of globalisation and the formation of quality EFL teachers would be incomplete without mention of the influence of neoliberalism on education systems at global, national and local institutional levels. It is the case that the formation of quality EFL teachers takes place within the context of the national education system, which is also influenced by what happens in other major systems, such as the political system. So, whenever there is a change in the political system globally, this will certainly affect the education system nationally and locally. In addition, the uptake of neoliberal ideas over time, in different ways and with different nuances in each period, means it is necessary to include a discussion of neoliberal ideas with respect to how they shape ideas about quality EFL teachers at this point in time.

Defined variously, Peck and Tickell (2002) suggest neoliberalism is a type of free market economic theory associated with the Chicago school of economics:

Neoliberalism has provided a kind of operating framework or 'ideological software' for competitive globalisation, inspiring and imposing far-reaching programs of state restructuring and rescaling across a wide range of national and local contexts. Crucially, its premises also established the ground rules for global lending agencies operating in the crisis-torn economies of Asia, Africa, Latin America, and the former Soviet Union (Peck & Tickell, 2002, p. 380).

Neoliberalism is also assumed as a policy reform programme initiated and rationalised through a relatively coherent theoretical and ideological framework (Larner, 2000). As a policy agenda, the values that rest in it include those of the individual, freedom of choice, market security, laissez faire, and minimal government.

Martinez and Garcia (2016) agree with this point of view, describing the main points of neoliberalism as governed by the notion of markets and economic growth. According to this approach to economic governance, individuals are now responsible for themselves. They cannot rely on the community or the government as a safety net in times of economic
hardship which includes reduction of expenditure in areas such as roads, water supply, as well as expenditure for social services such as education and health care. The notion of the market also includes ideas of privatisation in which goods and services are managed and owned by private investors. This also includes deregulation that reduces the government responsibility for regulation of national economic practices.

Larner (2000) identified three different interpretations of neoliberalism, namely as a policy framework, as an ideology, and as the lens of governmentality. As a policy framework, neoliberalism is marked by a shift from Keynesian welfare towards a political agenda favouring the relatively free operation of markets. Keynesian is “a theory of total spending in the economy (called aggregate demand) and its effects on output” (Blinder, 2008).

Often this renewed emphasis on markets is understood to be directly associated with the so-called globalisation of capital. Harvey (2005) assumed that neoliberalism was a theory of political economic practices that proposed that human well-being can be advanced by liberating individual entrepreneurial freedom and skills within institutional frameworks, characterised by resource privatisation or strong private property rights, free market and trade (Thorsen & Lie, n.d.). Regarding the above literature, neoliberalism can be defined as having features that include free economy (free market and trade) and globalisation as internationalism, while property rights are tightening and capital is invested in the international sector. In terms of the role of the state, neoliberalism minimises its role (minimal in economic activities, leaving the economy to the private sector; minimal economic policy). It means that the government budget is tightened and resource privatisation is upheld and the individual is considered to be liberalised.
In terms of governance, neoliberalism is marked by a decreased role of government and a greater emphasis on market forces. Sukmaningsih is reported in Kompas ("Kebijakan ekonomi Indonesia 100 persen liberal," 2009, June 9)\(^1\) as saying that Indonesian national policy seems to reproduce not only elements of neoliberal managerialist ideas but also elements of a globalising human-rights and social justice orientation. This has a focus upon the achievement of equity (Tamatea, 2005) such that neoliberal management principles – economic efficiencies, the logic of competitiveness, economic freedom – are re-constructed to be implicitly synonymous with social justice principles – pathways, access, equity and opportunity and collective action for public good. A critical perspective acknowledges that this reconstruction is misleading. For example, Muhsin (2008) contended that neoliberal ideas, as they are currently positioned in Indonesia, direct educational opportunity largely for the benefit or preservation of the upper and middle classes. Decreases in government education subsidies result in education being unreachable for the poor. This condition erodes the quality of education available to those unable to pay for it, and in the Indonesian context that is a large number of people (OECD & Asian Development Bank, 2015).

Perguruan tinggi bisa menggali pendanaan lokal dengan menjual jasa pendidikan kepada masyarakat secara cepat dan menguntungkan, di sisi lain di dalam PT itu sendiri terjadi degradasi kualitas pendidikan. Atau mempertahankan kualitas pendidikan namun kesulitan dalam pengadaan pendanaan pendidikan (Muhsin, 2008, p. 8)

[Higher education can be acquired through local funding by selling educational services to society fast and profitably, On the other hand, in the internal side of that in higher education, degradation of education quality may occur. Or [The institution may] maintain the quality of education but find difficulty in providing educational funding.]

\(^1\) Kompas.com is a major news source considered one of Indonesia’s leading credible news and multimedia portals.
There are many studies on language planning and policy highlighting the effects of globalisation in spreading the English language as a medium of instruction in non-English speaking countries (Dang et al., 2013). A study on the impacts of globalisation on EFL teacher education in Vietnam by Dang, Nguyen and Le (2013) revealed that many factors intervened with global influences on teaching practices, such as social and community pressure, trends toward the internationalization of education, and the availability of teaching resources.

The purpose of this study was to explore the broader components of EFL pre-service teacher formation with a view to better understanding the global flow of ideas shaping and being shaped in this field. Universities and teacher education departments are an important part of this space. In Indonesia, similar influencing factors such as neoliberalism may be present but their local effects are not yet fully understood. The social theory framework adopted in this study was designed to draw out the more complex parts of these systems and provide an opportunity to explore the interweaving of global, national and local levels of quality EFL teacher formation in Central Javanese contexts.

2.5.1 Pre-service teacher education institutions in the globalisation era

The government regulation pertaining to teachers (Republik Indonesia, 2008b) states that the teacher education program is the higher education program that functions to carry out teacher supply for formal pre-primary education, primary education, and higher education. This regulation also functions “to develop educational theories including education programs at Tarbiyah [the systematic development and training of Muslims] faculty and other faculties of the same type” (Republik Indonesia, 2008b, p. 7). These teacher education institutions produce graduates that are required to meet national standards of graduate competence.

Teacher education institutions enact the mandated messages of the Law on the National Education System, Teacher Law and related government regulations in the formation of quality teachers. For example, Government Regulation No. 19/2005 is used as a reference for the benchmarks of the
graduate competence standards in the curriculum. The curriculum contains a bundle of plans and arrangements of goals, content, learning materials and strategies to guide and carry out learning activities to achieve a certain level of education (Republik Indonesia, 2003, 2005a). Therefore curriculum should also mediate the national messages noted at the beginning of this thesis.

Teacher education programs around the world are involved in the process of global change. Drawing on Cochran-Smith and Fries (2001), Arnon and Reichel (2007) maintain that the change is triggered by the social, economic and political changes that challenge what ideal teachers should be and how they should be prepared.

Pre-service teacher education programs play an important role in preparing teachers in an era of globalisation. In an earlier section of this chapter, Zhao’s (2010) studies provided a clear framework for mapping the challenges teachers face in this era of globalisation. Zhao’s work also provides further guidance for those aiming to produce teachers who can respond well to these globalising contexts. First is to advocate policy changes, because the current education policies are regarded as major obstacles in preparing globally competent students and teachers. Second is shifting the thinking from serving the local community to the global. Third is articulating expectations for all teacher candidates to become globally competent. Fourth is rearranging the existing programs to suit the needs of education in the age of globalisation. Fifth is including a comprehensive and coherent curriculum covering the courses, experiences and activities aimed at preparing globally competent teachers. Sixth is developing global education partnerships. Zhao’s ideas are relevant in preparing EFL teachers in such local contexts as Surakarta so that graduates from English departments are ready to meet the global market for employability.

Teaching practice is a crucial part of becoming a teacher and an important component in developing the competencies noted by Zhao above. University teacher education programs use a number of terms to
describe this experience: professional practice, supervised professional experience, internship, school-based training, work place learning or student teaching. The experience is designed to prepare pre-service teachers for the real world of the classroom (Keogh, Dole & Hudson, 2007). It is often the first opportunity for prospective teachers to participate in the actual activity of teaching (Tok, 2010). It also provides pre-service teachers with the opportunity to learn about teachers’ work (Barbutiu, Rorrison & Zeng, 2011). It is a time for individuals preparing for a career in education to apply the theories and methods that they have studied during their teacher preparation programs (Norris, Larke & Briers, 1990). Furthermore, experiences obtained in teaching practice are necessary components in the broader training of learning to be a teacher (Wyss, Siebert & Dowling, 2012).

Teaching practice forms a vital part of pre-service teachers’ experience of becoming a teacher as it helps them to obtain professional experience, build professional knowledge, undertake professional practice and professional engagement to prepare them in this era of globalisation. Teaching practice facilitates pre-service EFL teachers to acquire the important and relevant knowledge and skills as well as attitudes. This is what teacher education programs need to consider when producing teachers. Madya (2009) at least suggested that teacher education programs need to focus on developing EFL communicative competence and EFL teaching competence and skills of the execution of those competencies as well as developing positive attitudes towards professional development. By providing sufficient teaching practice, it is expected that the goals to produce quality pre-service teachers would be achieved. The teaching practice components in pre-service teacher education are described below.

Microteaching
Teaching practice (practicum) is an important component in teacher education programs. It is practiced differently among countries depending
on its context. For example, teaching practice is conducted in both microteaching laboratories on campus and through school-based teaching experiences in Indonesia. However, it is not common practice in Australia or New Zealand to conduct microteaching sessions in laboratories on campus. Instead, pre-service teachers (the undergraduates) undertake their required teaching practicum in schools across several years of their teacher education programs. In an Australian context, Geng, Midford and Buckworth described the practicum as the period of time when pre-service teachers are "observing and participating in authentic teaching and learning settings [with] the primary purpose to provide PSTs with opportunities to become acquainted with the graduate standards, requirements and practice of their future profession" (2016, p. 102).

In the Indonesian context, "microteaching typically includes student-teachers conducting (mini) lessons to a small group of students (often in a laboratory setting) and then engaging in post-discussions about lessons" (Hattie, 2009, p. 112). A microteaching course is designed to provide a bridge between theory and practice for EFL pre-service teachers to address quality teaching.

Indonesian EFL teacher education programs are usually four years long with two semesters per year and the overall program is worth 146 credit points. During their study, Indonesian pre-service teachers usually undertake a microteaching course in their third year of study. According to Cruickshank and Metcalf, this amounts to a 'laboratory experience': "a scaled-down teaching encounter in which pre-service teachers demonstrate their ability to perform one of several desirable teaching abilities to a group of 3-5 peers during a short time period" (1993, p. 87). In this context, pre-service teachers prepare and teach brief lessons to their peers, focusing on selected elements in which a teacher will be required to demonstrate overall competence in graduating from their course. These elements might include developing 'clear instructions' (p. 87), using particular resources such as a computer or a flipchart, and facilitating selected teaching pedagogies, such as small group discussions (Cruickshank & Metcalf, 1993).
Microteaching is an important course in pre-service teacher education. A study on microteaching experiences in an English language education program in the Faculty of Education in the United Arab Emirates University (UAEU) by Ismail (2011) indicates that prospective teachers gained a variety of benefits from microteaching experiences.

**Field-based experience at schools**

In field-based teaching, pre-service teachers are placed in a school and required to participate in the school program, take responsibility for planning lessons, teach a sequence of lessons or a selected part of a program, and generally take responsibility for a class. Field-based teaching in a school provides various opportunities for prospective teachers to experience the ‘real context’ of a school. During the first week of field-based teaching, prospective teachers are usually introduced to the school environment and complete classroom observations. They observe administrative tasks, classroom situations, students, and how their mentor teachers design, plan, prepare and deliver lesson plans. The rest of the weeks are spent teaching, either supervised by their mentor teachers or wholly responsible for the class.

While teacher education programs provide clear guidance, instructions and strategies for prospective teachers, many face challenges during their teaching practice. A study in Malaysia (Yunus, Hashim, Ishak & Mahamod, 2010) has demonstrated that the challenges student teachers experience during teaching practice often stem from cultural differences that create misunderstandings. These misunderstandings result in negative perceptions about students combined with problems in adjusting to new social environments because of cultural differences. Cultural differences also generate misunderstandings because of differences in speech style which generates problems in applying learning in real contexts. These challenges could be seen when trainee teachers were dealing with students with mixed-ability because they had to teach the students according to their ability and proficiency. Another study demonstrates the problems dealing with instructional strategies and classroom management (Aydin, Demirdogen & Tarkin, 2012). Keogh et al.
(2007) indicated that the challenges result from mentors at the schools where student teachers practised teaching. They contended that not all experienced teachers are effective mentors, and therefore they need to undertake professional development and training in effective mentorship to enable them to provide fully-rounded practicum experiences for the pre-service teachers with whom they work. An Australian study (Buckworth, 2016) has noted the effect of mentor teachers on the student teachers’ experience of school practicum.

This period of time in simulated or actual settings is an important time for prospective teachers as they negotiate system reform (Raihani, 2014), curriculum reform (Mulyasa, 2013) and challenges to their personal identity (Buckworth, 2016). The flow on effects of technology is another issue they must navigate during this time.

2.5.2 Pre-service Teachers and ICT

One significant aspect of reform in EFL and more broadly is the role of technology and how globalisation presents new challenges and tasks for teachers because technology has changed the tradition of English teaching significantly. In addition, various technological alternatives have the potential to make teaching more interesting, to widen students’ knowledge about the culture of English, to create more conducive environments and to improve teaching efficiency (Patel, 2013; Pun, 2013). For example, there are advantages in using multimedia technology in teaching and learning communication skills, such as to improve students’ motivation, teaching effects, students’ understanding of western culture, teacher-student interaction, supporting contextual learning, promoting students’ communication capacity and facilitating malleable adjustment to the teaching material.

Technology-based curriculum and technological practice cannot be separated in the process of promoting effective integration of technology into the pre-service teacher education curriculum (Al-Zahrani, 2015). A study by Merç (2015) indicates the need for better integration of
technology in EFL teacher training and a stronger link between the placement schools and the university.

Hismanoglu’s study (2012) of the prospective EFL teachers’ perception of Information and Communication Technologies (ICT) integration shows that those having negative attitudes to ICT integration feel inadequate to use ICT due to insufficient knowledge of ICT. The results of the study imply that training in ICT is critical for pre-service EFL teachers and EFL teachers.

Besides that, a study by Black and Goebel (2004) shows the importance of teaching language variety in the Indonesian context and argues the importance of using ICT as a teaching media. It is argued that teachers, native or otherwise, cannot genuinely be adequate role models of the sort of dialectal variety with which learners of major languages often need to be able to cope. It would surely be even more difficult for them to illustrate the social significance of code choice in such multilingual situations as Indonesia. What is more, models of dialect variety and code choice can be supplied through audio-visual material, such as television programs. Drawing upon Fairclough (1992), Black and Goebel (2004) argued that learners still need to use Standard English in conventional ways when they judge it to be necessary because they will be disadvantaged if they do not develop that ability. Harmer (2007) contends that students of English as an international language need to understand as many varieties and accents as possible if they are to be competent users of English. The value of resource materials can be enhanced through computerised access and manipulation; even authentic multimedia material can achieve better results than the individual teacher.

Motschnig-Pitrik and Holzinger’s (2002) study also advises the use of ICT to facilitate learning by a combination of student-centred teaching and e-learning. Their case study revealed that such learning demands qualifications and social skills that are very different from those needed for conventional teaching. Interestingly, it appears that new media could
be extremely well employed to support a coach or facilitator in numerous ways particularly relevant to a student-centred approach.

Motschnig-Pitrik & Holzinger (2002) echoed Rogers (1983) and Aspy (1972) asserting that the student-centred approach relies on the assumption that students who are given the freedom to explore areas based on their personal interests, and who are accompanied in their striving for solutions by a supportive, understanding facilitator, not only achieve higher academic results but also experience an increase in personal values, such as flexibility, self-confidence and social skills.

To summarise, the role of technology and how globalisation presents new challenges and tasks for teachers are significant aspects in reforming the tradition of English teaching. Mandated ideas existent in the global policy agenda cannot be ignored in this globalised world. The role of technology to facilitate learning is important. It eases the process of delivery to the students. In accordance with Misra and Koehler’s (2006) conceptual framework for educational technology, by building on Shulman’s formulation of ‘pedagogical content knowledge’, it is important to integrate technology with pedagogy. Therefore, in this study of preparing quality EFL teachers in Indonesia, integrating technology in pedagogical content knowledge is vital in this global era. The following section discusses the policy agendas which influence the tradition of EFL teaching, EFL teacher education and the formation of quality EFL teachers.

2.6 Policy agendas as global, national and local artifacts
As noted earlier, policy responds to international developments and this involves international agreements and collaboration. Accordingly, two major global policy agendas, *Education for All* (hereafter termed EFA) and Millennium Development Goals (hereafter termed MDGs) provide a major focus for the rest of this study.

In 1990 the international community made commitments towards “the Rights-based approach to education supported by the Universal Declaration of Human Rights to achieve education for every citizen”
(UNESCO, 2000, p. 3). Then, at the 2000 World Education Forum in Dakar, they reaffirmed the vision of the former Jomtien declaration (UNESCO, 1990) and produced *The Dakar Framework* (UNESCO, 2000), which provides a “blueprint’ for development by 2015 of education systems around the world” (Tamatea, 2005, p. 311). Observers and researchers of such major policy agendas agree that *The Dakar Framework* is central to international policy agendas (Peters, 2007). This EFA policy agenda is significant to this study because it contains major references to quality education.

Equally significant as a global policy agenda are the MDGs. MDGs are “the highest profile articulation of the internationally agreed development goals associated with the United Nations” (United Nations, 2010, p. 2). This particular development agenda is based on the agreement among state leaders and delegates from 189 countries involved in the United Nations. This declaration has agreed the targets for prosperity and social development, initially established in 2000 and updated as recently as 2010 (United Nations, 2010), 2015 (United Nations, 2012), (United Nations, 2014) and post-2015 as Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) (Griggs et al., 2013).

As one of 189 state members of the United Nations, Indonesia has been committed to engaging in global cooperation (United Nations, 2014). The government of Indonesia, coordinated by the Ministry of National Development Planning (BAPPENAS) and the special agency responsible for the achievement of the MDGs, has occasionally adopted a whole government approach to coordinating resources. BAPPENAS has delegated authority to achieve the MDG targets for Indonesia by 2015. The MDGs guided the 2010-2014 Indonesian National Development plan and the actions of the responsible ministries, such as education (Lundine, Hadikusumah & Sudrajat, 2013). MDG related documents are significant to this study because of the concern with education (see MDG Goal 2) and achieving global partnerships for development (MDG Goal 8). The link of ideas between global policy texts and Indonesian national texts
seems to emerge from prescriptions elaborated at the global level. For example, the MDGs explicitly focus upon national education systems:

To achieve Millennium Development Goal 2, national education systems need to be strengthened by addressing infrastructure, human resource and governance constraints, backed by international donor support (United Nations, 2010, p. 20).

Therefore, the MDGs documents provide a useful point of reference for global policy agendas and the extent to which their influence is directed towards national and local action.

National Policy documents are also relevant to this study and cover a multitude of contexts, including Laws, Decrees and Regulations. For example:

- An Indonesian Law is used as authority to regulate advice, provide funds, declare or restrict something which is usually first proposed by legislative members and executives (The President) and then discussed among legislators
- An Indonesian government regulation is a rule of law which is determined by the President to enact the law. It has the force of law
- An Indonesian Decree is a rule of law which is issued by Ministries.

Examples relevant to this study include:

- Law No. 20/2003 on National Education System (hereafter referenced as NES)
- Law No. 14/2005 pertaining to teachers and lecturers (hereafter referenced as Teacher Law)
- Government Regulation No. 32/2013 on National Standards of Education as a revised version of No. 19/2005 on National Standards of Education (hereafter termed as New NSE)
- Decree of the Minister of Education No. 22/2006 on content standards for elementary and high schools (hereafter termed Content Standards).
The above documents provide exemplars of each of the specific types of texts relevant to this study.

At the local level, institutional policy texts address institutional practices and procedures, such as curriculum documents and institutional microteaching and field work operational guides.

2.7 Conclusion

To summarise, Chapter 2 has provided a way of thinking about the formation of quality EFL teachers that takes as its starting point the influences of globalisation as they emerge in global policy documents and flow through national and local institutional texts. The literature that elaborates debates about globalisation and quality helps us to understand the broader context of the formation of quality EFL teachers in Indonesia. Understanding various views of globalisation assists in framing how EFL teachers and their teacher education courses are influenced by global, national and local institutional policy texts. Considering that globalisation is the material of modernity, it is also worth looking at the debates around modernity and postmodernity, including their characteristics which influence the educational bureaucracy, ambivalence experienced by pre-service EFL teachers, and challenges in facing globalisation. Considering that ‘quality’ is one of the key ideas in this study, it is also important to understand the debates on the notion of quality, quality teachers and quality teaching. The characteristics and debates of neoliberal ideas were also presented to strengthen the understanding and defining of quality. Along with understanding the notion of quality, it is worth understanding pre-service teacher education in the local context and the debates around this globally. Considering that this study relates to policy, Chapter 2 also introduced the policy documents focusing on teacher preparation and quality discourse.

In the next chapter I describe a methodology for collecting and analysing texts – policies, interview transcripts, field notes and media texts – as a
way of bringing together the complex spaces in which pre-service teachers are formed.
Chapter 3
Methodology
3. Methodology

3.1 Introduction

The central point emphasised in this study is that the formation of quality EFL teachers is influenced by global, national and institutional policy documents, their experience of teaching practice, and the voice of the digital public. In order to understand the emerging ideas regarding the formation of quality EFL teachers across these various texts, the methodological approach of this study has been broadly informed by critical educational research (Cohen, Manion & Morrison, 2000). The critical paradigm from which this research emerges emphasises “the influence of social, political, cultural, economic, ethnic... values” upon both texts and contexts (Mertens, 2005, p. 23). This study is methodologically informed by aspects of the critical ethnographic approach which studies “social action taking place in one or more social sites” with the view to explaining “this action through examining locales and social systems intertwined with the site of interest” (Carspecken, 1996, p. 40).

Hence the aim of this study is to facilitate an understanding of the formation of quality EFL teachers through the influence of various global, national and institutional policy texts, including those generated by the digital public, in addition to the teachers’ own experience of teaching practice.

Chapter 3 presents the methodology used in pursuing this research project's aim. I initiate the discussion of this by explaining the research paradigm, including the philosophical frameworks underlying the selection of the research methodology, after which I present the research orientation. More specifically, this research project is guided by the principles and methodological practices of critical ethnography (Carspecken, 1996). Following an introductory review of critical ethnography, the discussion then explores data collection techniques, data analysis and the data interpretation framework used by this research.
project. Data analysis and interpretation are informed by Arjun Appadurai’s (1996) discussion of globalisation and his notion of global flows along global scapes. The final methodological discussion focuses upon research ethics, and the particular ethics approach taken in this research project.

Importantly, however, this study does not conclude with the provision of a solution or solutions to the research problem. Instead it contributes to expanding the discursive grounds for generating informed discussion regarding improved practice: discussion based upon the pre-service teachers’ awareness of how their field is contextually informed by a multitude of structuring and de-structured global flows at a range of contextual levels.

3.2 Research paradigm

At the broadest level, a research paradigm is “a way of looking at the world” (Mertens, 2005, p. 7) such that it contains basic philosophical assumptions that direct and guide action (Creswell, 2009; Guba & Lincoln, 1994; Mertens, 2005). It is important to understand that the research paradigm directly impacts the conduct of research as it informs that which comprises the research methodology (Crotty, 1998). Such activities are associated first with understanding the world to be constituted in a particular way, and second as strategies for generating knowledge (if not truth) from that — otherwise often referred to as ontology and epistemology (Guba & Lincoln, 1994). The identification of the research paradigm is thus critical to the research design of an investigative project (Mackenzie & Knipe, 2006).

Lather (2006) identifies four research paradigms, namely: positivism, interpretivism, critical theory and poststructuralism. Each offers a different understanding of what comprises ‘reality’ or ‘truth’ (ontology) and consequently a different perspective on how such reality or truth might be known (epistemology). Differences among these paradigms can be discerned in their response to five fundamental research related
relationships, namely: 1. the understanding of reality, 2. the theory-data relationship, 3. the researcher-participant relationship, 4. the data and truth relationships, and finally 5. the ethics relationship. The discussion below commences with an exploration of the understanding of reality.

3.2.1 Reality

In terms of understanding reality, positivism assumes that “reality is objective and ‘found’” (Lather, 2006, p. 38) while other paradigms see reality as something that is much more subjective and (socially) constructed. Positivism assumes that social phenomena are like objects in the natural world, such that the approach of the so-called natural sciences can be used to understand them (Mertens, 2005; Vine, 2009). Consequently positivism, or ‘logical positivism’ “strives for objectivity, measurability, predictability, controllability [associated with] patterning, the construction of laws and rules of behaviour” (Cohen et al., 2000, p. 28). While this is an approach that has proved to be particularly valuable in the investigation of matters related to physical objects – such as the law of gravity – it is an approach that is not so well suited to the investigation of the social domain.

Contrary to positivism, the interpretive paradigm holds that the subject matter investigated by natural science (Physics, Chemistry and Biology) is different from the subject matter investigated by the social sciences (sociology, ethnography). Consequently, in the interpretive paradigm there is an acknowledgement that social facts and values cannot be so easily separated. “The interpretive paradigm strives to understand and interpret the world in terms of its actors” or participants who are fundamentally ‘positioned’ and ‘valued’ (Cohen et al., 2000, p. 28).

Research that is framed by the critical paradigm is similar in some respects to that conducted within the interpretive paradigm in that it too recognises that research is not value free, objective or neutral. More than this, however, the critical paradigm aims to challenge interpretations and values of social actors in order to produce change (Cohen et al., 2000). Therefore, critical research supports a political agenda (Cohen et al.,
Whereas the interpretive researcher might research participants to reveal their views on a particular matter, the critical researcher will go beyond this to explore the contextual dynamics leading to and shaping the participant’s views, with the aim of generating findings leading to change. The fourth research paradigm is poststructuralism. According to Macdonald et al. (2002), the poststructuralist paradigm investigates individuals and social relations with an emphasis on discourse. Reality from the perspective of this paradigm is constructed discursively. If reality comprises discourse, then the object of the research by post-structuralist is to investigate discourse in order to establish the ‘truth’ (or truths).

3.2.2 Theory-data relationship

In terms of the theory-data relationship, the approach of positivism is to use data to test theory, in order to prove such theory. In positivism the core theories “are entailed by the use of variables” (Carspecken, 1996, p. 24). Positivists view theory as universal and not bound to a specific context. Theory, however, should not be confused with a law:

> While the law lets us calculate quite a bit about what happens, notice that it does not tell us anything about WHY it happens. That is what theories are for. In the language of science, the word ‘theory’ is used to describe an explanation of why and how things happen. For gravity, we use Einstein's Theory of General Relativity to explain why things fall” (Krampf, 2016).

In the interpretive paradigm, theory emerges from the data, such as in phenomenology and ethnomethodology (Cohen et al., 2000). Grounded theory exemplifies this (Creswell, 2009). But in the critical paradigm, theory is used to analyse the data. From this perspective, the application of different theoretical frameworks, such as Marxist or Feminist theory, to the study of the same social phenomenon can result in the production of very different findings. Hence, Denzin and Lincoln maintain that in critical paradigm, the nature of knowledge “is socially constructed [according to] the eyes of knower rather than being formulated from an existing reality”
(2011, p. 107) as in the case with logical positivism and the study of gravity as noted above.

### 3.2.3 Researcher-participant relationship

Regarding the researcher-participant relationship, the ‘ideal’ positivist researcher is one who is distant and separated from the participants. The researcher in this instance becomes the classic outsider (Greene, 2014). Positivism holds that the maintenance of distance between the researched and the researcher is fundamental to minimising ‘contamination’ in the effort to render an accurate account of the object – as it is (Greene, 2014). In the interpretive paradigm, the researcher is often close to the participants and may even become one with them in an effort to see the world through the ‘eyes’ of the researched (Greene, 2014). In the critical paradigm the researcher may either be close to the participants or not; either an insider or outsider. This relationship choice also informs poststructuralist framed research (Lather, 2006). At issue in terms of the researcher-participant relationship is the matter of objectivity.

### 3.2.4 Researcher-Truth Relationship

In understanding truth, positivism assumes that there is only one truth. That is, the truth of the matter exists independently of the researcher, such that the researcher’s task is to implement a research methodology that allows access to the truth – as it is – untainted (or uncontaminated) by the influence of the researcher (Denzin & Lincoln, 2011). By contrast, Interpretivists argue that the truth is what the participants say it is. Truth, from this perspective is something that is fundamentally socially constructed (Mertens, 2005) and not something independent of either the participants or the researcher. Interpretivism aims to establish the truth as it exists in a given context; or at the very least, how it is understood by the participants in a particular context, to exist (Creswell, 2003).

The critical paradigm maintains that while truth exists, it may not always be fully understood by participants. In this respect, the critical paradigm is reliant also upon the researcher to establish the truth. Critical theorists
assume that truth can be many-fold; the outcome of “systems of social-political power” (Lather, 2009, p. 38). Perhaps the best example of the view that the participants may not be entirely aware of the truth is that of Marxist theory and its notion of “false consciousness” (Dimitriadis & Kamberelis, 2006, p. 33). Marx maintained that labourers do not fully understand the nature of their exploitation by capital, and because of this they suffer from false consciousness (Dimitriadis & Kamberelis, 2006). Marxism maintains, like other critical and associated theories, that the researcher has the expertise to understand the truth of a given socio-political context in ways in which the participant cannot (Cohen et al., 2000). From this perspective, the (expert) researcher is required to reveal the truth to the researched.

Post-structuralism, however, holds that in any given context there can be a proliferation of truths, established on the basic of a discursive construction (Lather, 2006). If, as noted above, there is nothing beyond discourse (Derrida, 2002), and that our access to social reality is always both constructed and mediated by discourse, then the goal of the poststructuralist researcher is to identify not only the truth producing discourses in a given context (both hegemonic and subordinated) but how these interrelate with material practices (Lather, 2006).

3.2.5 The paradigm used in the present study

With regard to the key relationships identified above, this study has been guided by the critical paradigm; a paradigm that “grew from the Frankfurt School and the [European] social movements of the 1960’s and 1970’s” (Lather, 2006, p. 37). Critical theory can be viewed as a transformative approach, having the aim to bring about social change (Mertens, 2005, p. 16). According to Denzin and Lincoln, the aim of a critical inquiry is:

  to find the social power structure in an attempt to discover the truth as it relates to social power struggles… [and to] stimulate oppressed people… which will ultimately change social policy and practice (2011, p. 106).
In the critical paradigm, “what is taken to be real needs to be critically examined via an ideological critique of its role in perpetuating oppressive social structures and policies” (Mertens, 2005, p. 23). The critical paradigm thus comprises a paradigm associated with a range of social theory frameworks that have the goal of understanding socio-economic contexts – in order to implement research-informed practices leading to change. The basic principle of the critical paradigm assumes that knowledge is not neutral, but instead reflects the relationship between power and the individuals or groups (Creswell, 2014). Drawing upon Mertens, Creswell (2014) argued that the purpose of knowledge building in this paradigm is to develop the lives of its members most fully.

Critical inquiry involves “researchers interrogating commonly held values and assumptions, challenging conventional social structures, and engaging in social action” (Crotty, 1998, p. 157). In this research project some of the assumptions relate to cultural matters. In particular, the use of social theory frameworks enables the researcher to critically engage the socio-cultural factors in the formation of quality EFL teachers to provide insights to support efforts for change where needed.

At its base, the research problem identified in this research project “is constructed and informed by various social, political and economic constraints as well as the available literature, existing theoretical frameworks, and... the researcher's interest” (Tamatea, n.d., p. 87). That is, the research problem is neither an objective, neutral or independent entity. Rather it emerges as a problem at a specific point in time, in a specific place, to which are attached a range of specific social and economic actors and dynamics. While it may indeed be a problem noted or mentioned by others, it is equally a problem constructed as such by this particular researcher, and the meaning I have imposed upon a context inhabited by pre-service EFL teachers, in addition to a range of policy texts and digital public voices.

It is equally a research problem that has in some respects emerged through the researcher's application of a particular social theory
framework – in this instance globalisation theory. While the critical paradigm can accommodate a seemingly disparate range of theoretical frameworks, some of which are highlighted above, what they have in common is a commitment to uncovering relations of power which lead to both socio-economic domination and subordination. They include, for example, feminism with its focus on the patriarchal structure in society that subordinates women, and race theory that is focused on oppressed peoples upon the grounds of ethnicity and race (Denzin & Lincoln, 2011). They also include globalisation theory (Denzin & Lincoln, 2011), which is used as the guiding theoretical framework in the investigation of this research project’s problem.

In working with globalisation theory in this research project, this is not to say that matters of gender and race are irrelevant to the construction of the quality EFL teacher in Indonesian teacher education. However, a review of the literature, particularly around the notion of ‘quality’ in education, coupled with the researcher’s own experience indicates that the focus upon quality, as it is currently manifest, is a focus with origins potentially external to Indonesia (Chang et al., 2014). In view of this possibility, a social-theory framework that offered an explanation of both why and how the emphasis upon quality at local and national levels in Indonesian EFL teacher education might be linked with a globalising approach to quality was needed.

As discussed in depth in Chapter 2, this study draws upon Arjun Appadurai’s (Appadurai, 1996) theory of globalisation. This theoretical framework not only framed or imposed a degree of order upon the data collected but also upon data analysis and interpretation. Significantly, Appadurai’s model of globalisation was used to interrogate the participant-derived data. In moving beyond simply accepting the participants’ account of ‘reality’, globalisation theory was used to explore the manifold temporal, spatial, social, cultural and economic factors which informed their account of reality. Drawing upon Lather (2006) and Ezzy (2002), the findings of this study are not presented as the final truth, but
more as a contribution to an ongoing conversation around EFL teacher training in Indonesia.

3.3 Research orientation
The research orientation or approach is important regardless of the specific research area (Saunders, Lewis & Thornhill, 2009) as it is “the basic philosophical assumption that researchers bring to the study” (Creswell, 2009, p. 22). Saunders et al. (2009) divide research orientation into two broad categories; namely the deductive approach (quantitative) and the inductive approach (qualitative). There are key characteristics that differentiate these two broad orientations (Creswell, 2009; Saunders et al., 2009). Of these, at least four are relevant to this study: the existence of theories; the researcher’s relation to the research process; the research structure; and the specificity versus generalisation of the findings. These characteristic differences generally lead, though not in determinist fashion, to a correlation between the above mentioned paradigms and specific research orientations (Guba & Lincoln, 1994).

At risk of overgeneralisation, the quantitative approach tests the validity of theories or hypotheses while the qualitative approach contributes to the emergence of new theories. In the quantitative approach the researcher is held to be independent from the research process, whereas in the qualitative approach the researcher is the key instrument in the research process. In quantitative research the approach is highly structured, while in qualitative research it can be more flexible. In quantitative research samples need to be selected of sufficient size in order to facilitate the generalisation of research findings, while in qualitative research the findings do not necessarily need to be generalised; they can remain much more context specific, leading to a deeper understanding about a particular phenomenon in a particular place at a particular time (Saunders et al., 2009; Stake, 2005).

My study investigated texts across global, national and institutional domains as they relate to and inform pre-service EFL teachers and their
understanding of the notion of quality. This aim involved an interactive process that is arguably quite complex, being grounded in a web of voices spanning different spaces if not times. In conducting this study I was not only aware that the information collected was voluminous, emerging from local, national and global levels, but also aware that my own location generated information that fed into the data collection and interpretation process.

My own (research) location is that of an Indonesian (International) student located in Darwin in Australia. More specifically, I am a Javanese Indonesian from Solo, a town in Central Java, and I speak both Bahasa Indonesia and Bahasa Jawa (Javanese language). As a Muslim I am also a follower of Islam, a global religion guided by a temporal structure that is not the same as that framing much education policy emerging from the west. I am employed by a private Islamic university in Solo, Central Java, where I teach English in the graduate/undergraduate teaching education program. These aspects of my subjectivity cannot be so easily excluded from the research methodology, particularly as it comprises the study of a fundamentally social domain; namely education, which as will be shown involves the ‘translation’ of texts from one context and language into another. Whereas quantitative research seeks to actively discard researcher subjectivity such as that associated with the researcher’s own position described above, the qualitative approach which frames this study does not (Cohen et al., 2000).

3.4 Research method
The aim of this research project is to explore the constitution of quality EFL teachers through the ideas existent in global, national and local institutional policy texts, including policy documents, interviews and electronic resources such as the digital public voice. To understand claims about what comprises quality in these various texts, Carspecken’s critical ethnography (1996) informed the data collection and analysis strategies used in this research project. Discussion below details how
Carspecken’s critical ethnography was appropriated by this research project to explore the research problem.

3.4.1 Critical ethnography

The applicability of Carspecken’s critical ethnographic approach is grounded in the identification of a social group bounded together by common experience (Carspecken, 1996; Tamatea, 2008), which in this instance at the broadest level is EFL pre-service teachers learning to become teachers in Indonesia. While ethnography has often been associated with aspects of the interpretive paradigm, with the aim of understanding how the insiders see their world, Carspecken’s approach aligns this with a focus upon critical understanding and transformation associated with the critical paradigm (Carspecken, 1996). In this study, the purpose of critical theory is to provide insights. As noted previously in the critical paradigm, theory is used to analyse the data. In this study Appadurai’s globalisation theory is applied to analyse the interview data with EFL pre-service teachers and policy texts. The aim was not to change EFL pre-teacher teachers’ actual practice within the study, but to apply ideas about globalisation theory to their talk and existing policies and surface the alignment and/or disjuncture of key messages across both talk and policies. Following this somewhat eclectic approach this research project seeks to understand how pre-service EFL teachers’ perceptions of the quality EFL teacher may be framed and perhaps even shaped by a range of contextual factors (global, national, local) of which they may not be aware. The purpose of this is to transform both policy and practice where necessary.

While at the beginning of the study I focused on trying to understand, describe and interpret student behaviour and the meaning they attributed to their experiences (Carpenter, 2010), as the project unfolded I refined the research questions as more information from both the literature and from the review of early data came to hand, an approach consistent with the understanding of the nature of the ‘emergent’ research problem and the theory-data relationship associated with the various post-positivist
paradigms (Mertens, 2005). Through this process, new research questions emerged which focused more clearly upon the investigation of the emerging ideas (around the notion of quality) across global, national and local institutional policies, particularly regarding EFL teachers.

This dialectic process (Carspecken, 1996; Guba & Lincoln, 1994) led to the development of three sub-questions to investigate, namely 1. the notion of quality and its effects emerging across global, national and local institutional policy texts and EFL pre-service teachers’ experiences, 2. the subjective and objective features in constituting quality EFL teachers represented across global, national and local institutional policy texts, and 3. the notion of the quality EFL teacher contained in educational policy texts responded to in practice by pre-service EFL teachers.

In this dialectic and iterative process I became much more aware of not only the accumulated knowledge I held in relation to the research context but also what I did not know about this context. I had been working for over 12 years at Sun University in Surakarta, Central Java before I collected the data for this study. I had been immersed in the culture of many of the participants in this research project because I had been teaching EFL pre-service teachers all those years. In line with this knowledge of the context – as an insider – I began to explore ethnography as a way of understanding my relationship to the research problem, the research questions and the research participants.

However, during this period I also became aware of the large number of texts connected to the work of EFL teachers and their training programs. I collected documents relating to global, national and local institutional policy. Two global agenda and their associated policy; namely Education for All (EFA) and the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs), were central at the global level. At the national level, significant documents included (state) Law No. 20/2003 pertaining to the National Education System, Government Regulation No. 19/2005 pertaining to the National Standards of Education, and Law No. 14/2005 pertaining to Teachers and Lecturers. At the local (institutional) level, the curricula of the English
departments and their microteaching and field-based teaching guides were all identified as significant documents.

Over time my understanding of the research method transformed from an approach initially grounded in the interpretive paradigm and phenomenology (Cohen et al., 2000) to one grounded in the critical paradigm and critical ethnography. The change, however, is not one that is inconsistent with the premises of Critical Ethnography as acknowledged by Ezzy (2002), drawn upon Rosaldo (1989):

   Ethnographers beginning research with a set of questions, revise them throughout the course of inquiry, and in the end emerge with different questions than they started with. One’s surprise at the answer to a question, in other words, requires one to revise the question until lessening surprises or diminishing returns indicate a stopping point (Ezzy, 2002, p. 62)

I commenced this research project with one central question, which was What are the experiences of EFL pre-service teachers in doing teaching practice and how do their experiences match up with the policies? However, during my journey of inquiry I revised this question and developed new and different questions, which in turn have arguably generated an ‘answer’ to the research problem.

Additionally, ethnography is concerned with “the processes through which texts represent that which cannot be easily described in terms of ‘a true or false statement alone’ (Silverman, 2011, p. 238). In treating the textual data in this study, from this perspective, I recognised that the texts used to generate data comprise subjective social phenomena. As sites of sociality, texts are both inscribed by and describe contexts (Silverman, 2011). What is more, they variously do so, as will be shown, in relation to local, national and global context domains.

Upon reading more closely the literature on critical ethnography by Carspecken (1996), it became more apparent that, in its implementation or translation from the literature, the research methodology underpinning this research project was closely aligned with that of critical ethnography.
With this, a closer reading of Carspecken (1996) and in particular his methodology ‘stages’ strongly informed my approach.

In following Carspecken’s model, albeit not consciously so at the commencement of the project, I began by developing research questions as a preliminary step. Carspecken asserts: “the researcher is interested in a social site, a group of people… [Hence] it is necessary to brainstorm a list of questions. These questions should be general, broad, comprehensive and flexible” (Carspecken, 1996, p. 41). Generating this study’s research questions comprised the first methodological step, with the flexibility of those initial research questions enabling me to modify them as the research progressed. I then interviewed EFL pre-service teachers in Indonesia with regard to their learning and practicum experience. This step accords with Carspecken’s dialogical data generation stage (Carspecken, 1996, p. 42). Next, I constructed a preliminary analysis of the interviews to articulate the salient themes. This was followed by an examination of the relationship among the various data sources, which Carspecken addresses in his discussion about “describing system relations” (1996, p. 43). This commenced a significant phase in the criticality of this research projects methodology. In this stage I applied Appadurai’s discussion of globalisation and in particular his notion of “global flows” (1996, p. 33) to inform the identification if not construction of the system relations across the data sources. In data Chapters 4,5 and 6, I present the findings emerging from this data analysis and interpretation process.

3.4.2 Research sites and participants

The research ‘site’ where fieldwork is undertaken is a loose term to refer to a social site of the study where “regions within society in which routine activities, usually including interactions, take place” (Carspecken, 1996, p.34). The research sites in this project included two universities in Surakarta, Indonesia. With Carspecken’s understanding of what comprises a ‘site’, these institutions were selected on the following grounds. Aside from the relatively easy access to both which the
researcher maintained and which facilitated this researcher’s time management, both institutions, which I will call by their pseudonyms Full Moon University and Sun University, have large teacher-training faculties in Surakarta. They both have an English department within which pre-service EFL teachers are trained. Together both case sites share a cohort of students bounded by commonalities including location (in Surakarta, Indonesia), language (Bahasa Indonesia and Bahasa Jawa), religion (predominantly Islam), faculty structure (English Department), and teacher training.

After gaining ethics approval from the Human Research Ethics Committee of Charles Darwin University in 2012, I contacted the Heads of the English Departments at the teacher training and education faculties in the two universities with the view to setting up the research relationship. This contact included sending a plain language statement (PLS) about the nature of the planned research project to the departments that enabled them to read what the project aimed to achieve, including aspects of their involvement in it (See Appendix 1).

A second level of contact was made with the microteaching coordinators and lecturers in the two case study sites. This was to request access to staff and students as participants in the research project. Students who were interested in participating in this project were asked to contact me via email and short message service (SMS). Participants were selected from English Department students who were undertaking microteaching and field-based teaching programs in the pre-service teacher education program offered at the two Indonesian universities. The field-based program is called Program Pengalaman Lapangan (hereafter PPL) and is conducted in schools. Purposive random sampling was employed to determine potential participants (Creswell, 2014) and was used as a sampling strategy to select specific participants from the large number of applicants. According to Creswell (2014), this strategy adds credibility in purposive sampling.
Initially, 27 students expressed interest in participating in this project, as reported by the lecturers through email correspondence. This occurred while I was in Darwin at the Charles Darwin University (still distant from the targeted case study sites). I followed up this notification by sending candidate participants an email to thank them for their willingness to participate in this project. The email also requested their time availability to meet with me when I arrived in Indonesia the following month – April 2013. However, when I visited the case sites, the number of participants grew to 86 students. This large response was surprising and it meant I had to tactfully accommodate the cohort’s request to participate. Due to the large number of participants they were allocated into groups and sent messages to make an appointment for group meetings. Overall the collection of data from the field – with so many participants – took two semesters (one year). In some respects, the amount of time spent with the participants might be considered a limitation regarding the efficiency of the methodology, particularly when the redundancy of participant responses is taken into consideration. However, spending so much time with the participants, could also be seen as advantageous to the project since it meant getting to know the participants extremely well, they became more comfortable with me and were thus willing to openly share their feelings and concerns.

For the purpose of data collection I spent two semesters in the two institutional sites with an equivalent period of time spent in each site in each semester. The detailed schedule of the time spent in the field at these sites is presented in Appendix 3. Counterbalancing this, however, it should be noted that I myself became an EFL teacher in the very context in which this study was undertaken, and this has arguably provided a good degree of familiarity with the context (as an insider) (Liamputtong, 2013; Mertens, 2005). This positioning arguably afforded access to aspects and dynamics of the research context that may not have been so obvious to an outsider. Such dynamics included the participants’ openness and issue sensitiveness.
Conversely, it might also be argued that one’s familiarity with the context could also result in one overlooking dynamics which to them appear entirely ‘normal’ and therefore not noteworthy, but which to an outsider may appear unusual and therefore worthy of noting and exploring (Cohen et. al, 2000). Therefore, for some researchers, this (insider status) is considered a limitation in terms of the degree of sensitiveness toward salient aspects of the context. This sensitiveness could also be viewed in terms of research bias (Shore, 1996, p. 280).

3.5 Data collection techniques
Crotty (1998) maintained that research methods are the activities in which we engage to gather and analyse data. Furthermore “transformative researchers are pluralistic and evolving in their methodologies” (Mertens, 2005, p. 25). Similar to the transformative researcher type identified by Mertens (2005), critical theorists use diverse qualitative methods, such as interviews, document review and observation. In line with the comment of Mertens, the data collected in this study were collected from interviews, policy texts and electronic resources, including the voice of the digital public. In this research project, the interviews included group interviews and individual interviews. The policy texts included global policy agenda setting documents from UNESCO and United Nations, national policy documents and local institutional policy documents. Data from electronic media were only used as a secondary evidence source to further facilitate the process of ‘triangulation’ (Cohen et al., 2000) with regard to producing reliable findings.

3.5.1 Group interviews
The surprisingly large number of responses to the invitation to participate in this research project prompted me to consider group interviewing as a practical way of organising the additional participants, saving time and enabling a large number of responses to be collated. The group interviews also provided an opportunity to elicit responses associated with the general idea of becoming EFL teachers. Cohen, Manion and
Morrison (2000) identified several advantages associated with conducting group interviews, namely getting various opinions from several people at the same time and their practicality associated with “time saving and involve minimal disruption” (p. 287). Group interviews can also be “less intimidating” for children (Cohen et al., 2000, p. 287), and these conditions can also apply to adults. A weakness of group interviews is, however, that they may only provide a forum for the more dominant voices, resulting in a less than full record of participant perspectives.

At the agreed time and place, I met the participants from each group and explained the project again to make clear their involvement. Participants were provided with consent forms (See Appendix 1) and were asked to complete the forms if they agreed to participate before the group interviews were conducted.

Each group consisted of 7-10 participants, with the duration of the interview being 30-45 minutes. Table 1 below presents the schedule of group interviews and locations. Approximately 80 participants from both case sites were included in the group interview sessions and 34 participants participated in the one-on-one individual interviews.

Group interviews were conducted in Indonesian. The choice of using Indonesian took into consideration my background, and national language of the context within which I have grown up and conducted my professional career. The interviews were also recorded using a digital recorder. The sites for conducting these interviews was flexible, determined according to the participants’ location, interest and their availability.
Table 1: Group Interview Profile

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Name of group</th>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Place</th>
<th>Minutes</th>
<th>University</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Dahlia</td>
<td>May 1, 2013</td>
<td>Restaurant</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>7 Sun</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Nusa Indah</td>
<td>April 26, 2013</td>
<td>Campus</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>10 Full Moon</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Rose</td>
<td>May 13, 2013</td>
<td>Restaurant</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>12 Full Moon</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Matahari</td>
<td>May 8, 2013</td>
<td>Restaurant</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>9 Sun</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Harum</td>
<td>April 24, 2013</td>
<td>Campus</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>7 Full Moon</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>Anggrek</td>
<td>April 29, 2013</td>
<td>Restaurant</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>10 Sun</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.</td>
<td>Lyly</td>
<td>May 10, 2013</td>
<td>Campus</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>11 Sun</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.</td>
<td>Kenanga</td>
<td>May 10, 2013</td>
<td>Restaurant</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>7 Full Moon</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.</td>
<td>Arumdalu</td>
<td>May 27, 2013</td>
<td>Restaurant</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>12 Full Moon</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.</td>
<td>Mawar</td>
<td>May 10, 2013</td>
<td>Restaurant</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>7 Full Moon</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The group interviews were conducted during the period when pre-service teachers were undertaking microteaching. Key questions guiding the (semi-structured) group interviews included:

1. What do you think about being an EFL teacher in Indonesia?
2. Do you know much about the TEFL industry? Where do English department graduate work?
3. My study is about practicum; what are some observations that you can make during practicum?
4. How do you use English? When and where do you use English now?

From the group interviews, the research identified potential participants to be interviewed individually. These particular participants were selected based on the following criteria:

1. Those who actively engaged during group interview.
2. An attempt at balanced gender representation within the study even though 90 per cent of students in the Teacher Education Faculty are females.
3. Access to students undertaking microteaching unit practice at the time.
Following application of these criteria, individual one-on-one interviews were conducted at a place and time favoured by each participant.

3.5.2 Individual interviews

Individual interviews were carried out to follow up on participant responses made during the group interviews. Individual interviews enabled me “to examine individual attitudes, opinions and contexts of participants” (Liamputtong, 2009, p. 230). In this study, individual interviews were conducted twice; once during the period when participants were undertaking their microteaching course (semester 6, 2013) and once during their field experience at schools (semester 7, 2013). These individual interviews also mitigated some of the weaknesses identified above with the group interview strategy.

As noted, the first round of individual interviews was conducted in March 2013. By this time the participants had experienced microteaching and could share their experiences about it. The interview questions focused on: their rationales for selecting the English department of the teacher training faculty and for becoming prospective EFL teachers; their experience of the first opportunity at microteaching; and their English use during that time. The details of questions asked during the individual interviews are attached in Appendix 2.

The second round of individual interviews were conducted after September 2, 2013. I first approached the participants by contacting them to arrange a place for interviews. As the participants were placed in different schools, I asked them to choose the closest place to the schools where they practiced teaching. There were three places favoured by the participants, namely restaurants, home and the university campus. As noted in Table 2 above, most of the participants preferred restaurants as the place to conduct the individual interviews. However, some chose to be at their campus due to other campus related commitments. The details of these participants are presented in Appendix 4.
I carried out these semi-structured interviews in a way that allowed the conversational area of interest to be largely chosen by the participants. While initial questions were formulated, I modified these during the interview process. According to Silverman (2011), one characteristic that all qualitative interview formats share is that the questions are typically open ended (cannot be answered with a yes or no or simple response) and the questions are designed to reveal what is important to understand about the phenomenon under study. Accordingly, semi-structured interviews have several advantages over structured interviews, such as being more focused on what is significant, in addition to being time saving and flexible (Cohen et al., 2000; Liamputtong, 2009). In semi-structured interviews, the main “questions are determined in advance” (Cohen et al., 2000, p. 271), so that the interviews are more focused, avoiding ‘wandering around’ while still providing a space for flexibility and to follow up on interesting participant responses.

I returned to the participants on December 23rd, 24th, and 26th, 2013, and on January 2nd, 2014 to verify meanings associated with responses by the participants in the individual interviews. This verification process arguably adds to the reliability of this research project’s findings (Cohen et al., 2000). A summary of the meanings that I generated and subsequently presented back to the participants for verification in groups is detailed in Appendix 5. This process of taking the researcher’s derived meanings back to the participants helps to avoid criticism of critical research (when done poorly), which is that the findings reflect more of the researcher’s reality as the so-called ‘expert’ rather than that of the researched (Denzin & Lincoln, 2011).

3.5.3 Policy documents

Policy texts are characterised as official texts which operate to influence public perception of a policy agenda. Thus, policy texts seek to change the specific setting of practical action and in the process change the way policy is received by practitioners (Scott, 2000, p. 18).
Policy documents (hereafter referred to as texts) considered in this study include acts of parliament, government orders, and reports by quasi-governmental bodies such as “The Office for Standards in Education, and series of the policy, reports and commands from Local Educational Authorities or other bodies with responsibilities for schools, colleges and universities” (Scott, 2000, p. 18).


As one nation among many identified by UNESCO in relation to education and development (Jalal et al., 2009), the Indonesian government is committed to improving the quality of teachers. Though the presence of a policy response does not always translate to effective practice (Scott, 2000), the Indonesian government has nonetheless moved to develop a number of policies directed at supporting the achievement of education and development goals identified in global policy texts such as EFA and the MDG. Table 2 below identifies the range of policy documents that I collected in this study. The documents were chosen and subsequently read in relation to their significance to preparing EFL teachers.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Global policy texts</th>
<th>National policy texts</th>
<th>Institutional policy texts</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Decree of Minister of Education on Content Standards for elementary and high schools (Republik Indonesia, 2006)</td>
<td>Microteaching Guide Sun University 2013</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Decree of Minister of Education on the change of the Content Standards (renewed) for elementary and high schools (Republik Indonesia, 2007)</td>
<td>Microteaching Syllabus Full Moon University 2012</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Decree of Minister of Education on Process Standards (Badan Standar Nasional Pendidikan, 2007)</td>
<td>Curriculum of English Department - Academic guide Sun University 2012</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Decree of Minister of Education on the guide of curriculum construction in higher education and assessment of university students (Republik Indonesia,</td>
<td>Curriculum of English Department program Full Moon University 2011</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2000)</td>
<td>Decree of Minister of Education on core curriculum in Higher Education (Republik Indonesia, 2002)</td>
<td>Rector’s Regulation on curriculum Full Moon University 2012</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012a</td>
<td>Higher Education law (Republik Indonesia, 2012a)</td>
<td>Rector’s Regulation on the principles of policy governance in higher education Full Moon University 2011</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 3 below identifies the range of local policy documents collected for this project. It also identifies their audience and purpose.

**Table 3: Local Policy Documents: Title; Audience; Date; Purpose**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Audience</th>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Purpose</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sun University Field Work Operational Guide 2013</td>
<td>Pre-service teachers undertaking field experience at schools</td>
<td>2013</td>
<td>Operational guide to practicum at schools</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Full Moon University Field Work Operational Guide 2011</td>
<td>Pre-service teachers undertaking field experience at schools</td>
<td>2011</td>
<td>Operational guide to practicum at schools</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Full Moon University Microteaching Guide 2012</td>
<td>Pre-service teachers undertaking microteaching course and lecturers teaching microteaching course</td>
<td>2012</td>
<td>Operational guide to microteaching in schools</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sun University Microteaching Guide 2013</td>
<td>Pre-service teachers undertaking microteaching course and lecturers teaching microteaching course</td>
<td>2013</td>
<td>Operational guide in doing practicum in the microteaching course</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sun University Curriculum of English Department – Academic Guide 2012</td>
<td>Sun University, faculty and study program community members</td>
<td>2012</td>
<td>Gives academic and non-academic information</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Full Moon University Curriculum of English Department 2011</td>
<td>Academic community members in Full Moon University</td>
<td>2011</td>
<td>Information on curriculum and the targeted graduate competences</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sun University Rector’s Regulation</td>
<td>Academic community members in Sun</td>
<td>2013</td>
<td>To reinforce the implementation of</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Document Title</td>
<td>Institution</td>
<td>Year</td>
<td>Description</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>on new curriculum 2013</td>
<td>University</td>
<td></td>
<td>the 2013 curriculum</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Full Moon University Rector’s Regulation on curriculum 2012</td>
<td>Academic community members in Full Moon University</td>
<td>2012</td>
<td>Information on curriculum and the targeted graduate competences</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rector’s Regulation on the principles of policy governance in higher education Full Moon University 2011</td>
<td>Academic community members in Full Moon University</td>
<td>2011</td>
<td>Operational guide in governing and carrying out higher education</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 4 below identifies the selected national policy documents used in this study.

Table 4: National Policy Documents: Title; Audience; Date; Purpose

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Audience</th>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Purpose</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Teacher Law</td>
<td>Teachers and lecturers</td>
<td>2005</td>
<td>To acknowledge teacher’s and lecturer’s status as professional force</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. National Education System (NES)</td>
<td>Indonesian citizens</td>
<td>2003</td>
<td>To rule the education system</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Content Standards</td>
<td>For teachers in determining the competence achieved by primary and high school graduates</td>
<td>2006</td>
<td>For guidance in Primary and high schools levels in determining the minimal content and competence to achieve graduate competence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Content Standards (renewed)</td>
<td>For teachers in determining the competence achieved by primary and high school graduates</td>
<td>2007</td>
<td>To replace some points stated in Permendiknas RI No 22/2006</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Process Standards</td>
<td>For teachers in carrying the learning process to produce competent graduates</td>
<td>2007</td>
<td>For guidance in Primary and high schools levels in determining the process standards to produce competent graduates</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Decree on the guidance for of curriculum construction in higher education</td>
<td>Policy makers, curriculum developers and educators in Higher education institutions</td>
<td>2000</td>
<td>As a reference for the curriculum construction in higher education and assessment of university students</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 5 below identifies the global level policy collected for this project. It also identifies the policy audience and the policy’s purpose.

Table 5: Global Level Policy Documents – Title; Audience; Date; Purpose

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Audience</th>
<th>Purpose</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>MDGs Reports (United Nations, 2012, 2014)</td>
<td>2012, 2014</td>
<td>Member countries and international organizations</td>
<td>As milestone toward the progress of development agenda achieved.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Dakar Framework for Action (UNESCO, 2000)</td>
<td>2000</td>
<td>The participants in the World Education Forum: the governments, organizations, agencies, groups and associations</td>
<td>Pursue a broad-based strategy for ensuring that the basic learning needs of every child, youth and adult are met within a generation and sustained thereafter; to accelerate progress towards education for all, poverty reduction and inequalities abolishment</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
It should be noted that organising these policy texts into lists and tables to clarify publication dates, audience and purpose also facilitated the process of data analysis (Bazeley, 2013). Additionally, all of these documents were stored in NVivo software.

3.5.4 Electronic resources

Even though the primary data in this study is sourced from interview texts and policy documents, I also sourced data from electronic media domains to support analysis of the primary sources and to provide a richer pool of data over all. Consistent with the critical paradigm, this enabled the analysis of the interview data to be more easily located within the broader social, economic and political context framing the local, national and international discussion of quality and education. This inclusive framing also provided a ‘real life’ context within which to view the responses of the research participants. Engaging the voice of the digital public comprised a strategy that also enhanced the validity of this research project’s findings (Walker, 2010). It provided an additional perspective on the key issues discussed in policy and by the participants.

The voice of the digital public was sourced from blogs and online newspapers, which variously covered issues concerning the education system in Indonesia, including teacher education, teacher professionalism, and English language teaching and the curriculum. The use of digital data sources provides this research project with an alternative voice because with the anonymity afforded by online environments people are more likely to speak the truth (Tamatea, 2008). They are also more likely to offer unfavourable responses including discourses grounded in fear (Tamatea, 2011).

3.6 Data analysis

Data analysis occurred in several stages, commencing with transcription or conversion of the original corpus of texts into much more readable transcripts. This included the reading and checking of the translation,
familiarising myself with data, loading it into NVivo and coding it, and finally categorising and interpreting it.

3.6.1 Transcription matters

Transcription of the interview data was directly undertaken soon after I interviewed the participants. Ary, Jacobs and Sorensen (2010) contended that words should be transcribed directly to avoid potential bias in selection or interpretation that may occur with summarising. I employed graduate students (English department graduates from the case study sites) to undertake this task. During transcription the names of all interviewees were converted to pseudonyms to ensure participant anonymity and confidentiality. After the transcription was completed, it was checked for accuracy. I listened to the recording while reading the transcripts. A number of transcription errors were noted, such as, for example, the word “Radit” was miss-transcribed as “Rajut”. All errors were subsequently corrected.

To further verify the quality and reliability of transcripts, I was advised by my supervisor to take one example of the recordings and have it transcribed by a professional transcribing agency with experience in multilingual transcription. The same recording was also transcribed by another person. Then the script sets were compared. Table 6 below highlights some of the differences found between the translations.

Table 6: Issues in transcriptions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Australian Transcriber</th>
<th>Indonesian Transcriber</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Two words in the beginning of the sentence 1 missed: “(Two words) mengajar di sekolah...”</td>
<td>The sentence is complete: “Ceritakan pengalaman mengajar di sekolah...”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Filled pauses of the interviewer are transcribed fully.</td>
<td>Some filled pauses of the interviewer were not transcribed.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Some terms are transcribed with inappropriate spellings, for example: RPP is transcribed FPP KTSP is transcribed KSP</td>
<td>Correct spellings</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
As part of the research process and to reassure trustworthiness of the data, I also initially double-checked the transcription with a professional transcriber and this exposed other problems with the translation. For example, some ideas were not translated contextually. The professional transcriber only translated in a simple way without the benefit of immersion in the culture or context of the language, so that the translation produced incorrect meanings. For example: The word ‘sama’ was translated into ‘the same’. While this could be correct in certain contexts, in the context under review, the word ‘sama’ means ‘with’. Another example is how ‘guru pamong’ was translated as ‘public teacher’, while in the context under review, it actually means ‘mentor teacher’.

To address the above issues I then reviewed the translations on the basis of my own familiarity with the field of EFL teaching. I discussed with my supervisors the correctness of the language and developed some examples of how words needed to be selected in context rather than as direct translation. Following this, I decided to only translate by myself the quotes that I drew out from the interview data. This translation was checked by my supervisors for acceptability and intelligibility.

3.6.2 Familiarisation and organisation

The second stage of analysing data is familiarising oneself with the data (Ary et al., 2010). I familiarised myself with my data by reading the scripts several times. Ary et al. (2010) illustrate procedures for analysing qualitative data. These include familiarisation and organisation to make the data easy to retrieve. Actually, during the process of transcribing, I also started to familiarise myself with the data. However, this was more effectively undertaken by reading the scripts once the data set of interview transcripts had been ‘tidied’.

Besides familiarising oneself with the data through transcribing the interviews and reading the scripts numerous times, I used a program called NVivo 10 to organise the data. Due to the large amount of data, the use of NVivo was particularly helpful for organising and managing the vast amount of data.
3.6.3 NVivo use in data analysis

To complement conventional approaches to qualitative data analysis, I employed NVivo software to assist in managing and analysing the data. This software tool was used because it helped to store and organise the coding of the data in the form of nodes, in addition it made the data more easily retrievable. Coding by making a node is “essential for qualitative analysis but it is not the goal in itself. Rather it is a purposeful step to provide an access to evidence” (Bazeley, 2013, p. 125). Consequently, I coded and analysed the data using the following procedures:

1. Entering the text from interviews, policy texts and online data into NVivo as sources;
2. Reading the scripts several times and identifying each text based on Appadurai’s notion of five ‘scapes’; and
3. Coding the themes by making nodes. A node is a container for the coding: it represents related material in one place so that emerging patterns and ideas could be found (www.qsrinternational.com).

In this study, I created the nodes based on the focus of the questions. Identifying the nodes and making ‘child’ nodes and ‘parent’ nodes in NVivo enabled the mapping of various concepts and themes.

By using NVivo software, I identified each transcript and policy text based on Appadurai’s notion of five ‘scapes’ and coded them in a node; Appadurai’s (1996) notion of scapes was described in detail in Chapter 2. I also reviewed themes repeatedly to finalise the categories. One example of how categories were identified in global and national policies is presented in Appendix 6.

3.6.4 Informed by discourse analysis

Critical ethnography recognises that “truths are always discursively situated and implicated in relations of power” (Hardcastle, Usher & Holmes, 2006, p. 152). Discourse analysis explores how texts are made meaningful through connecting texts with practice. With this understanding in mind, this study focused on policy texts in particular and
the texts produced and reproduced by the research participants and by
the voice of the digital public. Interrelated texts and practices also
produce social reality (Parker, 1992). According to Phillips and Hardy
(2002), discourse comprises actual practices of talking and writing. For
Foucault, “a discourse is a way of talking about something, organizing
knowledge and classifying and regulating people” (Haralambos et al.,
1996, p. 159). Additionally, according to Hall, Foucauldian discourse
comprises:

- a group of statements to represent the knowledge about particular topic…
- about the production of knowledge through language… [It] constructs the
topic… governs the way that a topic can be meaningfully talked about and
reasoned about… [and] influences how ideas are put into practice and
used to regulate the conduct of others (2014, p. 72).

With this, the fundamental premise of poststructuralism is that discourse
constructs truths and social realities, and that there may be nothing
outside of discourse (Derrida, 1990). Consequently, discourse analysis
can be applied to various types of texts in order to discern the discursive
construction of their claims to truth (Bryman & Burgess, 1994), including,
in the case of this research project, the interview transcripts and policy
texts. Though not framed by the poststructuralist paradigm, principally
because the focus is upon how structures associated with globalisation
impact texts and practices, this research project nonetheless
acknowledges the constitutive nature of texts.

While this research project agrees in part with the ontological argument of
poststructuralism, its epistemological strategy remains much more
grounded in the tools and techniques of ‘simple’ content analysis (Ezzy,
2002) as the means to establishing relations between structures and texts
and indeed structures and ideas. This approach is supported by the use
of a social theory framework, which deploys the work of Appadurai (1996)
to understand how the textual sites explored by this study may variously
be the outcome, align with or even contradict global flows associated with
the notion of quality and education in the context of EFL teaching.
Hence, informed by Appadurai’s theory of globalisation and global flows, the data generated from the analysis of policy texts, interviews and the voice of the digital public were coded in relation to Appadurai’s (1996) five ‘scapes’, namely the ideo-scape, techno-scape, media-scape, finance-scape and ethno-scape. This data analysis (and later interpretation) tactic enabled the identification of a number of recurrent themes in the data, including quality, quality education, quality teacher, learning, and the significance of ICT. These categories/themes are shown in Appendix 7.

3.6.5 Content analysis and data interpretation

Content analysis emphasises analysis or interpretation of recorded material to understand human behaviour (Ary et al., 2010). Ary, et. al (2010) asserted that content analysis, which explores “What meaning is reflected in these materials?” has its roots in communication studies with its emphasis upon the analysis of written or visual. Content analysis can be quantitative or qualitative. They also contend that content analysis usually begins with a question that the researcher believes can best be answered by studying documents. Content analysis is a deductive form of data analysis because the categories of analysis are developed through logical deduction from the pre-existing theory (Ezzy, 2002), in this instance Appadurai’s theory of globalisation. Therefore, content analysis as a data analysis strategy used in this research project starts to a certain extent with pre-defined categories, namely those offered by Appadurai’s model of globalisation, which addresses ‘flows’ and ‘scapes’ and homogeneity and heterogeneity among them (Appadurai, 1996). With this pre-existing theory and its categories, the analysis paid close attention to the lexicon, phrases, themes and topics inherent in the collected texts.

The data analysis adopted some of the steps involved in content analysis as illustrated by Ary et al. (2010). First, I specified the phenomenon to be investigated. Second, I selected the documents to be used in order to obtain a representative sample of documents. Next, I formulated coding categories by determining the words or domains that represent globalisation, such as development, improvement and enhancement. To
consistently apply the coding scheme and to contribute to the reliability of
the content analysis, I used a computer program to search through the
scanned text and find words or phrases that met specified criteria.

Content analysis, which supports investigating the interrelation between
texts such as those subject to analysis in this study, is also considered to
be a valuable strategy for political analysis and particularly in relation to
propaganda (Krippendorff, 1980). In this respect it was useful for the
analysis of global policy texts, which in fact have been viewed by some to
be propaganda (Krippendorff, 1980; Tamatea, 2005), or at the very least
highly supportive of neoliberal economic and political agendas (Tamatea,
2005). In this respect, content analysis enabled the analysis of texts in
the context of broad social, political and economic relations. The
categorisation by the framework of Appadurai’s global flows in the data
sources are presented in Appendix 7.

In the investigation of the research problem, I commenced explicitly using
a theoretical framework only after collecting the data, and specifically
employed Appadurai’s globalisation theory as both the analytical theory
framework and the interpretative framework (Creswell, 2014). In
interpreting the data I drew upon the results of the analysis to illustrate
the flows that constitute globalisation and its complexities in relation to
the teaching of EFL in Indonesian teacher education and the achievement
of quality in this. Indeed, it has been argued that Appadurai’s ‘scapes’
framework is one of the more sophisticated frameworks at hand to
conceptualise and explain the flows and contradictions that constitute
globalisation (Sidhu, 2002). “When applied to international education,
Appadurai’s framework enables us to ‘see’ international education as a
highly complex composite of processes, practices, and outcomes that
produce and reflect disjuncture and conjuncture” (Sidhu, 2002, p. 3). This
is precisely the epistemological goal of this research project with its focus
upon the constitution of the quality EFL teacher in Indonesian teacher
education.
The next step in the data interpretation process was to identify the interrelationships between flows along the five scapes inherent or manifest in the data. Sorting the data into categories associated with the five scapes (ideo-scape, techno-scape, ethno-scape, finance-scape and media-scape) during the data analysis phase facilitated this process. The use of Appadurai’s model with these and its other key concepts facilitated understanding not only of the text and context of structuring relationships, it also enabled me to take into account a fuller range of dynamics and relations upon which the constitution of the quality EFL teacher rested.

Ary et al. (2010) contended that qualitative research invariably involves interpretation. In the context of this research project, this means reflection upon the words and acts of the study’s participants and abstracting important understandings from them. It is an inductive process in which the researcher makes generalisations based on the connections and common aspects of the categories and patterns which lead to the development of a hypothesis. In this research project, interpretation involved using the analysed data to bring out the meaning, tell the story, provide an explanation, and develop plausible explanations in response to the research questions.

Interpreting qualitative data is difficult because there are no set rules to follow. As noted with respect to the research paradigms above, the quality of the interpretation depends on the background, perspective, knowledge, and theoretical orientation of the researcher and the intellectual skills they bring to the task. Although it is acknowledged that a Marxist or even feminist reading of the data would have likely produced different findings, the interpretation of the data was cognisant of the fact that interpretation is not just created by our imagination but it must be supported by the data” (Ary et al., 2010). The meanings generated are the products of the social theory imposed.

In this project, Appadurai’s globalisation theory was imposed not only to inform the data analysis but also to interpret the data. Carspecken’s critical ethnography provided a space for interpretation, especially with
regard to stages 4 and 5 of Carspecken’s procedures, which are more explicitly linked to social theory (Carspecken, 1996). With this, the researcher links the findings from “local cultural site to other similar institutions and knowledge in an attempt to discover what these [system] relations might be” (Hardcastle et al., 2006, pp. 159-160).

Using this approach, and reliant upon Appadurai’s model of globalisation, I not only explored the key themes in relation to global flows or scapes, but started to answer key questions related to the research problem, such as: What’s happening here? Discussion in Chapters 4, 5 and 6 delivers an evidence-based response to such a question, which is the result of both data analysis and interpretation.

3.7 Ethics
An awareness of moral and ethical issues is important for those working in social research (Cohen et al., 2000). Potentially unforeseen ethical issues may emerge from the implementation of research procedures that in turn may require an appropriate, considered or indeed legal response (Cohen et al., 2000; Guba & Lincoln, 1994). This can be particularly so when conducting research in cross-cultural contexts, where the cultural norms and standards of the researcher may vary from those of the participants (Cohen et al., 2000). In the context of this research project, the research straddled two university systems, at least two languages and arguably at least two different legal systems. While these differences had a capacity to present ethical challenges, the conduct of this research project was guided by the maxim that research participants be as fully informed as possible, allowing them to provide their fully informed consent, rather than conducting a project grounded in deception (Guba & Lincoln, 1994).

To comply with this maxim, I gained ethical approval from the Human Research Ethics Committee of Charles Darwin University (CDU) in 2012. This CDU approval was conditional upon obtaining permission to conduct research at the two case-study sites from the Indonesian universities. In
recruiting potential participants, I provided them with a plain language statement (PLS) to allow them to fully understand the project. They were also provided with consent forms (see Appendix 1) to show that they had understood the nature of the project and the nature of their participation, and that on the basis of this they had consented to participate. The use of both forms supports the “the subject’s right to freedom and self-determination” (Cohen et al., 2000, p. 51). Participants were therefore allowed to withdraw from the study whenever they wanted and could refuse to answer any questions if they to. Both the plain language statement and the consent forms were approved by the Human Research Ethics Committee of CDU. To maintain anonymity in this study, the names of all participants, the research sites and document data regarding curriculum, Rector Regulations and other identifying material have been coded and de-identified.

3.8 Conclusion
To summarise, Chapter 3 focused on the methodology used to understand the formation of quality pre-service EFL teachers by global, national and local institutional policy documents, interviews and electronic resources. The research was framed by the critical paradigm, which is distinct from other paradigms – positivism, interpretivism, and post-structuralism. Considering the research problem – which in some respects emerged through my application of a particular social theory framework – Appadurai’s globalisation theory was considered a suitable approach to accommodate for the complexity of the problem. Considering that my subjectivity cannot easily be excluded from the research methodology, a qualitative approach was taken up to frame this study. Carspecken’s critical ethnography facilitated this goal.

The applicability of Carspecken’s critical ethnography was based on the identification of the common experience of EFL pre-service teachers learning to become teachers in Indonesia. This methodology enabled me to understand how pre-service EFL teachers’ perceptions of ‘the quality EFL teacher’ were shaped by a range of contextual factors (global,
national, local) of which they may not be aware. Carspecken’s approach articulates salient themes, and examines the relationship among the various data sources to describe system relations. In examining those relations, I applied Appadurai’s globalisation theory and in particular his notion of global flows to inform the identification if not construction of the system relations across the data sources. The findings of this study contribute to an ongoing conversation around EFL teacher training in Indonesia. The findings of this study are not presented as the final truth, but more as contributions to an ongoing conversation around EFL teacher training in Indonesia.

The next chapter comprises the first of the data-driven, evidence-based discussions exploring the notion of quality that emerged in and across global, national and local institutional education policy documents as well as in the experience of EFL teaching practice in Indonesia.
Chapter 4
Aligned Messages on Quality
Discourse
4. Aligned Messages on Quality Discourse

4.1 Introduction
Globalisation has arguably penetrated all aspects of life (Kell et al., 2004), including language policy (Kell, 2004) and English foreign language (EFL) teaching. In the field of EFL teaching, global flows are particularly evident as language (mainly English), language teachers, language students, their (cultural) capital and the ideas associated with the teaching of EFL move around the globe in relation to the market forces of supply and demand (Johnson, 2009).

As noted in Chapter 2, Appadurai (1996) maintained that globalisation was facilitated by ‘global flows’, represented as flows and influences along ‘scapes’ including the flow of people along ethno-scapes, the flow of technologies along the techno-scapes, the flow of media images and messages along media-scapes, the flow of funds, capital transactions and financial messages along the finance-scape and the flow of ideas along the ideo-scape. Movement along these global scapes is not however without consequence. Moreover Appadurai (1996) argued that the result of these global flows was often unpredictable as flows along these ‘scapes’ often produced unintended and contradictory outcomes; that is, flows along one scape can result in contradictory outcomes along another scape. These outcomes are then played out across the ethno-cultural domain.

For example, Tamatea (2011) in his work on reconstructing ‘national’ identity has shown that in Bali, the Ajeg Bali (Allen & Palermo, 2005; Reuter, 2012) movement covers an ethno-nationalist-like response to the inward flows moving through geographic boundaries into Bali. The Ajeg Bali movement is a movement to defend the Balinese traditions, customs and values that have begun to fade (Allen & Palermo, 2005). While on the one hand, powerful inward flows such as those associated with tourism have resulted in relatively high incomes for the Balinese, compared with similar contexts in Indonesia, these flows have also produced a socio-
political, if not ethno-nationalist, movement focused in many respects upon opposing and resisting such flows. Consistent with Appadurai’s model above, the response in the form of the Ajeg Bali movement has been played out largely within the cultural domain as the Balinese moved towards reconstructing what they believed to be their appropriate identity (Allen & Palermo, 2005; Tamatea, 2011). Consequently, the Ajeg Bali movement reveals a response to globalisation in Indonesia which exemplifies the flow and response paradigm of Appadurai’s model (Tamatea, 2011).

My study is similar to Tamatea’s 2011 study with regard to Appadurai’s global flows in the Indonesian context, but the focus is different. My research project is theoretically informed by Appadurai’s global flows to understand how global, national and local institutional policies constitute the idea of quality and quality education as well as quality EFL teachers through the experience of prospective EFL teachers in English teacher education in Central Java, Indonesia.

In the interest of exploring how the various flows of globalisation might inform not only the global education policy agenda, but also national and local policy agendas with regard to education and EFL teacher training, Chapter 4 explores the emerging policy ideas across texts such as policy documents, interview transcripts, and electronic media. With this focus, the project acknowledged that local institutional policies do not stand alone or in isolation, but are connected to and referenced by mandated messages and agendas in national policies. Similarly, national policies can often be grounded in the ‘message’ and agendas emerging from policy production institutions such as the OECD and UNESCO (Tamatea, 2011). Data used in this discussion emerged from a reading of global, national and local education policy documents.

According to Stromquist and Monkman (2014), global education policies include EFA and MDG reports. In this study, I also included The Dakar Framework for Action (UNESCO, 2000), and I drew upon the subsequent updated EFA Global Monitoring Reports (UNESCO, 2004, 2007, 2014),
As noted previously, educational ‘policy’ documents in this study also consisted of laws, government decrees, and school curricula (Raihani, 2014). National education policy documents in this study included the Law on the National Education System (NES), the Teacher Law and government regulations on National Standards. Local institutional education policy documents included curriculum documents from the two institutes involved in this study, which I have called Full Moon University and Sun University, and associated Rector Regulations, as well as the practicum guides for microteaching and field-based experience (FBE) in schools.

Discussion in this chapter explores how the notion of quality emerges in and across global, national and local institutional education policy documents as well as in the experience of EFL teaching practice in Indonesia. The discussion is informed by a range of Appadurai’s global cultural flows along the ideo-, techno-, media-, ethno- and finance-scapes (Appadurai, 1996). It will be argued that the various ideas and practices regarding quality, quality education and quality EFL teaching articulated in global agendas and national policies are reproduced through the media and subsequently inform local practice, ideas and utility for employment in many and varied ways. The flow of these ideas is arguably intensified by the advances in ICT which impact both the speed and geographic dispersal of ideas along the ideo-, media- and techno-scapes.

The flow of ideas, however, is not always linear or unidirectional. Ideas can flow from the local back to the national and from the national to the global in ways which are not always predictable (Appadurai, 1996). The complexity along the ideo-scape is additionally informed by flows along the finance-scape, as the globalising flows of English are variously associated with and informed by financial interests, agendas and desires (Johnson, 2009). In this, students, teachers, local and national interests
are variously engaged in the teaching, learning and advocacy of the need to learn English to secure improved financial futures.

Appadurai (1996) defines the ideo-scape as a series of images that deal with state ideologies, politics, and counter ideology movements that capture a portion of state power. He argues that flows along the ideo-scape are often grounded in an enlightenment worldview that consists of “a chain of ideas, terms and images, including freedom, welfare, rights, sovereignty, representation, and the master term, democracy” (Appadurai, 1996, p. 36). Working from Appadurai’s observations as a starting point, Chapter 4 identifies flows of additional ideas, specifically those associated with EFL teaching and learning. The discussion exemplifies the significance of the ideo-scape, and illustrates the existence of significant homogeneity in the discussion of ideas related to English and English language teaching among global, national and local institutional policy discourses.

Highlighting the significance of the ideo-scape does not mean that other scapes are unimportant in the context of English as a foreign language in Indonesia. The ideo-scape does not exist in isolation, but is variously informed by flows along other scapes, particularly in relation to the notion (idea) of quality, which is frequently deployed by education and education-related policy texts at global and national levels. In light of this, discussion below will reference other scapes particularly where their flows are connected with flows along the ideo-scape. In advancing this argument, this chapter, therefore, will be divided into two sections distinguishing between a general level (macro) of a discourse and specific exemplars (the micro level) of an inter-connected series of flows associated with ideas about quality.

Section 4.2 focuses on quality education at a macro level discourse which refers to the general level of the concept of quality elaborated in relation to neoliberal ideas. It will be argued that in the macro level discourse, crises in learning and teaching (and some strategies for recovering from crises through transparency and accountability in the education system)
are manufactured by the global agenda. These recovery strategies are also produced to counter three emerging ideas – global competition, mobility and employability – which are intensified under current global market conditions. These three ideas emerge from broader neoliberal ideas (Stromquist & Monkman, 2014; Tamatea, 2005), with a particularly strong focus upon political systems worldwide that establish nations as economic bodies in the global order (Shore, 2007).

Section 4.3 focuses on the notion of quality education at the micro level of discourse, where ‘micro level’ references and explains the notion of quality in relation to specific areas. This discussion illustrates how the notion of quality informs and affects six specific areas: learner centred pedagogy; the existence of English as a foreign and global language in Indonesia; (teacher) standards; quality teacher preparation; the role of finance; and the role of media in producing quality education.

Section 4.4 concludes the Chapter noting that quality education has been influenced by neoliberal ideas. Quality education in national and local educational contexts has been influenced by how the global policy agenda produces crises discourse and several ways for recovering from a crisis. The notion of crisis has been constantly recurring in education quality discourse to assign blame for the poor quality education, including poor quality EFL teachers. The recurring homogeneity of quality discourse is demonstrated and enriches an understanding of how global policies flow into the national and local context.

4.3 Neoliberal ideas and quality education: Macro level considerations
A focus upon the notion of ‘quality’ has been repeatedly articulated in the global education policy documents under discussion in this study (Chang et al., 2014; Raihani, 2014; Tamatea, 2005). The emphasis on quality in global policy documents, such as The Dakar Framework for Action (UNESCO, 2000), Education for All (EFA) Global Monitoring Reports (UNESCO, 2003, 2004a), Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) (United Nations, 2010) and other UNESCO texts, also inform teacher education
policy in Indonesia at both the national and local institutional level (Chang et al., 2014; Madya, 2009).

The flow of ideas (about quality) from the global to the local is illustrated by the adoption of English words, concepts and terms by Indonesian national education policy, as shown in the following table (Table 7).

**Table 7: Examples of English lexical terms articulated in Indonesian policy texts**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>English</th>
<th>Indonesian</th>
<th>Pages</th>
<th>Policy Document Sources</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Global</td>
<td>Global</td>
<td>1, 37, 44, 48</td>
<td>Government Regulation No. 32/2013 (Republik Indonesia, 2013b).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quality</td>
<td>Kualitas/Mutu</td>
<td>1, 5,6, 8, 37</td>
<td>Government Regulation No. 32/2013 (Republik Indonesia, 2013).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Efficiency</td>
<td>Efisiensi</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Government Regulation No. 32/2013 (Republik Indonesia, 2013).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transparency</td>
<td>Transparansi</td>
<td>18, 24</td>
<td>National Education System (Republik Indonesia, 2003)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Accountability</td>
<td>Akuntabilitas Publik</td>
<td>18, 24</td>
<td>National Education System (Republik Indonesia, 2003)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Competitive</td>
<td>Kompetitif/Daya saing</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>Government Regulation No. 32/2013 (Republik Indonesia, 2013).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Standard</td>
<td>Standar</td>
<td>1, 37, 38</td>
<td>Government Regulation No. 32/2013 (Republik Indonesia, 2013).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Objective</td>
<td>Objektif</td>
<td>7, 12, 26, 39</td>
<td>Teacher Law (Republik Indonesia, 2005b)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Competence</td>
<td>Kompetensi</td>
<td>13, 22, 24, 25</td>
<td>National Education System (Republik Indonesia, 2003)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The above table identifies several lexical terms borrowed from English that are used in Indonesian national policy texts. These key words from neoliberal discourse (Tamatea, 2005) suggest that, at one level,
Indonesian national teacher education policy is informed by neoliberal ideas. Flows along the ideo-scape from the global to national and local institutional levels are also revealed through Indonesia’s incorporation and articulation of ideas and focus areas drawn from the MDGs (United Nations, 2010). As one of 189 state members of the United Nations which committed themselves to engaging in global cooperation (United Nations, 2014), Indonesia agreed to these focus areas by Presidential Declaration:

[Former] President Susilo Bambang Yudhoyono, along with United Kingdom Prime Minister David Cameron and Liberian President Ellen Johnson Sirleaf, were the three co-chairs of the 27-member High Level Panel of Eminent Persons on the post-2015 development agenda. From September 2012 to May 2013 this panel was charged with providing recommendations to the UN Secretary General on the global development agenda beyond 2015 (Lundine et al., 2013, p. 57).

Furthermore, the Indonesian government lead by the Ministry of National Development Planning (BAPPENAS) and representatives pursued the MDG targets by taking:

a whole of government approach to coordinate resources and delegate authority to achieve the MDG targets by 2015. The MDGs guided the 2010-2014 [Indonesian] National Development plan and the actions of the responsible ministries such as health, education and the environment (Lundine et al., 2013, p. 55).

The paragraphs above illustrate emerging ideas designed to achieve MDGs targets as noted in Chapter 2, including reducing poverty and hunger, achieving universal primary education, promoting gender equality, and developing a global partnership for development. It is expected that “continued progress will mean improvement in the lives of millions of Indonesians and, increasingly, those who are the most at risk and hardest to reach” (Lundine et al., 2013, p. 55). While it could be argued that Yudhoyono’s participation reflects Indonesia’s increasing international clout and leadership role among middle-income nations, it might also be argued that Indonesia’s ‘acceptance’ of the goals reflects the increasing ‘clout’ of global education policy agendas.
The key ideas relevant to this chapter relate to quality education that is indirectly addressing Goal 2 on achieving universal primary education and Goal 8 on developing a global partnership for development.

The discursive link between global policy texts and Indonesian national texts seems to emerge from prescriptions elaborated at the global level. For example, the MDGs explicitly focus upon national education systems:

To achieve Millennium Development Goal 2, National Education Systems need to be strengthened by addressing infrastructure, human resource and governance constraints, backed by international donor support (UN, 2010, p. 20).

The emphasis upon aspects of governance articulated in the above statement of the MDGs agenda is the evidence of this global-local-national link. Further evidence is found in the Indonesian national education policy texts with the Law on the National Education System highlighting, for example, both quality improvements and the relevance and management of efficiency (Republik Indonesia, 2003). Of further significance, the National Education System policy not only locates the achievement of quality education within the neoliberal governance and management paradigm, it also speaks of the achievement of equity, arguing that the “national education system must be able to guarantee the equity of educational opportunities” (Republik Indonesia, 2003, p. 1). In this respect, Indonesian national policy seems to reproduce not only elements of neoliberal ideas as stated by Chandra (2005) and Sukmaningsih ("Kebijakan ekonomi Indonesia 100 persen liberal" 2009) in Chapter 2, but also elements of globalising human-rights and social justice ideas, with its focus upon the achievement of equity (Tamatea, 2005). Thus, a neoliberal management paradigm is re-represented, if not re-constructed, to be implicitly synonymous with social justice paradigms. This is not unique to the Indonesian context (Tamatea, 2005), but the alignment is often rejected in critical discussion of neoliberalism, which more often argues that neoliberalism is destructive of human rights and equity (Tamatea, 2005).
As Shore has argued, “political systems around the world have drawn on key words such as competition, innovation, social inclusion, and flexibility in their efforts to situate nations as viable economic entities in the global order” (2007, p. 66). The macro-level alignment of ideas noted in this section illustrate how quality discourse is linked with a range of other neoliberal lexical items, concepts and ideas, including notions of ‘crisis’, ‘transparency’, ‘accountability’, ‘competition’, ‘mobility’ and ‘employability’. These lexical items inform policy discussion at the general level of the concept of quality and simultaneously link quality to neoliberal ideas. Three specific articulations will be explored in the following sections: learning crisis and quality education; quality transparency and accountability; and quality, global competition and global mobility/employability.

**4.3.1 Quality education and learning crises**

The notion of crisis has impinged many aspects of human life worldwide. For example, the continued pursuit of MDGs (United Nations, 2012) illustrates that there are still crises in poverty. Progress of poverty reduction is still uneven and the full achievement of goals is threatened by many things (United Nations, 2010, 2012). “Hunger is increasing and remains an important global challenge” (United Nations, 2010, p. 4). Economically actions taken in response to the global financial and economic crisis have not yet solved a deeper recession and further legitimate action is needed to follow up in targeted years.

“Political, ecological and cultural problems lead to a legitimation of crisis in several Southeast Asian nations” (Kell, 2004, p. 59), including Indonesia. It is also acknowledged that since 1997, the Indonesian nation has suffered from many crises, ranging from economic and political to multidimensional natural disasters and emergencies (Hasbullah, 2015). While these may appear at first glance to be indirectly related to education, Luke and Dooley (2009) contend that the current changes in geopolitical power stimulate cultural flows and interactions that in the long run involve English education and English language teaching.
Global economic crises are reshaping the development and spread of English as both instrument and commodity, as a form of capital and as a complex sociolinguistic field in globalised cultural and economic exchange (Luke & Dooley, 2009, p. 2).

The statement above implies that English language teaching and learning is impacted by the global economic crisis. With regard to recovering from such a crisis, global organisations promote solutions through their agendas that become a reference for most countries suffering from the crisis. Kell and Kell assert that the Indonesian “Law on National Education System was enacted in response to the World Education (2000) Education for all (EFA) initiative” (2014, p. 103). This is specifically where the Framework argues that a lack of:

Attention to education quality and a failure to reach the marginalized have contributed to a learning crisis that needs urgent attention. The importance of education quality was recognized when it was established as the sixth Education for All goal in 2000, and again recently when the UN secretary-general made it one of the three priorities of the Global Education First Initiative (UNESCO, 2014 p. 18).

The EFA Global Monitoring Report Teaching and Learning: Achieving quality for all (UNESCO, 2014) maintains that these ‘crises’ are a result of a lack of attention to and achievement of quality in education, and accordingly it advises all member countries, including Indonesia, to invest in education in order to accelerate comprehensive development for which quality education is required. In this instance of policy discourse, the reference to quality is juxtaposed in a binary-like relationship against the reference to crises. The EFA Global Monitoring Report on Teaching and Learning: Achieving quality for all (UNESCO, 2014) is grounded in a number of key principles, namely: equality of access and learning; the opportunity for young people to obtain transferable skills that will prepare them to become global citizens; clear and measurable goal setting; and bridging the gap between the rich and the poor.

The EFA movement is part of a broader global movement to provide quality basic education for all children, youth and adults, and which
emphasises ‘quality’ as a central pillar of education (UNESCO, 2000). Consequently, the focus upon ‘quality’ also informs the MDGs. The Millennium Development Goals comprise eight international development goals that were established following the 2000 United Nations Millennium Declaration (Lundine et al., 2013) that expressed a commitment to accelerate human development and poverty reduction (Stalker, 2007). “One of the key indicators for success to monitor progress towards MDGs is improved quality based on holistic approach including education” (UN, 2010). Hence, the achievement of ‘quality’ is significant to the education policy agendas of both of these global education institutions. The EFA Global Monitoring Report 2013/14, for example, maintains that a high quality education is contiguous with sustainable development, positive attitudes towards globalisation and the challenges of a global free market. However, drawing upon Quirola, Tamatea (2005) contends that the so-called free (but not always fair) market doesn’t always result in positive contributions to enabling equality, equity or global citizenship, especially in developing countries. More often than not, the composition of the global free market is made up of winners and losers (Tamatea, 2005). Despite this outcome – or possibly precisely because of this outcome – it is generally agreed that the goals of neither the EFA nor the MDG have been fully realised (UNESCO, 2014). The EFA Global Monitoring Report Teaching and Learning: Achieving quality for all (UNESCO, 2014) states that the failure to realise its goals is argued by some to be the result of a lack of commitment from both the international community and national governments to recognising and exploiting the power of education as a catalyst for development (UNESCO, 2014, p. 143). More importantly, at least in terms of the discourse which informs these global policy agendas, is the UNESCO (2014) argument that the ongoing learning ‘crisis’ associated with a number of countries for which EFA and MDGs were proposed as solutions, results from lack of attention to educational ‘quality’ and a subsequent failure of education to reach and benefit marginalised populations (UNESCO, 2014, p. 217).
Such learning crises are worsened by the presence of neoliberal power. As stated in Chapter 2, Muhsin (2008) contended that a combination of neoliberal ideas and decreases in government education subsidies results in education being unreachable for Indonesia’s poor. Such circumstances may reduce the quality of education overall. Mushin (2008) also argued the decrease in government subsidy presents a dilemma for higher education in maintaining the quality of education provision with inadequate levels of educational funding.

This section began with the view that fabricating a sense of crisis is one way to achieve political and social action on a particular issue in learning and more generally in education. Crises in learning may always be in progress under the conditions created by the influence of neoliberal ideas and power relations. Improving quality learning is always both a challenge and a goal embedded in neoliberal policy ideas. This section shows how the notion of learning crises strongly articulated in global policy agendas achieves influence through the enhancement of quality education as it also challenges neoliberal ideas as they flow along and manifest themselves in the ideo-scape.

4.2.2 Quality, transparency and accountability

Along with EFA policy discourse on ‘crisis and quality’ identified above, and used as a reference point for developing quality education in national policy documents, also manifest in discourses of equity of learning opportunities are notions of accountability and transparency in order to address quality assurance. These are articulated in both EFA and MDG agendas. “The accountability of the school system to learners themselves, to parents and to communities should be emphasized” (UNESCO, 2000, p. 61) to guarantee quality assurance that involves social participation. Shore also confirms that in the present day, “the management of government funded programs require quality assurance and funding against prescribed national outcomes” (2007, p. 71), especially if they are to continue to receive funds. Thus, the efficiency,
the effectiveness and the progress of the funded program can be monitored and evaluated by the institutions that provide funding.

The emphasis on accountability in the statement above is also arguably related to the notion of quality in education. Both are components of neoliberal discourse (Tamatea, 2005). The notions of accountability, transparency and equity of learning opportunity as depicted in EFA policy texts are not only key components aligned with neoliberal ideas, they are also similar to what is articulated in national and local institutional policies.

In regard to apparent characteristics of neoliberalism, both transparency and accountability are repeatedly mentioned as part of the EFA agenda and especially in relation to key issues in monitoring the achievement of post-2015 outcomes:

If, as expected, new education goals after 2015 extend to lower secondary education, the finance gap will rise to US$38 billion. The post-2015 framework must include explicit financing targets demanding full transparency, so that all donors are accountable for their commitments, and finance gaps do not thwart our promises to children (UNESCO, 2014, p. 8).

The quote above highlights the reference to neoliberal notions of transparency and accountability. To some extent, transparency is useful in terms of building good governance and public trust. Mardiasmo (2001) contended that transparency refers to openness and indicates a responsibility of the government to the public, so that the development plans, goals, processes, and outcomes may involve them: “Transparency as a moral and political imperative is closely associated with goals such as accountable, inclusive, legitimate and democratic governance” (Gupta, 2008, p. 1). However, there is also criticism of such notions of transparency. Gupta and Mason (2014) contend that the effects of transparency are limited and often specific to particular contexts. In the context of education, Tamatea (2005) argued that a focus on transparency in managerial discourse might constrain the achievement of
diversity in education and therefore also the achievement of equity, particularly where it is strongly tied to universal criteria which can stifle the recognition of difference, creativity and innovation. Global notions of transparency may restrict the innovation and creativity of each country for which it has distinctive potential.

Yet notions of transparency and accountability are commonly reproduced in Indonesian national education policies, where it is stated that, “Pengelolaan dana pendidikan berdasarkan pada prinsip keadilan, efisiensi, transparansi, dan akuntabilitas public” [The management of educational budget is based on the principles of justice, efficiency, transparency, and public accountability] (Republik Indonesia, 2003, p. 13).

This statement, drawn from the NES (Republik Indonesia, 2003), reveals a focus on the idea of, among other things, transparency in managing the educational budget. This message attempts to guarantee accountability to the public and to avoid a disjuncture between transparent financial matters and the possibility of corrupt educational budget management.

The idea of transparency is also emphasised in the teacher certification process. The Teacher Law No. 14/2005 articulates transparency and accountability in terms of teacher certification. “Sertifikasi pendidik dilaksanakan secara objektif, transparan, dan akuntabel” [Teacher certification must be carried out objectively, transparently, and accountably] (Republik Indonesia, 2005b, p. 7). This emphasis on accountability is also confirmed in the National Accreditation Board for Higher Education (Badan Akreditasi Nasional Perguruan tinggi-BAN-PT) (Republik Indonesia, 2012b). This has been mandated by the decree of minister education No. 59 (Republik Indonesia, 2012). The National Board for Higher Education has several roles and among them are developing a national accreditation system, carrying out institutional accreditation, and evaluating the eligibility of study programs (departments in universities). The documents produced by the decree of ministry education on National Accreditation Board for Higher Education (Republik Indonesia, 2005c)
contain institutional guidelines, and policies on neoliberal ideas, such as: transparency, accountability, curriculum, and student quality. For example: Untuk meningkatkan kinerja lembaga Akreditasi pendidikan tinggi mandiri yang dibentuk oleh masyarakat...lembaga ini dapat merintis dan memberdayakan potensinya dalam menggali dana dan sumber daya dari masyarakat secara sah...dengan bentuk pertanggungjawaban yang transparan sesuai dengan prinsip akuntabilitas [to improve the performance of independent accreditation institution for higher education established by society...this institution can initiate and empower its potential in digging up the funding and resources from society legally...in the form obligation which is transparent in accordance with the accountability principle] (Republik Indonesia, 2005c, p. 6).

Transparency in this statement aims to convince the public that the process of teacher certification is open, fair and accountable to the public. Its intention is to avoid social distrust and any possibility of dishonesty and unfairness during the process of teacher certification.

Although from a financial perspective, transparency in the expenditure of finances is undoubtedly a desirable outcome (Thomas, 1999), with regard to its comprising an overarching frame for organising and ‘governing’ all social relations in education, its necessity and efficacy remains questionable (Tamatea, 2005; Thomas, 1999). Nonetheless, in global and Indonesian (national) education policy, the implicit policy position is that social relations can be governed by the same principles that govern financial relations. Transparency and accountability are used to assure quality.

Locally, institutional policies such as the Vice-Chancellor regulations, department curricula and practicum guides also articulate similar neoliberal notions of transparency and accountability. For example, Vice-Chancellor regulations reproduce a range of governance related notions reflected in global policy texts. Higher education governance at Full Moon University 2011 noted in this study is based on:
Principles of obedience to one God – the almighty, justice, equity of learning opportunities, accountability, transparency, management effectiveness and efficiency, by emphasizing quality, relevance and togetherness for educating nation, improving quality Indonesian people who have noble character and mastery of science and technology and art in national and international level (Full Moon, 2011)

The Vice Chancellor at this site manages the university by emphasising the message of transparency, which is then translated by academic and administrative staff into their daily tasks. For instance, lecturers are required to represent and enact the notion of transparency through the way they remain committed to the criteria of assessment which is transparent so that the students receive fair treatment and scores. Similarly, relevant administrative staffs are required to report the educational budget openly and fairly to the academic community at the institution.

This Vice-Chancellor Regulation deploys neoliberal ideas contiguously with notions which are very much less amenable to quantification and measurement. The local and national values which become the reference and foundation characterising national identity are mixed with neoliberal ideas which are mandated for national development. The five national principles – Pancasila (the official philosophical foundation of the Indonesia) – always characterise policy development. Therefore, when global messages are adopted and adapted, they negotiate with local and national values. One perspective is that such local policy texts blend global discourse with local wisdom (Tamatea, 2011). This constructs a local policy position which reflects the local contexts (Appadurai, 1996). This is particularly so in the Full Moon University context, where the Vice Chancellor’s statement references God, justice and nobility of character. While this may seem to be an unusual assembling of ideas, it again is not unique to the Indonesian context.

Raihani argued that “the idea of making religion classes compulsory was eventually realized in 1965” (2014, p. 109). He further explained that this idea was strengthened by “Decree No. XXVII/1966 issued by the
temporary People’s General Assembly declaring religion classes compulsory from primary school to university" (p. 109). Drawing from Mujiburrahman, he stated that Education Law 1989 (Republik Indonesia, 1989) reasserted the status of religion as a compulsory subject in Indonesian schools and this continued to be reasserted in the Education Law of 2003 (Republik Indonesia, 2003). The association between religion and national policy, particularly education policy, has often taken place in other countries too, for example, in Pakistan (Thobani, 2014) and the United States (Tamatea, 2008). Across these countries, what can be seen in the above assembly of ideas and concepts is the local adaptation of global policy to fit the needs of the local environment.

In summary, the idea of transparency and accountability existent in The Dakar Framework (UNESCO, 2000), EFA (UNESCO, 2014), NES (Republik Indonesia, 2003), Teacher Law (Republik Indonesia, 2005b), and Vice Chancellor Regulations are mobilised from the global to the local context. When those ideas arrive at the national or local context from the global one, they are adjusted to the situation in the local context. So, the ideas of transparency and accountability merge with local wisdom. This alignment shows the penetration of such a neoliberal idea as accountability into national and local institutional policies.

Besides acquiring positive acceptance, the discourse of transparency and accountability also attracts criticism. Transparency of financial accountability is associated positively with a demonstration of responsibility in spending funds. However, it attracts criticism for its tendency to minimise respect for diversity in education when such discourse is mainly used to assure quality in education.

4.2.3 Quality, global competition and global mobility/employability

Neoliberal discourse has triggered global competition and global mobility and employability. The movement of people around the globe is often associated with employment (Appadurai, 1996). Their movement is usually triggered by global employment needs and the sometimes high demand for quality education and skills (Kell, 2004). Two closely related
key issues are relevant for this study, namely global competition and the twin flows of mobility/employability that accompanies, foster and are in turn shaped by competition.

**Global competition**

Dang, Nguyen and Le (2013) argued that the discourse of global competition drives every country to achieve its best. For example, in the Indonesian context, Jalal et al. (2009) argued the importance of competitiveness in relation to the necessity to improve the quality of education. Quality education is argued to be a determining factor in the achievement of national competitiveness, grounded in the production (education) of competitive human resources (Chang et al., 2014; Jalal et al., 2009). Furthermore, technology is often considered not only necessary for the production of this resource, but also an outcome of its achievement (UNESCO, 2000) – for example, the production of workers with expertise in technology (Appadurai, 1996). With respect to this, *The Dakar Framework for Action* (UNESCO, 2000) highlighted that some countries were unable to effectively compete on the global stage as a result of a failure to establish a strong nexus between technology and education. For instance:

> In the Arab region, millions of individuals remain deprived of education and millions are getting education of poor quality, while most of the rest are not appropriately prepared for the technological era and the international competition in the new millennium (UNESCO, 2000, p. 48)

The above statement may also indicate that inequality in quality education is still experienced by some regions, while on the other hand; other parts of the world have enjoyed advances in technology. *The Dakar Framework for Action* (UNESCO, 2000) reproduces a position that is often articulated in the development focus literature with regard to the relationship between technology, education and development (Tamatea, Hardy & Ninnes, 2008). In the Indonesian context, for example, such inequality in accessing information and education may often be present in some remote areas. Madya observes the poor conditions associated with remote areas and asserts that:
In these areas, people are deprived of access to information and education, and schools, due to delivery problems, cannot be easily equipped with textbooks, curriculum guidelines and laboratories as well as other facilities. Certain schools in isolated areas are seldom, if ever, visited by their supervisors/superintendents and their staff members rarely have the opportunity to attend in-service education (2007, p. 199).

However, this could also be a result of resistance to development. The global message for development in ICT use, for instance, may not be accepted in certain local contexts.

Such examples of inequality or uneven access to resources may also be linked to the influence of neoliberal ideas found in this global neoliberal era (Hill & Kumar, 2009). Hill and Kumar (2009) argued that global capital has produced social class inequalities. “Global capitalisms wish to cut public expenditure” (Hill & Kumar, 2009, p. 2) and as a result, this widens the gap between the rich and the poor. In addition, the forms of competition associated with the world market and free trade challenge efforts to achieve equality because those with access to the discursive and financial resources to sustain their positions of power within neoliberal discursive formations are often more effective in maintaining the conditions of inequality underpinning neoliberalism.

The provision of a high-quality education remains a goal imposed by the development requirements, a positive attitude towards globalisation, and the challenges of the world market competition and free trade (UNESCO, 2000, p. 53).

This statement articulates a relationship between education and a neoliberal market grounded in competition and so-called ‘free trade’. Moreover, globalisation, it seems, is of the kind that is equally grounded in the neoliberal ‘world market’ and ‘free trade’ (Kell et al., 2004). The above articulation in The Dakar Framework holds implications for identifying notions of the global citizen existent in national policy. In the Indonesian teacher education context, Government Regulation, No. 74/2008 (Departemen Pendidikan Nasional Republik Indonesia, 2008) pertaining to teachers, asserts that into the future, a measurement of
quality will be one that is grounded in the capacity of the individual to compete in the global market place. Such policy declarations are aimed at producing graduate teachers, and as a consequence students, as global citizens who are winners in the world market, as opposed to losers. But as Zhao (2010) maintained, preparing students for global competition requires teachers to have knowledge of such globalisation.

As truthful as Zhao’s claim may be, Indonesian national education policy offers a particularly restricted view of what globalisation actually is (Grijns, 1999; Lie, 2007). Taking up the focus on the global citizen, the following section explores the notions of global mobility and employability in relation to flows along the ethno-scape.

**Global mobility and employability**

As noted above, notions of free trade and competition in the global market are challenging for many developing countries. In the context of the EFL classroom in Indonesia, this is especially difficult where both EFL teachers and their students are required to meet those criteria that will allow them, through attainment of proficiency in English, to be ‘winners’ with regard to securing appropriate jobs in the global employment market (Saavedra & Opfer, 2012).

Appadurai’s (1996) notion of ethno-scape refers to the movement of people around the globe and is often (but not always) triggered by global employment needs and the sometimes high demand for quality education and skills (Kell, 2004). Kell and Vogl (2012) suggest that economic competition arguably drives global mobility and employability along the ethno-scape. For example, as early as 2000, MDG reports noted the significance of the relationship between education and employment, asserting that MDGs can only work by engaging national and global society as a whole (United Nations, 2014, p. 27). Further, the global transfer and exchange of ‘skilled workers’ is central to “the scaling-up of Millennium Development Goal initiatives in many parts of the world” (United Nations, 2014, p. 31). In this context, education functions as a contributor to global employability and the portability of education.
qualifications and as a consequence it also contributes to neoliberal economic agendas. But this too is a site characterised by winners and losers. While nation states might be willing to encourage the inward flow of those with appropriate qualifications and skills, in the best case scenario this results in acceptance by local populations.²

In the Indonesian national context, the number of visitors to Indonesia increased in 2015 (Asdhiana, 2015), which shows an increase in global mobility. This increase may be an outcome of (among other things) the recently introduced free visa policy.³ Minister of Tourist Affairs, Arief Yahya (2015), states that “dampak dari kebijakan Bebas Visa Kunjungan ... mulai memberikan hasil dengan meningkatnya kunjungan wisman yang pada September 2015” [The impact of free tourist visa... starts to show from the increasing visits of foreign visitors in September 2015] (Asdhiana, 2015).

Furthermore, Ronny Sompie, the General Director of Immigration Affairs asserts:

Pada Juni-Agustus 2015 terdapat 864.982 orang warga negara asing masuk ke Indonesia. Padahal, pada periode yang sama tahun sebelumnya hanya terdapat 740.718 orang warga negara asing yang masuk ke dalam negeri"

[During June-August 2015 there are 864,982 foreigners entering Indonesia. In fact, at the same period in the previous year there were 740,718 foreigners entering [Indonesia] (Bisnis.com, Jakarta, 2015).

In addition to the above noted issues, the increased mobility results from regional open markets, such as the ASEAN Economic Community. Table 8 shows the distribution of foreign workers into Indonesia.

² In the worst case (and worse still in relation to the global flow of refugees which Tamatea (2011) sees as an outcome of global neoliberal policy) the result is often a surge in local politics of identity, as is currently occurring in Australia and Europe (Kell & Vogl, 2012; Tamatea, 2011).
³ To improve the relationship between Indonesia and other countries and to improve the benefits in economic improvement and the increase of foreign visitors, the Indonesian Government has issued President Regulation No. 21/2016 regarding free tourist visas (Republik Indonesia, 2016).
Table 8: Distribution of Foreign Working Force in Indonesia according to country

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Countries</th>
<th>Year 2011</th>
<th>2012</th>
<th>2013</th>
<th>2014</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>(People’s Republic of) China</td>
<td>16,153</td>
<td>16,731</td>
<td>14,371</td>
<td>15,341</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Japan</td>
<td>10,935</td>
<td>12,803</td>
<td>11,081</td>
<td>10,183</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>South Korea</td>
<td>6,505</td>
<td>8,190</td>
<td>9,075</td>
<td>7,678</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>India</td>
<td>4,974</td>
<td>5,923</td>
<td>6,047</td>
<td>4,680</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Malaysia</td>
<td>4,938</td>
<td>5,330</td>
<td>4,962</td>
<td>3,779</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>United States</td>
<td>4,483</td>
<td>4,644</td>
<td>2,197</td>
<td>2,497</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Thailand</td>
<td>3,863</td>
<td>4,146</td>
<td>1,841</td>
<td>941</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Australia</td>
<td>3,834</td>
<td>3,644</td>
<td>3,376</td>
<td>2,503</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Philippines</td>
<td>3,816</td>
<td>3,588</td>
<td>2,601</td>
<td>2,509</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>England</td>
<td>3,144</td>
<td>3,292</td>
<td>2,631</td>
<td>2,092</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Other countries</td>
<td>14,662</td>
<td>4,136</td>
<td>10,775</td>
<td>12,401</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>77,307</td>
<td>72,427</td>
<td>68,957</td>
<td>64,604</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: (Republik Indonesia, 2014)

Table 8 above identifies the foreign working force in Indonesia as coming from various countries. This indicates flows along the ethno-scape, including the year and the number of foreigners. The composition of this employment flow into Indonesia has been highlighted by the Indonesian Ministry of Labour and Transmigration [Kementerian tenaga kerja dan transmigrasi/ Kemenakertrans], which noted that between January 2011 and December 2011, there were about 77,300 foreign workers in Indonesia in various employment categories:

Sebagian besar tenaga kerja asing itu merupakan profesional sebanyak 34,763 orang, advisor/konsultan 12,761 orang, manajer 12,505 orang, Direksi 6,511 orang, teknisi 5,276 orang. Sedangkan sisanya terdiri, supervisor 4,746 orang dan komisaris 738 orang

[Most of those foreign workers consist of 34,763 people as professionals, 12,761 people as advisors or consultants, 12,505 people as managers, 6,511 people as directors, 5,276 people as technicians, while the rest consist of 4,746 people as supervisors and 738 people as commissaries](http://finance.detik.com).
Indonesia has agreed to commit to “Masyarakat Ekonomi ASEAN 2015” (the ASEAN Economic Community) (Malau, 2014; Wangke, 2014) that becomes the blueprint for integration into the global economy. Moreover, the Ministry of Labour of the Republic of Indonesia acknowledges, that incoming foreign workers bring both “positive and negative impacts” (Republik Indonesia, 2014, p. 9).

The positive influences associated with foreign workers include a transfer of high-end knowledge and opportunities, such as Indonesians working in areas such as engineering, nursing, architectural, surveying and medical qualifications and accountancy (Republik Indonesia, 2014, p. 9), in order to acquire specific skills and knowledge and work alongside an international class of workers. The negative impacts relate to reducing the employment opportunities for local workers, increasing outflow of government revenue (much of which is repatriated to the international workers’ home country), and cultural factors that are considered unacceptable to local standards and norms (Republik Indonesia, 2014).

In relation to education, references to global mobility are found in Indonesia’s Teacher Law (2005) with regard to rules for foreign workers. Article 65 of the Law states with regard to the foreign teaching force employed in Indonesia that, “Tenaga kerja asing yang dipekerjakan sebagai dosen pada satuan pendidikan tinggi di Indonesia wajib mematuhi peraturan perundang-undangan” [Foreign forces employed as lecturers in higher education level in Indonesia must obey the rules of the law] (Indonesian Teachers Law, Article 65, 2005).

The above statement may exemplify what Appadurai (1996) would view as a local response to inward global flows, which in this instance is the attempt to strengthen (ethno-) national boundaries in the face of perceived negative cultural practices.

Aside from the flow of workers into Indonesia to teach English, however, there is also a flow of workers out of Indonesia who are seeking enhanced access to English language opportunities. The establishment of the Indonesia Australia Language Foundation (IALF) exemplifies just one
of a number of institutions in Indonesia with multiple campuses (Jakarta, Surabaya and Bali) that provide training in English for the purpose of employment in a global context. Some scholarship providers, for example, facilitate the movement of Indonesian EFL teachers to upgrade their knowledge to improve their quality of education in English speaking countries. Such is the significance of the movement on the global scale, to learn English (Crystal, 2003).

To summarise, the notion of quality education at the macro level of discourse is linked with a number of neoliberal features. Crises in learning and teaching and some ways of recovering from crises by activating strategies of transparency and accountability in the education system are key features of global policy agendas. Along with the discourse on transparency and accountability to assure quality education, discussion of other features of neoliberalism – global competition, global mobility and employability – were included to illustrate the challenges of working in a global market. In the next section, the notion of quality is elaborated on in relation to specific exemplars of EFL teacher education operating at the micro level of discourse.

4.3 Neoliberal ideas and quality education: Exemplars from EFL teacher education

As noted in the introduction to this Chapter, the notion of quality at the micro level of discourse is associated with specific exemplars of interconnected flows. In this section this includes applied areas related to EFL teacher education programs for preparing quality teachers, including: learner centred pedagogy; English as a global language; (teacher) standards; quality teacher preparation; financial matters and the role of media for quality learning.

The MDGs reports (United Nations, 2010, 2014), The Dakar Framework (UNESCO, 2000) and Education for All (UNESCO, 2004b, 2014) also speak of quality teacher improvement, and this emphasis also informs
Indonesian national education policies and local institutional policies including curriculum.

4.3.1 Quality education and the notion of learner centeredness

*The Dakar Framework* (UNESCO, 2000) maintains that improvement in the quality of education is important for economic and social development and therefore the achievement of quality education is a national imperative. According to this framework, curriculum reform comprises one of the four elements necessary for achieving quality education, and this hinges on reorienting to learner centred pedagogies:

Approaches to improving the quality of education require adoption of curriculum content and processes that are learner centred, recognize the diversity of learning needs and stages of cognitive, social and emotional development, and develop knowledge, skills, and attitudes required for independent learning and problem-solving (UNESCO, 2000, p. 59).

This advice accords with that which has been articulated in the Indonesian Government Regulation on Standards of National Education (Republik Indonesia, 2013), which holds that [my translation] “learning should be framed by interactivity, cheerfulness, inspiration and challenge in order to motivate learners to participate in learning process more actively – all key components of a learner centred curriculum orientation” (Republik Indonesia, 2013, p. 10). In relation to the teaching of English as a foreign language in Indonesia, Sahiruddin (2013) argues that school curriculum in Indonesia has changed several times in the past fifty years in response to worldwide English Language Teaching (ELT) methodologies. The apparent synchronicity between the advice of *The Dakar Framework* and that provided in Regulations No. 19/2005 and No. 32/2013 (Republik Indonesia, 2013) suggests that education in Indonesia continues to be informed by the inward flow of globalising ideas. This relationship between the Indonesian education curriculum and globalising ideas continues in the new 2013 Indonesian curriculum (Mulyasa, 2013). Moreover, the 2013 curriculum explicitly identifies the phenomenon of
globalisation as one of the key dynamics for which education must prepare students:

Berbagai pihak menganalisis dan melihat perlunya diterapkan Kurikulum berbasis Kompetensi sekali ge berbasis karakter...sesuai perkembangan zaman dan tuntutan teknologi...penting guna menjawab tantangan arus globalisasi...oleh karena itu merupakan langkah yang positif ketika pemerintah (Mendikbud) merevitalisasi pendidikan karakter dalam seluruh jenis dan jenjang pendidikan termasuk dalam pengembangan Kurikulum 2013

[proponents from various sides analyse and consider the importance of implementing competence based curriculum which is also character based... aligned with the development of era and the demand of technology... crucial to answer the challenges of global flows... thus it is a positive strategy when the government revitalised character education in all aspects and levels of education, including in 2013 curriculum development] (Mulyasa, 2013, p. 6).

Mulyasa (2013), a Professor in Education and Curriculum Development at Universitas Islam Nusantara (UniNus), acknowledges that the quality of Indonesia’s education outputs is considered lower compared to those of other countries both within Asia as a whole and more specifically within the ASEAN countries. As a result, he strongly advocates the continued adoption of new and globalising ideas to support curriculum development in Indonesian school education, with the aim of developing Indonesian human capital (Mulyasa, 2013). Such development is urgent considering the fact that quality education “khususnya mutu output pendidikan masih rendah jika disbanding dengan mutu output di negara lain, baik ASIA maupun di kawasan ASEAN” [especially the quality of educational outputs, still remains lower compared to the quality of education in other countries, either Asia or ASEAN] (Mulyasa, 2013, p. 13).

The flow of ideas about learner centred learning along the ideo-scape are also reflected locally in the discourse and texts produced and circulated by various teacher training and education institutions. These institutions often reproduce the ideas embedded in national policy discourse and
texts concerning the regulation of national education standards that are the focus of this study. For example, the curriculum of the English Department of the Teacher Training Education Faculty in Full Moon University 2011 advises using various approaches, methods, techniques and media for English language learning, thus providing a broad choice of learning strategies because EFL pre-service teachers are exposed to various approaches, not only a learner-centred approach. However, the ideas about learner-centred pedagogy in the curriculum still emerge through learner-centred approaches, methods and techniques adopted from countries flowing to Indonesia that result from the movement of people (ethno-scape) via teacher exchange programs and the movement of information (media-scape) via internet access. For example, from the early 1950s, the Indonesian government through a US Ford Foundation grant started to introduce the audio-lingual approach, which later led to an audio-lingual based curriculum with the language laboratory as the main support, from which audio-lingual textbooks were developed (Sahiruddin, 2013).

Another form of local institutional policy, Rector Regulations of Full Moon University 2012, emphasises the idea of improving the quality of the learning process and producing competent graduates. In relation to producing competent graduates who may be globally employed, the curriculum contains strong emphasis on English, which has an important role not only in the context of developing science and applying technology in teaching but also for international communication. For example, the Rector Regulation (2002) in Sun University states that “program bahasa Inggris profesi ini merupakan program yang wajib diikuti oleh semua mahasiswa...serta wajib lulus dan menjadi prasyarat untuk mengikuti wisuda” [the English professional program is compulsory for all students... and they must pass the benchmark and this becomes a prerequisite for graduation].

The next section illustrates the idea of the necessity of English as a foreign language and how elements of the ideo-scape facilitate the flow of this idea and its effects.
4.3.2 English as a global language and a foreign language in Indonesia

English as a global language has to be considered by any nation in its language policy (Johnson, 2009; Spolsky, 2004). Global partnerships are among the many agendas articulated by the MDGs and require English language to be an instrument for communication in international affairs (Johnson, 2009). Even though there is no explicit articulation in the agenda, the agenda and reports are written in English, thus reinforcing the importance of mastering English as a language of global policy and as an international language for global cooperation. All nations are encouraged to promote and achieve English competence for all to meet the demands of the increasing global importance of that language (Exley, 2004; Zentz, 2013).

The ideo-scape informs the role of English language and how it is taken up in policy and circulates through finance systems, education systems, teacher training sites and industry.

The response to [English] demand by governments around the world has been to introduce English as a compulsory subject at younger and younger ages, often without adequate funding, teacher education, or the provision of appropriate resources. In business, industry, and government, workers are increasingly expected to develop proficiency in English (Nunan, 2003).

Moreover, regionally, the ASEAN Charter formalised the use of English as ASEAN's sole working language; all discussion and negotiation among the ten nations of Southeast Asia that make and establish ASEAN is in English and all documents are in English (Kirkpatrick, 2011). English is used as the official language by regional and international organisations (Zentz, 2013) and Indonesia participates in these organisations. In Indonesia, English is important as functioning as a means of communication in global partnership among nations. The importance of English is revealed in Indonesian National Education Standards (Republik Indonesia, 2013). Describing English as an essential language for global partnership in the policy texts illustrates how the flow of ideas along the ideo-scape is activated from the global level to the national level. The
following quote exemplifies such an implementation of the importance of English in Indonesia:

In addition to learning English as a subject, students in the university are also obliged to master English in line with the National Education Law… Many universities have made English one of the requirements of graduation, especially for their postgraduate programs. In the University of Indonesia for example, the Mathematics Department requires that its undergraduate students take an English Proficiency Test to identify their English capacity, and before they graduate, they should pass the test. (Emilia, 2005, p. 8)

That English is a global language and demand for English language skills continues to increase, especially in relation to global employment, was recognised by many participants in this study. One commented as follows:

In my mind, English language in the globalisation era is something which is very crucial because people can master the world, especially … jobs, like a good job, with that good position if someone can master English, so… why I became an English teacher is because an English language teacher is a stick for everyone to obtain success, so this job is promising in the future (Denny)

Denny’s response suggests that not only does national policy acknowledge a relationship between global employment possibilities and education, but that this relationship is also acknowledged and reproduced by students. This student perception is also supported by Indonesian employment advertisements:

We are currently seeking for a professional to fill the following positions…
“Mampu berbahasa Inggris baik lisan maupun tulisan [Having good skills of listening and writing in English] (Bilaboong.com, 2013).

The above advertisement illustrates the need for the mastery of good English for applicants; as does the following advertisement from The Jakarta Post (2014):
We are looking for suitably qualified and experienced individuals to join our team of IELTS examiners in Jakarta, Surabaya, Malang, Yogyakarta, Makassar and other locations. This is a professional qualification which will enhance employability as well as being a source of additional income. IELTS tests are conducted up to three times monthly and certified examiners (The Jakarta Post, 2014).

For the local context, the above advertisement requires a high level standard of English. Global mobility implies high quality standards in education. The local and national quality standards are important to upgrade in order to adjust to the global market.

EFL pre-service teachers and EFL teachers are among many agents of this rapid flow. At the local level, the rapidity in the flow of the English language is facilitated by local school curricula in which English becomes one of the compulsory subjects at schools and one of the main subjects to include in the national examination:

> Pada jenjang [pendidikan menengah] Ujian Nasional mencakup pelajaran Bahasa Indonesia, Bahasa Inggris, Matematika, dan mata pelajaran kejuruan yang menjadi ciri khas program pendidikan.

> [At the [junior and high] levels of education... the national examination includes, English, math, and vocational subjects that become the characteristics of education program] (Republik Indonesia, 2013, p. 17).

Promoting English as an international language, as occurs in the national policy noted above, creates opportunities to circulate and reproduce perceptions of the value of English in pre-service teacher programs. These opportunities are further taken up by prospective teachers as evidenced in Ruth’s interview below:

> Menjadi guru Bahasa Inggris itu menurut saya membantu siswa-siswa menyadari betapa pentingnya Bahasa Inggris itu sebagai bahasa internasional agar mereka itu lebih terbuka kepada dunia, memahami dunia secara luas tidak terpaku hanya di Indonesia

> [In my opinion, becoming an English teacher helps students to be aware of the importance of English as an international language so that they open
their minds to the world, understand the world widely, not focusing on the Indonesian context] (Ruth).

What Ruth highlights above reflects the response to the flow of ideas associated with the importance of English. Ruth and other EFL pre-service teachers are exposed to and take up perceptions of the importance of the English language.

Other EFL pre-service teachers also commented on the significance of English and demonstrated a strong awareness of the importance of English as an international if not global language:

Becoming EFL teachers in my mind…. helps learners to be aware of how important English language is as an international language in order to be open to the world, to understand the world more widely, not only focus on Indonesia… has certain pride because besides being able to use national language, able to learn another language, especially English that is the global language; moreover all science uses English so, with English, we do not only learn language because if we know how we use language and know the meanings, we can learn other subjects… And we can go everywhere if we can speak English. We can go to foreign countries, speak to foreigners, like there is no distance (Nina).

According to Nina above, English is significant not only because it supports international mobility: it is also associated with a capacity to transcend distance. Equally significant in this comment is the influence of a globalist framework for talking about English for oneself and others. Not only does it articulate a key dynamic of globalisation, which is space (and time) compression (Robertson, 1992), as discussed in Chapter 2, but it also represents English as being associated with access to a fuller range of knowledge, which in this instance is that associated with science.

The movement of global flows along the ideo-scape – as noted with regard to the idea of the importance of English above – is both inward and outward relative to the nation-state. For example, outward flows can be seen from the action of introducing Indonesian culture in international arenas, which has been one of the concerns of the Ministry of Education in relation to teaching English in Indonesia. The outward flow of culture
noted previously by Sahiruddin (2013) arguably enables Indonesian culture to become known by the international community, which can have consequences for flows along other scapes, one of these being the finance-scape. This interconnectedness between flows along different scapes is evident in Meriam’s discussion of her reasons for taking up English language learning in Solo, Central Java:

There were many tourists, and after talking to them, a new idea appeared, that English was fascinating and interesting, so we can chat with tourists everywhere; formerly I couldn’t speak fluently with them; and it turned out that there was English department... then I joined the English department (Meriam).

While the response of Meriam and many other student teachers is positive towards such flows along the ethno-scape, others in Indonesia do not look upon cultural flows, such as those that might be associated with the inflow of English, so positively. “Attitudes of some policy makers and commentators towards the language have often been ambivalent, expressing fears of its power to exert negative cultural influences” (Lauder, 2008, p. 1). The evidence showing positive and negative perceptions related to inward flow are revealed in some electronic resources, such as newspapers and blogs. For example, one of the online public blogs – Abatasa’s blog (Abatasa, 2009) – in responding to modernity and globalisation identifies the positive and negative impacts in the context of educating children. On the negative side, the blog reveals some of the tension associated with this scape, as also acknowledged in Appadurai’s model (1996):

Not all aspects of western cultures are productive or appropriate to be applied in Indonesia. Negative cultures that start shifting the indigenous culture, such as children do not respect parents, free life among adolescents, and so on (Abatasa, 2009).

The above statement indicates that in adhering to global policy commitments, the Indonesian government might be implementing a program of change which is not agreeable to some people. Therefore, implementing global and national messages in ways that improve quality
education is not always easy when there are tensions with local wisdom. Such tensions may often produce challenges in policy implementation. In the case of teaching English in Indonesia, it therefore becomes challenging for EFL teachers to implement policy in certain local classroom contexts. This issue will be more fully discussed in Chapter 6.

Access to international and globalising knowledge and flows associated with the ethno-scape can, however, have consequences at the local level, and the infl ow of English and knowledge associated with English has often constituted a site for local reaction (Appadurai, 1996). Such reactions are often ethno-nationalist in nature, as well as being identity-related and political (Tamatea, 2011).

In the context of this research project, the reaction to English was both positive and negative. Nationally the Indonesian government has mandated English as a compulsory subject starting from junior high school (Yuwono & Harbon, 2010), as required by both the 2006 and new 2013 curriculum. At the same time, many primary schools have also required an English subject through the local institutional wisdom of the school, and parents whose children study in those schools have also welcomed the government’s English language policy positively. However, the introduction of English into the primary curriculum has taken place in a context where few teachers are qualified to teach English to young learners (Suyanto, 2007). Indeed, although some parents were shocked that English was not required at the primary level in the 2013 curriculum, it should be noted that in fact English has never been a compulsory subject at the primary school level:

Orang tua di Jakarta, ujar Ramon, mungkin kaget saat melihat dalam Kurikulum 2013 tidak ada mata pelajaran bahasa Inggris dan TIK. Lalu mereka mengira keduanya dihapuskan dari Kurikulum, padahal memang tidak ada dari dulu

Ramon [Chair of the Curriculum and Book Centre, Ministry of Education and Culture] said that parents in Jakarta might be shocked when they saw there were no English and ICT in the 2013 curriculum. They thought that
those two subjects were abolished from the curriculum, whereas in fact they have never been in the curriculum [of primary schools] (Novia, 2013, p. 12 December).

The above statement highlights the positive expectation of the public, especially parents in big cities, such as Jakarta, with regard to the inclusion of English in the school curriculum. Notwithstanding the inclusion of English, the time allocated to the teaching of English as a subject has been reduced. As Sahiruddin noted, “In the context of ELT in the 2013 curriculum, the time allotted for English subject at schools is reduced. This surely brings about several consequences for language teaching and learning process in Indonesia” (2013, p. 570).

This comment, however, does not present the inflow of English in a negative light. On the contrary, it expresses a concern about the consequences of not including English more fully in the national school curriculum, which is a position that has often been reproduced elsewhere in Indonesia (Sahiruddin, 2013). For many Indonesians, such as Nina, the pre-service ELF teacher above, English is associated with global competitiveness. The minimisation of English in the school curriculum is considered to have the potential to negatively impact Indonesia in this respect (Sahiruddin, 2013).

In comparison, Malaysia continues to place a strong focus upon English in the school curriculum (Tharmalingam, 2012). Hence, not only is the reduction of English problematic in terms of maintaining a parity with similar contexts is South East Asia, but from a policy perspective, the reduced commitment seems to be at odds with Malaysia’s view that adequately resourcing English in the school curriculum can in fact function to strengthen the local language: ‘Memartabatkan Bahasa Malaysia dan Memperkukuhkan Penguasaan Bahasa Inggris’ – MBMMBI (Kementerian Pendidikan Malaysia, 2011), [To Uphold Bahasa Malaysia and to Strengthen the English] (Tharmalingam, 2012). In this respect, the reduced commitment to extending the presence of English in the Indonesian school curriculum may not only function to reproduce Indonesia’s relative disadvantage in terms of the quality of education
outcomes, but also in the production of English proficient human resources. This may also have the potential to negatively impact Indonesia's capacity to engage with globalisation (Lauder, 2008; Sahiruddin, 2013b) in the ways desired by Indonesian national education policy.

4.3.4 Standards

Flows along the ideo-scape which are related to the notions of quality also address the notion of ‘standards’, which are recognised as significant to the achievement of quality (UNESCO, 2014). The notion of a standard usually relates to the idea of measuring entities with a goal to achieving desired outcomes using generalised criteria. Based on a recent EFA document (UNESCO, 2014), in a third of the countries from which data is available, less than 75% of teachers of pre-primary schools are trained according to national standards and this endangers the quality of education especially in the beginning level:

The proportion of teachers trained to national standards is particularly low in pre-primary education. Although the number of teachers at this level has increased by 53% since 2000, in 40 of the 75 countries with data, less than 75% of teachers are trained to the national standard (UNESCO, 2014, p. 6).

In line with this emphasis upon standards and an agenda to improve the quality of educators and the teaching force, the Indonesian National Teacher Law (Republik Indonesia, 2005b) and the Indonesian Qualification Framework (Republik Indonesia, 2012a) further articulate the association between education and globalisation. The later document has been mandated by Presidential Decree No. 8, 2012 in which qualification of Indonesian workforce at different levels of competencies is required to enhance the quality standard to adjust to the demands of the global market. For example, in the certification process, the competence test is following national and international standards. The process of giving competence certificate is done systematically and objectively through “uji kompetensi sesuai Standar Kompetensi Kerja Nasional
The pursuit of quality is not only framed here by neoliberal managerialist discourse, which in this instance references accountability alongside social justice. This neoliberal framing is also justified on the basis of globalisation:

To guarantee the extension and equity of access, the improvement of quality and relevance, as well as good governance and accountability of education that is able to face the challenges in line with the demand of change in local, national and global lives, it is necessary to empower and improve the quality of teachers and lecturers (Republik Indonesia, 2005b, p. 1). The statement above not only references globalisation, it does so in relation to the quality of teachers (and lecturers). This is a focus which also informs the discussion of standards articulated in the Law of the National Education System (Republik Indonesia, 2003). Similarly the National Decree on Standards of National Education (Republik Indonesia, 2013) reveals that standards are important to guarantee the quality of education so that Indonesia can meet the global demand for quality education and thus enable Indonesians to effectively participate in global competition with other countries.
[that government regulation No 19 2005 pertaining to national education standard needs to adapt to the dynamic of the society development, local, national and global to actualise the function and goals of national education] (Republik Indonesia, 2013)

This *National Education Standards* document is used “as a reference in developing curriculum to actualize national education goals” (Republik Indonesia, 2013, p. 8). In government regulations pertaining to standards, the discussion occurs in relation to not only the construction of graduate teacher education students but also the teaching workforce in general, infrastructure, governance, financing and assessment, as well as arranging curriculum (Republik Indonesia, 2013).

While the discussion above has shown how Indonesian national education policy incorporates an emphasis upon policy in global policy texts, the movement of flows along the ideo-scapes from the global to the local (as opposed to the national flows reviewed earlier in this discussion) can also be observed in the discussion of quality in the local institutional documents of the teacher training institutions investigated in this project. In this instance, the focus upon quality is elaborated in the context of teaching English as a foreign language at the English departments of the teacher training faculty in two case study universities in Central Java. The curriculum of the English departments of Sun University and Full Moon University variously state that prospective teacher education graduates are expected to have met a range of standards to guarantee the quality of the graduates. For example, at Full Moon University this was stated as ‘high communicative competence’, ‘adaptive ability to new education paradigm and English language learning’, and ‘practical and creative skills in solving educational and learning problems’. Additionally, based on the department curriculum text above, prospective graduates have to master the subject matter, understand learners’ characteristics, and develop in personality and professionalism.

In providing teacher education students with real world teaching experience during their course, these two institutions – Full Moon and Sun Universities – have established a number of guidelines which are in
line with the global and national mandates and perspectives identified above. Those guidelines are aligned with a global message for preparing pre-service teachers. *The Dakar Framework* states “Adequate time and investment must be given to re-train the existing teacher workforce and to reform pre- and in-service training” (UNESCO, 2000, p. 60).

Nationally, the policy reference to standards and quality is supported by the emphasis on the competence standards to be achieved by university teacher education graduates as articulated in the Teacher Law (Republik Indonesia, 2005b) and Government Regulation (Republik Indonesia, 2005a). And as with the national references to standards, local teacher education institutions either Full Moon University or Sun University are expected to also refer to and address graduate competency standards, including those for prospective EFL teachers, who are required to attain to such standards during microteaching and field-based experience. The competencies are also associated with notions of ‘professionalism’ and are articulated through a discourse which contains a mixture of competency-related graduate teacher characteristics which are quantitative and qualitative in nature. The four identified competences in FBE guide in Full Moon University include pedagogic, personal, professional and social competences as translated below:

The practice of field experience is addressed to form professional teachers or teaching force through training activities at schools with a purpose of understanding closely at physical, administration, academic, social, psychological environment at schools where the partnership is conducted. This experience enables pre-service teachers to master various basic skills on teaching and learning, apply various professional competences on pedagogy comprehensively and interestingly in that situation, develop personal and social aspects at schools and deepen educative value and internalization and experience during the training through reflection and expressing the result of reflection in report. This practice is to prepare them to be members of society having noble character, knowledge, skills and autonomy, attitude to apply knowledge, technology and art for humanitarian purposes.
In general, the goals of the program of FBE are that pre-service teachers should have pedagogic, personal, social and professional competences. The specific goals of FBE in the two research study sites are to prepare them to be quality teachers and to be able to compete through standardisation and competency examinations and be able to adapt to changes in education, knowledge, and technology, as well as social change in general.

The above statements, drawn from the university operational guides on the FBE, effectively reproduce the emphasis upon standards of professional teacher competence identified in the Teacher Act (Republik Indonesia, 2005b). However, a brief review of just two advertisements below indicates that the standards required of graduates who hold English language skills are possibly much higher than is required by institutional competency standards.

Take IELTS to prove you have the right English language skills to study, work or migrate to Australia. Almost 900 higher education institutions and programs in Australia accept IELTS scores as proof of English language proficiency (British Council, 2016).

National University Singapore Graduate Scholarship for ASEAN Nationals… a candidate must have a good command of the English language: As evidenced with either/both of the following: a Test of English as a Foreign Language [TOEFL] score of at least 580 for the paper-based test or 237 for the computer-based test or 85 for the internet-based score; or an International English Language Testing System [IELTS] result of at least 6.0 (National University of Singapore, 2015, p. 8 August).

The above quotes highlight the need for achievement of international competency standards with respect to attainment of English language skills for those who wish to study overseas. Thus, in many instances, teaching English in Indonesia requires recognition and achievement of the international standards.

The above advertisements also highlight the preference for an international level of English language competency over and above that
associated with the local (Indonesian) level. This occurs in a context where English language and English language competency function as a globally tradeable commodity in a free language market, albeit one which is framed by efforts to standardise and regulate (Johnson, 2009).

The above advertisements also reinforce how the pursuit of quality is also linked to globalisation. The notion of quality is linked to human knowledge. The expected product of quality education is individuals having global competitive knowledge. Shore (2007) argues that new knowledge is important to develop an individual country’s capacity for innovation and the growth of global knowledge. Having global competitive knowledge is not only demanded by the above advertisements, but indeed, is mandated by law. This is reflected in the explanation section of Teacher Law No. 14/2005 stating that the human quality needed by Indonesians in the future is the ability to face global competition with other nations. Therefore, it seems that quality adjusts to the standard of global demand, whereas to actualize this, it rests with teachers who have strategic positions, functions and roles associated with national development in the education sector (Republik Indonesia, 2005b).

While discussion above has identified how the notion of quality is used in global education policy discourse at a general level, and how this notion (of quality) is also used in Indonesian nation-state education policy texts and local institutional policy texts, the discussion below will focus upon how the notion of quality is used more specifically in relation to preparing teachers.

4.3.5 Quality teacher preparation

Global policy agendas have consolidated the view that poor quality educational provision and learning crises are intertwined. One solution designed to resolve this dilemma is to improve the quality of teachers, for as Hattie (2009) argued quality teachers will impact (and improve) student learning outcomes. This may occur through implementation of policies that set high expectations, but in fact the teaching profession in Indonesia is still regarded as lower status when compared to other professions.
When the teaching profession is of low status, this leads to difficulties in recruitment and retention. Improving the status of teaching is associated with better motivation and job satisfaction, which increases teacher retention and performance as well as student learning (UNESCO, 2015, p. 201).

The attraction and retention of teachers is a problem faced by many countries worldwide. Many schools face problems such as teacher shortage, which is most apparent, especially in certain areas, such as English as a second language, mathematics and the sciences, and with teacher placement in remote areas (Ashiedu & Scott-Ladd, 2012). These problems appear because many of the fresh graduates choose not to go into teaching at all (Luekens, Lyter & Fox, 2004) or to leave after just a few years (Cooper & Alvarado, 2006). They also occur through the effects of retirement age (OECD, 2011) and the unfavourable assumption that a teaching profession receives less salary than many other professionals with lower education requirements (Lortie, 2002). However, a supportive perception on the teaching profession was indicated by an Australian study (Ashiedu & Scott-Ladd, 2012) that indicated that attraction and retention in the teaching profession are determined mostly by teachers’ intrinsic motivation, and extrinsic motivation in the form of salary, the school environment and working conditions that drive them for retention.

In Indonesia, “some localities and schools face teacher shortages for a range of reasons” (UNESCO, 2016, p. 14), however based on a study by Chen it appears that Indonesia “at an aggregated level, does not have teacher shortage issues, unlike some other countries in the region, such as the Philippines or Cambodia” (Chen, 2009, p. 5). Using his framework, Chen shows that there is a phenomenon of the overall over-supply of teachers but shortage of qualified teachers in Indonesia. This contributes to the challenge to improve the quality education in Indonesia as well.

As advised in the EFA agenda and by Hattie and others, the performance of student learning can be improved by enhancing the quality of teachers.
The focus is to have a powerful effect on achievement, and this is where excellent teachers come to the fore – as such excellence in teaching is the single most powerful influence on achievement (Hattie, 2003, p. 4).

UNESCO (2014) has emphasised the importance of recruiting the best teacher candidates to achieve quality teaching and thereby enable recovery from the learning crises generated by a range of things, including poor quality educational provision.

The key to ending the learning crisis is to recruit the best teacher candidates, give them appropriate training, deploy them where they are needed most and give them incentives to make a long-term commitment to teaching (UNESCO, 2014, p. 186).

Recruiting the best prospective teachers is one central piece of UNESCO advice documented repeatedly as the solution to the learning crises.

In the light of these less than positive insights about educational outcomes, attention now seems to be focused upon establishing if not achieving post-2015 MDG outcomes – the continued EFA agenda after the 2015 deadline. Central to this and thus central to the achievement of ‘quality’ (UNESCO, 2014) is the recruitment of appropriate teacher candidates.

Reflecting the findings of other research concerning the influence which teachers have upon student learning outcomes (Darling-Hammond & Baratz-Snowden, 2007; Hanushek et al., 2004; Hattie, 2009), UNESCO has recently asserted of the global teacher education policy environment:

Good quality education depends on giving teachers the best possible training, not only before they start teaching but also throughout their careers. Initial teacher education should prepare teachers to help students from a wide range of backgrounds and with different needs, including those with inherited disadvantage, especially in the early grades. It should go beyond the theory of teaching to include classroom experience, and ensure that prospective teachers know enough about the subjects they are going to teach (UNESCO, 2014, p. 236).
Two messages can be inferred from the above quotes. Obtaining real classroom experience, such as that acquired through school-based teaching, is just as important in preparing teachers from the beginning of their teaching careers as is the mastery of content knowledge. The second message inferred from the above UNESCO texts is that prospective teachers must be given quality training throughout their career in addition to their initial training.

UNESCO (2014) argued that “teachers should receive adequate training that strikes a balance between theory and practice and that makes up for any shortcomings in subject knowledge”. With respect to this training, UNESCO acknowledges that all teacher education programs should aim:

To ensure that teachers meet proficiency requirements before being certified as 'qualified' or 'trained’ – but the quality of teachers graduating from such widely varying programmes can also differ, depending on the quality of the content and how teaching practice is organized. Teacher quality cannot be improved simply by increasing the length of training; the quality of training also needs to be improved (UNESCO, 2014, p. 187).

This focus upon quality and teacher training is supported by the research literature, which maintains that there is a strong link between pedagogy and learner outcomes. In Australia, for example, such research has informed the new ‘Students First’ blueprint for teacher education (Teacher Education Ministerial Advisory Group, 2015) which reproduces the association between teacher training and student learning outcomes (Darling-Hammond, 2014). In other words, although not wishing to establish a simplistic causal relationship, ‘quality’ teachers produce quality teaching and quality learning (Darling-Hammond, 1994; Hanushek et al., 2004; Levin & Quinn, 2003). Hanushek et. al (2004), for example, assert that good teachers can offset the gap in student achievement standards between low economic group students and those from higher income families, making the hiring of quality teachers important if schools overall are to produce good outcomes. With this relationship recognised at both the global and national levels, and established in education research as a relationship that extends beyond initial training, it is not
surprising that these messages are also acknowledged in the local policy texts reviewed by this research project.

The next section will discuss quality education and the flow of ideas associated with finance-scapes and messages of quality teaching and training throughout a teacher’s career.

4.3.6 Role of finance in quality education

Commentary posted on various Indonesian social media sites refers to measures to reduce unemployment and increase overall welfare and reveals evidence of flows along the finance-scape. For example, in relation to the tourist industry in Bali, Tamatea’s 2011 study drawn from social media data reveals the movement of capital associated with tourists and finance travelling to and from Bali:

In Bali, development of the tourist industry has been accompanied by the inflow and outflow of foreign ownership capital and tourists dollars, and also the inflow of non-Balinese Indonesians (Tamatea, 2011, p. 15)

According to Appadurai (1996), the finance-scape comprises not only the movement of capital, but also the speed and implication of global capital flows. For example, when the economic crisis struck Indonesia in 1997, one of the key outcomes was that Indonesia was largely compelled to accept a package (loan) proposed by the IMF to facilitate its economic recovery (Ziegler, 2004). The provision of the package, however, was based on the requirement that (among other things) Indonesia reformed its education system. This took place at almost at the same time that Indonesia committed to the EFA program, a program which had significant financial underpinnings:

Achieving Education for All will require additional financial support by countries and increased development assistance and debt relief for education by bilateral and multilateral donors, estimated to cost in the order of $8 billion a year. It is therefore essential that new, concrete financial commitments be made by national governments and also by bilateral and multilateral donors including the World Bank and the regional development banks, by civil society and by foundations (UNESCO, 2000).
To actualise the global agenda at the nation-state level, financial support is needed, and this is acknowledged by UNESCO (2000). Member countries and organisations are urged to have a strong commitment in the provision of such financial support (Bjork, 2006).

In line with the link between funding and quality education established by UNESCO above, the Indonesian government committed 20 per cent of its national budget to education. OECD also reports that “Indonesia devotes 20% of government expenditure to education” (OECD & Asian Development Bank, 2015, p. 21). National policy documents also articulate this:

Dana pendidikan selain gaji pendidik dan biaya pendidikan kedinasan dialokasikan minimal 20% dari Anggaran Pendapatan dan Belanja Negara (APBN) pada sektor pendidikan dan minimal 20% dari Anggaran Pendapatan dan Belanja Daerah (APBD)

[Education funding, except teacher salary and official education costs, is allocated minimally at 20% from the national budget expenditure for the education sector and minimally 20% from local government budgets and expenditure] (Republik Indonesia, 2003, p. 18).

The above quote shows the commitment of the Indonesian government to directing 20% of the national budget to education. This implies that such an amount is used to finance development programs on educational equity, quality improvement and educational relevance. However, the commitment of 20% of the budget is not always realised by the local government due to diverse local conditions, such as restricted local potential (Lie, 2007).

Ashari (2014) contends that, based on national budget expenditure in 2010-2015, the budget allocation has met the mandated 1945 Indonesian constitution requirement of 20% expenditure of the state budget on education. This portion of budget is expected to meet the needs required to improve the quality of Indonesian education. As indicated by Ashari (2014), financial sources to meet this budget allocation come not only from the central government but also from local government. This reveals
the finance- scape – movement of capital – operating locally. Further, some of the amount committed to realising the EFA goals has been used to send lecturers for professional development, including those who have been sent overseas to study for further qualifications. In relation to this, it can be seen that in the field of education in Indonesia, the flows along the finance- scape and those along the ethno- scape are linked:

Kementerian Agama melalui Direktorat Pendidikan Tinggi Agama Islam DIKTIS) membuka peluang bagi dosen untuk memilih negara Inggris, Eropa, Australia, dan Amerika serta beberapa Negara ASEAN sebagai destinasi pendidikan S2/S3/PostDoc selain negara Timur Tengah yang sudah terjalin selama ini, demikian Murniati Mukhlisin, salah satu penerima beasiswa DIKTIS 2012 yang menuntut ilmu di University of Glasgow, UK kepada Antara London, Rabu

[The Ministry of Religious Affairs via the Directorate of Islamic Higher Education, DIKTIS, provides opportunities for lecturers to choose English [speaking] countries, Europe, Australia, America and several ASEAN countries to be educational destinations for master/doctorate/ post doctorate degrees besides the Middle East that has been engaged so far, as said by Murniati Mukhlisin, one of the DIKTIS scholarship 2012 recipients who studies at Glasgow University, UK reporting to Antara News London] (www.antaranews.com, 2014).

It is anticipated that this mobilisation of academic staff will not only positively impact the quality of Indonesian university lecturers but also Indonesian university graduates, enabling the production of human resources in the field of education that can be consistently benchmarked against global standards.

In addition, when knowledge becomes a popular and valued commodity sought by many people (Stewart, 2013), the flow of capital runs smoothly along the finance- scape from consumers, such as learners and society, to education industries.

The data from the literature shows a finance- scape flow which is triggered by the function of English as the language of globalisation – of international business, politics and diplomacy (Johnson, 2009; Kell, 2004;
Kell & Vogl, 2012). Proficiency in English has become a valuable commodity and because of its utility, as shown by “how English proficiency is a basic skill of modern life comparable with the ability to drive a car or use a personal computer, as well as for its image as a form of cultural capital” (Johnson, 2009, p. 133).

To sum up, improving quality education requires financial attention, and the nature and pattern of commitment is variously shaped by the flow of ideas via policy texts as well as industry pressure and expectations of employment requirements. The Indonesian government has responded to these influences by devoting 20% of local and national budgets to the education sector in order to improve the quality of education in Indonesia.

4.3.7 Roles of media for quality learning

Global and national policy messages are also delivered through the media-scape, which has the capacity to transcend space (and time) to reach a vast audience. According to Appadurai (1996), the media-scape comprises the spread of information and the distribution of images and ideas about the world on a global scale. This flow of information is supported and intensified or strengthened by technology, so that there are also links between flows along the media-scape and flows along the techno-scape. Information and news from around the world can be witnessed at almost the same time as it is produced. Flows along these two scapes are encouraged by global policies, with the EFA policy asserting that:

News media should also be engaged to create and strengthen partnerships with education systems, through the promotion of local newspapers, informed coverage of education issues and continuing education programmes via public service broadcasting (UNESCO, 2014).

Flows along the media-scape have significant potential to expand awareness of development related programs, including those concerning education, largely because, as the MDG Report 2014 states (United Nations, 2014), the internet will be used by around 40 per cent of the world population near the end of 2014. The increased use of internet, and
thus the spread of online information, enables those difficult to reach population centres greater access to information.

Young people play an important role in driving the information society, particularly in developing countries where they represent a relatively large group within the overall population. In 2012, there were around 363 million digital natives—persons aged 15–24 years with at least five years of online experience…. However, within the next five years, the population of digital natives in developing countries will be more than double, helping those countries to drive their digital adoption agendas… Adding affordable data plans to relatively inexpensive basic mobile voice services is one strategy that would allow more people in developing countries to benefit from access to the Internet (United Nations, 2014, p. 53).

The number of young people supports the increased use of internet in a society. They grow to become digital ‘natives’ who can access everything by just clicking the gadget held in their hands. Information is readily available to access. This implicitly contributes to a shift in the education paradigm from teacher centred to learner centred. The teacher who has been assumed to be the source of knowledge is not playing that role anymore; their role in this new technology enhanced environment is replaced by Google. Therefore, empowering learners is important because of this increased use of the internet developed in society.

In the national context, the role of media can be seen in the increased commitment of the Indonesian national government to distance learning.

Pendidikan jarak jauh adalah pendidikan yang peserta didiknya terpisah dari pendidik dan pembelajarannya menggunakan berbagai sumber belajar melalui teknologi komunikasi, informasi, dan media lain

[Long distant education is a form of education whose students are in distant from the teachers and the learning system uses various learning sources via communication technology, information and other media] (Republik Indonesia, 2003, p. 3).

This is a focus which is also supported in institutional policy documents with regard to education in general and EFL in particular. For example, at Full Moon University, the curriculum specifies:
using approaches, methods, techniques and media for English language learning... applying teaching methods and English language learning media appropriate to instructional material... [being] able to search for new sources... accessing electronic information to find new sources of knowledge (Full Moon University, Curriculum document, 2011)

The above quote reveals the flow of ideas in the use of media to supply information at an institutional level, which later is also reflected in the local practice. Accessing electronic information to gain new knowledge is emphasised in the local policy. This is also reflected in the practicum guide (FBE, 2013) and resonates with the idea of building professional teacher capacity by directing pre-service teachers to search, find and select information from various sources to improve their professionalism.

Interview data in this study also supports the use of media such as the internet in relation to building the experience of EFL pre-service teachers during teaching practice. Pre-service teachers use the internet to browse English teaching material to introduce the English context to their students. They prefer downloading teaching sources, such as YouTube or videos containing English conversation spoken by English native speakers. These can provide models to improve pronunciation, even though the pre-service teachers struggle to adapt the teaching material to the students’ level of English.

I search the material by browsing the internet (Aquila)

I prefer seeing YouTube, which provides [description of] teaching atmosphere, like Suggestopedia (Annie)

I use video with slow and regular English in it. In fact, I must pause at every sentence and translate it (Adam).

Using technology, and particularly the internet, to access EFL teaching materials exemplifies how the media-scape flows through to the practice level. This interview data corroborates findings from a Vietnamese study by Dang, Nguyen and Le (2013) that pre-service teachers mainly employed authentic audio and video English materials from the internet because they are a good source for learning to communicate in English.
These materials provide authentic learning environments for learners in non-English speaking countries.

Zentz (2013) asserts that products now often spread faster along techno- and media-scapes as a result of the universal emergence of English in television and computer programs. English programs on TV can actually be utilised by EFL pre-service teachers or practising teachers to enhance students’ English competence and to provide alternative tasks.

4.4 Conclusions
To summarise, I began this Chapter by exploring the notion of quality. In a broad sense, concerns for quality education have been prompted by the intensification of neoliberal influences in political, economic and social life and how these influences have flowed into and reshaped the governance mechanisms associated with educational provision. The global policy texts noted in Chapter 4 have produced a discourse on educational crises and accompanying ‘crisis recovery’ discourses that require every country to have transparent and accountable systems to monitor educational provision. Such systems are concerned with monitoring standards and ensuring a competitive edge in a dynamic global market which intensifies global mobility and employability. So, the notion of quality is linked not only to neoliberal ideas but also to the view of employment and competition in the current political, economic and educational context.

In more specific ways, the notion of quality was elaborated in relation to quality EFL teacher improvement. Here the discourse on quality was linked to ideas of learner centeredness, English as a global and a foreign language, standards, EFL teacher preparation, finance, and teaching media, to promote learning.

Across the policy documents, there are similarities in the ideas expressed about quality. These similar ideas may be carried as global messages enacted in national and local institutional levels, and may thus reflect the
workings of the ideo-scape. This means that neoliberal ideas may influence the educational policies across the levels.

Besides showing similarities along the ideo-scape, Chapter 4 also illustrates movements of capital (finance-scape) to support quality education and what that implies in the ethno-scape and in the movement of media (media-scape) and techno-scape in a way to facilitate quality learning and teaching.

The notion of crisis has constantly been applied to education quality and has often been used to blame poor quality education on a lack of attention by the international community (Lakes & Charter, 2011). This idea of crisis is promoted in the EFA agenda and is followed up by recurring advice to member countries in the form of transparency and accountability strategies that monitor progress, and activate ‘recovery’ discourses that bolster faith in quality assurance mechanisms designed to improve the quality of educational provision. Such advice reveals the movement of ideas from the global agenda to local institutions, which reflects the ideo-scape. This movement of ideas is facilitated by advanced technology and by its movement along the techno-scapes and media-scapes that spreads the information promoted by EFA agenda.

Additionally, such a notion of monitored quality triggers global competition, mobility and global employability that challenge the future of nations, and these ideas are linked to a demand for quality teachers, whose tasks, among other things, is to prepare their students to face global competition and employability triggered by the free market. The free market generates the demand to improve the quality of education, and skilled workers are needed for global employment.

The notion of quality education has been converted in recent times by the influence of neoliberal ideas of market orientation. In specific studies, neoliberal ideas have been linked to English language teaching and quality EFL teachers through the discourse of quality. The ideas are demonstrated through the aligned articulation in numerous EFA global monitoring reports, Millennium Development Goals documents, and
national and local institutional policies. Mostly informed by the ideo-scape as one of Appadurai’s global flows, similar ideas about quality can be traced from the global to the local policy level. Similar ideas across policy documents may become evident to show agreement among policy texts across global, national and local institutional levels. It means also that some elements of neoliberal ideas have contributed to the shaping of quality EFL teaching and professional EFL teachers in Indonesia through the experience of teaching practice. Some evidence of the recurring homogeneity of quality discourse enriches an understanding of how global policies flow into the national and local context.
Chapter 5
Notions of Quality and EFL Teachers
5. Notions of Quality and EFL Teachers

5.1 Introduction
Chapter 4 noted the existence and effects of ideas related to the notion of ‘quality’ contained in global, national and local institutional policy documents, interview texts and electronic resources, particularly in relation to education, teacher training and English as a Foreign language. The circulation of these ideas about quality has been fostered by the intensification of neoliberal influences in political, economic, social and educational contexts.

It was mentioned earlier that global policy organisations have produced a discourse on crises related to learning. Analysis of texts indicates that a ‘crisis’ is often explained by lack of attention to quality education by the international community. Such crises require tightly scripted transparency and accountability interventions in order that educational systems may recover and respond to mobility and employability challenges experienced by countries. Thus, policy documents position teachers as central to the achievement of national economic success in the global ‘free’ market, one in which graduates from an Indonesian education system would be valued by employers globally.

Chapter 4 revealed homogeneous understandings of quality circulating in influential texts at both macro and micro levels. At the micro level the notion of quality was explained in terms of specific areas associated with the quality of EFL teacher education. The Education For All (EFA) agenda requires a specific commitment to the achievement of a quality education and thus, it is argued, EFA establishes a ‘blueprint’ for the discursive construction of the quality teacher that is undertaken by national teacher education policy texts and local institutional policy documents.

In Chapter 5 discussion turns to the similarities and differences across policy texts with regard to the significance of quality in the discursive constitution of the EFL teacher. Chapter 5 argues that these similarities and differences principally concern the focus upon subjective (human)
characteristics which Indonesian national and local policy deems important aspects of the quality teacher. This Chapter argues that while many texts present teacher characteristics as objective, neutral and transferable competences, in practice the features that contribute to the notions of ‘quality teacher’ and ‘quality education’ are often associated with subjective measures. That is, determining value is based on, and influenced by, the involvement of individual taste and hence the result of individual (or collective) processes and judgements. Through these processes and judgements individuals are not separate and isolated entities. Rather they operate at the intersection of general truths and shared principles (Mansfield, 2000). In determining matters of value associated with quality and how it is measured, the subjective side of an individual may intervene. 'Quality' itself is not a neutral word; it is a socially constructed concept, with very particular meanings, produced through what we refer to as “the discourse of quality” (Dahlberg et al., 1999, p. 87). In these matters the tension around subjective and objective decisions about value are paramount.

Reiger (2002) defined ‘subjectivity’ as the condition of being a human subject (Reiger, 2002). As Wahana (2004) contends, a value is characterised as subjective when its existence and truth depends on the taste, feeling or attitude of someone, while it will be characterised as objective when its existence and its truth does not depend on the self.

Based on this framing of quality as a debated and contested notion, the discussion in Chapter 5 explores quality standards which arguably cannot be empirically quantified or measured and objective standards which are more amenable to empirical measurement and quantification. Following this, ‘objective’ policy discourses and measures are explored in relation to three areas. The first of these addresses pedagogical features that constitute the quality teacher, and in particular three issues are discussed: professional knowledge, professional practice and professional engagement. This discussion is informed by the work of the Australian Institute for Teaching and School Leadership (AITSL) (AITSL, 2011). In the next section, the notion of quality is related to EFL teachers
pertaining to English language competence that comprises content mastery and skills. This English language competence is often assessed objectively using certain criteria.

Finally in this Chapter I draw on information and communication technologies (ICT) to provide a third exemplar of quality discourse and the discourse of objective measures.

The Chapter closes with an analysis of the implications of the similarities and discrepancies across these sites that produce notions of quality in EFL teacher education.

5.2 Characterising quality teachers in values-based education systems

While much neoliberal discourse constructs ‘quality’ to be an entirely objective phenomenon (Tamatea, 2005), the *EFA Global Monitoring Report 2005, Education for All: The Quality Imperative* (UNESCO, 2004) goes beyond this rather simplistic and unhelpful representation of quality to recognise that quality also has subjective properties. Such subjective properties of quality are apparent in a UNESCO policy statement which emphasises “education’s role in promoting values and attitudes of responsible citizenship and in nurturing creative and emotional development” (UNESCO, 2004, p. 2). In this statement, the subjective properties of quality are associated with nurturing values, attitudes, emotions, autonomy and creativity. While it may be possible to measure such ‘qualities’ from an objective or quantitative perspective, arguably such qualities or affective dispositions tend to be more associated with a subjective and qualitative world view, and because of this, they are generally not so amenable to ‘measurement’ in any objective sense (Dahlberg et al., 1999; Tamatea, 2005; Wahana, 2004).

This subjective view further consolidated the notion of quality related to learning. An exemplar of the articulation of the subjective characteristics in relation to nurturing, emotions and autonomy is also presented in *The Dakar Framework*, which asserts that “social and emotional development,
[as well as] developing knowledge, skills and attitudes is required for autonomous learning and problem-solving” (UNESCO, 2000, p. 59).

The above statement details several characteristics that teachers need to develop in their students, namely ones involving social, affective, and autonomous properties. Both policy documents, the *EFA Global Monitoring Report 2005, Education for All: The Quality Imperative Summary* (UNESCO, 2004) and *The Dakar Framework* (UNESCO, 2000), reveal that although *Education for All* has been informed by strong neoliberal values as mentioned above, it has also included a number of clearly subjective values as desired educational goals and outcomes. In this respect, the EFA ‘Quality Imperative’ text (UNESCO, 2004) marks a significant departure from the original EFA policy framework (UNESCO, 2000).

The characteristics identified with respect to EFA policy (UNESCO, 2000, 2004) above, however, reflect the focus of Indonesian national education policy, which places importance on the establishing of good character for students. This orientation is particularly strong in the 2013 school curriculum, which Mulyasa refers to as a “Kurikulum berbasis Kompetensi sekaligus berbasis karakter [competency and character based curriculum]” (Mulyasa, 2013, p. 6). ‘Character-based’ education is popularly known in America as moral education, while in Europe it is often referred to as values-based education (Sudrajat, 2011). Morals education has been identified by the well-known educational philosopher John Dewey as an essential element in broader education goals (Dimitriadis & Kamberelis, 2006). In the Indonesian context, character education plays an important role in instilling and developing the nation’s character (Sudrajat, 2011). The emergence of character education is aimed at enlivening spirituality (Kusuma, 2007). According to Kusuma (2007), the value of such subjective qualities is that they can be embedded in a range of curriculum (subject) areas, such as religious education, citizenship education and civics. Moreover, this character education can be used as a proactive strategy that functions to maintain the citizens’ strong sense of values and identity in a world where globalisation is more characterised
by rapid change as opposed to continuity (Mulyasa, 2013). Appadurai (1996), for example, highlights how the movement of globalising flows, such as the movement of ideas (idea-scape) across nation-state borders, can significantly impact the citizens’ sense of self and identity, and often with negative consequences.

The subjective values associated with quality teaching in the original EFA (UNESCO, 2000) required a specific commitment by nation-states to achieve quality education and thus the construction of quality teachers who are considered integral to the achievement of this outcome (World Bank, 2015). The subjective characteristics of the quality teacher and curriculum are further elaborated to include dispositions and values which are informed by ‘democracy’, tolerance and social justice (World Bank, 2015). According to more recent EFA global monitoring reports (UNESCO, 2014; World Bank, 2015), “Education helps people understand democracy, promotes the tolerance and trust that underpin it, and motivates people to participate in politics” (UNESCO, 2004, p. 16).

This statement means that teachers’ roles include, among other things, preparing their students to have such subjective values as being democratic and tolerant. Indonesian Law (Republik Indonesia, 2003) also emphasises that education is carried out democratically and fairly, as well as not discriminatively, by upholding human rights, religious values, cultural values and the commitment to national pluralism. This values-based orientation has an implication for teachers who are consequently required to exercise fairness in teaching all students from all backgrounds.

This requirement is consistent with the position taken by Goodwin (2010), Hollins (2011), Shulman (1987) and Beijaard et al. (2000), which is that a good teacher is one who builds a curriculum grounded in cultural relevance and a respect for diversity and social justice. In terms of cultural relevance, good teachers are to have cultural competence; they demonstrate skills at teaching in a cross-cultural or multicultural setting. They are able to relate course content to the students’ cultural context.
They also respect students’ different characteristics and treat them fairly. In the context of Indonesian national ideology, these values-based goals resonate with the Bhinneka Tunggal Ika (‘Unity in Diversity’, which is the Indonesian official national symbol) and Pancasila (the official philosophical foundation of the Indonesia). This is especially so of the fifth pillar, which states: “Keadilan social bagi seluruh rakyat Indonesia [social justice for all of the people of Indonesia] (Morfit, 1981).

Statements from the Teacher Law (Republik Indonesia, 2005b) further illustrate the importance of subjective characteristics:

Pembangunan nasional dalam bidang pendidikan adalah upaya mencerdaskan kehidupan bangsa dan meningkatkan kualitas manusia Indonesia yang beriman, bertakwa, dan berakhlak mulia serta menguasai ilmu pengetahuan, teknologi, dan seni dalam mewujudkan masyarakat yang maju, adil, makmur, dan beradab berdasarkan Pancasila dan Undang-Undang Dasar Negara Republik Indonesia Tahun 1945

[National development in the education sector strives to educate nations and improve the quality of Indonesian people who are faithful, obedient, and noble and master knowledge, technology and art in actualising a developed, just, prosperous, and civilized society on the basis of Pancasila [Five principles-the official philosophical foundation of the Indonesia] and the Indonesian constitution] (Republik Indonesia, 2005b, p. 1).

The above statement highlights a number of subjective characteristics, such as faithfulness, nobleness, social justice and prosperity. The Teacher Law mandates that teachers educate students so that they become citizens who have faith and who have nobility. The statement is grounded in the implicit assumption that teachers hold these characteristics as a precursor to enabling the emergence of such characteristics in their students. The Indonesian policy texts differ from the global texts, however, in referencing faith as a key teacher characteristic. References to faith are completely absent in the global documents, which are decidedly secular in orientation. The absence of articulating faith in the global agenda may imply that the messages are intended for all nations, despite what faiths the nations follow.
As articulated in a range of other policy texts, the Indonesian Teacher Law (Republik Indonesia, 2005b) mandates that teachers have an appropriate personality and appropriate social competencies. As agents of learning, teachers are required to possess both good moral conduct and social interaction skills.

National education in Indonesia is governed by the Law on the National Education System (Republik Indonesia, 2003) grounded in the *Pancasila* (five fundamental principles – the official philosophical foundation of Indonesia) and the Undang-Undang Dasar RI 1945 (The Constitution). These governing documents and their associated principles are rooted in a range of values that are related to both religion and Indonesian national cultures. The values are held to be responsive to the demands of an era of change (Republik Indonesia, 2003). For example, the National Constitution asserts that national education functions to develop a range of outcomes that include “responsibility, citizenship, knowledge ability, creativity, competency, democracy, dignity (national) character, civilization, healthiness, and autonomy, in addition to faithfulness and obedience to the Almighty God” (Chapter 2, Article 3). Of significance in all of this is that the quality teacher is one who not only has a role to play in the development of their student’s academic capacity, but also a role to play in the development of their students’ morality and religious faith. This is a significant departure from the orientation of global policy discussion.

Formally, educating teachers is carried out in Indonesia’s teacher education institutions; therefore these institutions comprise one of the key sites in the formation of quality teachers. Nevertheless, as the following discussion illustrates, these institutional sites, which are locally situated, are the subject of much influence from national and global messages on the notion of quality teachers. In accordance with cultural flows, a range of global and national policy texts influence the local institutions in preparing pre-service teachers to be quality teachers.

The Government Regulation on Teachers (Republik Indonesia, 2008b) states that:
Program pendidikan tenaga kependidikan adalah program pendidikan tinggi yang berfungsi menyelenggarakan pengadaan guru untuk pendidikan anak usia dini jalur formal, pendidikan dasar, dan/atau pendidikan menengah, serta mengembangkan ilmu ke pendidikan, termasuk program pendidikan pada fakultas tarbiyah dan pada fakultas lain yang sejenis.

[A teacher education program is a higher education program that functions to carry out teacher supply for formal pre-primary education, primary education, and higher education as well as to develop educational theories, including education programs in Tarbiyah [the systematic development and training of Muslims] and other faculties of a similar type] (Republik Indonesia, 2008b, p. 7)

Teacher education institutions are engaged to achieve the mandated prescriptions of the NES Law, the Teacher Law and related Government Regulations and policy texts in appropriately preparing prospective teachers. For example, the Government Regulation (Republik Indonesia, 2005a) is used as a reference for the bench-marking of the standards for graduate teachers’ competence. As noted in Chapter 4, these standards include high communicative competence, educational competence, the ability to adapt to new education paradigms and English language learning, and practical and creative skills in solving educational and learning problems. All standards support the achievement of establishing professional teachers’ four types of competences – personal, professional, social and pedagogical – required as articulated in the Law on National Standards (Republik Indonesia, 2005a). These ideas are incorporated in the curricula of the English departments of the researched universities.

In the local context, the teacher education curriculum in the English departments at the two case study sites contain messages that mandate that prospective teachers are to uphold a rights-based commitment toward learners grounded in the respect of students’ rights and consequent provision of a supportive curriculum. Consequently, this local message contains a number of subjective elements that not only align
with the global policy texts’ emphasis on equity: it is a message that is also in alignment with the fifth principle of *Pancasila*.

Drawing conclusions from the above examples, it can be argued that the quality teacher is among other things shaped by a number of immeasurable aspects grounded in an alignment of similar – but not entirely the same – messages circulating in education policy texts from the local to the global. In this, teachers are required to recognise social and emotional developments, and instil in the learner the quality of being autonomous and responsible citizens. Hence, although some similar subjective characteristics recur across global education documents and their associated agendas, national policy documents and local institutional texts, it is the focus upon morality and religion in particular in Indonesian national and local policy texts that constitute a significant site of difference between the global and the ‘local’. This discrepancy may provide insights into how a global agenda may be translated and enacted in national and local contexts.

To mark the end of this section on subjective characteristics, it is important to note that the notion of quality involves the presence of subjective values across policy texts. The formation of quality teachers is coloured by such complex subjective values as teachers’ nurturing qualities, their faith based beliefs, their views about citizenship, national character, and approaches to student autonomy. Drawing on Appadurai (1996), an analysis of the texts indicates the recurring presence of subjective policy ideas that flow from the global and national to the local level. There is a degree of similarity in the presence and influence across the three levels, showing homogeneity in the ideas about quality and EFL teacher formation. However, differences between global and national-local institutional policy texts also represent differences in how national and local identity are expressed and influence the overall formation of quality EFL teacher formation.
5.3 Objective characteristics of quality teachers

Aside from subjective characteristics of quality teachers as discussed in the previous section, there is a vast body of literature that supports the view that quality teaching can be captured in a range of objective characteristics and measures. For example, the notion of quality teaching drawn upon in the EFA (UNESCO, 2004a) states that 'learners' cognitive development [is] the major explicit objective of all education systems. Accordingly, the success with which systems achieve this is one indicator of their quality" (UNESCO, 2004, p. 2).

As mentioned in the above quote, the central indicator proposed for achieving quality, at least in terms of this statement, is tied to the learners' cognitive development, which is often portrayed as objective. In contrast to the previous section, the discussion below focuses on objective dimensions of quality, with specific reference to pedagogical features such as English language competence, and ICT, and quality teaching in education generally and in teacher education in particular. The discussion of the first part – pedagogical features of quality – is grounded in reference to the Australian Professional Standards for Teachers (AITSL, 2011).

5.3.1 Pedagogical features of quality

There are several national quality frameworks which characterise professional standards for teachers. Professional standards focus on what is expected of teachers, and many countries have a quality framework relevant to their specific context. Australia uses the Australian Professional Standards for Teachers (http://www.aitsl.edu.au/australian-professional-standards-for-teachers/standards/list) developed by the Australian Institute for Teaching and School Leadership (AITSL). Finland is well-known for its quality education system, and the status of the teaching profession there is highly acknowledged (National Board of Education, 1999). The United States has the Interstate New Teacher Assessments and Support Consortium (INTASC) Standards as developing standards for new teachers with a clear framework for
teaching components covering 10 principles (Council of Chief State School Officers, 2011). I employ AITSL Standards in this section because they exemplify clear indicators for quality teachers, ranging from novice to advanced teachers, and parallel the concerns of this project to investigate novice teacher formation.

The Australian Professional Standards for Teachers contain seven Standards which “identify what is expected of teachers within three domains of teaching” (AITSL, 2011, p. 5). These Standards cover four career stages that acknowledge teachers’ professional growth. Each stage is clearly identified and described and “represent[s] increasing levels of knowledge, practice and professional engagement” (AITSL 2011, p. 5).

Informed by the Australian Professional Standards for Teachers framework (AITSL, 2011), discussion in this section highlights the similarities and differences between global, national and local institutional policies concerning the pedagogical features associated with the formation of quality teachers. The discussion is structured according to the elements of professional knowledge, professional practice and professional engagement noted in the AITSL standards. According to the AITSL framework, professional knowledge involves or represents that aspect of teacher practice concerning pedagogical knowledge. Competence in this domain is addressed through two Standards: understanding the students and how they learn (Standard 1), and understanding the content and how to teach it (Standard 2).

The domain on professional practice aims at ensuring learning is engaging and valued. It captures the elements of planning for and implementing effective teaching and learning (Standard 3), creating and maintaining a supportive and safe learning environment (Standard 4), and assessing and providing feedback and reporting on student learning (Standard 5) (AITSL, 2011).

Professional engagement includes engaging in professional learning (Standard 6) and engaging professionally with colleagues, parents/carers
and community (Standard 7) (AITSL, 2011). Considering that the subjects of the research are prospective EFL teachers, standard 6 and 7 are elaborated briefly, given that, while relevant to quality teaching, their focus is more concerned with professional and continuing education of teachers rather than pre-service formation.

**Professional knowledge**

The pedagogical dimensions characterising the quality teacher articulated in EFA monitoring reports relate to several domains of teaching and standards that are similar to and explicitly referenced in AITSL documentation (Dinham, 2013). Such similar and explicit referencing reflects the international emphasis on improving teacher quality promoted by OECD and UNESCO. AITSL standards are an exemplar of the flow of ideas achieved through direct referencing across global and national levels of teacher formation. AITSL Standard 1, professional knowledge associated with ‘knowing students and how they learn’, is similar to the value placed upon quality teaching found in EFA documents which require a specific commitment to achieve quality education and thus the construction of quality teacher (UNESCO, 2014). For example, EFA (UNESCO, 2014) expects teachers to recognise the diversity of learning needs and the various stages of cognitive development as a basis for learner knowledge development (UNESCO, 2014). This highlights that EFA policy also emphasises the importance of understanding students’ characteristics in the process of teaching and learning. In relation to learning a foreign language, Brown (2007) argues that learner characteristics are an important variable influencing the success of foreign language learning; therefore learner characteristics should be understood by teachers. A teacher’s capacity to facilitate diverse learners to acquire that language is vital. Thus, it is essential for EFL teachers to understand learner characteristics and to have pedagogical knowledge to act on those understandings in diverse contexts.

In relation to professional knowledge and understanding learner characteristics – how they learn and how to best teach – the Indonesian National Education System (Republik Indonesia, 2003) mandates that
teachers should become a model for their students, build students’ motivation, and develop students’ creativity in the learning process. This is an approach which is also supported in the literature concerning good pedagogy (Goodwin, 2010; Darling-Hammond, 2005; Shulman, 1999). This Law also requires teachers to meet several pedagogical obligations, such as [my translation] “to create a meaningful, pleasing, dynamic and dialogic educational atmosphere and to become a role model” (Republik Indonesia, 2003, p. 15). These obligations are similar to expectations found in the broader literature on good pedagogy (Darling-Hammond, 2005; Darling-Hammond & Baratz-Snowden, 2007; Shulman, 1999) and in other regional and global documents.

Similarly, in the local context, in the two institutions of teacher training which comprise the case study sites for this research project, teacher training policy texts resonated with aspects of the national and global texts identified above. For example, the graduates of the English department at the research sites are expected to achieve several competences, including the capacity to understand learner characteristics and the capacity to master learning and professional development. The curriculum in both research sites states that pre-service teachers are expected to be able to appropriately categorise a learner’s potential for learning English and identify the learner’s learning style as part of this process. These are pedagogical strategies consistent with the views of Darling-Hammond and Baratz-Snowden (2007) and Shulman (1999). Moreover, they also reflect the principles underpinning AITSL Standard 1 – knowing students and how they learn.

The pedagogical strategies associated with the domain of professional practice also align with elements articulated in texts on the constitution of the quality teacher at both case study sites. Curriculum in these documents is defined as a bundle of plans and an arrangement of goals, content, learning materials and strategies designed to guide learning activities to achieve a certain level of education (Republik Indonesia, 2003, 2005a).
The focus on pedagogy at the local level, particularly in relation to training pre-service EFL teachers, is articulated with reference to providing a supportive learning environment for students. The curriculum of Sun University (2013), it is argued, must be grounded in “the application of an English language learning model oriented towards students... creating a conducive learning atmosphere for learning the English language”. This focus is very similar to The Dakar Framework, which asserts the importance of learner centeredness (UNESCO, 2000).

Standard 2 (AITSL, 2011) requires teacher education graduates to understand learners and how they learn and reflects the emphasis on learner centred pedagogy promoted by UNESCO (2000). In achieving competence in Standard 2, prospective graduates are deemed to emphasise learners’ needs. Similarly, the local curriculum in both Full Moon and Sun Universities contain mandates to emphasise learner-centred pedagogy. This places the learner at the very centre of the teaching and learning process, maximising the learners’ role and participation in the process of learning. This is an approach where teachers not only have sound subject knowledge or content knowledge, but they also know how to teach it (AITSL, 2011; Darling-Hammond & Baratz-Snowden, 2007; Shulman, 1999; UNESCO, 2014). The approach is also one adhered to by key advanced economies such as Australia.

**Professional practice**

Besides supporting professional knowledge detailed in Standards 1 and 2, AITSL standards contain more practical elements embodied in the domain of professional practice. As introduced in Chapter 2 and the above sections, the domain of professional practice is reflected in detail in Standards 3 and 4. Standard 3 requires that graduates can plan and implement effective teaching and learning (AITSL, 2011). This standard is also relevant to local teacher education policy documents, national policy texts and global texts. For example, EFA global monitoring reports require teachers to implement interactive classroom strategies that lead to learner-centred pedagogy (UNESCO, 2015). This is considered significant because this strategy promotes critical thinking, which
supports students in actively constructing knowledge through several activities, including group work and reflection (UNESCO, 2015). To some extent, this focus is similar to that contained in Standard 2 regarding professional knowledge, namely knowing subject content and how to teach it. However Standard 3 is more focused on a practical level, so that aspects of Standard 2 can be incorporated into the implementation of Standard 3, particularly in relation to the use of interactive pedagogies to support student learning.

Locally, professional practice that focuses on Standard 3 – plan and implement effective teaching and learning – is exemplified in the English Department curriculum at one of the research sites. This curriculum document of Full Moon University states that learning mastery covers:

Planning and designing learning, mastering learning approaches, methods and media, mastering principles, procedures of assessment of learning process and learning outcomes, benefiting the result of assessment for learning improvement and planning and carrying out research to improve the quality of learning for the learners (Full Moon University, Curriculum document, 2011).

As indicated in the statement above, a quality EFL teacher is one who can set learning goals and plan lessons for effective teaching and learning using the basic principles of English language learning and teaching and the various approaches to teaching and learning with a focus upon the learner as opposed to the teacher.

In addition to similarities between the local and global approaches to teaching and learning which are otherwise associated with the ‘quality’ teacher, there are also points of difference. While EFA policy recommends that teachers adopt only the learner-centred approach, the institutional curriculum standards at the Full Moon University requires pre-service teachers to achieve many things:

Mastering learning approaches, methods and media: mastering various approaches, methods, techniques and media for learning English language; selecting appropriate approaches, methods, techniques and
media for learning English language regarding instructional material; using approaches, methods, techniques and media for English language learning (Full Moon University, Curriculum document, 2011).

The domain of professional practice, which focuses upon ‘planning for and implementing effective teaching and learning’ (Standard 3), is similarly reproduced by other local institutional policy documents in the case study sites, particularly in the microteaching and FBE guides. In the microteaching guide, a number of statements confirm that the aim of training is to bridge theory and practice provided for EFL pre-service teachers and to address effective learning and teaching in constituting quality teachers. Based on the Full Moon microteaching guide, pre-service teachers are expected to exercise their teaching skills during the course. Expected competence outputs include the ability to perform the microteaching skills, gain mastery over related theories underlying the teaching practice and explain the theoretical basis underlying learning practice.

The Full Moon University microteaching guide references school-based practice teaching as part the formation of quality teachers. EFL pre-service teachers are provided with opportunities for ‘real world’ practice wherein they are able to apply university-sourced education and learning theory in their practice teaching. Sun University equally provides students with such opportunities [my translation]:

The goal of microteaching is to prepare pre-service teachers to face teaching practice in the classroom by having knowledge, skills, and attitude as a professional teacher…. to improve the quality of learning for teachers… to help pre-service teachers master special skills in real contexts… to master special skills in teaching in order that their teaching performance is firm, skilful and competent, [and to] support skill-improving endeavours, competences and effective and efficient teaching performance in learning process (Sun University, Microteaching Guide document, 2013).

The above statements are concerned with the domain of professional practice. As mentioned previously, microteaching is conducted on
campus, in what is called a Professional Learning Laboratory. In addition to what is available in the microteaching guides for each university, the focus on professional practice is also reproduced in the field-based teaching guides for each case study institution. The FBE program in schools is one of the curricular activities that constitute a culmination point for the whole teacher education program that has been internalised and experienced by the pre-service teachers. The FBE program facilitates the EFL pre-service teachers training to apply various knowledge, attitudes and skills in the process of becoming a professional teacher. Again, in my translation of the FBE of Sun University:

The competence standard for field experience [school based teaching] is formulated based on the demands of four teacher competences. The four competences are pedagogic, personal, professional and social, which are mandated law No. 14/2005, chapter IV, article 10, and additionally by Indonesian government regulation No. 19/2005 concerning national education standards, especially chapter V, article 26, verse 4 which treats the competence standard of university graduates.

[School based teaching] includes learning practices and main activities done by teachers at schools in doing professional tasks... to form four [types of] competences required for becoming professional teachers. The four [types of] competencies are pedagogic, professional, personal and social competences... to prepare them to be quality teachers and which enable them to compete through standardisation, competency examination and to adapt to the change in education, knowledge, and technology, as well as social change in general (Sun University, FBE document, 2013).

The above statements indicate that EFL pre-service teachers, like other teacher education graduates, are required to obtain the mandated competencies associated with professional practice. This approach to ensuring graduate teacher quality, in so far as graduates must demonstrate achievement of certain competencies, is similar to the expectations of competence of graduate teachers established by AITSL. As professional teachers, the EFL graduate teacher must thus demonstrate achievement in both content knowledge and in the practice of teaching in ways aligned with the pedagogic, professional, personal
and social competencies which Hollins (2011) and others (e.g., Das & El-Sabban, 1996) otherwise associate with the notion of the ‘quality teacher’.

In the earlier part of this section, it was mentioned that the domain of professional practice appears in two standards, namely Standard 3 and Standard 4. While Standard 3 focuses on planning and implementing effective teaching and learning, Standard 4 emphasises the creation and maintenance of supportive and safe learning environments. Standard 4 facilitates conducive learning environments for learners. This Standard requires graduates to create pleasing learning strategies that overlap with the domain of professional knowledge associated with AITSL Standard 2 – ‘how to teach’ – and echo the emerging ideas on learner-centred pedagogy promoted by the EFA agenda. Similarly, this emerging idea is present in the NES as “Pendidik berkewajiban menciptakan suasana pendidikan yang bermakna, menyenangkan, kreatif, dinamis, dan dialogis” [the teacher is obliged to create meaningful, pleasing, creative, dynamic and dialogic educational atmosphere] (Republik Indonesia, 2003, p. 11). The learning process is orientated to active learning that develops learners’ potential (Republik Indonesia, 2003). Consistent with the intent of the Law, creativity and autonomy are also emphasised.

The domain of teaching in relation to professional practice mentioned above is similarly reproduced in the local context. For example, some emerging ideas manifest in global and national policies above, such as in building the learner’s autonomy, encouraging student’s creativity, and providing a pleasant learning atmosphere, appear to be the main ideas in the Standards (Republik Indonesia, 2005a). Some of the characteristics of quality teachers are existent in the global agenda and government endorsement in national policy texts signals the influence of this flow of ideas on the process of formation of professional teachers at the institutional level.

Similarly, from the above two examples of FBE guides in the two researched universities, the Teacher Law (Republik Indonesia, 2005b) and the Government Regulation (Republik Indonesia, 2013) mentioned
above also noted four types of competences required of quality professional teachers. So, FBE in both universities is designed to produce quality teachers through training activities at schools. In terms of the pedagogical aspects of competence, in the field-based teaching program prospective EFL teachers can learn various basic skills of teaching and learning, apply various professional competences of pedagogy contextually, and conclude with educative value and internalisation of the experience during the training through reflection. These all strengthen the professional practice articulated in Standard 5 of AITSL, which focuses on assessing, providing feedback and reporting on student learning (AITSL, 2011).

The emerging EFA ideas about professional practice manifesting in learner centred pedagogy resonate with AITSL and Indonesian national policy texts and some local institutional texts. These similar ideas emerge across texts in relation to the teaching domain focusing on professional practice and illustrate corresponding messages promoted by EFA to which both the Australian and Indonesian governments are responding. Furthermore, in also being promoted locally, the idea of learner-centred pedagogy reveals the workings of the ideo-scape and so also the role of the ideo-scape in the discursive construction of quality teachers.

**Professional engagement**

As with professional knowledge and professional practice, the domain of professional engagement is aligned with a domain of practice and associated Standards. Standard 6 focuses on engaging in professional learning. This Standard involves teachers being able to ‘identify and plan professional learning needs’, ‘engage in professional learning and improve practice’, ‘engage with colleagues and improve practice’ and ‘apply professional learning and improve student learning’ (AITSL, 2011, p. 18).

In regard to this Standard, there are clear resonances with *The Dakar Framework* and how it has informed professional development for teachers. According to *The Dakar Framework* teachers must have:
Access to training and ongoing professional development and support, including through open and distance learning; and be able to participate, locally and nationally, in decisions affecting their professional lives and teaching environments (UNESCO, 2000, p. 20).

In response to the above advice, at a national level Indonesian teachers are given the opportunity to pursue lifelong learning. The Teacher Law states that teachers must “Memiliki kesempatan untuk mengembangkan keprofesionalan secara berkelanjutan dengan belajar sepanjang hayat” [Have opportunities to develop their professionalism sustainably through lifelong learning] (Republik Indonesia, 2005b, p. 6). Considering that this project focuses on pre-service teachers, such a mandate on lifelong learning may not explicitly impact them at this stage, but inserting such an idea into the curriculum provides pre-service teachers with an awareness of the changing role of teachers’ work and future professional development needs from an early stage. They need to be well informed on the importance of globalisation and the forthcoming changes necessary to prepare them for future global employability.

AITSL Standard 7 (AITSL, 2011) shares similarities with the EFA Framework for Action Education 2030 (World Bank, 2015), which places emphasis on qualifications. Standard 7 raises specific awareness of relevant legislative, administrative and organisational policies associated with teaching and professional development. Professional qualifications contribute to the quality of teaching and this includes ongoing engagement with policies as part of their development.

The government regulation pertaining to teachers (Republik Indonesia, 2008b) goes further and aligns teacher pedagogy with global economic competition. Professional teachers are those who have the ability to educate students to develop the capacity to be effective participants in a changing global economy, one in which nation-states variously compete to achieve an economic advantage.

Kualitas manusia yang dibutuhkan oleh bangsa Indonesia pada masa depan adalah mampu menghadapi persaingan yang semakin ketat
The quality of Indonesian people in the future is the ability to face competition which is tighter among other nations in the world. The quality of Indonesian people is produced through quality education by professional teachers (Republik Indonesia, 2008a, p. 1).

In this respect, the quality teacher also seems to be one who has a capacity to effectively engage with the goals of neoliberalism and who can foster this capacity in students. Through this they are also professionals who can effectively manage aspects of globalisation, particularly in relation to the finance-scape and its requirements for certain kinds of workers (Zhao, 2010). In Government Regulation No. 19/2005, Chapter 6 reconfirms the link between education, globalisation and the achievement of national goals through education and the role of teachers in facilitating those goals:

Educators must have an academic qualification and competence as an agent of learning... have ability to actualize national educational goals (Republik Indonesia, 2005, p. 21).

The above statement mandates that quality teachers are those who are not only appropriately qualified in terms of higher education academic knowledge, but who are also able to implement national education policy goals. This mandate is related to the professional engagement domain reflected in AITSL Standard 7, which requires that graduate teachers “understand the relevant legislative, administrative and organisational policies...” (AITSL, 2011, p. 19). In regard to the Indonesian context, quality teachers are required to hold certain qualifications in accordance with the level of education that they intend to teach. And as agents of learning, the role of such a teacher is to facilitate, motivate, trigger, manipulate learning and inspire learners (Republik Indonesia, 2005b).

Both university operational guides pertaining to FBE in schools contain similar messages in constituting the quality teacher. Both institutional...
policy texts contain ideas about ‘the professional teacher’ which are arguably similar to the notion of the quality teacher. This suggests that homogenous ideas do emerge across global, national and local institutional policy texts about this notion of a quality teacher and how they are formed. Policy texts used in both institutions refer to the national Teacher Law (Republik Indonesia, 2005b) to constitute teacher professional competencies and additionally to the Indonesian government regulation relating to the competence standards of university graduates (Republik Indonesia, 2005a). With this degree of synchronicity, there seems to be a level of homogeneity among global, national and local institutional texts in relation to notions of the professional and quality teacher and their formation.

The homogeneity across the various texts also highlights a consistency in the local interpretation of policy mandates formulated at higher levels. Several elements in the constitution of professional teachers – the pedagogical dimension of learner centeredness, creating a favourable atmosphere for learning, understanding learners’ needs – are consistently highlighted from the global down to the local institutional level in the context of teacher education, at least in terms of the case study institutions explored in this research project. This degree of consistency and similarity reveals an alignment in the flow of ideas circulating between local and global education policy production contexts. With respect to Appadurai’s (1996) model of globalisation, it can be argued that there is a strong degree of synchronicity between global education policy, Indonesian national teacher education policy and local institutional policy in relation to ideas about quality teachers and the discursive construction of quality pedagogy.

5.4 English language competence
Besides referring to the pedagogical features as stated above, the focus on objective dimensions in defining the notion of quality also refers to English language competence. The discussion below is concerned with
the notion of quality and EFL teachers pertaining to English language competence that comprises content mastery and skills.

English is the dominant language of international communication. It is arguably the language of globalisation, of international business, politics and diplomacy (Johnson, 2009), and because of this it is important to have a good understanding of English and how to communicate in English. As a consequence, there is a great demand for EFL teachers in Indonesia to meet the requirements of complex systems charged with producing competitive outputs regarding English language skills in a globalised world. This means also requiring teacher training institutions to produce competitive graduates who will themselves become EFL teachers that are not only locally and nationally but also globally employable.

Politically, the UN with its many official languages maintains English as its most common working language (Duchêne, 2008) and regional political organisations like ASEAN (Association of Southeast Asian Nations) and SEAMEO (Southeast Asian Ministers of Education Organisation) have adopted English as their official and/or working languages (Zentz, 2013, p. 1).

The above noted international organisations highlight the necessity of English for effective participation in international affairs, and particularly those involving Asian countries. Zentz (2013) added that to meet the demands, either perceived or real, of the increasing global importance of English for all, nation-states around the globe are rushing to deliver English to the masses, particularly through school curricula. Note that the competence of students communicating ideas effectively with diverse audiences has been identified as a global competence that the students should have for the 21st century.

The Asia Society and the U.S. Council of Chief State School Officers specify global competence as the core capacity students need for the 21st century and define it as the capacity and disposition to understand and act on issues of global significance. Per this definition, globally competent students do the following: 1. Investigate the world beyond their immediate
environment. 2. Recognize perspectives, others’ and their own. 3. Communicate ideas effectively with diverse audiences. 4. Take action to improve conditions (Saavedra & Opfer, 2012, p. 5).

But if the globally relevant competence of communicating ideas is the core competence for students in 21st century, then mastering English language to communicate in the global community is arguably a must. Darling-Hammond and Baratz-Snowden (2007) contend that quality teachers are those who master content and pedagogy. Nationally, the Decree of the Minister of National Education of Republic Indonesia No. 16/2007 also emphasises the necessity for content mastery with respect to the English language abilities of English language teachers. While the basic curriculum structure in higher education in Indonesia is developed by the specific institution for each study program or department (Republik Indonesia, 2005a), such curriculum structures are nonetheless grounded in Standards set out in national education policy. As noted above, one expectation concerns the use of English language. Consequently, the Indonesian Minister of National Education has determined the competence of foreign language teachers as follows:

Kompetensi Guru Bahasa Inggris pada SD/MI, SMP/MTs, dan SMA/MA, SMK/MAK…memiliki pengetahuan tentang berbagai aspek kebahasaan dalam bahasa Inggris (linguistik, wacana, sosiolinguistik, dan strategis). Menguasai bahasa Inggris lisan dan tulis, reseptif dan produktif dalam segala aspek komunikatifnya (linguistik, wacana, sosiolinguistik, dan strategis)

[The competence of English teachers at elementary, junior and senior high schools include having knowledge of several aspects of English (linguistic, discourse, sociolinguistic and strategic aspects). [This includes] mastering English orally and in written form, with both receptive and productive skills in all communicative aspects (linguistic, discourse, sociolinguistic and strategic aspects)] (BSNP, 2007, p. 28).

The above Standard identifies the level of English mastery that EFL teachers need to have in terms of subject matter and English language skills.
The articulation of mandated mastery is reproduced in local institutional curriculum texts, which align with the Standard of Graduate Competence identified in the Decree No. 16/2007 (Kementerian Pendidikan Nasional, 2007b). As articulated in the curriculum of the Sun University, graduates of English teacher education programs are expected to master the content of the English language including: the substance of the language; an ability to apply it in the school curriculum at appropriate levels; the ability to develop appropriate linguistic knowledge; an awareness of English literature in the context of learning English; and an ability to develop material in accordance with the school curriculum. In addition to mastering the subject matter, graduates are required to possess a good command of English. In this, EFL teachers are required to engage in ongoing professional development as part of meeting the ‘Standard’ and improving their professional performance. This competency can be achieved through undertaking self-reflection and assessment as an EFL teacher, as part of trying to always deepen one’s knowledge of the English language. This focus is not only in line with AITSL Standard 2, which encourages ongoing professional development (AITSL, 2011), but also in line with what is expected of teachers more generally in relation to the acquisition of 21st century skills (Saavedra & Opfer, 2012).

The mastery of subject matter signalled above is a pre-requisite to becoming a quality teacher (Darling-Hammond & Baratz-Snowden, 2007). This is what Shulman (1999) refers to as content knowledge. EFL pre-service teachers at both case study institutions are thus required to master the knowledge of the English language (BSNP, 2007).

The mandate to have good command of English is reproduced in the curriculum at institutional levels. Therefore, there is a dimension of homogeneity in the curriculum expectation and structure across universities regarding the construction of quality EFL teachers in terms of English language mastery and skills. This homogeneity again reveals the agreement of ideas from global discourse into both national and local level texts, and specifically so in relation to the significance of English, to master English and how to teach English. Studies of what comprises a
good foreign language teacher reveal that one of the key characteristics is maximum use of the foreign language (Bailey, 1985; Sanderson, 1983).

As is often identified in the literature, one’s capacity to learn a foreign language (such as English in the context of Indonesia) is enhanced through its frequent use (Krashen, 1989). Nelson (2008) and Matsuura (2007) have confirmed that exposure will facilitate understanding (intelligibility). Krashen’s (1989) monitor theory, for example, addresses the conditions that facilitate the process of ‘acquisition’ of the target language. Acquisition refers to the natural assimilation of language rules through using language for communication (Richards & Rodgers, 2001). Following Krashen (1989) and Richards and Rodgers (2001), it can be argued that more frequent use of English in the EFL teacher training classroom – as the medium of instruction – would seem to facilitate the process of English language acquisition. However, it is often noted that “Indonesia does not provide adequate exposure to English for the majority of the learners” (Lie, 2007, p. 8).

There seems to be a discrepancy between such research findings and Indonesian education policy with regard to foreign language teaching. In terms of using English as a medium of instruction, as in the case with immersion programs and international standard schools, there is no strong articulation of this methodology at the national policy level in Indonesia because “English requirements for teachers working in SBI schools have mostly not been met” (Raihani, 2014, p. 57). Even though the Law on NES introduced the concept of using the foreign language as a language of delivery in certain education contexts, this has not been particularly visible in local institutional texts. Thus, although national policy has advised that “foreign languages can be used as a language of instruction to support the students’ ability of acquiring a foreign language” (Republik Indonesia, 2003), this is absent in local institutional documents and leads to various interpretations in local practice. This inconsistency in using English as a medium of instruction may possibly impact the students’ progress towards communicative competence.
5.5 ICT and quality teaching

The other objective dimension associated with the notion of quality teaching in the formation of quality teachers is the role of information and communications technology (ICT) in teaching. Technology plays an important role in teaching English language in an era of intensifying globalisation (Pun, 2013). Globalisation has also provided new challenges to teachers as globalising technologies offer new ways of supporting language acquisition (Patel, 2013; Pun, 2013). Examples of such technologies include “TV, CD Rom, Computers, C.A.L.L., the Internet, Electronic Dictionary, Email, Blogs and Audio Cassettes, Power Point, Videos, DVD’s or VCD’s” (Patel, 2013, p. 116). New multimedia technology, for example, can improve students’ motivation, teaching impact, the students’ understanding of western culture, and teacher-student interaction. Such technologies can also support contextualised learning, promote students’ communication skills and facilitate effective adjustments to the teaching material (Patel, 2013).


The EFA agenda also articulates the importance of ICT in teaching which means that teachers are required to use these technologies in order to make the most of their pedagogical benefits:

> Information and communication technologies (ICTs) must be harnessed to support EFA goals at an affordable cost. These technologies have great potential for knowledge dissemination, effective learning and the development of more efficient education services. This potential will not be realized unless the new technologies serve rather than drive the implementation of education strategies. To be effective, especially in developing countries, ICTs should be combined with more traditional technologies such as books and radios, and be more extensively applied to the training of teachers (UNESCO, 2000, p. 21).
The Dakar Framework mandate is further elaborated in Indonesian education policy texts. For example, the Teacher Law advises that national development in the education sector affords to “mencerdaskan kehidupan bangsa dan meningkatkan kualitas manusia… serta menguasai ilmu pengetahuan, teknologi” [educate national life and develop human quality… as well as mastering science and technology] (Republik Indonesia, 2005b, p. 1).

The message above implies that teachers should master knowledge and technology to improve the quality of life in the process of national development. Similarly, Government Regulation No. 32/2013 regarding national education standards also highlights the use of technology to support teaching and learning. It proposes that the standards of infrastructure are required to “menunjang proses pembelajaran, termasuk penggunaan teknologi informasi dan komunikasi” [support the learning process including the use of Information and Communication Technology] (Republik Indonesia, 2013b, p. 3). The importance on technology is further articulated in Law No. 20/2003, which maintains that technology facilitates ‘distance’, which is otherwise referred to as external or online education, as stated as follows: “Pendidikan jarak jauh adalah pendidikan yang peserta didiknya terpisah dari pendidik dan pembelajarannya menggunakan berbagai sumber belajar melalui teknologi komunikasi, informasi, dan media lain” [Distant learning is education of which participants are separated from the educators and its learning uses various learning resources through information communication technology and other media] (Republik Indonesia, 2003, p. 26). Law No. 20/2003 also states that the curriculum should be designed in accordance with the development of technology. It states that “Kurikulum disusun sesuai dengan jenjang pendidikan dalam kerangka Negara Kesatuan Republik Indonesia dengan memperhatikan… perkembangan ilmu pengetahuan, teknologi, dan seni” [Curriculum is designed based on the levels of education in the framework of the State Republic of Indonesia by considering [among other points] the development of scientific knowledge, technology and arts] (Republik Indonesia, 2003, p. 14).
In line with the various national policy texts, institutional documents in the form of FBE guides in both research sites reproduce the ICT mandate signalled in global and national policy discussion. The practicum guides at the institutional level support the development of a professional teacher, and EFL pre-service teachers must be trained to search, find and select appropriate information from various sources and employ technology to improve their professionalism. The pedagogical implications of a study on EFL teachers in using ICT in the classroom (Chen, 2011; Li & Walsh, 2011; Merç, 2015) may indicate the need for better integration of technology into EFL teacher training and for a stronger link between placement schools and the university. However, in some other contexts this technological focus is not always accepted (Merç, 2015). For example, a recent study in Saudi Arabia by Al-Zahrani (2015) shows resistance to adopting such global trends as integration of technology on a wide scale due to cultural-religious conservatism. In Indonesia the importance of technology is acknowledged, but “in general the development of ICT in Indonesia nowadays is less encouraging compared to the developed countries, or even compared to neighbouring countries such as Singapore, Malaysia, Thailand and others” (Yuhetty, 2002, p. 2).

A focus on using ICT to support teaching and learning is also articulated in Indonesia in the competence standards with regard to teachers developing both the appropriate personality and professionalism. Integral to this professional identity is the ability to search for new sources of knowledge, and accessing electronic information in English is deemed a necessary component of this identity (Kementerian Pendidikan Nasional, 2007b). Hismanoglu’s (2012) study of prospective EFL teachers’ perception of ICT integration shows that those holding negative attitudes towards ICT integration feel insufficiently competent in the use of ICT, a consequence of a lack of ICT training. The results of the study strongly suggest that training in the use of ICT is critical to the development of graduate teacher standards that align with policy mandates, and this is particularly so for EFL pre-service teachers.
The focus of this subsection is on the importance of ICT in quality teaching. The recurring articulation of the importance of ICT across documents shows the emerging notion of quality teaching featured by the objective dimension. The similarities in referencing of the importance of ICT across documents from global to local levels illustrate a positive response to the global agenda of ICT use flowing through to the level of national and local institutions. However, there also remains an element of discrepancy among these policy documents, which in some respects is recognised in the EFA agenda. The agenda recognises that while:

all teacher education programmes must aim to ensure that teachers meet proficiency requirements before being certified as ‘qualified’ or ‘trained’, in practice there remains wide differences in teacher education programs in terms of the quality of teachers graduating from such programmes (UNESCO, 2014, p. 237).

Indicative of the discrepancy between the global and national and local levels with regard to ICT in education is the Indonesian 2013 Curriculum, which doesn’t include ICT as a subject matter taught at schools. While the Teacher Law states that the government highlights scientific knowledge and technology to develop civilisation (Republik Indonesia, 2005b), Simanjuntak (2013) noted that in the 2013 Curriculum, ICT as a subject has been abolished:

Di dalam struktur Kurikulum 2013, teknologi informasi dan komunikasi tidak lagi sebagai mata pelajaran yang diajarkan, akan tetapi teknologi informasi dan komunikasi akan menjadi sarana pembelajaran pada semua mata pelajaran

[In the structure of curriculum 2013, ICT is not a school subject anymore, but ICT becomes a learning resource for all subjects. This means ICT will not be taught at primary and high schools but will become the teaching aid for teachers of any subject matter] (Simanjuntak, 2013, p. 78).

The removal of ICT subject matter from the 2013 school curriculum and its transformation into an integrated learning area across the curriculum may bring both advantages and disadvantages with regard to the capacity of both teachers and students being able to take up the global mandate
regarding the significance of technology to national development and international economic competitiveness in particular (Patel, 2013; Pun, 2013; Simanjuntak, 2013). If Indonesia’s schooling infrastructure was adequate to respond to expressed needs and the skills of teachers to use ICT adequately were sufficient, the decision of the government to abolish ICT as a subject might be understandable, but at present this is not the case. However, benefiting from ICT in learning is required to facilitate and motivate learners in order to achieve competitive skills required globally. Furthermore, “knowledge as technological capacity [such as ICT] emerges as a key component in the attainment of [global] competitiveness” (Stromquist & Monkman, 2014, p. 2). Therefore, while ICT is absent as a subject in the 2013 school curriculum, it is noted that there are still courses on ICT offered in the English department (higher education institution) curriculum.

There remains in Indonesia much work to be done in rolling out a stable high speed internet infrastructure, particularly for schools. Furthermore, students from lower income households often have little or no access to computers or the internet at home (Warschauer, 2000). Such a removal of ICT as stand-alone learning area may significantly compromise Indonesia’s capacity to meet its international obligations as signalled in both global and national education policy documents. Moreover, this situation has the capacity to reduce the quality of teaching across the other learning areas within which ICT is to be integrated.

The removal of ICT as stand-alone subject area may cause various interpretations in constituting quality teachers, either at the level of local policies or at the level of practice. The institutional documents at the researched universities show a high expectation of the mastery of technology in managing higher education. For example, one Rector Regulation of Full Moon University provides support for:

- competency based learning according to national and international quality standard by optimizing the benefits of information technology and communication to facilitate to obtain cognitive, psychomotor and affective
competence determined by the study program…. referring to lifelong learning and self-motivated learning or self-directed learning.

This Regulation means that prospective teachers must be facilitated with knowledge and skills in ICT. It acknowledges the importance of ICT in learning for developing quality standards and expects to optimise the use of ICT. In relation to establishing quality EFL teachers, prospective EFL teachers need to be facilitated with ICT during their learning to become teachers, especially in order to implement ICT in their teaching practice either at university or in schools where they practice real teaching.

To conclude, the emerging notion of the importance of ICT in quality teaching is presented as an objective dimension emerging across global, national and local institutional texts. This appears as ideas about ICT promoted by the global agenda flowing along the ideo-scape and into the local institutional context. Analogous articulation in local texts illustrates the acceptability of the global agenda in local context, but the discrepancies that occur at the local level show how careful actions taken up locally might have unanticipated outcomes precisely because of the local conditions of access, resourcing, and teacher competence.

5.6 Conclusion
Chapter 5 identified a number of features active in the formation of quality EFL teachers. These have been identified as having subjective and objective dimensions. The subjective dimension appears as subjective values about quality across global, national and local institutional texts. These subjective values are associated with social and affective values, such as democracy, tolerance, creativity and autonomy. These subjective values are aligned with respect for other values, such as social justice and diversity. The objective dimension is identified in three dominant areas, namely pedagogy, English language competence and ICT, which involve alignment with measures of quality and competence that are more objectively aligned.
There is a degree of homogeneity across subjective and objective characteristics documented in the EFA and other global monitoring reports, national education policies and local institutional policies about quality EFL teacher formation. In analysing these features through the insights offered by Appadurai’s (1996) model of globalisation, we see the extent of flow from global to local context. To some extent this indicates the acceptance of general ideas of the formation of quality teachers from the global level to the national and local institutional levels. This may result in either facilitating or challenging the process of development. Similar ideas from the global to the local context may smooth the process of development programs designed to improve the quality of EFL teaching and teachers. However, disagreement in ideas across global, national and local policy texts has several consequences that delay this process of improvement.

In this chapter, the ideo-scape has emerged as the most dominant of Appadurai’s global flows in establishing quality EFL teachers. The global movement of ideas in terms of subjective values, such as social justice, affective values, democracy, creativity and autonomy, shows that the ideo-scapes influence the constitution of quality EFL teachers. In addition to that, the objective features identified also reveal the global movement of ideas in terms of pedagogy which refer to the AITSL framework of teacher standards, English language competence and ICT. Similar ideas on the notion of quality teaching in the area of pedagogy identified through comparison with the AITSL framework show the acceptance of emerging ideas from the global agenda (EFA) through to acceptance in national and local institutional texts in constituting quality EFL teachers. As a similar point in relation to the English language competence and ICT, the global movement of ideas arrives at a local context which in many respects is also an indicator of acceptability of these global ideas.

However, discrepancies are also evident in the notion of quality that reflects subjective values in relation to the absence of faith being articulated in the global agenda. The global agenda, which is more secular in nature, provides an exemplar of the visible difference between
national and local institutional policies, that latter of which are more religion based.

At the same time, there are discrepancies in the ways that global, national and local texts value and promote objective dimensions of the formation of quality EFL teachers. Discrepancies apparent across global, national and local institutional texts related to learning English as a foreign language in non-English speaking countries, such as Indonesia, include exposure to English being minimal and there being limited articulation at the local institutional level toward the use of English for the medium of instruction in English teacher training institutions. This illustrates a lack of anticipative action toward global employability and may indirectly weaken human capacity toward global competitiveness.

Discrepancies may also suggest different interpretations of the formation of quality teachers in each local institution. A disjuncture around policies in regard to English language use as a medium of instruction demonstrates an unsupportive learning atmosphere for obtaining English language skills required by quality EFL teachers. A strong policy statement on using English as a medium of instruction in English lessons may contribute to achieving quality EFL teachers’ competence. Additionally, a disjuncture on learner centeredness may indicate either the lack of awareness of the global message by local institutions or the lack of acceptability of learner centeredness in the local context; teacher centeredness may be more favourably applied. This tension may be prompted by a lack of awareness of the global message, and it suggests that a professional development program in developing global awareness should be initiated.

Regarding the criteria for quality EFL teachers in the 21st century, there are some gaps in understanding the globalisation prompted by absence of strong awareness and discussion in the curriculum. Institutional policy makers may need to reconsider the possibility of inserting such knowledge in order that the graduates are not only nationally and locally employable but also globally aware and employable.
With regard to the criteria for professional EFL teachers, there are some issues also absent in the curriculum. Understanding globalisation, as Zhao (2010) recommended for professional EFL teachers, is not an active component of the curriculum. This means graduates are still to meet local and national needs, but as noted above, issues of global employability are not yet projected into the curriculum. Each of these issues has implications for how local institutions engage in the formation of quality EFL teacher education programs to meet the needs of 21st century learners in local Indonesian contexts.
Chapter 6
The Formation of Ideal Teachers: Living and learning between text and practice
6. The Formation of Ideal Teachers: Living and learning between text and practice

6.1 Introduction
The preceding Chapters explored the similarities and discrepancies across documents at three different levels of global, national and local institutional policy texts. Chapter 6 focuses on issues of implementation, and therefore turns attention more specifically to responses from pre-service teachers and how they are aligned, or not, against dimensions related to the notion of quality EFL teachers.

As stated in Chapter 2, the word 'quality' is not neutral. According to Dahlberg et al. (1999) it is a socially constructed idea emerging from the human services tradition and has spread from the United States to Europe in recent decades, particularly in the context of the neoliberal economic and political climate. Drawing on Dickson, Dahlberg and colleagues assert that quality was widely recognised as one of the most important factors for success in global markets in the early 1990s. In relation to education, the debates around the idea of quality usually emphasise a concern for teacher quality (Graue, Delaney & Karch, 2013). Dahlberg et al. (1999) further state that this style of quality discourse is underpinned by neoliberal ideas of competitiveness. In a similar vein, Shore (2007) notes that the word ‘competition’ has been emphasised in policy documents as nation-states position themselves as competitive entities in the neoliberal global economy.

Such discourse on quality has been discussed in the Indonesian context in relation to education. The quality of education plays a crucial role in determining a nation’s competitiveness (Jalal et al., 2009). Jalal et al. (2009) assert that in preparing for global competition, Indonesian governments have strived to promote strategies to enhance the quality of education. The quality of an education system is acknowledged to be central to the supply of highly competitive human resources to meet the needs of global economic competition.
As highlighted in the previous Chapters, the focus of this study is on the formation of quality EFL teachers and the implications that might have for quality EFL teacher education programs. Quality EFL teachers is an idea that is shaped through content discourse, pedagogical discourse, and also a professional values discourse which in comparison with the other discourses seems to be much more subjective. Chapter 4 illustrated many similarities in the use of concepts around what constitutes a quality EFL teacher in national and local education policies. This similarity suggests a degree of shared understanding at the various levels of policy development, interpretation and implementation.

Aside from the similarity of ideas, there were discrepancies in the messages between the various levels. Those dimensions are reflected in the debates about quality more broadly, and in discussion of quality education and quality teachers more particularly; it is a debate that is often triggered by the neoliberal ideas that underpin development discourse and global competition in many areas.

Chapter 6 identifies those differences, tensions and indeed the disjuncture between policy and interview discussions which emerged in the data. It reflects on the challenges these disjunctures present in constructing a coherent framing of quality EFL teachers.

6.2 Difference and disjuncture
In his discussion of ‘scapes’ elaborated on previously in Chapters 2 and 4, Appadurai (1996) asserts that there are five so-called ‘scapes’ comprising global flows that are often interrelated, but which can also be disjunctive (Heyman & Campbell, 2009). The differences between flows along the various scapes can produce contradictory outcomes at global, national and local levels (Appadurai, 1996). Indeed, Appadurai refers to such outcomes as instances of difference and disjuncture (1996). In this chapter I draw upon Appadurai’s notions of difference and disjuncture to explore an understanding of the presence of different constructions of the quality EFL teacher among the various policy texts, particularly where
such texts concern education and pre-service teacher education in Indonesia.

The notion of ‘quality’ as reviewed in Chapter 4 often relates to the market focused neoliberal discourse on quality, where notions of efficiency, competition, autonomy and equity are hegemonic. This neoliberal discourse informs discussion across the many EFA global monitoring reports noted in this study and has been variously reproduced in national and local education institutional policies, such as Government Regulation No. 32/2013 (Republik Indonesia, 2013), National Education System (Republik Indonesia, 2003) and the Teacher Law (Republik Indonesia, 2005b). Notwithstanding the significance of this neoliberal-based discourse, one of the areas of difference and thus disjuncture emerges in the curriculum of Sun University, specifically in the discussion of pedagogical dimensions of EFL practice and the content dimensions of EFL teaching, the disjuncture and resulting ambivalence being promoted by difference between mandated policy messages and experiences of EFL pedagogy.

6.2.1 Pedagogical dimensions

The pedagogical dimensions illustrated below include three areas, namely learner centeredness, English language as a medium of instruction and ICT use in the classroom.

*Learner centeredness as a pedagogically ideal message*

The disjuncture that emerges among policy texts with regard to the pedagogical dimension of the quality teacher is articulated particularly in relation to three notions: learner centeredness in the learning process; the language of instruction in the classroom; and the use of ICT in the learning process.

At the level of practice, there is a gap or difference among the policy texts at local, national and global levels in terms of the emphasis on applying a learner-centred approach to learning and teaching. UNESCO advised that “approaches to improving quality of education require adoption of
curriculum content and processes that are learner centred” (UNESCO, 2000, p. 59).

To some extent, as noted earlier in this thesis, the policy advice from the global agenda is in line with what is articulated in the national standard of education as detailed in Indonesian Government Regulations No. 19/2005 and No. 32/2013 (Republik Indonesia, 2013), as well as being in line with curriculum policy texts at each of the Indonesian research university sites. For example, Government Regulation No. 32/2013 (Republik Indonesia, 2013) details that the process of learning should be carried out interactively, inspiringly, joyfully, and challengingly, so as to motivate learners to participate actively. Additionally, at Full Moon University documents attest to the fact that the process of learning should provide space for innovation, creativity and autonomy in accord with the talent, interest and physical and psychological development of learners. Such a focus upon pedagogy as an important dimension of learner development in the context of EFL is also reproduced in the curricula of the English departments of both research sites. They advise, for example, of the necessity to support ‘educative learning’ and apply English language learning models that are ‘oriented to students’ and create ‘conducive learning’ environments for English language learning.

However, there are variations in implementing the message in practice that reflect important locations of disjuncture. Even though most of the participants in this study acknowledged that they applied the active learning approach as called for by the above global, national and local policy texts, with typical teaching techniques, such as discussion, role-plays, presentations, games, songs, group works and other task-based techniques in micro teaching sessions, some other participants did not. These variations in practice may have resulted from the participants’ interpretation of the message mandated by teacher training policies and institutions that recommend a learner-centred approach. Notwithstanding the possibility that invariably policy in action is always a matter of interpretation (Howlett & Ramesh, 2003). What this finding shows is that in the context of pre-service EFL teacher education in Indonesian policy
prescriptions are not always so readily adopted. It seems that when EFL pre-service teachers meet the ‘real’ classroom, their practice and interpretation of policy is equally a matter of negotiation with both the challenges and the enablers of the specific teaching context.

Some indications that many EFL pre-service teachers still applied a teacher-centred approach with its associated typical lecturing technique in FBE, can be seen in the participant statements below. Pre-service teachers acknowledged that during their teaching practice at schools, they were exposed to many practices, so that they could not in fact afford to apply a student-centred approach.

[A learner-centred approach] didn’t work… my mentor teacher said that discussion method or learner centred could not be done because the students tended to be unserious when grouped (Dior).

[I use] the teaching [technique] that the mentor teacher uses… explain the text and translate the reading text [sentence by sentence] (Smith).

In my opinion the teacher still used a lecturing technique [teacher centred] that looked boring… and when the teacher explained, the students didn’t pay attention (Kristy).

These participant responses are indicative of the divergence between policy around quality teaching and the practice of teaching. Additionally, they indicated that, although policy texts around quality teaching may align between the local, national and global levels, difference and disjuncture can still emerge at the site of policy implementation. What is desired in the global, national and local institutional policies may not always be implemented optimally in classroom. The tendency to apply learner-centred approaches or revert back to a teacher-centred pedagogy seems to be triggered by several factors, such as its perceived effectiveness in enabling good classroom management and by the mentor teacher’s own model and pedagogical expectations around what comprises good teaching and learning.

Additionally, it seems that pre-service EFL teachers feel safer in the use of lecturing rather than in the use of a student-centred approach, largely
because they report being unfamiliar with the students' characteristics. For example, one of the participants confirmed that a task-based approach did not work because only certain students participated while others were silent. Knowing this, she stopped carrying out the active learning activities and changed to the lecturing technique because she was worried about wasting time.

Consequently, learner centeredness is variously implemented, with some indications that a teacher-centred approach is commonly applied. Overall, this mismatch between policy and practice with regard to the implementation of a policy-based model of learner-centred pedagogy is an outcome in line with Luschei and Zubaidah's (2012) observations of the pedagogical approaches taken by student teachers in Indonesian school classrooms. It is also a finding that resonates with Carron and Chau's study (1996) of teaching styles, which identified how, in many places, teacher pedagogy remains 'traditional', teacher-centred and fairly rigid and even authoritarian.

However, Shah (2014) argued in her study on Learner Centred Pedagogy (LCP) that it creates more inclusive, democratic and relevant educational experiences for all Timorese children. She also maintains that:

> globally, development partners such as UNICEF, the World Bank, USAID (United States Agency for International Development) and AusAID (Australian Agency for International Development) maintain that LCP is a key aspect of quality-focused improvement in schooling systems throughout the global south (Shah, 2014, p. 63).

Drawing upon Hopper (1996), Shah contends that learner centeredness is related to the reinforcement of “competences, knowledge and skills such as problem solving, teamwork, critical thinking which important for participating in the twenty-first century knowledge economy” (2014, p. 64). Based on her observation, besides creative mediation of LCP by the teachers, Shah found teachers’ resistance to the imposition of learner centred pedagogy to be due to large class sizes and lack of available resources, such as textbooks.
**English as the language of instruction in the classroom**

The importance of English as the language of globalisation (Johnson, 2009) and its consequence of a high demand of English tuition in Indonesia has been noted previously (see Chapter 4). In addition, there are emerging challenges for quality EFL teachers who will themselves produce students with the requisite English language capability to support Indonesia’s national competitiveness in the current era of economic globalisation (Madya, 2002). Nationally the importance of English in the global context has been responded to by the Indonesian Government via endorsement of Decree No. 16/2007 (Kementerian Pendidikan Nasional, 2007a) on the need for mastering English content and communicative skills by English department graduates. Locally, institutional curriculum policy also recirculates this emphasis by emphasising the necessity of English to the Indonesian economy and the training of quality EFL teachers and the standard of graduate competence that requires a good command of English by the graduates. This recirculation of the importance of English is an exemplar of a flow along the ideo-scape.

However, here too there are some inconsistencies between policies and practice. Two primary examples of these inconsistencies are elaborated below. One example relates to inconsistency in relation to the use of English as a medium of instruction in the classroom and the other relates to concerns about EFL teachers’ English language proficiency.

In response to the global demands and challenges identified above, Law No. 20/2003 on the National Education System (Republik Indonesia, 2003) introduced the notion of using the foreign language as a language of delivery in the EFL classroom. The Law states that the foreign language can be used as a language of instruction at certain education levels to support the students’ ability to acquire the particular language (Republik Indonesia 2003, Chapter VII, Article 33, Clause 3). But this policy imperative is also subject to different interpretations emerging in the context of application.
Based on the interview data, pre-service EFL teachers are generally aware of the circulation of discourses highlighting the importance of English. Almost all participants in this study also acknowledged using over 70% English in delivering the material during their microteaching practice. They used English as the instructional language in the classroom because of their lecturers’ expectation. Most of their lecturers urged them to deliver the material fully in English. Some participants acknowledged that using English as the language of instruction made them feel comfortable and confident; however, others felt nervous because of their insufficient English language proficiency, particularly in terms of grammar, pronunciation and vocabulary. However, using English as the medium of instruction was considered preferable during teaching practice and this was something promoted by most lecturers of English Departments at the researched universities.

In microteaching, we were trained, “Don’t underestimate your students”. So, as far as possible we used 95% English and 5% Indonesian in microteaching (Ingrid).

However, several participants used mixed language – English and Indonesian – in which the English portion comprised 50% or less of the discourse. Interestingly, these participants acknowledged that there was no strict rule from their lecturers to use English in delivering the material. These pre-service teacher education students maintained that they were given the freedom to decide which language to use as long as it was appropriate to the level of their students. Consequently, some delivered using a bilingual approach, with a smaller percentage of English content in response to what they viewed as the lower capacity of their students to effectively engage with English-only instruction. In addition, among these students there were those who used a bilingual instructional approach due to their own limited English language skills. One of the participants acknowledged that the delivery was “40% English, 60% Indonesian” (Devi). Others stated:

In my opinion, I feel lack of vocabulary, Mam. Sometimes I have a blank mind in front of my students, and then I directly use Indonesian (Indira).
Because they pretended to be Year 7 students, I mixed English [and Indonesian]. I translated it into Indonesian so as to adapt to [the level of] the class (Etta).

However, during teaching practice at schools, not all pre-service teachers could actualise their ideas through the use of English as much as they did in the microteaching program, as some of their students were unresponsive to English stimuli. Some EFL pre-service teachers also acknowledged that their students did not understand when they spoke English because their usual classroom teachers used English poorly.

I try to use English in order that I can… but the problem is that the most students didn't understand because of the teacher himself… when I observed, the teacher used more Indonesian and Javanese when teaching English; English is only less meaningful, getting little portion of English listening from the teacher… The difficulty is being unsure whether the students understand or not with the words that I uttered, but I still continued using English; when they were confused, 'What does it mean, Sir?', then I explained that the meaning is this-this (Dunn).

I try to use English, even though they don't understand, I translate into Indonesian… if I am [using] yes 80% English… but the mentor teacher is vice versa, yes around 30%, Ma'am. Very rarely using English (Cyndi).

As demonstrated in the quotes above, some pre-service EFL teachers preferred to use a bilingual approach grounded in a higher percentage of Indonesian than English when teaching English.

At the first time I taught at school, it was different from microteaching. In microteaching I was supposed to teach the first year students of high school. The first difference that I felt [in actually teaching school] was the language of delivery. When I introduced myself using English and said “today we will learn with me”, all students directly responded “Miss, don't speak English.” The difference is quite clear when using language delivery. In microteaching we used full English, while in the field I really could not use English at all. The English teachers there use English only in greeting and closing, and seldom in between. However, when I taught there, I tried to add more English but with translation (Inez).
At the first time I entered the class and I used 95% English; [the students] were stunned and complained, like, “What is it?” (Ingrid).

In senior high school, in the beginning I wanted to use English, but finally it turned out that the [students] remained silent when asked to make groups; maybe they didn’t understand, so I had to repeat using Indonesian, therefore I could not use full 100% English; and the vocabulary of the students was also limited (Ina).

While the use of one’s first language in teaching English may be of some benefit, if it is predominantly used in conjunction with the minimal use of the target language, this can result in reducing the opportunities for students to be immersed in the target language (Harmer, 2007). Language learning does not necessarily require immediate comprehension of the target language, as much as it requires exposure to the target language (Richards & Rodgers, 2001). Learning English is arguably made all the more successful when the students are provided with an English rich learning environment (Krashen, 1989), despite the challenge which the teachers may feel when using the target language as the medium of instruction. Given the responses by both mentors and students in classes, it is obviously a challenge for prospective EFL teachers to maintain their commitment to use English when teaching it.

Studies of language teachers reveal that one of the characteristics of good foreign language teachers is the maximum use of, and talk in, the foreign language for teaching and learning (Bailey, 1985; Finocchiaro & Bonomo, 1973; Sanderson, 1983). However, the data above show that prospective EFL teachers could not use English language optimally during their English lessons in the real classroom. Most of the pre-service teachers placed in disadvantaged schools in this research project could not apply the idea of using English due to both the poor role model provided by their mentor teachers and their students’ lack of motivation to use English. Consequently only a few pre-service EFL teachers use more than 70% English as the language of instruction. Most of the pre-service EFL teachers preferred to use a bilingual approach grounded in relatively
minimal use of English. This further reveals a difference between policy and practice.

The finding above also indicates that most pre-service teachers in this study have low commitment to using English in the classroom, blaming both the students and their mentors for this outcome. If they had high self-efficacy, perhaps such blaming may not have emerged, and they may have employed certain strategies that would have supported the use of English as the language of instruction under such circumstances. The requirement to implement more effective pedagogical practices to suit the context rather than giving up and switching to Indonesian in teaching English was, however, noted by some of the pre-service teachers:

> In my opinion, the students learn a little from the teachers. If, for example the teachers are willing, in the learning process they would use much English, choosing scaffolding words that help and make it easy for the students to understand… [Then] the students can follow (Cyndi).

What Cyndi describes above suggests that teachers drive students’ learning of English. Teachers determine how much the students learn. This is in synchrony with Shulman’s (1999) advice that good pedagogy involves more than content knowledge alone.

The context in which teaching and learning take place is very important. Hattie (2009) suggested that socio-economic status contributes to the success of learning. If the context is characterised by low socio-economic factors, then the EFL teachers should also understand how socio-economic ‘class’ impacts learning.

### 6.2.2 ICT implementation

In regard to pursuing its goals, *The Dakar Framework* suggests ICT is important in distributing knowledge and facilitating effective learning and educational development. This implies that in establishing quality teachers, it is important to integrate ICT in the learning process. ICT use must be feasible; therefore it is advised that it be provided at a reasonable price and in practical ways.
Information and communication technologies (ICTs) must be harnessed to support EFA goals at an affordable cost. To be effective, especially in developing countries, ICTs should be combined with more traditional technologies such as books and radios, and be more extensively applied to the training of teachers (UNESCO, 2000, p. 21).

The above quote from the EFA agenda emphasises the importance of applying technology to support the delivery of education, learning and teaching. More specifically, the potential capacity of technology facilitates the spread of information, therefore making it largely essential to integrate ICT in teacher training in an effective way. Despite the often high costs of ICT implementation, there is a strong need, as signalled above, to actualise the use of ICT to meet education goals aligned with Indonesia’s economic and education policies. But in this, there emerges a potential disjuncture between the necessity for the use of ICT and the cost of ICT, which can be conceptualised as a disjuncture between ideas flowing along the techno-scape and the realities of financial flows along the finance-scape, particularly in the context of ‘developing’ countries such as Indonesia.

Madya (2002) contends that the acceleration of development in Indonesia should be supported by technology. Madya (2007) assures us that technology will certainly facilitate development in remote areas. However, she also acknowledges that limited financial capacity has made it impossible to achieve equity of educational access. The lack of financial resources is a recurring issue, as is the extent to which global policy around the use of ICT for education can accordingly be thwarted at the national and local levels. For example, the schools where the pre-service teachers practiced their teaching were not always equipped with a sufficient ICT infrastructure. The consequence of this is that the capacity of pre-service teachers to use ICT for learning and teaching varies depending on the school in which they undertake their practice teaching. Some schools are labelled by the pre-service teachers as a ‘favourite’ school, particularly so in the urban city context where schools are generally well equipped with ICT resources. Indeed, comments from the
pre-service teachers indicate that overall, they enjoyed the use of technology to support learning and teaching, as mandated by their teacher training institutions.

We must find new methods, new innovations for the teaching itself in order that students are not bored with monotonous teaching methods... finding new method which is based on technology is very good and more interesting (Denny).

I used video with slow and regular English in it. In fact, every sentence must be paused and translated (Adam).

The above statements illustrate that pre-service EFL teachers have to employ interesting teaching methods including the use of video and the language laboratory. Where schools were well resourced, pre-service teachers could apply the teaching from microteaching sessions on campus, where they were trained to apply ICT in their teaching practice. In addition, they could adopt technology to avoid monotonous teaching methods and to build students’ interest. In this respect, their teacher training had equipped them to meet the expectations of both the National Law (Republik Indonesia, 2005b) and accompanying global messages in so far as the use of ICT to support learning and teaching goes (UNESCO, 2014). At the national level, Government Regulation No. 32/2013 on national education standards promoted the use of technology to support student learning (Republik Indonesia, 2013). In line with this national regulation, institutional policies in the form of the FBE guides of Full Moon University require pre-service teachers to be quality teachers who are able to compete through standardisation and competency examinations and to adjust to changes in educational knowledge, technology and society. The guides therefore promote the training of quality teachers by promoting the use of technologies to achieve that goal.

Aside from the reasonably well-equipped urban schools, many schools where pre-service EFL teachers undertake their practice teaching were not well resourced in terms of ICT. It could be argued that such less well equipped schools contradict the requirement for using ICT in education
mandated in global and national policy texts. In these less well equipped schools, pre-service teachers arguably could not easily reach the standards for the use of ICT for learning and teaching identified in policy. In such schools even an internet connection, that would be taken for granted in other contexts, is not available (Goswami, 2008). And without an internet connection, many of the other ICT affordances arguably lose their educative value in the interconnected digital world represented in the global and national policy texts. Put simply, what many pre-service EFL teachers have learned in their teacher training institutions could not be applied in the classrooms.

For villagers, there are a lot of challenges, like... vocabulary, furthermore technology and media used. In villages we can use meaningful [teaching] instruments, but limited internet, limited communication and electronic media as well, which is influential, because in village schools, sometimes it is unaffordable to buy the tools and that affects the teaching of English. If it is in town, there is an English laboratory; however, in a village there is only a common class in which the situation is noisy and students' concentration is lacking. So that when English is taught, there are students who are sleepy, writing something else, and village teachers sometimes teach through words; for example, there is a story, and only translating to Indonesian is used, not exploring more deeply, and this becomes a challenge for English teachers trying to give useful lessons for their students on their social life (Smith).

The above excerpt highlights the impact of insufficient infrastructure on effectively teaching English in ways that can motivate students, as mandated by Teacher Law No. 14/2005 (Republik Indonesia, 2005b), particularly with an emphasis upon the use of ICT in education for the purpose of improving Indonesia's human capital for national development.

What emerges in the context highlighted above is not only a disjuncture between flow along the techno-scape and the finance-scape, but also along the ideo-scape, particularly in relation to the idea that ICT must be used to support education. The idea of integrating ICT in teaching English is actually welcome in national and local institutional contexts, but
insufficient technology hampers the implementation of the idea. As a consequence, the achievement of a globalising idea – which is that ICT must be used to support learning and teaching – is often not realised in practice at the local level in the context of pre-service EFL teacher education.

Information and communication technology is arguably crucial in English language teaching. As often recognised there are many benefits in applying technology in English language teaching. Patel (2013) and Pun (2013), for example, contend that globalisation has provided new challenges because technology has changed traditional practices for English teaching, which provides various technology-based alternatives, making both teaching and learning much more interesting and productive. Patel (2013) identified the benefits arising from the use of multimedia technology in learning and teaching to include: improvements in learning communication skills, student motivation, student understanding of western culture, teacher-student interaction, support for context-relevant learning, and the capacity to facilitate malleable adjustments to the teaching material. But despite the clear mandate for the use of ICT in education at all levels, and research identifying the value of ICT to learning and teaching, the use of ICT remains an idea that in many instances is not put into practice in pre-service EFL teacher training or in field experience in Indonesian schools. Contrary to Patel (2013) and Pun (2013) above, this represents yet another instance of difference between policy and practice.

6.2.3 The content dimension

Besides the disjunctures on the pedagogical dimension noted above, there is disjuncture related to content, namely the mastery of English language content and skills. Mastering content is advised in the EFA Global Monitoring Report (2014). It advises that “teachers need not only sound subject knowledge but also training in how to teach” (UNESCO, 2014, p. 238). This means that quality teachers are required to master not only pedagogy but also content. Specifically, establishing quality EFL
teachers needs to be concerned with content knowledge of the English language. However, in the Indonesian context, where English is a foreign language, mastering English is not always easy and not without difficulty. The following section illustrates how what is advised in the global agenda may not be easily achievable in practice due to the insufficiency in English language proficiency and the time for teaching practice.

**Insufficiency in English language proficiency**

The discourse on global competition has triggered a demand for high proficiency English languages speakers. For example, the Indonesian Minister for Research, Technology and Higher Education contends that to face competition in the Asian economy, English must be mastered (Farmita, 2015). This advice agrees with the significance of English in Indonesia that appears as an emerging idea through both global and regional imperatives.

As important as such realities are at the local classroom level, the EFL teachers’ communicative ability in English is an essential factor not only for effective classroom management but also for their students’ acquisition of the target language (Nunan, 1991). In other words, and as can be seen from the discussion above, it seems to be at the local level where global and national agendas are either realised or not. In regard to school students’ successful acquisition of English communicative competence, EFL teachers should provide opportunities for students to communicate in English. As Nunan (1991) and others above maintain, language skills are acquired when learners actively interact with each other to communicate in the target language.

It is in regard to this position and the national demand for English language speakers that pre-service EFL teachers have been prepared to master a range of English language competences within their respective English departments. For example, the English department curriculum at Full Moon University reproduces the idea that the pre-service teachers are to have high communicative competence in line with global demand. But as has been noted above with regard to both pedagogy and ICT,
even though teaching training institutions have prepared to deliver on the mandates of global and national policy, outcomes might still not be entirely satisfactory, particularly as the perceived communicative competence of their pre-service EFL teachers is not always so high. Around 60% of the participants in this study acknowledged that their English capacity was just sufficient for teaching school students at the level at which they themselves practiced. Hence 40% of the pre-service teachers perceived that their English was insufficient. The insufficiencies reported by the pre-service students included their English pronunciation, spelling, grammar and vocabulary, as indicated in the following statements:

For self-ability, I am not confident with pronunciation, whether the spelling is correct or not. In that class the students come from different areas with different dialects. For example, myself, I come from Tegal; sometimes I am influenced by my dialect although I speak English (Inez).

I am still hampered by my grammar whether the structure is correct… (Mary).

Frankly, I am still insufficient, Ma’am. When finding something strange, I open a dictionary secretly (Aquila).

Lacking proficiency in English language is identified as one of the challenges for EFL pre-service teachers in teaching. The finding regarding the insufficiency of English language capacity thus confirms previous studies by Dardjowidjojo (2000), Hamied (1997), Marcellino (2008), and Yuwono and Harbon (2010) concerning the poor language mastery and pedagogies of English language teacher graduates, and the broader challenges facing the EFL teaching profession in Indonesia.

Krashen’s monitor theory (1989) addresses the conditions that facilitate the process of ‘acquisition’ of the target language. Acquisition refers to the natural assimilation of language rules through using language for communication (Richards & Rodgers, 2001). Considering this principle, some pre-service teachers were aware of the importance of maximising English exposure in the teaching and learning process. Even though they
acknowledged the limited use of English in classroom context, they would make some changes to accommodate the requirement for increased exposure.

We learn a language with a goal for communication, don’t we? I can see… they are very limited in using English for communication because only one way [no mutual interaction]. If reading or writing, they only use the texts, but do not practice with their friends for communication. I want to make something different that can sharpen them to communicate (Cindy).

However, many pre-service teachers could not maintain solid communication in English with their students in schools, and instead they gave up, falling back to rely on Indonesian. While as noted above, the limited use of English in the classroom may have resulted from the resistance of students at disadvantaged schools characterised by low socio-economic status, there was a perception among the pre-service teachers that the school students simply felt that English was something too hard to learn. For example:

[The students] like mocking. “Gee, you act as if you were English man” and most of them didn’t listen. Male students like to tease others if not making noise, but the female students like to shout and grab mirrors. So, if I use English, they become noisier (Audrey).

When the first time I taught using English, the students didn’t respond and didn’t understand… to explain on certain chapters, I must use Indonesian and even Javanese in order that they understand. So English is only used to give instructions (Adam).

What these pre-service EFL teacher comments reveal is that English is not optimally used for communication in the English language classroom. Implicitly, it means that the process of acquiring the target language is not well supported. This is in line with what Lie (2007) stated, that in Indonesia, exposure to English is not provided adequately to most of the learners because English is used as a foreign language. It also means that the communicative competence expected in the Association of Teachers of English as a Foreign Language (TEFLIN) Focus Group Discussion (TEFLIN, 2011) is perhaps not well supported by such
teachers for building students’ communicative competence. Even more interestingly, some of the pre-service teachers do not optimally use English, they instead fall back on Javanese, rather than Indonesian, as the medium of instruction.

Additionally, many pre-service teachers are still in the process of developing their professional identity as language teachers (Hong, 2010), and thus there is the possibility that this too may contribute to the lack of success in building English communicative competence if they don’t commit to communicate effectively in English (Riggenbach & Lazaraton, 1991). Pre-service teachers’ lack of using English may result from their own learning environment which may not be supportive enough. Kumaravadivelu confirmed that “social settings such as the neighbourhood and the classroom, in which learners come into contact with the new language have also been found to influence L2 development” (2008, p. 43). Drawing on studies by Wong-Fillmore, he provides a convincing case that opportunities to communicate can be created in specific social settings to thus maximise learning potential.

To summarise, in the Indonesian context, there are still a number of issues impacting the notion of quality as it relates to EFL teachers’ content knowledge. There is a breakdown in achieving optimal training of quality EFL teachers, as expected by the EFA agenda, due to lack of content knowledge mastery. This reveals a difference between policy and practice in regard to content knowledge and may be a site of further investigation in attempts to improve the quality of EFL teacher formation in Indonesia.

**Time for teaching practice**

*Education for All* global Monitoring reports 2014 (UNESCO, 2014) drawing upon the OECD (2011) policy advice and Schleicher (2012) articulate the need for investment of time by pre-service teachers in the classroom during their initial teacher education:

Opportunities for teaching practice are essential to ensure that teacher trainees succeed later in improving students’ learning. Countries that have
achieved high student learning outcomes are also those that ensure sustained periods of learning to teach in classrooms under the supervision of expert teaching staff (UNESCO, 2014, p. 240).

The above statement asserts that time investment contributes to better quality outcomes.

Pre-service teachers should get adequate experience in learning to teach in the classroom, if given enough time to practice under the supervision of expert mentors. It suggests that pre-service teachers must be prepared in such a way to enable them to have sufficient opportunities to engage in practice teaching. But even though local institutions have reproduced this idea, notably through the provision of microteaching and field-based experience in schools, according to some this seems to be insufficient in terms of the actual time spent in practice. According to UNESCO (2014), drawing from a study on improving teaching and learning in Africa by Akyeampong, Lussier, Pryor and Westbrook (2013), teacher education programmes in developing countries often fail to ensure that trainees get adequate experience of learning to teach in classrooms, which contributes to the poor quality of teaching.

The relatively poor time investment in practice teaching highlighted by UNESCO above was also noted in this study by a participant who acknowledges that their time for teaching practice was limited

[I was] only given two months… I feel that it was very short for me to educate children… it is learning to be a teacher and whether it is appropriate or not for us to be a teacher, so I think two months, interrupted by making a report, observations and so on, I feel it is insufficient (Aryan).

The above statement from Aryan aligns with the claims made by UNESCO, such that while global policy calls for additional teaching practice time, national and local policy implementation does not reflect this. This presents another site of difference, not only at the level of policy, but in terms of its implementation. Some dimensions of disjuncture are a sign that mandated goals are not being achieved and this creates ambivalence amongst the teachers.
6.3 Ambivalence experienced by pre-service EFL teachers

Aside from the experience of an actual disjunct between policy and practice, there also emerges a degree of ambivalence among pre-service teachers, an additional factor which may be constraining the achievement of quality outcomes in terms of EFL teacher training and EFL teaching in Indonesian schools. Craig and Martinez (2005) defined ambivalence as inconsistencies or contradictions within someone’s desire or feelings:

> When a person’s distribution of considerations includes contradictory or inconsistent evaluations, beliefs, or emotions, we can describe him or her as being ambivalent (Craig & Martinez, 2005, p. 2).

For Bhabha (1994), the concept of ambivalence is related to colonial discourse and emerges out of the relationship between coloniser and colonised. Unlike the more ‘common’ understanding, Bhabha’s conceptualisation of ambivalence is deeply related to identity and relations of ‘Superiority and inferiority’ (Bhabha, 1994). Through references to discourse, Bhabha maintains that such relations of superiority and inferiority, and indeed power, can be observed. For Bhabha (1994), ambivalence is not only a manifestation of such relations in terms of how they shape and inform identity, but such ambivalence is to be found in the language (discourse)⁴ used by ‘subjects’.

Without more fully engaging with the colonialist and post-colonialist dimensions of Bhabha’s critique, the data obtained in this research project nonetheless presented instances where the teaching of EFL in Indonesia appears to be framed by relations of superiority and inferiority, leading to the expression of ambivalence. Thus the aim is, in addition to identifying ambivalence in its more common senses, to show how and account for why, EFL pre-service teachers experience mixed feelings

---

⁴ While Bhabha references discourse as the site wherein ambivalence is made apparent, this study - which does not comprise a critical discourse analysis - nonetheless draws upon Bhabha to inform the analysis of the participant responses to the extent that this reveals the play of relations of superiority and inferiority highlighted by Bhabha.
depending upon the context in which they find themselves. Such contexts in this study have been shaped by the following: the perception of the EFL teaching profession; the selection of appropriate teaching resources; assessing the learners’ English skills; and national identity in relation to the global demand for global employability.

6.3.1 Perceptions of the EFL teacher profession

In addressing quality education, the global policy agenda such as EFA has advised member countries to enhance public perception of teachers. The policy is adamant that:

Public perceptions of teachers and teaching must be enhanced; incentives to identify, attract and retain good teachers must be provided; for example, policies should be in place to protect teachers’ salaries, rights and welfare. In addition, strong and ongoing teacher, supervisor and manager support and professional development services, at the level of the school and classroom, must be introduced. Teachers themselves must be more genuinely involved in decisions that affect their work. Adequate time and investment must be given to re-train the existing teacher workforce and to reform pre- and in-service training (UNESCO, 2000, p. 60).

In addition, the Indonesian government has endorsed Teacher Law No. 14/2005 as one of the ways to protect the teaching profession and enhance its image. The Indonesian teaching profession’s characteristics, such as being a low income profession with limited rights and welfare, are to be addressed and eliminated according to this law. However, public perceptions of teaching as a profession generally involve lack of respect in Indonesia (Chang et. al., 2012). Becoming a teacher is often considered to be entering a second class profession on the grounds that teachers do not make a lot of money. Consequently many young people, including high school graduates, do not choose teaching when entering university. Instead they prefer entering more prestigious professions, such as medicine, engineering, law and accountancy:
In the beginning I was interested in the International affair aside from communication. But, I was not accepted in that university, so then I changed my mind and entered this department (Emilie).

Actually I entered this institution by accident. My first choice was the English department of a faculty of letters, but I failed. Then I entered this department (Iqbal).

My goal was not initially to go to this department. Because I was not accepted in my first choice, then I applied in this department. I was lucky because I was still an early bird so I got a priority (Mary).

The ambivalence of young Indonesians towards entering the teaching profession often emerges when they can’t pursue their ideal profession. In such circumstances some choose teaching as a path to save face rather than being penganggur, ‘a no status person’, after graduating from high school.

Parental desire is another factor that leads some young people into the teaching profession, despite their own ambivalence, and consequently they enter teacher training without a full commitment:

Since the beginning I was not interested in this department. My interest was in sports. But my parents insisted that I join this department. Actually I refused, but they always force me because my father is a civil servant teacher and knows a lot about the teaching profession. He motivated me very much (Smith).

The above statement not only highlights the presence of ambivalence in the more common sense understanding of the term, but arguably also the presence of ambivalence in terms of identity and relations of superiority and inferiority. In such circumstances some choose teaching as a path to save face rather than being penganggur, ‘a no status person’, after graduating from high school. In this statement, they enter the teaching profession to ‘save face’, to not be one without status. Further informing this interpretation is the fact that in the strongly patriarchal Javanese culture, parents, particularly fathers, play dominant roles in the family. Parents determine the future occupation of their children. As an inferior
group, relative to their parents, children are expected to show their obedience and follow the guidance of their parents, who hold superiority over them – even though the parents’ position conflicts with that of the child.

This being the case, there seems to be an additional gap between policy and practice, particularly in relation to the prescriptions of Teacher Law No. 14/2005 regarding the teaching profession and the ‘realities’ of young people’s perceptions, if not those of their families.

6.3.2 Selecting appropriate learning resources

One of the important elements in improving quality of education as advised in The Dakar Framework (UNESCO, 2000) is choosing appropriate learning resources. This framework maintains that quality teaching should be grounded upon the development and adaptation of learning experiences and materials to ensure social and cultural relevance for learners (UNESCO, 2000). Indonesian national policy also articulates that teachers are to select appropriate learning resources (Republik Indonesia, 2007). However, considering that English is a foreign language in Indonesia, it is not always easy for EFL pre-service teachers to teach English at certain local schools with limiting conditions shaping the learning and teaching context. For example, in teaching language skills, such as listening, EFL teachers are advised to use authentic material and other downloaded learning resources (Republik Indonesia, 2007). However, to a certain extent meeting this requirement is, as noted above in the discussion of ICT resources, limited by the Indonesian context.

In the area that is far from [internet], technology like Facebook… it becomes a problem for the English teaching profession, but if we are successful to teach English to the students, certainly we contribute great knowledge that they can use to lead a sustainable life in the globalisation era for their future… it becomes a pressure because it is listening, because we look for listening material with real voice based on the real context. When we have to make a lesson plan which contains a teaching
Consequently, while pre-service EFL teachers have the desire to use appropriate learning resources, it is difficult to translate such desire into practice. The response to this is characterised by ambivalence in that they are largely left to use teaching materials that reproduce aspects associated with the Javanese culture, which in this instance is that material which is not grounded in the culture of Solo. While in this instance there seems to be a degree of ambivalence in the general sense of the term, there is clearly a degree of ambivalence that is grounded in identity and perceived relations of power and the extent to which such relations continue to frame the local curriculum.

6.3.3 Assessing the learner’s English skill

It is further advised in the EFA agenda that the assessment strategy needs to focus on learning how to learn and including diverse, continuous and responsive approaches. This message is also articulated in the Law on the National Education System (Republik Indonesia, 2003). Yet EFL teachers feel ambivalent when assessing students’ English capacity, being caught between a desire to provide the ‘real’ score that reflects students’ competence or an ‘artificial’ score to meet the benchmark associated with learning and teaching standards that demonstrate (pseudo-) success to the public. As an example, Garniwa (2013) highlights this dilemma in his blog criticising English language education in Indonesia:

In general English education in our country has not met the expectation yet. In fact, the education is still oriented to achieving good score, ignoring the essential goal of learning the language-language mastery… many English teachers that feel sad with the quality of the learners. They are confused in giving average score of KKM because students’ English life skill is still far from the expectation, so that they ask their students’ to study at English courses-off schools or falsifying the score because if they don’t
do that, the learning process in the classroom is assumed to be unsuccessful to achieve the standard outcome (Garniwa, 2013).

The above insight reveals the teachers’ view that English has not delivered on its promises. If the teachers mark the students’ English capacity objectively and give the students the real score, they are then not sure that the students deserve to pass based upon the set standards. Additionally, there is the fear that with the provision of the ‘real’ score, teachers in English departments at teacher training institutions will be judged as not being effective, leading to disappointment by a range of stakeholders, including parents and the public more widely. However, if they falsify the score, they then feel guilty for not being honest and it contradicts their professional idealism and desire. Such a case reveals the existence of ambivalence in the sense of being caught between two possible courses of action – in other words, ambivalence in the more general sense of the term.

### 6.3.4 Implementing teaching innovation

Teacher Law No. 14/2005 (Republik Indonesia, 2005b) states that improving the quality of teachers for national development requires the mastery of knowledge and technology. This requires that EFL teachers not only deliver knowledge but also use innovative strategies and technologies to do so. However, many school teachers do not use the appropriate resources available:

Most of the EFL pre-service teachers use media while the [mentor] teachers don’t make use of the facilities. Indeed every class has been provided with an LCD, screen but no speaker, so if [we] want to use video listening, we have to bring the [loud] speaker by ourselves. [The students] are never brought to the [language] laboratory either. I want to bring them to the laboratory but feel uneasy with others; [I] may be labelled pretentious to bring them to the laboratory, Ma’am (Inez).

Inez acknowledged that the school is resourced with a language laboratory but the mentor teacher never uses it to facilitate listening skills. Being aware of the existence of school facilities for upgrading students’
English skills and applying the learning from campus, Inez would use the laboratory. However, she felt uncomfortable when she realised that the mentor teacher didn’t use it. She felt discouraged because she was afraid of being considered impolite.

This reveals ambivalence among the EFL pre-service teachers in implementing such innovations at schools. They feel ambivalent about applying their learning obtained at university in the context of practice teaching in schools. On the one hand, they want to teach their school students what they have learned and experienced at their institution’s language laboratory with regard to listening skills, for example, but in some schools there is no such facility. On the other hand, their use of the language laboratory can be constrained by a perception that they will be viewed by mentor teachers as being ‘sok’ – having an ‘affectation’ or a sense of superiority. The pre-service teachers feel uneasy because their mentor teachers, their supervisors, rarely if ever use the language laboratory in teaching certain English language skills; thus in the context of Indonesian, if not Javanese or even Solo cultural standards and expectations, how can the pre-service teachers be so brave to use the laboratory? As Bhabha (Bhabha, 1994) has noted, the feeling of being excluded from the dominant culture seems to inform this instance of ambivalence.

In addition, pre-service teachers’ social competence is also challenged in terms of how they adjust within the school community. Social competence is reflected in how pre-service teachers adjust to the school community, including with students who challenge them. Even though some might experience tension with the mentor teachers in the beginning, at the end they developed strategies to cope with these professional differences (Buckworth, 2016). Buckworth, Kell and Robinson (2015) also argued that social problems are experienced by international students in undertaking practicum under the supervision of mentor teachers. In that particular study, pre-service EFL teachers tried to make the relationship work with the mentor teachers because the mentor teachers had power over their final teaching practice assessment. Similarly, in this study, even though
some pre-service teachers experienced a tension with the mentor teachers in the beginning, at the end of the experience they developed strategies to cope. They try to adjust because the mentor teachers have power over their final assessment for their teaching practice.

6.4 Tensions and the perception of the effects of globalisation

Globalisation has had a substantial effect on national education systems (Anh, Nguyen & Le, 2013; Bianco, 1999; Chang et al., 2014; Goodwin, 2010). Bianco (1999), for example, argued that through international organisations, globalisation impacts national education systems in three ways, namely through consultancies from the international agencies to national governments; through pressure and the influence of virtual studies that the agencies conduct; and through more direct ways to adopt some instruments, such as through declarations, agreements and conventions. The OECD and UNESCO are among such international organisations which are influential on a global scale, including in Indonesia. These political and economic (if not cultural) organisations variously influence the decisions of national government in ways that directly affect their citizens (Van Krieken et al., 2014). Education comprises one particularly significant site of such influence.

A key element articulated in the EFA agenda to address quality education is enhancing positive attitudes toward globalisation. National and local institutional policies also reproduce the importance of adjusting to global demands.

It is in regard to their generally positive attitude toward globalisation that EFL pre-service teachers assume that becoming EFL teachers provides them with a sense of pride, particularly in the context of learning English as a global language. While using the national language certainly supports maintaining national identity as an Indonesian, it is the use of English that may enable them to participate more effectively in the current era of globalisation, characterised as it is by both global and as noted
earlier, regional markets. Knowing and teaching English is thus valued by EFL pre-service teachers:

In my opinion, becoming EFL teachers has certain pride because besides able to use national language, we are able to learn another language, especially English that is the global language; moreover all science use English so, with English, we do not only learn language because if we know how we use language and know the meanings, we can learn other subjects (Rachel).

What Rachel states above, and is confirmed by her friends, illustrates her positive attitudes about learning English as a global language. EFL pre-service teachers are optimistic with regard to the prospects of EFL teachers in the future. Being aware of the importance of English language in globalisation, they are confident that their chosen profession to be EFL teachers has long-term relevance.

To my mind, English language in globalisation era is something which is very crucial because people can master the world especially, a job like a good job, with that good position if someone can master English so… why I became an English teacher is because English language teacher is a stick for someone else to obtain a success, so this job is promising in the future (Denny).

What Deny expresses also shows a positive response to the English language which is considered crucial for her future. Other similar positive responses are expressed below:

English teacher in Indonesia is very influential because in this era, every day we need English. Open the internet, we use English; sometimes using a hand phone also needs English, so what? Very influential for life, so if we become English teachers, we will have a bright prospect in the future… In my opinion, becoming English teachers in Indonesia offers great prospects because besides English becoming an international language, English becomes one of the ways for accessing knowledge, for example from foreign countries, such as science and technology that is mostly from foreign countries; we look for references also from foreign countries; besides, it is for daily life communication, but it is also for gaining
knowledge. More and more people now need English teachers, so English
teachers are more in demand (Hansel).

Indonesian Government Regulation No. 19/2005 on national education
standards articulates the needs for adjusting the dynamic of local,
national and global social development to actualise the function and goals
of national education. The preamble of the National Education Standard
mentions that to educate the nation requires a national commitment to
improve quality and national competitiveness (Republik Indonesia, 2013).
This articulation provides broad views that may produce wisdom for
Indonesian citizens living in this global era; however, at the same time it
may produce hope for national competition that indirectly may produce
uncertainty for EFL pre-service teachers in facing the challenges of global
demands and employability due to the insufficiency of their capacity.

Predictions about the prospects of EFL teachers are important to
determine the direction of the policy and teacher preparation program
undertaken. Pre-service teachers’ optimism must be accompanied by
effective programs and policies.

However, there appears to be a tension between the positive view of
globalisation in global and national policies, and also present in the views
of many pre-service EFL teachers, and the slightly less positive view
which is often expressed in a range of Indonesian online forums.

While globalisation is perceived to produce several advantages that could
enhance the quality of the nation generally and education more
specifically, at the same time globalisation is viewed by some as
introducing unexpected values that are in tension with those at national or
local levels. Hence although there is a positive view of globalisation there
is also an ambivalence grounded in the existence of a much more
negative view. Arguably this ambivalence presents challenges to those
tasked with implementing the national plan for best responding to
globalisation, as is the case with pre-service EFL teacher education,
which is then tasked with filtering the flows of globalisation that inform the
teaching and learning of English in Indonesian schools.
Moreover, the status of English as a language of globalisation and even power at the global level arguably makes the pre-service EFL teachers rely more fully on English as the medium of instruction in the classroom. Indeed, several of the pre-service teachers indicated that such use of English may not be entirely wise because their students mocked them when they used English. Their students did not want to listen to their English, saying that they were ‘showing-off’: ‘Wah mbaknya sok Inggris’. Here both the pre-service EFL teachers and their engagement with English – as required by policy – are constrained by relations of inferiority and perceived superiority and status. The decision taken by EFL pre-service teachers to use more Indonesian in teaching thus functions as an entirely rational pedagogical strategy under the circumstances.

This also implicitly reveals the presence of ambivalence or lack of pedagogical certainty, which is of course a common experience or feature of policy particularly at schools pertaining to using English as a medium of instruction. There is no strong articulation on the use of English as a medium of instruction in the policy at a national level. Even though Law No. 20/2003 on National Education System (Republik Indonesia, 2003) introduced the concept of foreign language as a language of delivery in certain educational units, it does not strongly emphasise instruction in English. The Law states that a foreign language can be used as a language of instruction at certain education levels to support the students’ ability to use the foreign language (Republik Indonesia 2003, Chapter VII, Article 33, and Clause 3). Such a lack of emphasis by the government, results in various interpretations toward using English language at the classroom level as discussed earlier.

Considering what happens at the practice level related to the issue of learner centeredness discussed much earlier in this Chapter, it is assumed that what is recommended in national and institutional policies regarding a learner-centred approach is still problematic. This poses some questions about the pedagogic competence of the mentor teachers and prospective EFL teachers. How could mentor teachers expect pre-service teachers to perform in terms of what is not recommended in
policy? How could pre-service teachers translate policy into practice at schools regarding innovation, if what is recommended and practiced at campus and stated in policies could not be applied during their FBE in schools?

6.5 Conclusion
While the EFA agenda of improved educational quality is quite explicit, there are still issues of difference, disjuncture, ambivalence and tension at the levels of national and local institutional policy documents and at the level of practice. Enhancing the quality of education as advised in EFA may still be problematic in practice. Even though the global message is supported through its articulation in national and institutional policies and there is some agreement between policies and practice ranging from the global and national to the institutional level, there are also some dimensions of disjuncture and ambivalence.

The differences evident across policies and practice cover several areas, among them pedagogy and content. The pedagogical areas cover learner centeredness, the use of English in the classroom and the use of ICT in teaching English. Those of content include the mastery of English language skills and time investment.

The cases of ambivalence are mostly found in the reflections of EFL pre-service teachers doing teaching practice, however there are also a few examples taken from EFL teachers through online data. The ambivalence experienced by the participants in this study is revealed in several areas. They include the perceptions of EFL teaching as a profession, selecting appropriate learning resources, assessing the learners’ English skills, implementing teaching innovations and meeting global demand.

There are several challenges manifest in the ambivalence expressed by the EFL pre-service teachers. They feel ambivalent in the beginning of their study when entering the teaching profession due to unsupportive public perceptions of the teacher profession. Ambivalence is also evident during their practicum at schools. In fact, this is due to the unsupportive
school culture. The resulting tension based on the disjuncture between the perception of the effects of globalisation and those views expressed in online data may also create ambivalence and potentially challenge EFL pre-service teachers in improving their professionalism in the future.

This study supports previous studies on the use of bilingual practices in teaching English (Hamied, 1997) and the poor English language mastery of EFL teachers in Indonesia by Dardjowidjojo (2000) and Lie (2007).

Some dimensions of disjuncture and ambivalence may indicate that the mandated messages from the global agenda have not been optimally achieved yet. Many points related to disjunctures of pedagogical dimensions are evident. First, learner centeredness is not largely applied in classrooms. A teacher centred approach is still common. This finding confirms the study by Shah (2014) on teachers’ resistance to the teacher centered pedagogy. Second, English as a language of instruction is not optimally used in the classrooms either. Most pre-service EFL teachers use English and Indonesian (bilingually) when teaching English. This finding confirms the study by Hamied (1997) that most EFL teachers use bilingual English and Indonesian in their teaching. As mentioned in Law No. 20/2003 on National Education System that “English can be used as the medium of instruction in secondary and tertiary education” (Republik Indonesia 2003, Chapter VII, Article 33, Clause 3), it is important to interpret that EFL teachers should use as much English as possible when teaching as it would be awkward if EFL teachers did not speak English in their classes. Besides, by speaking English to communicate with their students, EFL teachers can facilitate a conducive English learning environment needed in the success of English learning and acquisition. Third, learning resources and ICT implementations are still problematic. Due to limited financial capacity, it is inevitable that inequity of educational access still occurs. Besides pedagogical dimension, content dimension also experiences disjuncture. Pre-service EFL teachers’ English language proficiency is still insufficient based on their perception. Many pre-service EFL teachers acknowledged that their pronunciation, spelling, grammar and vocabulary were still poor. Therefore, this finding
confirms previous studies by Dardjowidjojo (2000), Hamid (1997), Lie, (2007), Marcellino (2008), Yuwono and Harbon (2010) concerning poor language mastery. As their English will be the model for their students, EFL teachers should have good command of English throughout their careers. Thus, the education reform proposed by Madya (2009) concerning EFL teacher professional competencies is essential to uphold. This study contributes to understanding the gap between mandated messages and practice. The illustration of the issues among policy documents and practice provides a basis for finding ways of minimising the problems of development programs in Indonesia.

Some ways to achieve quality education mandated in the EFA agenda can be followed up by looking at the issues addressed in this Chapter. In addition, some efforts to eradicate disjuncture and to reduce ambivalence and the resulting tension must be enhanced through finding alternatives, such as continuing promotion and real actions that produce awareness in people regarding the benefits of high quality education.
Chapter 7
Conclusion and Implications
7. Conclusion and Implications

7.1 Introduction

Pre-service teacher education institutions around the world are urged to produce quality graduates who will be able to meet the requirements of global markets. Yet it is claimed that many teachers, who are mostly graduates from teacher training institutions, are of low quality (Chang et al., 2014; Lie, 2007; Madya, 2009; Marcellino, 2008). Chapter 1 outlined the importance of adequately preparing prospective EFL teachers to address the need for quality education systems. A wide range of literature shows that teachers are crucial assets if education systems are to deliver high quality education.

The formation of quality EFL teachers is an ongoing process. It begins with preparing novice teachers and proceeds through to advanced preparation and continuing professional development as they continue in their occupation. This formation of quality EFL teachers is influenced by social, economic, political and cultural processes of change. Such influences are particularly reflected in the policies, EFL pre-service teachers’ experiences, blogs and newspapers assembled in this study. The present research is informed by Appadurai’s (1996) notion of global cultural flows, and the five global flows underpinning his theory provide insights into how the policy documents, interview data and electronic resources co-constitute the notion of quality EFL teachers. However, of the five scapes, in this particular study the ideo-scape is revealed as the most dominant one. The movement of ideas from a global agenda into local institutional contexts around quality, quality teachers and quality education could easily be traced. This supports the decision to apply the theoretical framework in this study to provide insights into how the formation of quality EFL teachers is influenced by institutional policies and practices.

For these reasons, in Chapter 7 I explore how EFL teacher education programs, policy makers, prospective EFL teachers and practising EFL
teachers can become more aware of the global challenge and the need for sustainable development in establishing quality teachers in a globalised world. In Chapter 7 I present the key ideas and findings drawn from each Chapter, I then illustrate the implications of the research findings for policy and practice. Next I revisit critical theory of Appadurai’s global flows used in this study and end with suggestions for further research.

Through extracting the key findings, I reflect the contribution of those who are directly and indirectly engaged and affected by this study. This study may provide meaningful insights towards the formation of quality EFL teachers not only locally and nationally but also in the broader context of teacher preparation globally. What becomes most apparent in this final Chapter is the importance of ‘beyond classroom’ practices as key influences in the quality pedagogy being developed by prospective EFL teachers in Central Java.

7.2 Key insights from each chapter
Chapter 1 began by describing the background of the study. The low performance of schooling outcomes triggered the need for improving the quality of the education system in Indonesia. In particularly the concern in this study was to address the quality of EFL teachers, who are the agents of change in globalised contexts. The role of English in a non-English speaking country such as Indonesia and the expected EFL teacher competence for graduate employability is an important dimension in the global context. The context is also significant and relates to what an EFL teacher is and does in Indonesia according to social and cultural expectations, law and the prospective teachers themselves. Next I detailed the aim and purpose of the study which was to explore the alignments and issues in the formation of quality EFL teachers across global, national and local institutional policy texts and EFL teaching practice in Surakarta, Central Java. This is significant in understanding various ideas and practices regarding quality, quality education and quality EFL teaching reproduced by global agendas through the media.
which informs local practice. The significance is addressed in preparing and graduating quality EFL teachers for local, national and global employability. Chapter 1 also included a disjuncture that I myself experienced which strengthened the evidence addressing the problems in quality improvement.

To answer the research questions, understanding issues highlighted in the literature was important in order to see the gaps and extend the views of this literature. Thus in Chapter 2 I presented a synthesis of relevant debates related to notions of globalisation and quality. In the early part of Chapter 2 I noted that there were various views of globalisation shifting from the modern era into the postmodern era. The modern era was noted to begin in the 18th century. This period of modernity emerged at a time when Indonesia was under colonial role, and therefore it is relevant to include colonialism as well as bureaucracy as a key factor shaping education at this time. During the colonisation, the feeling of uncertainty experienced by the colonised emerged which manifested in ambivalence. This ambivalence was noted to be the transition to the postmodern era. Chapter 2 also explicates Appadurai’s scapes reshaping globalisation.

Globalisation is linked to challenges in educational provision, and challenges for EFL teachers engaging in the notion of quality and quality teachers in the context of globalisation. Describing the issues in quality EFL teacher preparation and EFL teaching generally in the global context, and more specifically related to the issues on teaching innovation and English as a medium of instruction in the Indonesian context, is also important for understanding the universal features of EFL teacher preparation. The notion of neoliberalism was introduced to emphasise the impact of the complexity in the discussion of globalisation in pre-service teacher education programs. Chapter 2 ended with a description of the policy agendas and texts in which the notion of neoliberalism emerged in the formation of quality EFL teachers in Indonesia.
Chapter 3 outlined problems to be considered in generating data about the complex issues related to the influence of policy documents, interviews and electronic resources in the formation of EFL teachers. At the beginning of Chapter 3 I described the research paradigm that guided me in the selection of the research methodology, including issues regarding the truth covering the epistemology and ontology under the critical paradigm. I developed a multi-layered framework for investigating this issue based on the view that a social theory framework applied to investigate the meanings that the data produced, without awareness of the participants and the context in which data was generated, would give only half the story. For that reason I collected policy texts, interviews and electronic resources. This produced complex data sources. All the data were assembled and read using key features of Appadurai’s global cultural flows.

Drawing on this complex set of artefacts, Chapter 4 identified the presence and effects of ideas related to the notion of quality emerging from global, national and local institutional policy texts. In macro discourse, the idea of ‘quality’ is repeatedly linked to neoliberal ideas, such as learning crises, transparency, accountability, competition, mobility and employability. The notion of a learning crisis has been produced by the international policies and education community. This crisis is manufactured in relation to lack of attention to quality education. In neoliberal terms, recovery from crisis requires greater transparency and accountability in monitoring progress to improve quality education initiatives. Additionally, global competition, mobility and employability are encouraged in the teaching workforce as these terms present challenges for quality and therefore, the demand for high quality teachers is promoted because their tasks are important to prepare their students in facing global competition and employability triggered by the free market. The notion of a free market – an important idea in neoliberal ideology – also generates the demand to improve quality education regionally, and skilled workers are needed to take up the employment challenges created
by mobility of goods and services (including education) in a global economy.

In micro discourse, the idea of quality is linked to the teaching of the English language. In relation to improving the quality of English teaching, ideas about learner centeredness, the importance of English in Indonesia, the significance of standards in achieving quality and the use of ICT in teaching were elaborated on in Chapter 4.

Chapter 4 also revealed the influence of neoliberal ideas on the education system in general and specifically on English language teaching and the formation of quality EFL teachers. Specifically, a particular discourse of quality appears in global monitoring reports and national and local institutional policy documents such that policy texts reflect substantial homogeneity and synchronicity when establishing the features of quality systems and quality teachers. This also means that neoliberal ideas have contributed to the shaping of quality EFL teaching and quality EFL teachers in Indonesia through their experience of teaching practice. Other global flows, such as ethno-scape, finance-scape and media-scape also played a minor role in informing the construction of quality EFL teachers. However, in this study the effects of these scapes are less dominant in the data. It appears that the ideo-scape plays the dominant role within that global idea of neoliberalism and the capacity of media, financial processes and rewards, people mobility, and technological advancements.

Chapter 5 examined the similarities and differences found in policy texts and how they construct quality EFL teachers. Significantly, many values-based subjective features – social, affective, moral, and creative – are associated with quality teachers. Three dominant areas related to objective features were identified: pedagogy, English language and ICT. The similar ideas on subjective and objective characteristics among EFA global monitoring reports and other global reports, national education policies and local institutional policies showed substantial homogeneous dimensions in constituting quality EFL teachers in some respects.
Following Appadurai (1996) this study argues a strong degree of homogeneity across global education policy, Indonesian national teacher education policy and local institutional policy, creating an alignment across the policy documents on what constitutes quality EFL teachers. Evidence of homogeneity suggests accepted values across borders from global to national to local spaces. This may result in facilitating the process of development.

The global movement of ideas in terms of subjective features, such as social justice, democracy, creativity and autonomy shows that the flow of ideas along ideo-scapes may influence the formation of quality EFL teachers. These subjective features had influence in terms of how diversity and social justice are to be respected. In addition to that, the objective dimension identified also revealed the global movement of ideas in terms of pedagogy, English language competence and ICT. The similar ideas in the areas of pedagogy identified by the AITSL framework show homogeneous ideas in the formation of quality EFL teachers in a national context in a different nation, Australia. As a similar point in relation to the importance of English and ICT, the global movement of ideas ‘arrives’ at local contexts in such a way that it provides acceptability and disjuncture in those two areas.

At the same time, some discrepancies were found among global, national and local institutional policies in the subjective and objective dimension in establishing quality EFL teachers. With respect to Appadurai’s framework is recognition of the interrelationships among global flows which can be characterised by the presence of heterogeneity and difference. For example, the absence of faith in the global agenda differs from national and local institutional policy texts. The global agenda is a secular based policy. Indonesia has a spiritual based policy.

In the context of learning English as a foreign language in non-English speaking countries, such as Indonesia, discrepancies may potentially occur due to some efforts toward strengthening national identity and preserving local values.
These discrepancies may also cause different interpretations in each local institution regarding the formation of quality teachers. A difference between policies in regards to English as a medium of instruction in EFL teacher education institutions demonstrates an unsupportive atmosphere for obtaining English language skills required by quality EFL teachers. Policy makers need to consider this difference as a concern in producing quality EFL teachers. The absence of policy statements regarding the use of English as a medium of instruction in English lessons, may indeed contribute to the formation of unqualified EFL teachers, especially in obtaining English competence, instead of the desired quality EFL teachers. Additionally, a disjuncture on learner centeredness may indicate either the lack of awareness of the global message by local institutions or the lack of acceptability of learner centeredness in the local context; teacher centeredness may be more favoured in application.

Chapter 6 takes up the issue of ‘practice’, examining how understandings of quality EFL teacher construction are influenced by global, national and local institutional policies in which values are both synchronous and disjunct at the practice level. The disjuncture and tension the EFL prospective teachers experience and the resulting ambivalence suggests that preparing quality EFL teachers is still problematic in Indonesia. This may lead to greater challenges for EFL pre-service teachers in teaching English and EFL teachers’ professionalism in the future. Thus, achieving globally competitive education outcomes is challenging in the present and in the future. It means that enhancing the quality of education as advised in EFA may still be problematic at the level of practice. Even though the global message is articulated in national and institutional policy texts and there are some agreements between policies and practice ranging from global, national to local institutional level, there are some dimensions of difference experienced at the level of practice.

The differences across policies and practice cover several areas, including pedagogy and content. The pedagogical areas cover learner centeredness, the use of English in the classroom, and the use of ICT in teaching English. The content includes the mastery of English language
skills and the time investment. The disagreement manifest in tension can be seen in the area of subjective values, such as social competence.

Chapter 6 emphasised three elements of ambivalence. Some dimensions of disjuncture are a sign that the mandated message is not being achieved and this creates ambivalence amongst the EFL prospective teachers and students. As noted, the EFA has mandated for enhancing public perception of teachers and selecting appropriate learning resources, however some prospective EFL teachers experience ambivalence in responding to those messages. The ambivalence is evident in EFL pre-service teachers’ reflection on teaching practice and also from EFL teachers through online data. These instances of ambivalence indicate that the mandated message in policies may not be optimally achieved. It means the development programs promoted in the global agenda and in which the Indonesian government participate in are not fully welcome at the level of practice. Consequently, the flow of the message of sustainable quality education is interrupted and the ideal quality EFL teachers are only dreams. Therefore, continuing the promotion and real actions that produce awareness in people toward the benefits of high quality education need to be enhanced.

7.3 Implications for policy and practice

There is no doubt that global, national and local institutional policies are having profound effects on the formation of teachers through teacher education programs, curriculum and local practices.

This study has extended our understanding of the relations between global, national and local institutional policy texts and the tangible ways in which their effects shape the construct of quality teachers and hence the formation of EFL quality teachers and EFL pre-service teachers’ experiences of teaching. The findings show that the global, national and local institutional policy documents contribute to the formation of quality EFL teachers. Appadurai’s conceptualisation of global flows provides a way of understanding how events, practices, professionalising
tendencies, and standards, emerge from global agenda to take up influence in national mandates and local practice in the formation of quality EFL teachers. What is most significant for this study is the way in which “globalising and localising processes... feed and reinforce each other rather than being mutually exclusive” (Powell & Steel, 2011, p. 76).

The key findings of this study have implications across the various administrative and academic levels of ministries, universities, teacher training faculties, and English departments, as well as in the lives and career planning of EFL teachers and prospective EFL teachers. Also this study gives insights for international agencies to take up ways to promote good quality pre-service teacher education programs in order to produce good quality teachers. In the following section I address implications of the above findings for several levels of engagement with EFL teacher education. In all, four issues are addressed: the extent to which stakeholders are aware of global flows shaping the formation of education systems and education practice; values based influences in quality provision; the degree to which school infrastructure and resources facilitate the flow of pedagogical ideas; and alignment of practicum investment.

7.3.1 Awareness of global dynamics

Emerging ideas about quality as they flow from global to local institutional policy texts reveal shared understandings about the neoliberal ideas that inform contemporary policies. This is evidence to suggest that neoliberal ideas influence the formation of quality teachers in general and quality EFL teachers in particular. It means that EFL teacher education institutions will be exposed to neoliberal market discourses that position their graduates within the globally competitive graduate marketplace. This finding supports Kezar’s idea (2004) stating that neoliberalism is transforming all levels of higher education including faculty roles and responsibilities as well as the experiences of individual students. This study also supports Kandiko’s study (2010) examining the effects of neoliberalism on students’ experiences in college in different countries.
The emerging notion on quality discourse among policy documents across levels from global to local in constituting EFL quality teachers is benefiting the government to some extent because their development programs are facilitated. This means that global awareness is responded to positively in the locally institutional context. It also means that the development programs that the government has carried out are supported nationally and locally. However, the difference in ideas present across the policy documents and in practice become evidence that to some extent, global awareness is still lacking in the local institutional level. This means that some development programs to prepare quality teachers are not optimally supported. Therefore, government is still required to consider several aspects that can increase global awareness in local context in relation to preparing quality EFL teachers in responding to the demands of global market employability. Two aspects are identified for responding global awareness for employability, namely: the need to use English as a language of instruction for EFL pre-service teacher education institutions; and an understanding of globalisation.

First, to respond to global awareness for gaining competition in global employability, governments need to be aware of the use of English as a language of instruction for pre-service EFL teachers, which is not optimally supported in the policy articulation of policy. The need for articulation in using English as the language of instruction has been stated but with less emphasis, and has not addressed specifically EFL teacher formation. For the sake of improving EFL teachers’ English language skills to prepare for global employability, it is important to include articulation on the necessity of using English as the medium of instruction in the regulations at the teacher training institutions. This must then be followed up by lecturers to use English during their teaching. It is unrealistic to expect pre-service EFL teachers to use English while the lecturers themselves do not speak English during their instruction.

Second, to respond to the increasing competition for employability regionally and nationally, it is essential for pre-service EFL teachers in a local context to have an awareness of how global flows shape their local
practice. Pre-service EFL teachers will not only be employed locally and will not only compete with local people for employment, they will also compete with a teaching workforce that has been trained elsewhere and seeks employment in the region. By having a global understanding that they can articulate in response to regional, national and local practices, pre-service teachers can enhance their employability and ability to interpret curriculum and policy. This awareness will also assist them to address the often negative interpretations applied to education provision by politics, the media and other sources.

In addition, extending international networks for internship programs for pre-service teachers may be an alternative that government could consider, to enhance pre-service teachers’ experience of teaching practice in the global context.

Locally, policy makers at a university level need to respond coherently to the government development programs. The substantial synchronicity across policy documents and practice in relation to the notion of quality brings some implications for vice-chancellors to be responsive to global messages, if they consider global employability to be among the end products orienting the institutions. The graduates of EFL teacher education should not only be prepared for local and national but also global employability. Additionally they need to consider the global issues and agendas contributing to EFL teacher professionalism. In relation to English as the language of instruction, lack of English language competence should be addressed with visible and strong institutional policy articulation toward using English as a medium of instruction for pre-service EFL teachers.

The existing issues on the perceived communicative competence and English language capacity of EFL pre-service teachers, implicitly means that what is idealised in the policies for quality EFL teachers is not yet optimally obtained. The minimal use of English as a medium of instruction in the classroom, due to the inadequate policy articulation on English use, may contribute to this insufficiency because it causes an unsupportive
learning atmosphere for acquiring the English language skills required by professional EFL teachers. Such unclear articulation on the use of English or its absence in the curriculum and local policy texts, shows negotiating ideas regarding the context that English is a foreign language; however this uncertainty weakens the conditions to achieve the success of English language teaching. If we hold the idea that the success of acquiring and learning English is through maximised use of English, there should be strong policy statements on using English as a medium of instruction in English lessons, especially to achieve professional EFL teachers’ competence – English communicative competence – for English Department graduates. Additionally, at the department level, lecturers under the coordination of the heads of English departments are recommended to initiate delivery of the subject matter using English language, including in daily communication with students of English departments, in order to facilitate improving the English language competence of the prospective graduates.

Global awareness needs to be exposed to pre-service EFL teachers. They need to be aware of the global challenges for global employability. Preparing themselves for their future to gain opportunities in the global market should be supported. Improving English language competence must be afforded if they do not want to lose the chance of being globally employed. The old saying, ‘Never wait for something to happen but act’, might be insightful for them in preparing for their future. For example, regarding limited English language exposure in the local context, the students themselves need to be assertive and find opportunities to familiarise themselves with English, making use of electronic media for learning English, which in turn enhances their global horizons of understanding.

The second aspect of global awareness relates to understanding globalisation. As noted previously, the graduates are still to meet local and national needs, but they are not yet projected to global employability. Thus, it is crucial for pre-service teachers to understand globalisation. English department curriculum needs to include this insight to broaden
the horizon of pre-service teachers to anticipate global challenges. If the institutional curriculum could accommodate this idea, graduates may develop global understandings that facilitate them in entering and attaining global employment. In addition to the above points, understanding globalisation as Zhao (2010) recommends for professional EFL teachers is not visible in the local institutional curriculum; it is apparent that government and policy makers consider such understandings as part of the graduate outcomes of EFL teacher education programs. Such changes in the EFL teacher curriculum may also enhance graduate competence for employability outcomes locally and nationally as well as globally.

Furthermore, an alternative to providing global understanding could be in the form of external activities providing international or global experience for EFL pre-service teachers. Teacher training institutions need to provide apprenticeships with international networks so that the prospective teachers can have international insights, knowledge, networks and confidence for global employability.

7.3.2 Values-based influences in quality provision

Neoliberal ideas affecting quality education suggests that the government needs to upgrade policy standards to adjust to global market demand. Clear upgraded criteria articulated in the policy standards are required to provide possibilities for graduates to enter the international market and may be an alternative for improving quality outcomes for participating in the global market. Three aspects will be considered in relation to standards, namely: the selection criteria for the teaching profession; learner-centred pedagogy in the learning process; and the falsification of marks. Low perception of the EFL pre-service teachers’ chosen profession demonstrated through their ambivalence suggests that the government needs to reconsider selection criteria and processes for pre-service teachers and articulate these in policies. Selecting the best candidates for prospective teachers, as Singapore and Finland do to
produce quality teachers, is one alternative for producing quality teachers in Indonesia.

In Singapore, candidates are chosen from the top third of high school graduates. In Finland, selection is highly competitive, with only about 10% of applicants gaining entrance to teacher education programmes (UNESCO, 2014, p. 234).

Chen also confirmed that “getting the right people to teach is only the very first step in improving educational quality and learning outcomes” (2009, p. 27). Teaching is considered an elite profession in Finland and the teaching profession requires a research based master's degree in education (Saunders, 2017; Määttä, Uusiautti & Paksuniemi, 2013; Sahberg, 2007). So, in Finland, in regard to student selection, it is imperative for those who enter the teaching profession to have a master level education as well as highly competitive skills. The idea is to prepare pre-service teachers with the ability to independently analyse and solve educational problems (Määttä et.al, 2013). In South Korea, the selection requires applicants from the top 5% of the high school academic cohort (Auguste, Kihn & Miller, 2010). In Australia according to Gore, Barron, Holmes and Smith, “the Federal and State departments of education have implemented policy measures to ensure that all teachers are within the ‘top 30%’ of the population in literacy and numeracy achievement (2016, p. 528). The above study also confirmed that a national set of standards and procedures for initial teacher education programs has been introduced by the Australian Institute for Teaching and School Leadership (AITSL, 2011) and noted that a high level of personal literacy and numeracy is required if applicants are to consider themselves equal to the top 30 per cent of the population (Gore et al., 2016).

In the researched Full Moon and Sun universities, the low interest of pre-service teachers towards the teaching profession, which is not in accordance with the global message to maintain quality teachers, suggests that at the institutional level, vice-chancellors and deans need to further consider all the available criteria in order to maintain the best results. For example, ‘loving’ the teaching profession and genuinely
wanting ‘to make a difference’, could be part of the criteria for entrance selection into programs. The local institutional policy in recruiting candidates proposed above could be followed up by heads of departments and understood by lecturers and other staff in order to promote recruitment of the best candidates.

Pre-service teachers have to realise that the teaching profession is a noble profession that requires professional commitment. If they want to keep going to become teachers, they have to love and uphold the teaching profession, to be committed to the profession and undertake their teaching tasks professionally. Their full commitment to being teachers is required to contribute to better quality teaching.

Another issue in relation to how standards are not met is due to teachers falsifying the marks of students’ English language skills. This suggests that governments should evaluate the implementation of the policy on standards. Otherwise, the quality of outputs will remain low and the policy is a waste. This requires further action from schools as the institution that should be responsible for disseminating and elaborating quality standards of education to stakeholders and society in general. The teachers need to be taught that to maintain their role regarding quality teaching; they need to uphold the policy. However policy makers also need to consider what actually happens in practice. Therefore, further study in terms of policy implementation should be conducted to see progress in practice. There should also be a forum as a bridge among policy makers, teachers, and stakeholders to synchronise the vision and to achieve optimal goals.

A third aspect of improving Standards relates to learner-centred learning processes. The disjuncture found across policy documents and practice on learner-centred pedagogy (LCP) indicate less than optimal strategies on this area of concern emphasised by UNESCO through EFA and by the United Nations more generally through MDGs as a way to improve quality education. It means also that teacher-centred approaches are still favoured among Indonesian EFL pre-service teachers and teachers. Thus, what is mandated in the policies in regard to active learning
strategies and learner centeredness is not implemented. This suggests that government and related bodies and organisations should revisit the applicability of LCP in the Javanese context. If LCP, which is mandated in the EFA agenda, is to be implemented at a local context then government needs to articulate this strongly in the regulations in order for it to be followed up at lower administrative levels. Ongoing professional development activities on LCP should be carried out more intensively for mentor teachers nationally.

In accord with that, the university level should adhere to the idea of upholding learner-centred pedagogy more intensively. There should be intensive monitoring at schools by the university during student practicums to make sure the implementation of LCP in schools is in fact occurring.

It is also recommended that heads of the departments, together with lecturers, mentor teachers, and EFL pre-service teachers, facilitate ‘Sarasehan’ – to discuss and share – regarding the issue of LCP in order to achieve the stated goals in the department curriculum more effectively and enhance the global awareness at the department level.

Regarding the process of development – in many areas being facilitated by a strong degree of synchronicity among education policy documents in relation to subjective and objective elements on quality – there are potential elements of development that can be maximised. This suggests that government should take a stronger position to uphold subjective values in the national development process. Government needs to be aware that developing EFL quality teachers involves both subjective and objective entities, and that developing quality teachers doesn’t rely on objective measurements only: unmeasurable entities that manifest in subjective features also need to be considered. While adopting global messages, the government needs to promote subjective criteria to produce responsible citizens who will be members of the global community, and promote local and national values, to strengthen national identity in global affairs.
At the university level, subjective features should not be ignored when preparing quality graduates. Developing pre-service teachers’ subjective values are important in preparing them to be responsible citizens who will participate in a global community. Subjective values rooted in local wisdom and national values need to be strengthened in order to respect national and local differences.

### 7.3.3 Relations between infrastructure and outcomes

The difference between policy and practice in ICT implementation provides evidence that suggests government should provide fair distribution of infrastructure. This disjunction also demonstrates the evidence that regardless of EFA intentions, disparities continue to persist in terms of available learning opportunities due to limited availability of technology in many schools in Central Java. Therefore, the availability of technology in the classroom should be afforded and the government needs to make sure of its effective implementation so that the availability of ICT facilitates learning. Otherwise, the gaps in the learning experience between students from poor school facilities and those from rich ones will be widened.

In addition, government also needs to make sure that quality education goes to all Indonesian people so that this will later result in non-discriminatory quality outcomes. Any effect on education triggered by neoliberal ideas, such as limited access to ICT in learning and appropriate school infrastructure, need attention from the government. They need to facilitate broader access to ICT in learning and appropriate school infrastructure for the poor. Otherwise, social justice will only be a dream if many Indonesian people still can’t obtain quality education.

The unavailability of ICT infrastructure in schools also affects the implementation of a learner-centred pedagogy. The implementation of learner centred pedagogy will not be optimal if the school’s infrastructure is not sufficient. Insufficient learning resources demotivate student engagement; consequently optimal student achievement cannot be reached. Accordingly, the government needs to improve infrastructure
that can facilitate learner centeredness to produce effective teaching. Furthermore, more visible policy statements to create a more conducive school culture for facilitating learner-centred pedagogy should be articulated in government policy.

**7.3.4 Alignment of practicum investment through global/local awareness**

It is necessary to reconsider the effectiveness of practicum timing, which comes late in the range of courses and which does not provide a foundation for globally prepared EFL teachers. Even though a change in 2015 resulted in more time for internship which was also provided earlier in a course (for example during semester 2), the effectiveness of student internships may need to be revisited. As advised in the EFA agenda, time investment contributes to better quality outcomes. Matching statements in the national and local institutional policy texts about when, where and how time is invested would give greater visibility to the micro- and filed-based teaching contributions to quality teacher formation.

The idea stated in the global agenda, giving more opportunities for pre-service teachers to practice teaching, enables pre-service teachers to obtain professional skills that they feel they are lacking. To provide the foundation for globally prepared EFL teachers, it is important for the government to provide policy that enables pre-service teachers to have more intensive practicums and flexibility to choose schools independently in order that they can invest optimal times for learning to teach. However this seems to produce another problem too since most students would naturally want to choose the few best schools. This implies also that the government should allow pre-service teachers to choose internship programs across countries. Consequently, universities, faculties and departments should be required to provide flexibility for pre-service teachers to undertake practicum in schools or learning centre wherever they can invest their teaching time optimally. It means that these institutions would be required to extend their networks for teaching practice, either nationally or globally. Through this strategy, pre-service teachers would be required to build social relationships, networks and
teaching profession exposure from the beginning of their study at teacher education institutions.

With regard to improving professional knowledge, professional practice and profesional engagement, pre-service teachers also need to be made aware of lifelong learning for improving their teaching professionalism. It is not enough for them to gain teaching profesional knowledge only from teacher education institutions; they also need to develop autonomous sources of alternative learning and professionalism networks for sustainable career development.

**Revisiting critical theory and suggestions for further research**

The general finding showing the emerging ideas in the global, national and institutional policy texts and EFL pre-service teachers’ experiences produces some implications related to social theory on globalisation. These ideas strengthen the evidence of the applicability of Appadurai’s theory of global flows to EFL teacher construction and EFL language teaching. The ability of this theory to explicate extends understanding and provides insights on how the mobility of human beings (EFL policy makers, EFL teachers, EFL learners and indeed, tourists), finance, ideas, technology, and media affect EFL teaching and the formation of quality EFL teachers. This presents a very complex landscape for researchers. The ‘glocal’ relations of the cultural economy of education are interactive. The “intertwining and fluid landscapes help us to see the dynamic between homogenization and heterogenisation at play every [sic] in these disjunctures between these global flows” (Powell & Steel, 2011a, p. 75).

Therefore, my study contributes to providing insights into Indonesian policy making and Indonesian EFL teacher education in understanding the complexities of the formation of quality EFL teachers.

However this study still leaves some issues to need further following up. The specific finding in relation to a disjuncture on learner centeredness may need further exploration. The indicated tendency of most pre-service teachers to favour applying teacher-centred pedagogy in teaching
practice at school needs to be followed up to know whether they lack awareness of the global message by local institutions or whether there is a lack of acceptability of learner centeredness in the local context. This requires further study. Furthermore, it is also wise for the government to reconsider the money spent for professional development programs to promote learner centeredness if the trained teachers don’t apply it in real classrooms. Therefore, it would be insightful to carry out further study to understand the effectiveness of the implementation of learner-centred pedagogy. In addition, further research is needed on the appropriateness of the implementation of active learning and learner-centred theories in the Javanese context.
References


266


Darling-Hammond, L. (1998). Teacher learning that supports student learning. Educational Leadership, 55(5). Retrieved from http://cdu.summon.serialssolutions.com/2.0.0/link/0/eLvHCXMw3V1NS8QwEA3qSRD8WnH9gB7EW3WTGlz8LAsK-JJ2PVc2iZVYa2LbcGf70zTtN2i4Nlrk0KZCTNvppP3CHHiELKcgM


(Deconstruction and the possibility of justice). *Cardozo Law Review, 11*(5-6), 920.


275


Maulia, E. (2008, May 2). Teacher certification a hope amid concerns about quality. *The Jakarta Post*. Retrieved from http://cdu.summon.serialssolutions.com/link/0/eLvHCXMwY2BQMDNPMKuxBJ1smbJukGaabGFhaJBqkJyWnAja4WnpinJT17ibKIOfmGuLsoQsrF eNTcnKAgjVnlYnTZyDPA0FCMgTcRtPA7rwS8QS4yF70XtTixMKf1Cz3Xn5jLw7ABAEnILQ


Republik Indonesia. (2013). Peraturan pemerintah Republik Indonesia no 32 tahun 2013 tentang perubahan atas peraturan pemerintah no 19 tahun


Tiffany, Y. & Hiu, W. (n.d.). Compare and contrast the notion of modernity with the notion of post modernity or late modernity: Why is this conceptualization important for sociology? Retrieved from https://www.researchgate.net/publication/265117305_Compare_and_contrast_the_notion_of_modernity_with_the_notion_of_post_modernity_or_late_modernity_Why_is_this_conceptualization_important_for_sociology


Appendices
Appendix 1: Plain Language Statement and Consent Form

PLAIN LANGUAGE STATEMENT

Title of the project: Becoming an EFL teacher in Central Java: The experience of “teaching practice” components in pre-service teacher education

Principal investigator: Koesoemo Ratih

Purpose of the study: to investigate the experience of prospective teachers in learning to teach English during their pre-service training program in Central Java, particularly during the practicum.

Your participation: I will be very happy and grateful if you are willing to participate in this project. However, participation is voluntary and there is no compensation for your involvement, although I hope you may find it useful for your professional practice in your future career. In any case you may refuse to participate if you do not care to. If you decide to participate now and later you change your mind, you will also be free to withdraw at any time.

What would be expected of you? In this project, I would like to record three interviews with you in the Indonesian language during the period when you are undertaking your practicum (once during microteaching and twice during field experience at schools). I want to ask about your experience in learning to teach through both microteaching and field experience program at schools, and your background and interest in becoming an EFL teacher. I also want to collect your teaching journals, ask you to write about your teaching experience in emails, and your permission to study any video recording made of teaching practice as well.

Confidentiality: All of the above material, including the recordings and notes on the interviews, will be kept fully confidential, to be heard or read only by the researcher in this project. When I will use the information for
my thesis or in presentations, or publications, I will not mention your name or give any information that would identify you.

**Results of the study:** I will be pleased to provide you with a copy of any written reports or publications resulting from this study if you would like to have one.

**Contact information:** If you have any questions or complain about this study, you can contact the researcher or the Human Research Ethics Committee of Charles Darwin University.

The researcher: Koesoemo Ratih: email Ratih.koesoemo@cdu.edu.au or phone +61 8 XXXX-XXXX (PhD office); +61 XXX XXXX XXXX (Aus mobile)

The Human Research Ethics Committee of Charles Darwin University: email cduethics@cdu.edu.au, phone +61 8 XXXX XXXX or mail the Research Office, Charles Darwin University, Darwin NT 0909.

PERNYATAAN

**Judul Penelitian:** Becoming an EFL teacher in Central Java: The experience of “teaching practice” components in pre-service teacher education

**Peneliti utama:** Koesoemo Ratih

**Tujuan penelitian:** menginvestigasi pengalaman belajar mengajar para calon guru bahasa Inggris di Fakultas keguruan dan ilmu pendidikan di Jawa Tengah dalam kegiatan mikro teaching dan PPL.

**Partisipasi anda:** Peneliti sangat senang dan menyampaikan terimakasih sedalam-dalamnya jika anda bersedia berpartisipasi dalam penelitian ini. Keterlibatan anda dalam penelitian ini sukarela dan tidak ada kompensasi apapun. Anda boleh menolak untuk tidak berpartisipasi. Seandainya anda telah memutuskan untuk berpartisipasi dan kemudian anda berubah pendapat dan ingin keluar dari partisipasi dalam penelitian ini, anda boleh melakukannya. Namun demikian, dengan turut berpartisipasi dalam
penelitian ini, anda akan memperoleh manfaat yang menunjang tugas professional anda sebagai guru dikemudian hari.

**Apa yang perlu anda lakukan?** Dalam penelitian ini, peneliti akan merekam wawancara yang dilakukan dalam bahasa Indonesia. Peneliti akan menanyakan pengalaman belajar mengajar anda selama kegiatan microteaching dan PPL. Peneliti juga akan bertanya tentang latar belakang dan minat anda menjadi guru bahasa Inggris, meminta anda untuk mengumpulkan jurnal mengajar, meminta anda menulis di email tentang pengalaman mengajar anda dan mengkopi CD rekaman praktek mengajar anda.

**Kerahasiaan:** Rekaman dan catatan yang dikumpulkan selama penelitian akan dijaga kerahasiaannya dan hanya akan dibaca dan didengar oleh peneliti. Peneliti akan menggunakan informasi yang diperoleh untuk disertasi, presentasi dan publikasi. Nama anda tidak akan ditulis atau disebutkan.

**Hasil penelitian:** Peneliti dengan senang hati akan memberikan foto kopi dari laporan penelitian atau publikasi jika anda menghendaki.

**Informasi yang bisa dihubungi:** jika ada keluhan atau ada sesuatu yang ingin ditanyakan, hubungi peneliti atau Komite Etik Charles Darwin University berikut ini:

Peneliti:

Koesoemo Ratih: email Ratih.koesoemo@cdu.edu.au

The Human Research Ethics Committee of Charles Darwin University: email cduethics@cdu.edu.au
CONSENT FORM

PROJECT TITLE: Becoming an EFL teacher in Central Java: the experience of learning to teach English in the pre-service teacher education

I,…………………………………………………………………………………………..

Hereby consent to participate in a study to be undertaken by Koesoemo Ratih, the PhD student in education of Charles Darwin University and I understand that the purpose of the research is to investigate prospective English foreign language teachers’ experience of learning to teach English during their pre-service training program in Central Java, particularly during the practicum (microteaching and field experience programs).

I acknowledge that:

• Any information that I provide will not be released in an identified form
• Aggregated results will be used for research purposes and may be reported in scientific and academic journals
• Individual results will not be released to any person except at my request and my authorisation
• I am free to withdraw my consent at any time during the study, in which event my participation in the research study will immediately cease, and any information obtained will be returned to me or destroyed at my request.

I agree that direct quotes from this interview will be applicable. Yes  No

Signature:…………………………………………………………Date:………………
Formulir Kesediaan untuk Interview

JUDUL PENELITIAN: Becoming an EFL teacher in Central Java: the experience of learning to teach English in the pre-service teacher education

Saya, ………………………………………………………………………………

Dengan ini menyatakan bersedia berpartisipasi dalam penelitian yang dilakukan oleh Koesoemo Ratih, mahasiswa program PhD di Jurusan Education, Charles Darwin University dan saya memahami bahwa tujuan penelitian ini adalah untuk mengeksplorasi pengalaman belajar mengajar para calon guru bahasa Inggris di program studi bahasa Inggris, Fakultas Keguruan dan ilmu pendidikan, khususnya selama kegiatan microteaching dan Program pengalaman lapangan (PPL).

Saya menyetujui bahwa:

- segala informasi yang saya berikan tidak akan diungkap dalam bentuk yang bisa diidentifikasi.
- data yang dikumpulkan akan digunakan untuk tujuan penelitian, disertasi, dan jurnal ilmiah.
- data pribadi tidak akan disebarkan kepada siapapun kecuali atas permintaan atau kuasa saya.
- Saya bebas mengundurkan diri kapan saja selama penelitian ini berlangsung dan jika partisipasi saya dalam penelitian ini tiba-tiba terhenti, segala informasi yang saya berikan akan dikembalikan atau dibuang sesuai permintaan saya.

Saya setuju jika peneliti akan mengutip langsung dari hasil interview ini

Ya    Tidak

Tanda tangan:

Tanggal…
Appendix 2: Questions for Individual Interviews

Questions for Individual Interviews

Interview Protocol

RESEARCH QUESTIONS:

1. What are Indonesian prospective EFL teachers’ experiences of their teaching practice components (microteaching and field experience) in their pre service teacher education?
2. To what extent do these experiences either resonate with or contradict current policy regarding teaching English as a foreign language in Central Java?

Questions for interview

1. In Microteaching
   1.1. After the first turn of teaching practice:

   A. Questions to understand the background (Personal biography/educational biography)
      a. Why did you take English department of teacher training faculty?
      b. Why are you interested in becoming an EFL teacher?

      (Follow up prompt: when did this interest appear? How?)
      c. Where are you from? From suburb, sub urban, or town?
      d. How do you learn English?

   B. Questions to understand the meanings of their experience in teaching practice

      Could you tell me your experience on your first turn of teaching practice?

      (Follow up prompt: Were you confident? Why/ why not?)

   C. Questions to understand their language capacity

      a. What language of instruction did you use?
      b. How did you feel when you used the language?

      (Follow up prompt: Confident/not? Why /why not?)
c. How do you perceive your English language capacity for your teaching practice?

D. Questions to understand relationships between the theory of teaching English and the practice of teaching English.

a. Are you aware of any of the theoretical frames (methods) for teaching English?
b. Which one do you prefer and why?
c. Which one do you least like and why?
d. Have you ever read anything about these theories beyond what is taught in the classroom? (on line)
e. Have you ever spoken to others about these theories – who – what did they say?

1.2. After the final turn of teaching practice:

Questions to understand their teaching practice

a. How did you experience your teaching practice in microteaching after all?
b. Did you feel something changing after your final turn in your teaching practice compared to your first turn? What was it?
c. Which theory/s are did you use?
d. Do you stick to the one only, or do you mix them – why?
e. Which approach do the students seem to like best – why?
f. Which approach to the students seem to dislike – why?
g. Which approach seems to be the most effective in terms of learning outcomes?
h. Can you tell me what the other students might be thinking about the various approaches?
i. Can you identify any particular teaching strategies that you use?
j. Do you feel that there is pressure on you to teach in a particular way?
k. What is the most difficult challenge for you in teaching English?
l. What benefits and problems did you get from taking part in microteaching?

2. In Field experience

2.1. After the first turn:

a. How did you experience your teaching practice at schools?
b. How did you use English in the classrooms? What did you feel?
c. How did perceive your English capacity at this stage for teaching your students?
d. What problems did you encounter in teaching real students?
e. Did microteaching experience contribute to your teaching practice at schools? Which contributes mostly?
f. Is there anything that you would change in you teaching as a result of the micro-teaching?
g. Do you ever think about the relationship between your theory and practice?

2.2. After the final turn:

a. Make a reflection on your teaching practice at schools.
b. What benefits and problems did you get from having real teaching at schools?
c. What do you expect in the future for field experience program?
d. Based on what you have experienced in teaching practice, do you think that you have obtained everything you need to prepare you to EFL teacher?
e. Are you aware of the syllabus/curriculum
f. Are you aware of the policy/s
g. Are you aware of how the policies come about
h. Do you feel that there is pressure on you to teach in a particular way
i. What plans do you have for your teaching career?
Appendix 3: Schedule of data collection

Schedule for Data Collection – February 18 - Dec 17, 2013

### Microteaching session

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Activities</th>
<th>Duration</th>
<th>Place of execution</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Sending PLS to heads of departments and microteaching lecturers</td>
<td>February 18, 2013</td>
<td>Darwin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Meeting the microteaching lecturers, visiting their classes, introducing my project to the students undertaking microteaching subject and recruiting the participants (in a persuasive way to both universities).</td>
<td>2 weeks (March 18- 30)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Making an appointment for the interviews and conducting the interviews</td>
<td>3 weeks (April 1 – 20)</td>
<td>Indonesia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Transcribing (employing advanced students)</td>
<td>3 weeks (April 22-May 11)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>CD recording adapting to student’s turn</td>
<td>6 weeks (April 1- June 15)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>Reading the script, analysing and interpreting</td>
<td>May 12- August 23</td>
<td>Darwin</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Field experience session

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Activities</th>
<th>Duration</th>
<th>Place of execution</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Meeting the participants and conducting the interviews about teaching practice during field experience at schools</td>
<td>1 month (September 1- October 1)</td>
<td>Indonesia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Transcribing</td>
<td>2 weeks (October 2- 16)</td>
<td>Indonesia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Reading the script, analysing and interpreting</td>
<td>October 17- December17)</td>
<td>Darwin</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Appendix 4: Profile of individual interview data

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Names of Participants</th>
<th>Place</th>
<th>Place</th>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Length1) mins</th>
<th>Length2) mins</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Aquila</td>
<td>Campus</td>
<td>Campus</td>
<td>080513</td>
<td>13092013</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Adam</td>
<td>Restaurant</td>
<td>Restaurant</td>
<td>270513</td>
<td>04102013</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Dior</td>
<td>Campus</td>
<td>Campus</td>
<td>140513</td>
<td>13092013</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Denny</td>
<td>Restaurant</td>
<td>Restaurant</td>
<td>270513</td>
<td>04102013</td>
<td>3 (ruined)</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Dewey</td>
<td>Campus</td>
<td>Restaurant</td>
<td>130513</td>
<td>24092013</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Audrey</td>
<td>Campus</td>
<td>Campus</td>
<td>240413</td>
<td>27092013</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Hansel</td>
<td>Campus</td>
<td>Campus</td>
<td>240413</td>
<td>27092013</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Tirka</td>
<td>Campus</td>
<td>Restaurant</td>
<td>260413</td>
<td>21092013</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Illy</td>
<td>Campus</td>
<td>Home</td>
<td>020513</td>
<td>04092013</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Indy</td>
<td>Campus</td>
<td>Restaurant</td>
<td>260413</td>
<td>27092013</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Indiah</td>
<td>Campus</td>
<td>Restaurant</td>
<td>030513</td>
<td>28092013</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Inayah</td>
<td>Campus</td>
<td>Home</td>
<td>240413</td>
<td>12102013</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Henny</td>
<td>Campus</td>
<td>Restaurant</td>
<td>030513</td>
<td>28092013</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>Meriem</td>
<td>Campus</td>
<td>Campus</td>
<td>290413</td>
<td>09092013</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Annie</td>
<td>Campus</td>
<td>Campus</td>
<td>020513</td>
<td>13092013</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>Rudy</td>
<td>Campus</td>
<td>Campus</td>
<td>080513</td>
<td>13092013</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>Redy</td>
<td>Campus</td>
<td>Restaurant</td>
<td>130513</td>
<td>27092013</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>Smith</td>
<td>Campus</td>
<td>Campus</td>
<td>080513</td>
<td>13092013</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>Agustin</td>
<td>Campus</td>
<td>Campus</td>
<td>290413</td>
<td>07092013</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>19.47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>Willy</td>
<td>Campus</td>
<td>Restaurant</td>
<td>240413</td>
<td>20092013</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>Mary</td>
<td>Campus</td>
<td>Home</td>
<td>100513</td>
<td>07092013</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>Maya</td>
<td>Campus</td>
<td>Campus</td>
<td>130513</td>
<td>27092013</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>Evil</td>
<td>Campus</td>
<td>Restaurant</td>
<td>270513</td>
<td>04102013</td>
<td>20</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>Fidey</td>
<td>Campus</td>
<td>Restaurant</td>
<td>020513</td>
<td>20092013</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>Etic</td>
<td>Campus</td>
<td>Restaurant</td>
<td>030513</td>
<td>28092013</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>Inez</td>
<td>Campus</td>
<td>Campus</td>
<td>240413</td>
<td>08102013</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>Klein</td>
<td>Campus</td>
<td>Restaurant</td>
<td>100513</td>
<td>28092013</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28</td>
<td>Hepy</td>
<td>Campus</td>
<td>Restaurant</td>
<td>020513</td>
<td>19092013</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>3 ruined</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td>Andy</td>
<td>Campus</td>
<td>Restaurant</td>
<td>270513</td>
<td>04102013</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Name</td>
<td>Location</td>
<td>Type</td>
<td>Phone</td>
<td>Start Date</td>
<td>Entry Date</td>
<td>Entry Time</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>------------</td>
<td>------------</td>
<td>------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30.</td>
<td>Emilie</td>
<td>Campus</td>
<td>Restaurant</td>
<td>260413</td>
<td>12102013</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31.</td>
<td>Arfi</td>
<td>Campus</td>
<td>Campus</td>
<td>080513</td>
<td>12092013</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32.</td>
<td>Starfi</td>
<td>Campus</td>
<td>Home</td>
<td>100513</td>
<td>07092013</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33.</td>
<td>Cindy</td>
<td>Campus</td>
<td>Restaurant</td>
<td>080513</td>
<td>08102013</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34.</td>
<td>Anisah</td>
<td>Campus</td>
<td>Campus</td>
<td>140513</td>
<td>09092013</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix 5: Summary of the meanings verified to research participants

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Themes</th>
<th>Code Categories</th>
<th>Code</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Emotional experience in teaching real students</td>
<td>Positive</td>
<td>confident, excited, surprised, challenging, patient</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Negative</td>
<td>confused, hard, ignored and unrespected, nervous, sad, shocked, uncomfortable or clumsy, unsatisfied</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Themes</td>
<td>Code Categories</td>
<td>Code</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Participants’ perception of     | Teacher as a knower/                  | doubtful  
| EFL teachers                    | expert/right model                    | pessimistic  
|                                 | Social and cultural meanings          | 1. showing commitment to use English for delivering material  
|                                 |                                        | 2. as expert that becomes a reference for learning English  
|                                 |                                        | 3. something challenging that need tough person due to restriction in local context  
|                                 |                                        | 4. creative person doing multitasking  
|                                 | “service”                              | 5. the one distributing knowledge to students and showing the right thing  
|                                 |                                        | 6. becoming a model for students  
|                                 |                                        | 1. meeting social satisfaction  
|                                 |                                        | 2. comfortable occupation and taking less risk  
|                                 |                                        | 3. flexible occupation for females and full of ease  
|                                 |                                        | 1. facilitating students and building their characters  
|                                 |                                        | 2. religious service- dedicating to God  
|                                 |                                        | 3. promising and potential occupation regarding Indonesia belonging to global community  
|                                 |                                        | 4. giving promise for others in achieving a successful life  
|                                 |                                        | 5. helping students to be aware of English as international language to open  

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Themes</th>
<th>Code Categories</th>
<th>Code</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Challenges in field experience at schools</td>
<td>Managing the classroom</td>
<td>1. school students' responses</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2. skilful at handling class</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3. strategies to make the students engaged</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Showing image/ power as teacher</td>
<td>1. showing power</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2. showing good image at the first meeting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3. keeping distant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>4. feeling underestimated</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>5. changing students' perception of student teacher through calling in order not to be underestimated</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Concern for students' difficulties and follow up</td>
<td>1. building students' characters</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2. building students' motivation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3. carrying out remedial test</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>4. creating group work</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>5. finding the solution through translating and drilling</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Themes</td>
<td>Code Categories</td>
<td>Code</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Problem solving</td>
<td></td>
<td>6. sharing with peers on student’s’ difficulties to get solution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1. coping strategy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2. to make students engaged</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teaching method</td>
<td></td>
<td>1. following their admired teachers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2. learner centred with various teaching techniques</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3. teacher centred</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>4. various teaching media</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>English language delivery</td>
<td>Commitment to use English</td>
<td>1. committed to use English due to keeping English teacher identity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2. vague due to imitating mentor teacher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3. vague due to students’ condition, instead using Indonesian</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Consistency</td>
<td>1. by bilingual</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2. by drilling</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3. by gesture</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>4. grouping the students to have discussion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>5. strategic competence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Themes</td>
<td>Code Categories</td>
<td>Code</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Flexibility</td>
<td>1. using the language of instruction</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. adjusting to mentor teacher's expectation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3. adjusting to the students' condition</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4. adjusting the lesson plan to who expects</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mentor teacher</td>
<td>1. expectation varies in terms of lesson plan, English language delivery, teaching strategy,</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. inefficient (old source, unclear delivery, uninteresting method)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3. different styles of guiding the student teachers</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Language capacity</td>
<td>1. sufficient or enough</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. insufficient due to limited vocabulary</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3. more than enough</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4. need to struggle to adjust to students' level</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Language Instruction:</td>
<td>1. field schools: English is less used than Indonesian</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- English is used more than Indonesian</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- exposure to English</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- reasons: rural, students' condition</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. microteaching: full English</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Themes</td>
<td>Code Categories</td>
<td>Code</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------</td>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>school culture</td>
<td>- mixed English-Indonesian</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1. Indonesian language dominated</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2. lecturing is favoured</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3. low expectations from mentor teachers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>4. low motivated learners</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>5. respecting student teachers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>6. teacher centred (grammar translation method)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>7. limited exposure to English in classroom</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>perception on English language</td>
<td>1. underestimated subject matter</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2. unimportant in vocational schools</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>students' condition</td>
<td>1. high achieving students</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2. low achieving students</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3. pseudo discipline</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>4. undisciplined</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>5. various other conditions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Themes</td>
<td>Code Categories</td>
<td>Code</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Goal of learning English</td>
<td>to achieve communicative competence; to enable learners to communicate</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Curriculum</td>
<td>1. Curriculum 2006 (school based curriculum)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. Curriculum 2013- new</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lesson plan</td>
<td>1. as a guidance for practice</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. as a matter of formality viewed by the mentor teacher</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3. as an administrative matter that can be downloaded</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4. confusing and out of date reference</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5. mismatched concept between microteaching and schools views</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How does power exist?</td>
<td>Innovation</td>
<td>student teachers apply teaching techniques never before done at schools</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Empowering student teachers</td>
<td>1. empowering student teacher to make media that can be applied at school (filling the gap); mentor teacher never uses media so empowering the student teachers to make.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Who has power?</td>
<td>1. mentor Teacher- Student teacher</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. student teacher- students</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Themes</td>
<td>Code Categories</td>
<td>Code</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relationship with mentor teacher</td>
<td>1. distant</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. scary</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3. cooperative</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Safety</td>
<td>following mentor teacher in order to be safe</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student teachers' expectations</td>
<td>1. apply learner-centred approach</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. cooperative mentor teachers</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3. full English in delivery</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4. more practice</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5. teaching model</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mentor teachers' qualities</td>
<td>1. mentor teacher makes many mistakes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. mentor teacher only concentrates on final exam</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3. mentor teacher uses limited English</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4. mentor teacher uses out of date teaching material</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student teacher feeling better than mentor</td>
<td>1. attended by English Department lecturer during the examination</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. information on vocational schools</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3. language skills</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4. learning learners' characteristics-psychology</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Themes</td>
<td>Code Categories</td>
<td>Code</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>what needs improving</td>
<td></td>
<td>5. more practice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>6. strategy to approach mentor teachers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>7. language components- structure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>8. TEFL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>9. language components: vocabulary and pronunciation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Connection and disconnection between what is obtained in teacher training institution and schools</td>
<td>Contributions of microteaching to field work experience</td>
<td>1. enriching teaching methods</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2. managing the classroom or students</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3. preparing making lesson plan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>4. preparing mental capacity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>5. time management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gaps between microteaching (MT) and field experience at schools</td>
<td></td>
<td>1. teaching unreal students vs. real students:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- full of pretention in MT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- handle difficult students in real classes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- real students might have nothing in their mind</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2. different concepts between mentor teacher at schools and lecturers in microteaching</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Themes</td>
<td>Code Categories</td>
<td>Code</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
|                                           | Links between theories and practice          | 3. lesson plan cannot always be applied in real classes  
4. microteaching doesn't prepare student teachers practicing at vocational schools  
5. portion of English language delivery is limited in real classes  
6. teaching methods are not always applicable in real classes  
7. theory cannot always be applied in real classes |
| Implications                              | What can be learnt from teaching practice at microteaching? (teaching practice at microteaching means learning) | 1. learning to apply teaching method  
2. learning to be effective EFL teachers  
3. building confidence to be an EFL teacher  
4. learning to manage classroom  
5. as a reference for practice teaching at schools  
6. learning to anticipate unexpected situation in the real classroom |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Themes</th>
<th>Code Categories</th>
<th>Code</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>What can be learned from teaching real students at schools? PPL means Learning</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1. learning from environment (outside of the self)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. learning to understand learners’ characteristics, why, how</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3. learning to adjust to local context</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4. learning to manage students</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5. exciting experience to learn to teach outstanding students in favourite schools in towns</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>6. learning to do administrative matters</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>7. learning to use English as medium of instruction in classroom</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>8. learning to teach students to communicate</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>9. learning to manage the time</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>10. preparing to make plan and choosing the appropriate material and teaching methods and interesting teaching atmosphere</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>11. learning to be teacher that is not dominant</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>12. hard experience regarding the insufficient English language capacity... nervous, etc.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>13. pretending to teach real students</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>14. tense and nervous experience</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>15. artificial teaching</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>16. snapshot activity</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Themes</td>
<td>Code Categories</td>
<td>Code</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>7. learning to use teacher language (intelligible and clear pronunciation)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>8. learning to make the students understand what’s explained</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>9. learning to be EFL teacher from mentor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>10. learning to socialize with mentor teachers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>11. making favourable and effective learning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>12. making them aware of the teachers’ role and responsibility that are not achieved on campus</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>13. learning to interact with students</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>14. learning to teach in interesting, creative and contextual ways</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>15. insufficient teaching practice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>16. learning to manage time and classroom</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>17. difficult experience to teach low students in private schools</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>18. learning to apply appropriate methods suited to students’ condition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uniqueness</td>
<td>Unique</td>
<td>1. every school gives different expectation on: lesson plan, language use, approaching students, students’ condition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2. students are sent to vocational schools which make the student teachers experience cultural shocks</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Appendix 6: Categories of themes between global and national policies

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Global Policy</th>
<th>National Education system policy</th>
<th>Page</th>
<th>Teacher Law</th>
<th>Page</th>
<th>National Standard</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| - Globalisation  
- Development strategies  
- Progress  
- Improvement | - Globalisation  
- Quality improvement | National Development  
Teacher quality improvement | - Social development  
- Life change | 13 |
<p>| Ethno-scape | | Foreign teaching force employed as teachers must obey the law | | |
| Techno-scape | Techno-scape | Distant learning to Chapter X, Curriculum, article 36, verse 3 | Mastering Technology | 1, 6, 26 and 37 extended explanation of the Act |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Global Policy</th>
<th>National Education system policy</th>
<th>Page</th>
<th>Teacher Law</th>
<th>Page</th>
<th>National Standard</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ideo-scape</td>
<td>Ideo-scape</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Mastering science</td>
<td>1, 6, 26, 37, extended explanation of the Law</td>
<td>The importance of English in global communication</td>
<td>44, 46, 48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Media-scape</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finance-scape</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consequences of globalisation</td>
<td>Life change demand</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Global demand</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity and challenge</td>
<td>Equal opportunity to education</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Equal opportunity in education</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Modernity</td>
<td>- Education national standard</td>
<td>3, 9, 37</td>
<td>Education accountability carried out objectively,</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Contend standard, process standard, graduate competence</td>
<td>9, 37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- International standard</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>Quality standard education certification</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Global Policy</td>
<td>National Education system policy</td>
<td>Page</td>
<td>Teacher Law</td>
<td>Page</td>
<td>National Standard</td>
<td>Page</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>--------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>transparently and accountably</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Teacher has to be objective and not discriminative in educating</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Network Involvement</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>participation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Relevance</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Education management</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Ensure enlargement and equity of access, quality and relevance</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>relevance and efficiency</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eliminate Poverty poor</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>National building</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Literacy</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eliminate Inequality and Gender disparity</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Equal access to education</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Global Policy</td>
<td>National Education system policy</td>
<td>Page</td>
<td>Teacher Law</td>
<td>Page</td>
<td>National Standard</td>
<td>Page</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>-------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- Every citizen has right for education</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- Teacher empowerment is not discriminative, justice</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Integrity, accountability and Transparency</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Education accountability</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>education certification carried out objectively, transparently and accountably</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>democracy</td>
<td>Democratic citizen</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>- Democratic citizen - Teacher empowerment is in democratic way</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Improving Quality Education, Good quality</td>
<td>- Improving Quality Education</td>
<td>1, 15</td>
<td></td>
<td>1,5</td>
<td>Learning process</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Global Policy</td>
<td>National Education system policy</td>
<td>Page</td>
<td>Teacher Law</td>
<td>Page</td>
<td>National Standard</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ensuring excellence</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- Professional development</td>
<td></td>
<td>which is interactive, inspiring, creative, challenging, motivating,</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- teacher professionalism</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Education and individual empowerment</td>
<td>- individual potential empowerment</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>- Potential development of learners</td>
<td>1, 19, 26</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Learner competence development</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>- teacher empowerment through self-development</td>
<td>5, 38, 39, 6</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- equality of learning access; opportunity to gain knowledge for</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- Every citizen must take primary education and government must pay</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>extended explanation of the Law</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Global Policy</td>
<td>National Education system policy</td>
<td>Page</td>
<td>Teacher Law</td>
<td>Page</td>
<td>National Standard</td>
<td>Page</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>-------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>youth and adults</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>for it</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- Teacher empowerment is not discriminative</td>
<td></td>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Human rights; opportunity to gain knowledge for youth and adults; Opportunity to quality education; quality of learning; rights to get education</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- Every citizen has right for education - Teacher empowerment is not discriminative</td>
<td>6, 37, extended explanation of the Law</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EFA goals and commitment of Funding agencies</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>The country allocates at least 20% of national and local budget for education</td>
<td>37, extended explanation of the Law</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- challenge related to lack of resources</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>conduct educational program</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

333
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Global Policy</th>
<th>National Education system policy</th>
<th>Page</th>
<th>Teacher Law</th>
<th>Page</th>
<th>National Standard</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>correlation between poverty and low learning outcomes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Enhance dignity, teacher competence, carrier profession, national education quality, equity and reducing gap in rural and quality education</td>
<td>37</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IT and education; ICT and teacher training; increase attention to teacher quality; the need to teacher training in science and technology</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ineffective quality education; lack of quality improvement; connectivity between curriculum and society needs</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>education and women's equality and empowerment</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- Teacher empowerment is not discriminative, justice</td>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- Enhance dignity,</td>
<td>37</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Global Policy</td>
<td>National Education system policy</td>
<td>Page</td>
<td>Teacher Law</td>
<td>Page</td>
<td>National Standard</td>
<td>Page</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>--------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>teacher competence, carrier profession, national education quality, equity and reducing gap in rural and quality education</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>lifelong learning; Enhance the status, morale and Teacher Professionalism</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- Professional education</td>
<td>1,2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- Teacher professional principles</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- The status of teacher</td>
<td>4,5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- Teacher empowerment through self-development</td>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- Lifelong competence improvement</td>
<td>10</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>minimal education qualification for modern</td>
<td>Teacher qualification, competence and</td>
<td>5, 6</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Global Policy</td>
<td>National Education system policy</td>
<td>Page</td>
<td>Teacher Law</td>
<td>Page</td>
<td>National Standard</td>
<td>Page</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>-------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>country</td>
<td>certification</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- measuring quality education</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Academic qualification</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Teacher competence</td>
<td>3, 5,6</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Quality standard</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Professional education</td>
<td>2, 6</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Certification</td>
<td>3,6</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Roles of education institutions in offering good quality education and competent teachers</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Teacher education institutions</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Curriculum at teacher training and education institutions is to develop teacher competence to support national, international and local</td>
<td>12</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Global Policy</td>
<td>National Education system policy</td>
<td>Page</td>
<td>Teacher Law</td>
<td>Page</td>
<td>National Standard</td>
<td>Page</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>-------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>excellence based education</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Roles of IT in supporting EFA goals</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Roles of teachers in promoting quality education</td>
<td>Function, roles and position of teachers to carry out quality national education</td>
<td></td>
<td>Quality learning</td>
<td>1, 5,</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>society involves to monitor the educational development</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>system of educational governance</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teachers and learning facilitator</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Global Policy</td>
<td>National Education system policy</td>
<td>Page</td>
<td>Teacher Law</td>
<td>Page</td>
<td>National Standard</td>
<td>Page</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>--------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>the importance of governance upon learners' need</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The importance of education</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The focus on education program</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>the need to basic literacy in the context of relevant life skills</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Competent teachers</td>
<td>Well-trained teachers</td>
<td></td>
<td>Curriculum to develop teacher competence to support national, international and local excellence based education</td>
<td>12</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- well-trained teachers and EFA promotion</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Decentralization in education</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>education and economic</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Global Policy</td>
<td>National Education system policy</td>
<td>Page</td>
<td>Teacher Law</td>
<td>Page</td>
<td>National Standard</td>
<td>Page</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>--------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>development</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>education for peace and global understanding; Peace and stability</td>
<td>Intellectuality, global peace, freedom, and social justice</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Preamble</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Money efficiency and education system</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>…to guarantee efficiency and education quality</td>
<td>11</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>the need to the integration of functional education in equivalency programs</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix 7: Themes based on Appadurai’s global flows across texts

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Types of data</th>
<th>Ideo-scape</th>
<th>Techno-scape</th>
<th>Ethno-scape</th>
<th>Finance-scape</th>
<th>Media-scape</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>EFA</td>
<td>- high quality education and global partnership;</td>
<td>- national development, global developmental competitiveness &amp; teaching innovation:</td>
<td>- educational improvement, global employability, tourism and cultural values:</td>
<td>- professional development and global employability:</td>
<td>- Quality education for global employability</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MDG</td>
<td>- High quality education</td>
<td>- National development</td>
<td>- Movement for educational improvement</td>
<td>- Professional Development</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Education System</td>
<td>- Quality teacher improvement</td>
<td>- Teaching innovation</td>
<td>- Global employability</td>
<td>- Global employability</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher Law</td>
<td>- Curriculum design</td>
<td>- Global competition</td>
<td>- Tourism and cultural values</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Standards</td>
<td>- Using English as a foreign language to support global partnership</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Department Curriculum</td>
<td>- ELT methodologies</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Practicum Guides</td>
<td>- Neoliberalism</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interviews</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>